

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
MAY 7, 2014**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 P.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez
ABSENT: Zuniga, Salas

- Chairman’s Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2014-136 | UDC Amendments |
| 2. Case No. 2014-141 | 1315 San Pedro |
| 3. Case No. 2014-138 | 139-151 E. Commerce |
| 4. Case No. 2014-153 | 10700 Nacogdoches |
| 5. Case No. 2014-137 | 328 E. Josephine |
| 6. Case No. 2014-147 | 141 E. Magnolia Ave. |
| 7. Case No. 2014-411 | 1130 Broadway |
| 8. Case No. 2014-145 | 1221 Broadway #116 |
| 9. Case No. 2014-148 | 115 Plaza de Armas |
| 10. Case No. 2014-155 | 1029 Dawson |
| 11. Case No. 2014-151 | 306 Barrera |
| 12. Case No. 2014-150 | Foster Meadows and Highway 87 |
| 13. Case No. 2014-140 | 4002 Roosevelt |
| 14. Case No. 2014-109 | 215 Barrera |
| 15. Case No. 2014-143 | 622 S. Main |
| 16. Case No. 2014-082 | 214 W. Lullwood |

Items 1, 2 5, 9, 13 and 15 were pulled from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2014-136

Applicant: Office of Historic Preservation

Address: UDC Amendments

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting changes to Article III and Article VI of the Unified Development Code regarding performing arts centers and the allowance of monitors to display performances in the RIO-3 District:

SECTION 1. Chapter 35, Article III, Section 35-311, Table 311-2 is amended by adding Performing Arts Center as follows:

May 7, 2014

										2	
PERMITTED USE O-1 & O-1.5	O-2	NC	C-1	C-2	C-3	D	L	I-1	I-2	ERZD	
Recreation Park - Public	P	P	P	P	P	P	S	S	S	P	
Recreation Performing Art Center - Digital Display Monitor								S			
Recreation Recreational Facility - Community Wide						P	P	P	P		

SECTION 2. Chapter 35, Article VI, Section 35-673(i), Street Furnishings is amended as follows:

* * * * *

(i) Street Furnishings. Street furnishings are exterior amenities, including but not limited to, tables, chairs, umbrellas, landscape pots, wait stations, valet stations, bicycle racks, planters, benches, bus shelters, kiosks, waste receptacles and similar items that help to define pedestrian use areas. Handcrafted street furnishings are particularly important in San Antonio, and therefore this tradition of craftsmanship and of providing street furniture is encouraged.

(1) Prohibited Street Furnishings in Riverwalk Area. The following street furnishings are prohibited within the publicly owned portion of the Riverwalk area, whether or not the property is leased, and on the exterior of the riverside of buildings directly adjacent to the publicly owned portion of the river:

* * * * *

G. Monitors (i.e., television screens, computer screens, digital displays, and video boards) except those permitted as part of a performing arts center digital display monitor pursuant to a specific use authorization.

H. Speakers, except those permitted as part of a performing arts center digital display monitor pursuant to a specific use authorization.

SECTION 3. Chapter 35, Article VI, Section 35-678, Signs and Billboards in the RIO is amended as follows:

* * * * *

(n) Nonconforming Status. Any legally erected sign that which, by reason of revisions to this chapter, no longer complies with its provisions, shall be awarded nonconforming status upon review by all necessary city departments.

(o) Performing Arts Center Signs. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Chapter or Chapter 28 of the City Code of the City of San Antonio, a wall sign that is a digital display monitor meeting the following parameters may be allowed in the "RIO-3" River Improvement Overlay District-3 by the City Council with a Specific Use Authorization provided that such digital display monitor meets the following standards:

1. The monitor must be situated on a performing arts center premises.
2. The monitor may only be utilized during ticketed events of the performing arts center.
3. The monitor may not be used for on-premise or off-premise advertising.
4. Sound associated with the monitor must be in compliance with the noise ordinance in the City Code.
5. The light intensity of the monitor shall not exceed:

(a) 1,000 nits during the day; and

(b) 500 nits at night, measured from sunset until sunrise.

6. The monitor must automatically adjust the monitor's light intensity according to ambient light conditions.

7. The size of the monitor is in compliance with the provisions of 35-678(d).

8. The monitor complies with all condition(s) imposed by the City Council as part of the specific use authorization.

(p) (o) Violations in River Improvement Overlay Districts and on the Riverwalk.

Performing Arts Center means a multi-use performance venue with at least 1,500 permanent seats in one or more performance spaces in a building of at least one hundred thousand (100,000) square feet. A performing arts center use may include, the provision of alcohol, a dance hall, food services, and/or live entertainment as an accessory use.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval of the proposed amendments.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Judson to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

2. HDRC NO. 2014-141

Applicant: Mike Beaty

Address: 1315 San Pedro

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Construct park improvements including a 10-foot wide, lighted walkway around the perimeter of the park and the addition of monument signs at entries. Portions of the existing sidewalk around the park will be removed. A number of small caliper trees will be removed and relocated to accommodate the walkway. Three mature palm trees at the corner of W Ashby Place and North Flores are to be removed. Historic features, including WPA-era footbridges, will be retained.

