

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
OFFICIAL MINUTES  
APRIL 7, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in a work session regarding the proposed UDC amendments at 2:00 p.m. in the Tobin Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.
- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Vice-Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

**PRESENT: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**ABSENT: Gonzalez, Salas**

- Chairman’s Statement.
- Citizens to be Heard:
- The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- |                       |                                 |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2010-018  | 401 S. Presa                    |
| 2. Case No. 2010-108  | 1426 Napier                     |
| 3. Case No. 2009-229  | 514 W. Commerce – Market Square |
| 4. Case No. 2009-244  | 514 W. Commerce – El Mercado    |
| 5. Case No. 2010-096  | 1801 Broadway                   |
| 6. Case No. 2009-309  | 108 Barrera Street              |
| 7. Case No. 2010-095  | 266 E. Rosewood                 |
| 8. Case No. 2010-092  | 118 W. Kings Highway            |
| 9. Case No. 2010-090  | 321 Alamo Plaza                 |
| 10. Case No. 2010-089 | 502 E. Nueva                    |
| 11. Case No. 2009-380 | 1111 S. Alamo <b>PULLED</b>     |
| 12. Case No. 2010-091 | 111 Soledad Street              |

Commissioner Shafer made a request to pull Case No. 2009-380 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Beyer to approve the remaining items on the Consent Agenda with staff’s stipulations.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

• **Annual Ethics Refresher Course**

**Presentation made by Camila Kunau, City Attorney’s Office**

**11. HDRC NO. 2009-380**

Applicant: Sprinkle & Co.

Address: 1111 S. Alamo

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval of signage.

1) Proposed signage consists of two neon signs affixed to the new elevator shaft and backed by painted metal plates. The Liberty Bar sign will be mounted on the east Sheridan Street façade and will have dark blue neon lettering. The background will be painted to match the elevator shaft and will have yellow neon letters on a dark blue painted background. Its area is 12sf. Total signage area will be 42sf.

Commissioner Shafer requested clarification on signage proposal.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve as submitted.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**HDRC Case No. 2010-111 was moved up on the agenda**

**16. HDRC NO. 2010-111**

Applicant: Edward Mery

Address: 900-1000 Block S. Alamo Street

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1) Construct traffic calming measures, in the form of bulb-outs, on a portion of S. Alamo Street, from Sheridan to Beauregard. There will be a total of 9 locations. Exterior finish material to include concrete and brick as proposed in the attached rendering.

Tim Sulluck, Southtown Chamber of Commerce, presented the project. The concept for the bump outs is to eliminate traffic on the right hand lanes on both sides of the street to help with speeding issues.

Commissioner Cabel feels that “no parking” signs would eliminate parking on the street that would keep the buses out of the middle lane.

Commissioner Brown questioned if there were bike lanes.

Tim Sulluck, applicant, stated there is no bike lane, however, Public Works Department intends to install a 48” bike lane in front of the bump outs.

Commissioner Carpenter suggested that the applicant further study the proposed size of the bump outs so that there will be sufficient planting area for the landscaping to survive.

Commissioner Cone stated he would like to review the proposed materials.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Beyer to approve with staff recommendations.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**RECUSED: Shafer**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**13. HDRC NO. 2010-076**

Applicant: Edward Flores

Address: 2230 W. Mistletoe

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to replace the deteriorated wood windows with vinyl windows.

Commissioner Maldonado made the on site committee report. She further indicated that the contractor has submitted a letter stating the same type of windows proposed have been installed in other districts. Commissioner Maldonado further stated she has asked the applicant to have the contractor submit the address where the proposed windows have been installed.

Edward Flores, applicant, stated many houses in the neighborhood have vinyl or aluminum windows.

Commissioner Cone suggested that staff look into the address and see if building permits were pulled.

Commissioner Cabel stated he has asked that consideration be given to use vinyl on rear and side windows. Also, when the rules & procedures were created for HDRC, two members would be required to attend on site committee meetings.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to refer back to an on site visit to allow more attendance by the commission with the stipulation that the window representative be in attendance for the on site visit.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**14. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-106**

Applicant: Alberto Isunza

Address: 426 Mission Street

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

- 1) Restore an existing single story bungalow using the original materials and finishes.
- 2) Demolition of a recent small addition on the back of the existing structure and a proposed 1,640sf single story addition on the back of the existing structure to include a master bedroom, a studio, a living area and a courtyard, with no exposure to the front of the property. One of the goals of the design is to conceal the addition from the street view, behind an existing 6' wooden fence as well as a landscape screen and to make clear the distinction between the existing building and the new and preserving the qualities of the original bungalow.

