

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
MARCH 6, 2015**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 8:30 A.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Guarino, Chair and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Guarino, Connor, Laffoon, Cone, Rodriguez, Judson

ABSENT: Zuniga, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman

- Chairman’s Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|----------------------|---------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2015-082 | 18402 Corporate Woods Dr. |
| 2. Case No. 2015-075 | 1544 W. Mistletoe |
| 3. Case No. 2015-072 | 632 Leigh/636 Leigh |
| 4. Case No. 2015-076 | 1606 E. Pyron |
| 5. Case No. 2015-089 | 309 N. Hackberry |
| 6. Case No. 2015-085 | 100 Auditorium Circle |

Item 1 and 4 was pulled from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Laffoon to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Guarino, Connor, Laffoon, Cone, Rodriguez, Judson

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2015-082

Applicant: Chuck Shine

Address: 18402 Corporate Woods Dr.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a new concrete driveway and asphalt parking lot (12 spaces). The proposed parking lot will be located near the southwest entrance of the park.
2. Install new wayfinding and trailhead signs.
3. Install new seating. The seating will consist of inconspicuous, natural-looking stone blocks. The proposed design of the seating is meant to blend in with the landscape.
4. Create approximately 6,000 linear square feet of eight-foot wide concrete trails.
5. Install park amenities including bike racks, exercise equipment, and drinking fountains.
6. Construct a portable toilet enclosure.
7. Install a new fence. The fence will border Redland Woods HOA Park and Gold Canyon Dr.

FINDINGS:

- a. The design and layout of the proposed park development considers the existing natural climatic and topographical features of the site. This is consistent with the UDC Section 35-642.a.1. and b.8.
- b. The proposed park development and amenities are appropriate to help make the park accessible and inviting to users. This is consistent with the UDC Section 35-642.b.1 in terms of creating high design quality standards for public facilities.
- c. The proposed new parking area is consistent with the UDC Section 35-642.a.2-3.
- d. The design, materials and color of the proposed signs, seating and fence are consistent with the UDC Section 25-642.b.3. and 5.
- e. The size and scale of the proposed signs and fence is consistent with UDC height regulations.
- f. The proposed trail is appropriate for its location and will improve accessibility to the park. This is consistent with the UDC Section 35-642.a.3.
- g. The Project has been reviewed by the City Archeologist.

Staff recommends approval of all items based on findings a through g.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve as submitted based on findings a through g.

AYES: Guarino, Connor, Laffoon, Cone, Rodriguez, Judson

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

4. HDRC NO. 2015-076

Applicant: Accurate Roofing & Construction

Address: 1606 E. Pyron Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Construct a carport addition to the existing house at 1606 E Pyron. The applicant has noted that the proposed carport is to be twenty (20) feet wide and will feature a gable that matches that of the existing structure in both form and height.

FINDINGS:

- a. The Mission Historic District was created by ordinance in 1977 and covers a large area. Roughly following the path of the San Antonio River to include the four southern Mission sites, the district includes a mixture of uses and building types. Once a more rural setting, homes found along this portion of E Pyron come from different time periods and feature various styles and scales.
- b. The applicant has proposed to construct the carport addition to the side of the existing structure at 1606 E Pyron as well as match the existing roof pitch and form. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 1.A.i and iii.
- c. According to the Guidelines for Additions 1.B.i, additions should be designed in a manner in which they are subordinate to the principal façade of the existing structure. The proposed carport at 1606 E Pyron is consistent with the Guidelines. In addition to this, the Guidelines for Additions 1.B.v. states that the height of new additions should be consistent with that of the existing structure. The proposed carport addition is consistent with the Guidelines.
- d. The applicant has noted that the materials used in the construction of the carport addition are to match those of the existing structure including the asphalt shingle roof. This is consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 3.A.i. The Guidelines for Additions 3.A.iii states that original roofs should be matched in both form and materials.
- e. According to the Guidelines for Additions 4.A.ii in regards to architectural details, new additions should contain architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. The applicant's proposal to match the materials of the original structure is consistent with the Guidelines.

March 6, 2015

3

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings a through e with the stipulation that the roofing materials of the carport addition match those of the existing structure.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Laffoon to approve with staff recommendation.