RECOMMENDATION:

a. The request was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on March 25, 2014. During that meeting, the pedestrian light poles were discussed and whether ground lighting would be more appropriate. The applicant stated that lighting the walkways was desirable due to safety concerns. Twelve-foot poles are the most effective way to accomplish the desired lighting and that an increased number of ground lights would be required to achieve similar results. Overall, the committee members present noted that the proposal would benefit the park and allow for improved pedestrian access.

b. The proposed improvements are generally consistent with UDC Section 35-642(a) and maintain the character of the site and its setting.

c. The applicant has coordinated with staff to retain the WPA-era footbridges consistent with UDC Section 35-643(a) and (b).

d. The proposal to remove three palm trees on West Ashby Place is not consistent with UDC Section 35-643(a) as it constitutes the removal of landscape elements that are characteristic of the site.

- e. The proposed signage at entry points is simple and legible, consistent with UDC Section 35-645.
- f. The applicant has met all requirements for archaeology for this project.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that the palm trees on W Ashby Place be retained and protected during construction based on finding d and that any additional changes resulting from public meetings be incorporated into the final design.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to approve with staff recommendation that the palm trees on W. Ashby Place be retained and protected during construction based on finding d and that any additional changes resulting from public meetings be incorporated into the final design.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Laffoon

THE MOTION CARRIED.

5. HDRC NO. 2014-137

Applicant: Bill Shown

Address: 328 E. Josephine

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Relocate the two-story structure at 328 E Josephine (former Boehler's / Liberty Bar) to the lot at 618 Avenue A; and
2. Relocate the one-story house at 923 Avenue A to an undetermined location.

FINDINGS:

- a. The buildings at 328 E Josephine and 923 Avenue A first appear on 1912 Sanborn maps. The two-story Boehler's / Liberty Bar building at 328 E Josephine is believed to date back to 1890 and was allegedly damaged in the 1921 flood resulting in its present-day leaning condition. The single-story house at 923 Avenue A is believed to have been built circa 1905.
- b. This request was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on April 29, 2014. At that meeting, concern was expressed that proposal would remove the Boehler's / Liberty Bar building from its historic context. Not only is the building located on a prominent corner, it is believed to have a connection to the 1921 flood. It is unknown at this time whether the existing leaning condition of the building would be corrected upon relocation. The applicant prefers to maintain the eccentricity of the structure and is willing to make a significant investment in its rehabilitation. Of the two committee members present, one was in favor of relocation and the other was not. There was also discussion regarding the relocation of the small circa 1905 house to a space on Avenue A adjacent to the Granary. This location has not been finalized by the applicant, who noted that the house would not be moved until a suitable location had been determined. Both committee members expressed support for relocation of the house.
- c. The provisions of UDC Section 35-613 do not directly apply to these buildings because they are not designated historic landmarks. However, staff finds that the HDRC may reference this section as guidance for the relocation of these structures within the RIO-2 District.
- d. The Boehler's / Liberty Bar building sits on a prominent corner. It contributes historic character and aesthetic interest to its present setting. At the proposed new location on Avenue A, the building would also sit on a prominent corner. Although

it orientation will be changed, the existing balconies of the north and east façade will continue to have frontage along the street edge.

- e. The applicant has indicated that the vacated lot will be used as future parking. Plans for the parking lot will be submitted at a later date if relocation is approved.
- f. The Boehler's / Liberty Bar building has been substantially modified over time. Although the structure will be partially dismantled in order to be relocated, the applicant has indicated interest restoring the building to its original conditions. The applicant has also indicated that attempts will be made to maintain some of the existing leaning condition, but it is unknown at this time whether it will be feasible to do so. Staff finds that the existing leaning condition contributes to the character and aesthetic interest of the building and that maintaining the leaning condition will allow the building to convey its history at a new location.
- g. The proposed new location is on a nearby lot with a similar context has the present setting.
- h. The Boehler's / Liberty Bar building is located within the RIO-2 district and will remain within the RIO-2 district following relocation.

RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that every attempt within reason be made to maintain the existing leaning condition of the structure. A structural analysis must be provided to staff if it is determined by the applicant that this stipulation cannot be met.
- 2. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that the house remain within the RIO-2 District. If the applicant is unable to meet this stipulation, or if building is sold in the future, staff recommends additional stipulations in the following order:
 - 1) That the building be relocated to a vacant lot within a residential historic district; or
 - 2) If that is not possible, that the structure be relocated to a vacant lot within San Antonio's original 36 square mile boundary and receive designation as an individual historic landmark.Staff does not recommend relocation of the structure outside the original 36 square mile boundary.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to 1) Denial of item 1 based on the intrinsic historic value of the structure and its contribution to the urban streetscape. 2. Approval of item 2 with the stipulation that details for the proposed site plan be submitted to staff for review.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Connor, Rodriguez
NAYS: Feldman

THE MOTION CARRIED.