Alberto Isunza, applicant, gave an overview of the project.

Commissioner Carpenter gave the committee report.

Commissioner Cone stated he is concerned with the significant amount of impervious cover with roof that would redirect a significant amount of water to certain areas. The HDRC is not giving approval for any type of zoning change but rather looking at this from an appropriateness angle. Commissioner Cone further indicated he is concerned that the design documents are not 80% complete.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant conceptual approval with the stipulation that the applicant return with paint colors, stain color and additional material details.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**15. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-097**

Applicant: Stephen & Wanda Bartley

Address: 138 Laurel Heights Place

Steve Bartley, owner, presented proposed plans.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to refer to the Demolition Committee for an on site visit.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**17. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-094**

Applicant: Jason & Candace Martin

Address: 1601 Belknap

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

- 1) Re-roof using the same materials. An official inspection of the roof notes that it was improperly installed; shingles are loose and in some areas missing.
- 2) Extend roof from existing roof line to a new gable roof over garage. This new roof portion will be shingled using the same materials throughout the existing structure. The current flat surface of the garage does not allow for proper water run-off. It has caused water to leak into the structure and mold to permeate the walls.
- 3) Sand and repaint existing door with Signature Colors, Eddie Bauer Home, Coffee Bean EB47-1.
- 4) Demo entire attached "maid's quarters" and accompanying deck. Sod to be placed in the location for the only area considered a "backyard". The structure has a warped roof and has significant mold damage.
- 5) Repair damaged trim, soffit, fascia and sash throughout façade with like material. Will paint the repaired areas with the proposed trim color.
- 6) Change trim and sash color to an appropriate color reminiscent of a Tudor Style home.
- 7) Change base color of home (stucco) to a similar color: Valspar Historic Paint Colors supported by the National Trust for Historic Preservation, Del Coronado Tequila 3008-10C. Change trim and sash color to an appropriate color reminiscent of a Tudor Style home. The color choice is: Eddie Bauer Home Coffee Bean EB47-1.

Candace Martin, owner, presented proposed plan.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with the exception of item 2.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**18. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-065**

Applicant: Gilbert Ortiz

Address: 9822 Espada Road

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Demolish an existing residential building.
- 2) Construct new single family residence.

Eliterio Tinorio, applicant, presented the owners proposal.

Commissioner Cabel stated the owner has not provided enough information for economic hardship. Commissioner Cabel further indicated that the design does not fit into the Mission Historic District.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to refer the case to the Demolition Committee for an on site visit.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**20. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-110**

Applicant: Mary Beth Lytle

Address: 207 W. Mulberry

Withdrawn per the applicant.

**21. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-112**

Applicant: Barry & Bonnie Bankler

Address: 102 E. Kings Highway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace 17 windows on the east side of the 2<sup>nd</sup> story. The windows to be replaced were part of porches that were enclosed in the 1970's and were not original to the house. Replacement windows to be Anderson 400 Series wood clad, with composite vinyl exteriors.

Bonnie Bankler, owner, gave an overview of the project.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Beyer to approve with the stipulation that the muttoms be true divided light and that the mutton width match the existing muttoms.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**Commissioner Cabel requested item #24 be moved up.**

**24. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-102**

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 421 N. Olive

The applicant is requesting a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board to:

Order repairs to a single story wood framed structure. Post and beam foundation is listing with deteriorated posts and sills. Exterior wood walls have deteriorated wood members, holes and are in need of paint. Metal gable roof has rusted and has separated and/or lifted in areas. Rafters, ceiling joists, and overhand have deteriorated. Roof covering has a large hole on the south side of the structure. Structure is currently secured and only an exterior inspection was performed.

Benjamin Fleming, owner, stated they have contracted a structural engineer to evaluate the structure. The engineering report indicates that the structure is sound.

Commissioner Shafer stated that the home seems structurally sound.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to recommend repairs be ordered for the house at 421N. Olive Street.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**22. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-103**

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 606 Nolan

Owner was not present.