AYES: Guarino, Connor, Laffoon, Cone, Rodriguez, Judson

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED

7. HDRC NO. 2015-088

Applicant: Steve Haynes

Address: 202 Bushnell

Withdrawn per the applicant.

8. HDRC NO. 2015-023

Applicant: Jennifer Boone

Address: 415 E. Park Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 2-1/2 story single family house.

The proposed design will have a metal roof, vinyl windows, cement board plank and shingle siding and a rooftop balcony.

FINDINGS:

a. The applicant is currently working on expanding the west property line of the lot at 415 E. Park so that the lot width is sufficient to allow for a driveway for the new project.

b. The project was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on October 7, 2014, at that time Committee members were concerned with front yard parking, the disruption of historic pattern along the street, massing, the introduction of a front yard fence, and roof form. The Committee recommended extending the roof further over the deck, exploring adding more windows/articulation and revising the roof form. The project was presented to the DRC again on October 21, 2014, at that time committee members noted that front yard fencing, front yard parking, and the depth of the rooftop deck were a concern.

c. The case was heard by the HDRC on January 21, 2015. At that time the case was forwarded to the Design Review Committee. The DRC reviewed updated drawings on February 10, 2015, at that time the Committee determined many of the previous issues had been addressed but was concerned with the proposed design for the columns.

d. Consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction, new buildings should have a similar height and scale to adjacent buildings. The majority of the houses on this block of East Park are large and over 2 stories tall. The proposed design is appropriate for its context and in keeping with the guidelines.

e. According to the Guidelines for New Construction, front facades of new buildings should align with existing buildings when there is a consistent setback along the street. Houses on this block of East Park have an overall consistent setback that should be preserved. Although the front wall behind the porch on the main house aligns with front walls of adjacent houses, the solid two story portion of the house extends past the front wall of the adjacent houses which is not consistent with the guidelines.

f. The foundation of the proposed house will align with adjacent houses consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction. According to the guidelines, new construction should incorporate materials that complement historic materials in type, size and texture. The proposed hardi-shingle skirting material is consistent with the guidelines.

g. According to the Guidelines for New Construction, new buildings should incorporate similar roof forms and pitch that are consistent with other buildings on the block. The proposed gable roof design is typical of houses on the street and appropriate for this setting. The proposed metal roof is a traditionally used material in historic districts and consistent with the guidelines as long as the recommended detailing for metal roofs is used.

h. Consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction window and door openings should have a similar proportion of wall to window space as typical with nearby historic facades. Windows, doors, porches, entryways, dormers, bays, and pediments shall be considered similar if they are no larger than 25% in size and vary no more than 10% in height to width ratio from adjacent historic facades. The proposed double hung windows are consistent with the guidelines.

i. According to the Guidelines for New Construction, new buildings should be of their time while respecting the historic context. Architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face are recommended when they are simple in design and complement, but not visually compete with the character of the adjacent historic structures. The proposed Craftsman style columns visually compete with the surrounding historic structures and are not consistent with the guidelines. Simplified square or round columns would complement the adjacent houses and be more appropriate for their setting consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on findings a-i. Staff recommends conceptual approval of the design with the following stipulations:

- a. The front setback matches adjacent houses.
- b. The front porch columns are simplified.
- c. The roof incorporates panels that are 18-21” wide, ridges less than 2” high, and a double munched seam or low profile cap with no ridge vent.
- d. The drawings are further developed to reach at least 80% completion.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Connor to conceptual approve with staff recommendations.

AYES: Guarino, Connor, Laffoon, Cone, Rodriguez, Judson

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED

9. HDRC NO. 2015-078

Applicant: Ben Johnson
Address: 2507 Fredericksburg Rd.

Reset to March 18, 2015

10. HDRC NO. 2015-087

Applicant: Diane Hays
Address: 138 E. Hollywood Ave.

Postponed per the applicant.

11. HDRC NO. 2015-083

Applicant: Clint Belew
Address: 1011 S. Main Ave.

Withdrawn.

12. HDRC NO. 2015-080

Applicant: Long Standing Properties
Address: 205 Camargo

Withdrawn per the applicant.

March 6, 2015

5

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:45 A.M.

APPROVED


Michael Guarino
Chair