9. HDRC NO. 2014-148

Applicant: Fashion Theater
Address: 115 Plaza de Armas

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Fill in one window opening on the north side of the Plaza de Armas building, facing the Spanish Governor's Palace, and install flashing over an existing void between the Plaza de Armas building and the Spanish Governor's Palace restroom. The existing restroom addition partially covers the window in question and creates a triangular gap (approximately 2'x2') between the north wall of Plaza de Armas and the wall of the restroom. The applicant proposes to cover this gap, infilling the window, to avoid further moisture infiltration. The window itself is going to remain in place and the opening is proposed to be filled in from the outside with buff brick salvaged from interior demolition in Plaza de Armas.

FINDINGS:

- a. On May 1, 2013, the HDRC approved new canopies on the west elevation of Plaza de Armas, infilling non-original doorways, and restoring the south-facing storefront. On October 16, 2013, a new CPS vault behind Plaza de Armas was approved by the HDRC.
- b. Although the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Section 6.A.i, states to avoid filling in historic window openings, the proposed modification will not have a significant impact on the appearance of this structure from the public right-of-way, due to its location on the building and the fact that it is partially obscured by an existing wall.
- c. In accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 10, the proposed infill of this window opening will be done in a way that is reversible, leaving the actual window in place.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings b and c.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Judson to approve as submitted based on findings a through c.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC NO. 2014-140

Applicant: Kenneth Zuschlag

Address: 4002 Roosevelt

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new high school building with a total area of 49,518 sf. Proposed materials include stucco, clay tile, stone and cast stone.

FINDINGS:

- a. Located within the Mission Historic District, the proposed new construction is consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction in terms of roof form, façade configuration, materials and architectural details.
- b. The applicant is responsible for meeting all requirements for archaeology outlined in the Unified Development Code.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on the findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to approve as submitted based on findings a through b.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Shafer

THE MOTION CARRIED.

15. HDRC NO. 2014-143

Applicant: Bury, Inc.

Address: 622 S. Main

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Create a bike and pedestrian path along the east side of S Flores Street between Arsenal Street and E Cesar Chavez Blvd. The bike and pedestrian corridor consists of the following: a 9.5-foot landscape buffer between the face of the existing curb on S Flores to the western edge of the existing stone wall (the existing concrete sidewalk will be removed), a 6-inch permeable buffer located on the eastern edge of the existing stone wall, an 8-foot, two-lane concrete bike path, a 5.5-foot bioswale landscape strip, and a 5-foot concrete pedestrian walkway. The overall resulting corridor will measure approximately 30-feet wide and will constitute addition right-of-way dedication. Street trees and low vegetation will be planted along the corridor in both the landscape buffer area and bioswale. The existing chain link fence in front of the Commander's House property will be removed. Bike lanes along Arsenal Street and Old Guilbeau will be marked with striping. Bike lanes across driveways will be marked with pavement paint. Other amenities, such as pedestrian lighting are proposed along the corridor.

2. Create a new entry at Whitley Blvd to serve as the main entry for both the HEB Arsenal Campus and Commander's House. The existing drive will be widened to 44 feet. A traffic signal and pedestrian crosswalk will be added at this intersection. Approximately 65 linear feet of the existing stone wall will be removed to accommodate the driveway; the stones will be relocated and repurposed along the northern edge of the Commander's House property. Three existing mature palm trees will be relocated along Taylor Circle to accommodate the widening driveway. A 30" heritage sycamore located near the drive will be retained.

3. Stabilize, repair and restore the remaining portions of the stone wall based on historic photographs, including the replication of missing stone columns.

4. Repave and expand portions of Taylor Circle in front of the Commander's house. The existing asphalt will be replaced with new asphalt topping. Stamped asphalt paving will be used at the crossing points along the linear path between the front entry gates and main structure. A new concrete drive is proposed to connect Taylor Circle to the existing surface parking area located behind the Commander's House. A concrete walkway is proposed between the Commander's house, the bike/pedestrian corridor and a future grocery store site at the corner of S Flores and E Cesar Chavez Blvd. Additional seating has been proposed along this walkway.