Commissioner Shafer stated the structure is in poor condition. Some elements of the home could possibly be salvaged.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Beyer to recommend demolition.

**AYES: Cabel, Beyer**

**NAYS: Cone, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**THE MOTION FAILED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to refer to the Demolition Committee.

**AYES: Shafer, Carpenter**

**NAYS: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Connor**

**THE MOTION FAILED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado for a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board for repairs to be made to the structure.

**AYES: Cone, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: Cabel**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**23. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-098**

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 110 Potomac Street

The applicant is requesting a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board to order repairs to be made to a two-story wood framed structure that has sustained fire damage. Post & beam foundation is listing at the front. Exterior wood walls are deteriorated, has holes, loose members, and in need of paint. Hip roof has sustained fire damage. Structure is currently secured and only an exterior inspection was performed.

Commissioner Shafer stated he feels the structure is in bad shape.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Connor for a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board for repairs to be made to the structure.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: Shafer**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**25. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-101**

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 417 N. Olive

The applicant is requesting a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board to order repairs to be made to a single story wood framed structure. Pier & beam foundation appears to be undergoing repairs. Transit and wood siding in deteriorated condition, holes, and loose and/or missing members, in need of paint. Metal gable roof in deteriorated. Large hole in south side of structure exposing the interior to the elements allow further deterioration. The structure is currently secure and only an exterior inspection was performed.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Connor for a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board for repairs to be made to the structure.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**26. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-100**

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 1623 E. Houston

The applicant is requesting a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board to:

1) Order repairs are made to a single story wood framed structure. Post & beam foundation appears to be undergoing repairs. Asphalt & wood shingle siding has deteriorated, cracked and loose members. Metal hip roof has deteriorated and worn. Deteriorated ceiling joists and overhang. Structure is currently secured and only an exterior inspection was performed.

2) Order repairs are made to a single story wood framed accessory structure.

Owner was not present.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer for a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board for repairs to be made to the structure.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**27. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-099**

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 1130 Mission Road

Owner was not present.

Anna Glover, OHP staff, read into the record a letter from the owner requesting demolition.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to refer to the Demolition Committee.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: Beyer**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**19. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-109**

Applicant: Hugh Daschbach

Address: 625 W. French Place

Applicant/owner was not present.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to reset the case to April 21, 2010.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

- December 16, 2009, January 6, 2010, January 20, 2010, and February 3, 2010 HDRC meeting minutes

Commissioner Cabel made corrections to the December 16, 2009 and January 20, 2010 minutes.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve the minutes, pending the corrections.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**RECESS 5:40 – 5:45 P.M. Commissioner Beyer left at 5:40 p.m.**

- **Signage Task Force – update**
- **HDRC recommendation of proposed UDC amendments – presentation & possible action**

Commissioner Shafer commented on Amendment #2

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to reinstate “historic exceptional and historic significant” through out the document.

**AYES: Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Connor**

**NAYS: Cone, Brown, Carpenter**

**THE MOTION FAILED.**

**Commissioner Shafer left at 6:10 p.m.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to reflect a notification sent to a property owner also be sent to the neighborhood association.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Brown and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado add in archeological reminder in Amendment #4.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Brown and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to reinstate National Register language criteria in Amendment #4.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to add "Visual impact on nearby historic resources" on Amendment #6.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to change verbiage on administrative approval on a C of A to reasonable paint changes on previously painted masonry.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to change verbiage on administrative approval on a C of A to reasonable paint changes on fabric awnings.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Brown and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to include paragraph from page 28 “HDRC shall be guided in its decision by...” copy from demolition section and add to relocation section on Amendment #10.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to direct staff to further define Loss of Significance, specifically giving examples in the UDC. Actions on the part of the owner should not be allowed to cause the loss of significance.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel that the language is consistent to also refer to HE/HS when referencing new historic landmark designation.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Brown to change “the structure **and** property” opposed to “structure **or** property” on Amendment #11.

**AYES: Cone, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**  
**NAYS: Cabel**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Brown to add in section under demolition for all structures and properties: to include securing of the structure of and if the property has received any tax exemptions and also if there is any additional information in the Code Compliance database about the property within a 5 year period.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Brown to consider a 2/3 vote of members present for demolition.

**AYES: Cone, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: Cabel**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve the remaining balance.

**AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:45 p.m.

APPROVED



Tim Cone  
Vice Chairperson