The applicant is also requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

5. Implement two, 44-foot wide entry drives at S Flores and E Cesar Chavez Blvd which serve as main entrances for the HEB Arsenal Campus and two, 35-foot entry drives for vehicular access to the future grocery store site at the corner of S Flores and E Cesar Chavez Blvd (variance to UDC Section 35-672(b)(1));

6. Locate surface parking along the edge of the dedicated right-of-way (variance to UDC Section 35-672(b)(2)); and

7. Implement a landscape buffer less than 15 feet (variance to UDC Section 35-672(b)(3)).

FINDINGS:

a. The U.S. Arsenal in San Antonio was established in 1859 on the former homestead of Dr. James M. Devine. The first arsenal buildings were constructed in 1860. The Commanding Officer's Quarters (Commander's House) was constructed circa 1883 and is believed to incorporate the former Devine house which served as the previous quarters. A low stone wall is located along S Flores and is the remnant of a stone and iron fence that was constructed in 1889 to enclose the property. The San Pedro Acequia also runs through the property from north to south. Portions of the stone-lined walls of the acequia remain visible behind the Commander's House and adjacent Servants' Quarters. Other site features, such as Taylor Circle and a network of scored concrete walkways, appear in early maps and aerial drawings and are believed to predate the 1883 Commander's House.

b. The Arsenal property has potential to yield valuable archaeological resources. As a local and National Register District, any ground-disturbing work taking place on publicly-owned portions of the district will require an Antiquities Permit from the Texas Historical Commission. Office of Historic Preservation staff has recommended that all excavation work related to this request receive archaeological monitoring. Work on privately-owned property will also require archaeological investigations including potential monitoring as required under by the City's Unified Development Code.

Findings related to request item 1:

c. Generally, the addition of a bike and pedestrian path along S Flores will provide a safe passage for travel along S Flores and will provide much-needed public access to the Commander's House Park.

d. The remaining portions of the stone wall are an important 19th-century resource and contributing structure to the Arsenal Historic District. The wall features two courses of rusticated limestone blocks in an ashlar pattern with cap. One segmented column remains at the northernmost end of the wall, two in front of the former gated entry to the Commander's House, and a fourth to the north of the existing opening at Whitley Blvd. There are two other remaining locations where these columns appear to have been removed. The existing sidewalk along S Flores directly abuts a concrete curb supporting the stone wall. The request to remove this sidewalk in favor of the proposed bike and pedestrian path on the eastern side of the wall will not increase the amount of paving abutting the wall. The applicant has further specified a detail which incorporates a gravel strip between the wall and the proposed concrete bike path. The incorporation of this gravel strip prevents new concrete from being introduced along the wall and results in a reversible condition, consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 10. The applicant is encouraged to further develop specifications to protect the wall during the construction of the bike path.

e. Presently, a scored concrete walkway is located on the Commander's House property between the former gated entry and the main structure. A portion of the walkway will be removed to accommodate the bike and pedestrian path. While many portions of the concrete walkways on the Commander's House property are believed to date back to 1870, a portion of the scored paving to be removed for the new path appears to have been previously replaced. The applicant has specified accent pavers and plantings at this location to maintain the formal linear path that was historically present. Staff finds this to be an appropriate solution provided that the proposed accent paving is similar in material and style as the original scored concrete.

f. Specifications for street trees, pedestrian lighting and bike racks were developed in accordance with the Downtown Design Guide.

g. A VIA bus shelter is proposed on S Flores just north of the Commander's House Property (outside of the Arsenal Historic District). This location serves as a placeholder only, and a separate application for the final design of the shelter will be submitted for review at a future date.

Findings related to request item 2:

h. The use of Whitley Drive as a main access into the Arsenal campus and Commander's House Park is generally consistent with the historic conditions that existed prior to the extension of S Main Street through the campus. This access point will become a controlled intersection with traffic signal and pedestrian crosswalk. As submitted, approximately 65 linear feet of the stone wall will be removed to accompany the widening driveway, which the applicant has disclosed to be the minimum amount that can be removed while accommodating vehicular and pedestrian access. Removal of any intact portions of the wall is not consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 2 and constitutes a negative impact to the overall integrity of this feature. However, the wall itself is in disrepair and many original elements are missing. As mitigation for its partial removal, the applicant proposes to stabilize, repair and restore the remaining portions of the wall based on historic photographs, including the replication of the missing stone columns (request item 3). Staff finds this to be an appropriate compromise. Furthermore, the applicant proposes to salvage and reuse materials to repair the missing or broken pieces of the wall. The remainder of the salvaged pieces will be assembled to form a matching low wall at the northwest corner of Commander's House Park. The proposed new wall is will be located in close proximity to the original wall, align with the northernmost remaining column and help to reinforce the northwest corner of the park which is the original boundary of the arsenal. Staff finds this to be an appropriate solution that is in keeping with the historic context of the site.

i. The applicant has coordinated with the City Arborist regarding a 30" heritage sycamore tree located near the proposed drive. The applicant intends to keep the tree and will take steps to protect the tree during construction. However, it remains unknown if the overall site improvements will have a negative impact to the tree. The applicant has committed to providing mitigation for the tree consistent with the tree ordinance as a safeguard against its failure.

Findings related to request item 3:

j. The proposal and methods used to stabilize, repair and restore the remaining portions of the stone wall are generally consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines.

Findings related to request item 4:

k. As submitted, the width and general footprint of Taylor Circle will be maintained. Historically, the circle is believed to have consisted mostly of gravel with stone or concrete pavers located at crossing points along the linear path between the former front gates and main structure. Some remnants of this paving type remain visible at the crossing points, but it is unknown to what extent they remain intact or whether they are salvageable. The proposal to resurface the circle with new asphalt is consistent with the existing conditions. The applicant has specified the use of stamped asphalt paving at the crossing points to replicate the remaining visible pavers. Staff finds that this may be an appropriate solution, provided that the proposed pattern is similar to the historic paving type. However, other options for either stone or concrete pavers at these locations should be further explored in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 5.

l. The introduction of accessible walkways and seating within the park will improve pedestrian access and overall use of the park.

Findings related to request item 5:

m. The design objectives outlined by UDC Section 35-672 are intended to promote pedestrian safety and walkability within the RIO Districts. The two, 44-foot driveways have been designed to incorporate an 8-foot landscape median which will improve pedestrian safety. The two requested driveways would also be controlled intersections with crosswalks marked with high-visibility pavement paint.

n. The two, 35-foot driveways will service a future grocery store and gas pumps at the northwest corner of S Flores and E Cesar Chavez Blvd. The bike and pedestrian path will be located away from the street to reduce the actual crossing distance. The applicant has also specified high-visibility pavement paint at these crossings.

Findings related to request item 6:

o. Although being relocated within the Arsenal property to accommodate the dedication of new right-of-way along S Flores, the proposed parking along the S Flores property line will be consistent with the present-day conditions of the site. Staff does not anticipate an adverse impact to the pedestrian experience in consideration of UDC Section 35-672(b)(2).

Findings related to request item 7:

p. UDC Section 35-672(b)(3) requires a minimum 15-foot landscape buffer between the pedestrian right-of-way and any parking areas. Parking areas for the proposed grocery store, although not consistent with the 15-foot required buffer, will incorporate a greater buffer than the present-day conditions. Other areas of improvement, such as the bike and pedestrian corridor along S Flores, provide an ample landscape buffer which creates a safe and enjoyable environment for pedestrians.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that accent paving located on the bike and pedestrian path in front of the Commanders House be similar in material and style as the original scored concrete based on finding e.

2 & 3. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings h through j.

4. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that options for either stone or concrete pavers at the crossing points in Taylor Circle be further explored based on finding k.

5-7. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings m through p. The applicant must also apply for and obtain a variance from the Board of Adjustment for these items.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Feldman and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to:

Item 1 – Approved with the stipulation that accent paving located on the bike and pedestrian path in front of the Commanders House be similar in material and style as the original scored concrete based on finding e.

Item 2 & 3 - Approved as submitted based on findings h through j.

Item 4 - Approved with the stipulation that options for either stone or concrete pavers at the crossing points in Taylor Circle be further explored based on finding k.

Items 5-7 – Approved as submitted based on findings m through p.

The applicant must also apply for and obtain a variance from the Board of Adjustment for these items.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC NO. 2014-091

Applicant: Andrew Olguin, Geneve Mendoza

Address: 640 Leigh

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Construct a new, two story residence on a vacant lot in the Lavaca Historic District. The proposed new structure will have a standing seam metal roof, stucco and cedar exterior. It has an attached garage on the front of the structure with horizontal cedar siding and doors. The home will have a recessed primary entrance. Fixed, vinyl windows are proposed on the majority of the structure.

FINDINGS:

- a. A similar request for new construction of a single family home at 640 Leigh was heard by the HDRC on March 19, 2014. At that hearing, the Commission voted to send the request to the Design Review Committee.
- b. The Design Review Committee reviewed the original application on March 25, 2014. At that meeting, the committee noted concern about the complexity of the proposed design, in terms of its form, particularly the roof form. The committee recommended that the applicant simplify the proposed form to help create a more coherent overall design that will relate to nearby historic homes.
- c. The Design Review Committee reviewed this revised application on April 29, 2014. At that meeting, the committee found that the design has been substantially simplified and is more coherent, with simpler roof forms and more consistent fenestration. The committee recommended approval of the revised application.
- d. The lot at 640 Leigh is within the Lavaca Historic District and is currently vacant. This block of Leigh faces a vacant piece of land. The two lots immediately to the east of 640 Leigh contain one story historic homes. There is a vacant parcel directly to the west and a new two story home to the west of that. Overall, the context of this block is not consistent in terms of development.
- e. While the immediate context is not consistent in terms of scale, the majority of the historic homes on this block of Leigh maintain similar lot coverage. The proposed new structure will cover the bulk of this lot which is not consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, Section 2.D.i.

- f. The incorporation of a front-loaded garage on the front of the home is not consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction Section 5.A.i, which recommends keeping garages and outbuildings subordinate to the principal structure. Traditionally, garages and accessory buildings would have been detached from the primary structure and set at the rear of the property. While a detached garage may not be feasible on this property due to its size and orientation, staff finds that the garage should be pushed further back from the street so as to become less of a visually dominant element.
- g. While the proposal to incorporate horizontal cedar siding and garage doors on this portion of the structure will help camouflage it, staff finds that its proximity to the street makes it too prominent in comparison with the primary entry to the home which is not consistent with historic context or with the Guidelines for New Construction, Section 4.A.i.
- h. The revised proposal incorporates simplified roof forms, eliminating the previously proposed hipped elements. This simplification is appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, Section 2.B.i.
- i. The use of cedar on the primary elevation of the proposed home is appropriate and relates to the surrounding historic homes, consistent with Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Section 3.A.i. The proposed cedar will also help to camouflage the proposed garage doors. The use of stucco on portions of the structure and standing seam metal roofing is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Sections 3.A.i and 3.A.iii.
- j. While there are two-story structures on the 600 block of Leigh, the majority of the existing homes are one story. The proposed structure will be taller. The simplified roof form is more consistent with existing design guidelines, reducing the perceived scale of the proposed new structure and helping it relate to the surrounding properties.
- k. The revised proposal incorporates simplified fenestration patterns and fewer fenestration types, consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, Section 2.C.i.
- l. The proposed structure incorporates a front porch with a front-facing entry. The proposed porch can be seen as a contemporary interpretation of a traditional front porch and balcony, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Section 4.A.iii. Staff finds however, that the front porch should become a more visually dominant element on the front façade of the home, possibly by being located closer to the street or with the incorporation of architectural details to help it read as a porch.
- m. The revised driveway maintains a 12 foot curb cut and 10 foot approach width, but widens to approximately 20 feet in front of the garage, incorporating parking pads with pavers to help visually break up the concrete surface. While the incorporation of pervious materials is appropriate, staff finds that the driveway is more typical of suburban development, which is not consistent with traditional development patterns in the Lavaca Historic District or with the Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 5.B.i. A 10 foot wide driveway and curb cut is recommended.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on findings e-g, l and m. Staff recommends that the garage be relocated further from the street or eliminated to be more consistent with existing design guidelines.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to approve as submitted by the applicant.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

18. HDRC NO. 2013-369

Applicant: Nik Villarreal

Address: 323 Lavaca

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Modify the front elevation and site plan of the previously approved new construction to incorporate a front parking space, consistent with current UDC requirements for off-street parking. The applicant proposes to create a 10' x 18'6" grasscrete pad in the front yard of the new home to allow for one car to park, pushing back a portion of the southwest corner of the ground floor approximately 7 feet.

FINDINGS:

- a. The Design Review Committee reviewed an application for new construction of a single family home on this property on November 12, 2013, and on December 10, 2013. At the first meeting, the committee noted some concern over the proposed fenestration pattern. The committee also discussed the small size of the lot limits the footprint of the structure. Revised drawings were presented by the applicant at the second DRC meeting, incorporating a gabled roof form and modified fenestration. The committee recommended approval of the revisions.
- b. The request for new construction was given conceptual approval by the HDRC on December 18, 2013, and final approval on February 5, 2014.
- c. After receiving HDRC approval, this request was set to be heard by the Board of Adjustment on April 21, 2014, for a variance on the parking requirement as per UDC Section 35-526, Table 526-3a, which states that a single family detached dwelling must provide one onsite vehicle space. Board of Adjustment staff was not recommending approval of the applicant's request for a variance. The applicant chose to modify the proposed design and return to the HDRC rather than pursue the variance.
- d. The proposed modification to incorporate an onsite parking space was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on April 29, 2014. At that meeting, the committee found that the proposed modification, while a departure from the previously approved, more traditional form, will satisfy the parking requirement with minimal impact to the site. The committee noted that an ideal solution would maintain the vertical line of the southwest corner of the structure, rather than creating a contemporary cantilevered element, but that maintaining that line is not possible on this extremely constrained site. Given the concern about increasing street parking in the Lavaca Historic District, the committee found that the proposed parking solution is acceptable.
- e. The lot at 323 Lavaca is very narrow, limiting the footprint of any new construction. According to the Guidelines for New Construction, Section 2.D.i, new construction should cover no more than 50% of the total lot area. However, given the constraints of this site, the proposed new residence is appropriate in terms of lot coverage and meets the current setback requirements.
- f. This block contains a rare cluster of very narrow lots, including 323 Lavaca.
- g. This property sits between an existing two story house, at 321 Lavaca, and a lot which is currently vacant, at 325 Lavaca. Directly across the street from this property are several intact historic, one story homes. The adjacent historic home at 321 Lavaca has a similar size lot and a similar footprint to what has been proposed in terms of lot coverage.
- h. Neither the adjacent two story home at 321 Lavaca or the existing one story home at 327 Lavaca have a curb cut or onsite parking.
- i. The previously approved new residence is appropriate in terms of orientation, setback, and scale, consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, Sections 1.A, 1.B. and 2.A.
- j. While this block of Lavaca does not have an established, consistent rhythm of driveway/parking placement, staff finds that parking in front of a primary structure in a historic district is not appropriate or consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 7.A.ii. If there is not sufficient space on the lot to locate off-street parking to the side of the structure, a parking space in front of the structure should not be introduced.
- k. The proposed modifications to the building form create a more contemporary appearance that is less in keeping with traditional precedent in the area.

1. The proposed use of grasscrete, which is permeable, as the surface for a parking spot is appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 7.B.ii. This material is visually less obtrusive than solid concrete.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on findings -k.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to approve as submitted by the applicant.

AYES: Judson, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: Cone, Guarino, Rodriguez

THE MOTION CARRIED.

19. HDRC NO. 2014-142

Applicant: Lewis Fisher

Address: 231 Washington

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Restore and screen-in the rear porch and balcony based on photographic evidence;

2. Construct a small rear addition with wood lap siding and sash windows;

3. Construct a two-story carriage house on the rear property line. The building will have a footprint of 1,350 sf. and feature a flat roof with pool deck, board and batten siding, metal lattice, glass guardrails, steel-framed glass doors and large picture windows. The carriage house will build upon an existing concrete slab but will require new footings. A stone wall with punched window openings will compose the eastern wall of the carriage house along the property line; and

4. Implement a landscape and hardscape scheme which includes the addition of a second, 13-foot curb cut on Washington Street, a circular gravel driveway, a wood front yard fence, and a stone rear wall.

FINDINGS:

a. This request was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on April 8, 2014. At that meeting, the commissioners present noted that the scale and location of the proposed carriage house were appropriate and consistent with the existing conditions and that the materials selected referenced materials that were used historically. The applicant was commended for restoration work to the primary structure.

b. Both the porch restorations and small rear addition have been designed based on photographic evidence consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 7.B.v.

c. The existing carriage house was constructed circa 1985 and has received approval for demolition as a non-contributing building.

d. A site visit conducted by staff indicates that the existing carriage house is not highly visible from the River Walk due to existing vegetation. The carriage house rests on a level concrete slab inside the property line. An iron fence with stone columns is located along the rear property line behind the carriage house. Immediately beyond the fence, the topography slopes down towards the River Walk with a second stone retaining wall located along the walkway.

e. The rear of this property abuts the eastern bank of the San Antonio River and publicly-owned portions of the River Walk. As proposed, the carriage house will be constructed along the rear property line abutting the river. This is allowable

by UDC Section 35-516(c) and is also in keeping with historic development patterns for similar properties in King William that are located along the river consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.B.ii. However, there is general concern regarding the potential impact of the new construction to the existing topography and vegetation on the publicly-owned portions of the River Walk. A right-of-way permit will be required for any construction activity to take place outside of the private property. The applicant has indicated that there is a desire to protect and maintain the existing vegetation.

f. The parapet height of the carriage house will be subordinate to the primary structure, consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.i. The use of a flat roof has precedent in this area.

g. The footprint of the carriage house is less than 40% of that of the primary structure, consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.ii.

h. The selected materials are generally consistent with those found historically on the site. Staff finds the proposed stone wall and board and batten siding to be consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.iii. Wood lattice does have precedent at this site, but it is unclear whether the proposed metal lattice is a compatible material. More contemporary material selections, such as glass guardrails and large, steel-framed picture windows and doors are not consistent with the Guidelines.

i. The southeast and southwest elevations feature wood sash windows that are consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 3.A.

RECOMMENDATION:

1&2. Staff recommends conceptual approval as submitted based on finding b.

3. Staff recommends conceptual approval of the carriage house based on findings d through i with the stipulations that:

- 1) That the applicant explore options for implementing windows and doors of traditional sizes and materials instead of large expanses of glass;
- 2) That the applicant explore railings of tradition materials instead of glass;
- 3) More information regarding the finish and dimension of the metal lattice is provided; and
- 4) Detailed specifications for the proposed footings and any related excavation for the carriage house are provided for final approval. A plan for maintaining and protecting the existing vegetation and topography must be provided as well.

4. Staff recommends conceptual approval as submitted based on findings j through l.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to grant conceptual approval with the stipulations: 1) That the applicant explore options for implementing windows and doors of traditional sizes and materials instead of large expanses of glass; 2) That the applicant explore railings of tradition materials instead of glass; 3) More information regarding the finish and dimension of the metal lattice is provided; and 4) Detailed specifications for the proposed footings and any related excavation for the carriage house are provided for final approval. A plan for maintaining and protecting the existing vegetation and topography must be provided as well.

AYES: Cone, Guarino, Rodriguez, Judson, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

20. HDRC NO. 2014-149

Applicant: Charles Turner

Address: 421 Paschal

Withdrawn per the applicant.

21. HDRC NO. 2014-139

Applicant: Michael Andrew Perez

Address: 330 Mission St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Construct a 20' x 20' two-car garage in the back yard at 330 Mission Street with frontage onto Stieren Street. The garage will be open on three sides with only a 16' x 7' metal overhead door composing the 4th wall. Other materials consist of a standing seam metal roof, cedar shingles and wood siding.

FINDINGS:

- a. According to Sanborn maps, the house at 330 Mission Street sits on a lot that has been divided over time. A carriage house was originally located towards the back of the property where the small house at 403 Stieren is currently located.
- b. UDC Section 35-516 requires that new garages and carports be set back a minimum of 20 feet from the street right-of-way. The HDRC may approve a lesser set back consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.B.ii., but a variance from the 20-foot requirement will be required before a permit can be issued.
- c. There are other examples of garages and off-street parking with access to Stieren. Other garages and carports on this block of Stieren are set back away from the property line. There does not appear to be a precedent for this type of building on the zero lot line.
- d. Other single-family homes are located on Stieren adjacent to this property. As proposed, the garage will be set closer to the street than these homes and will be more prominent.
- e. According to the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.v., garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district should be used. The proposed 16-foot metal overhead door is not consistent with this guideline. Wood, divided stall doors are more common within the district and would be more appropriate.
- f. Generally, the proposed materials and design are consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 5.A.i., 5.A.ii. and 5.A.iii.
- g. There is not an established pattern for driveways on Stieren, and the existing curb cuts vary in size and material. Typically, new driveways in historic districts should be limited to no more than 10-feet, consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 5.B.i.. However, given the lack of consistency on the block, staff finds that the proposed curb cut is appropriate.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that divided stalls with wood doors be implemented based on finding e.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to approve with the stipulation that divided stalls with wood doors be implemented based on finding e.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

22. HDRC NO. 2014-154

Applicant: Xavier Gonzalez

Address: 111 S. Concho

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Modify existing windows openings on the structure at 111 S. Concho which faces Dolorosa Street to the south. The applicant proposes to replace existing storefront on the east, west and south elevations with new all-glass, frameless systems, removing existing brick beneath the current openings to bring the windows down to the ground. Similarly, the applicant will restore existing arched window openings that have been filled in with brick. Existing exterior wood trim will be removed.
2. Replace the existing shed canopies with new horizontal cantilevered canopies over the window and door openings on the west elevation of the structure. The proposed canopies will be 12" steel channel, painted a dark bronze color, with a wood soffit. They will be held in place with steel tie backs.
3. Remove an existing fountain and tile backsplash from the west façade of the building, filling in the area behind the fountain with brick.

FINDINGS:

- a. The applicant received HDRC approval on November 20, 2013, to replace the existing storefront on the adjacent uilding at 218 Produce Row with similar frameless glazing systems.
- b. The structure at 111 S. Concho first appears on the 1911-1924 Sanborn map. At that time, it extended further west than the current footprint and has been modified over time.
- c. The existing storefront is likely not original to this building. Based upon a visual inspection of the brick beneath the existing window openings, it appears to have been a later addition to the building. The brick color changes in some areas as does the mortar color and joint size. Similarly, there are arched brick courses in some locations that indicate that originally there were arched window openings that have since been filled in.
- d. Given the previous modifications to the window opening size and configuration over time, staff finds that removing the existing infill brick to bring the storefront down to the ground and restore the arched configurations is appropriate and consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Section 10.B.ii.
- e. While the openings have been modified, staff finds that a wood framed glazing system would be more appropriate and in keeping with the style of the structure than the proposed contemporary frameless glazing.
- f. The proposed canopies are minimal in terms of design and will not detract from the existing historic buildings or obscure significant historic details. Their simple form and materials are consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Sections 11.B.ii and 11.B.v.
- g. The existing fountain on the west side of this structure was a later addition to the building. Removing it and infilling the area behind the tile backsplash with brick is consistent with similar modifications that have occurred throughout the life of the building and will not require modifications to original materials.

RECOMMENDATION:

1. Staff recommends approval based on findings b-d with the stipulation that a wood-framed system be used based on finding e.
2. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on finding f.
3. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on finding g.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Judson to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Shafer, Feldman, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:00 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair

