

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
OFFICIAL MINUTES  
MARCH 21, 2012**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

**PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**  
**ABSENT: Salas, Shafer**

- Chairman's Statement
- Announcements
- Citizens to be heard

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- |                      |                    |
|----------------------|--------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2012-053 | 110 Tuleta         |
| 2. Case No. 2012-069 | 140 E. Houston     |
| 3. Case No. 2011-094 | 315 E. Pecan       |
| 4. Case No. 2012-071 | 318 W. Houston     |
| 5. Case No. 2012-072 | 516 E. Courtland   |
| 6. Case No. 2012-073 | 559 E. Huisache    |
| 7. Case No. 2012-074 | 723 Donaldson Ave. |
| 8. Case No. 2012-075 | 801 N. Olive St.   |
| 9. Case No. 2012-077 | 3302 N. St. Mary's |

Commissioner Carpenter pulled items 1, 3, 6 and 7 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**1. HDRC NO. 2012-053**

Applicant: San Antonio Conservation Society

Address: 110 Tuleta

The applicant is requesting a finding of historic significance for the Alamo Stadium and Gymnasium at 110 Tuleta Drive. The site was added to the National Register of Historic Places in September, 2011.

Virginia Van Cleave read into the record a letter from San Antonio Conservation Society. When Alamo Stadium was completed in 1940 it was and continues to be the largest high school football stadium in Texas. It is an outstanding example of rustic Art Moderne institutional design of the New Deal Era. It is also distinguished for its display of large tile murals.

Commissioner Carpenter presented the committee report.

Kamal ElHaber, SAISD, presented.

Ed Garza, SAISD Board President, presented.

Dr. Perez, SAISD Superintendent, presented.

Bianca Maldonado stated she is in full support for a finding of historic significance.

Bob Buchanan stated he is in support for a finding of historic significance.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve of a Finding of Historic Significance for the Alamo Stadium and Gymnasium at 110 Tuleta Drive and a recommendation to City Council for designation as a Historic Landmark (HL). Local HL designation applies only to the exterior of the structures.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**RECUSED: Barrera, Zuniga**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**3. HDRC NO. 2011-094**

Applicant: Kimberly Mercer, AIA

Address: 315 E. Pecan

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace the built-up roof at the narthex and sacristy with a modified bitumen roof with stainless steel flashing
2. Repair gutters and replace downspouts
3. Repaint masonry
4. Repair stained glass windows and tracery and place protective covering over stained glass
5. Conduct below grade work to eliminate rising damp
6. Replace concrete paving with flagstone paving
7. Rebuild exterior stairs to be in compliance with current building code and finish with flagstone.
8. Replace handrails to be in compliance with building code
9. Install site lighting

- 10. Replace finials at the Parish Hall to match previously removed finials
- 11. Remove fountain and planting on west elevation

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve as submitted.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**  
**NAYS: None**  
**RECUSED: Guarino**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**6. HDRC NO. 2012-073**

Applicant: Jose J. Calzada

Address: 559 E. Huisache

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a new 6,200 sf. commercial office building and parking lot.

Paul Kinnison stated the property is significant to Monte Vista being an entrance into the district. It has been suggested that a row of trees be planted between the site and residential to west. The driveway proposed off of Mulberry should be pulled back 8 feet from property line.

Jose Calzada, applicant, presented.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to grant conceptual approval pending the resolution of the fencing and landscaping raised by Monte Vista Historic District.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**  
**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**7. HDRC NO. 2012-074**

Applicant: Kenneth Fowler, Rialto Studios

Address: 723 Donaldson Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Adopt a new Master Plan to guide the design, prioritization, phasing, and budgeting of site-related improvements to the campus. Proposed work includes the following:

1. Renovation of Pony Field with new irrigated turf for football and soccer, new bleacher seating with a small press box, and associated drainage improvements
2. New baseball and softball fields and appurtenant structures, with associated drainage improvements
3. New paved Band/ROTC marching field
4. New natural-turf soccer practice fields (to be located off-campus on property yet to be acquired)
5. Rehabilitation of school exterior areas - courtyards and other interstitial spaces
6. Lighting upgrades for Pony Field and overall campus
7. Rehabilitation of overall school landscape and irrigation
8. Accommodation of building expansion and new construction, including the demolition of one building and an addition to another
9. Rehabilitation of perimeter fencing
10. Removal of selected on-site parking to accommodate improved school program facilities
11. Reconfiguration of on-street parking for vehicles and busses on Donaldson Avenue and
12. Parking on Kampmann Boulevard
13. Reconfiguration of main vehicular entrance from Wilson Boulevard to improve pick-up / drop-off traffic flow
14. Resolution of on-site drainage issues
15. Renovation of Thespian Island

Ken Fowler, applicant, presented. Mr. Fowler stated they support the staff recommendations.

Commissioner Carpenter presented the committee report.

Commissioner Rodriguez stated she would like more information on the tree plan.

Bianca Maldonado stated the neighborhood has had the opportunity to meet with SAISD. The neighborhood believed that SAISD was applying for conceptual approval and not final approval. There are concerns with final approval going forward. The campus sits within the 100 year flood plain and all runoff must be mitigated to protect the Monticello Park Historic District. The school has a significant amount of illegal lighting that has been installed over the years. Sport field lighting will have a negative effect on the neighborhood. The proposed overflow parking area needs to be buffered for the residents of the 400 block of Club. The fencing proposed for the softball/baseball field are not appropriate and drastically out of scale. The view shed down Fur Drive has not been addressed in the master plan presentation. The residents are not in support of the Thespian Island in becoming part of the Thomas Jefferson High School Master Plan. There is concern to the removal of the trees. There should be great consideration as to what trees will be removed and what will be replaced.

Ferne Burney stated there is great concern with the stadium lighting.

Robert Sipes, President of Monticello Park Neigh. Assoc., stated that Monticello Park Neigh. Assoc. is generally supportive of the Master Plan. While there has been some progress there are three concerns to address; drainage, sports field lighting, and fencing. The greatest concern is over the lack of transparency in the process. The images shown and promises made at previous meetings have been completely removed from the official submission. Monticello Park Neigh. Assoc. respectfully asks that the Commission add the following stipulations: 1) Requirement that stormwater will be mitigated

on site, i.e. that any addition of the impervious cover or change in topography will not negatively affect the neighborhood. 2) Replacement of the sports field lighting with pedestrian scaled safety lighting. 3) Either removal of the outfield fences or a requirement that they be low (4' max) decorative fences. Requirement that no perimeter fencing be erected along Donaldson or Kampmann. 4) Requirement that the Thespian Island be removed from the scope of the master plan. The City of San Antonio is proposing to renovate this area using the 2012 Bond monies.

Kamal El Habr, SAISD, presented.

Ed Garza, SAISD Board, stated the plan is better and stronger with all the public input SAISD has received. SAISD must balance the needs of the process as well as the wishes of the residents. Most importantly Thomas Jefferson is a traditional public high school for the entire community.

Commissioner Carpenter stated the concerns for the drainage, lighting, and fencing are very valid. Through the HDRC and continued dialog there could be resolution.

Commissioner Rodriguez questioned the applicant on the detention pond and the existing elevations. Commissioner Rodriguez further questioned if the applicant is submitting for final, how the plan would incorporate the comments and input of the neighborhood association.

Ken Fowler stated there will be continued dialog and how the HDRC will vote.

Commissioner Guarino stated the value to the neighborhood of the historic school is as equitable and is as important as anything else in terms as its master planning.

#### **COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve with staff stipulations and the additional stipulation that any proposed lighting be reviewed against the NCD lighting requirements.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

#### **THE MOTION CARRIED.**

#### **23. HDRC NO. 2012-076**

Applicant: Corey Taylor

Address: 801 E. Quincy St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a new sign with wooden legs and vinyl face which will be 6' tall on the northeast corner of E. Quincy St. and Atlanta St.. The sign will include 18 square feet of signage (36" high by 72" long) and stand on 36" tall legs.

Corey Taylor, applicant, presented.

Jessica Phipps, owner, requested that HDRC not reduce the width of the sign to 48". The proposed width would not detract from the integrity of the building.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve with staff stipulations that the height of the legs be reduced to 12" for an overall height of 48" and that the width of the sign be reduced to 48".

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor**

**NAYS: Barrera, Zuniga**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**10. HDRC NO. 2012-018**

Applicant: Timothy K. Sanford

Address: 103 W. 9<sup>th</sup> Street

Postponed per the applicant.

**11. HDRC NO. 2012-051**

Applicant: Justin Carpenter

Address: 210 Thorain

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a porch on the front of the house.
2. Fill in the garage door opening with stone to match the existing, and install a window in its place (garage area has been converted into living space).

Justin Carpenter, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Carpenter presented the committee report.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve with staff's stipulation that the applicant remove the wood porch and construct a poured concrete porch in its place.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**12. HDRC NO. 2011-261**

Applicant: Randy Bartholomew

Address: 233 Leigh

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to construct a new one and a half story residence.

Randy Bartholomew, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Guarino presented the committee report.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve with staff stipulations.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**13. HDRC NO. 2012-060**

Applicant: Tom and Elizabeth Short

Address: 306 W. Elsmere

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install replacement windows in place of original windows at the rear of the house. This work was done without a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Tom Short, owner, presented.

Commissioner Carpenter presented the committee report.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve with DRC recommendations.

Vinyl replacement windows could remain if wood screens to replicate a historic pattern be installed over the windows to mitigate the appearance of the new vinyl windows. These screens are to be placed on both sides and the rear of the house.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**14. HDRC NO. 2012-065**

Applicant: John Green

Address: 115 Oakmont Court

Postponed per the applicant.

**15. HDRC NO. 2012-011**

Applicant: John Greene

Address: 119 Oakmont Court

Postponed per the applicant.

**16. HDRC NO. 2012-066**

Applicant: John Greene

Address: 146 Oakmont Court

Postponed per the applicant.

**17. HDRC NO. 2012-066**

Applicant: Ben Lopez, M & M Contracting

Address: 2350 Gillingham and 2486 Gillingham

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to demolish the structure.

Gregg Hammer, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Barrera presented the committee report.

Commissioner Connor stated he is concerned with the demolition as presented and also the future demolition of five more buildings as discussed in the on site committee meeting.

Commissioner Rodriguez stated by supporting demolition that is a threat and virtually unraveling of the historic district. The buildings are unique and represent national history.

Commissioner Cone stated two major items should be addressed if the applicant should return; a master plan should be submitted showing what buildings will be kept and what buildings will not be saved. Two buildings out of the mass are possibly acceptable but to not save close to half is troubling. HDRC needs to understand the full scope of what will be proposed. Also, if the applicant returns, please provide the discussions with the industry professionals (anyone who might be a potential

stakeholder) and the insurance and maintenance cost to the applicant.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to deny the demolition request for 2350 Gillingham and 2486 Gillingham.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**19. HDRC NO. 2012-064**

Applicant: A-1 South Texas Sign Erectors/Tejas Signs

Address: 607 Camden

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness to install one sign, measuring 18" high by 26' long (39 sq ft) consisting of internally illuminated channel letters on the north elevation. The sign will be located on the building's second story, 27.5' above the ground.

Bebb Frances, attorney for owner, presented.

Dr. Ganishpa, owner, addressed the Commission.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approval of signage as submitted.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**Commissioner Guarino left the meeting at 6:20 p.m.**

**20. HDRC NO. 2012-078**

Applicant: Mark and Tracy Lewis

Address: 118 W. Kings Highway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a side yard privacy fence along the east property line. The new fence will match the height and material of an existing fence located on the south and west sides of the property. The fence will be constructed of limestone and cedar. The base of the privacy fence will be made of stone to a

height of 5' and the top of the fence will be constructed of cedar for an additional height of 3' 9" for a total height of 8'9".

2. Extend the height of a portion of the existing fence along the west property line to a height of 8'3" to match the height of the rest of that fence.
3. Construct a new 5' metal fence in front of the house which would extend from the east property line across the front of the house the length of the outside porch.
4. Construct a metal fence to extend from the west property line to the house. The height of this fence will match the height of the neighboring fence, and will support vines.

Paul Schoenfield, applicant, presented.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve of items 1, 2, and 4 as submitted. Denial of item 3 pending discussion with Monte Vista Historic District.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**21. HDRC NO. 2012-079**

Applicant: John Carte and Itiel Saenz

Address: 337 W. Hollywood Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the original green Spanish tile roof with a new clay colored barrel tile roof.

John Carte, owner, presented.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve as presented.

**AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Rodriguez, Connor, Zuniga**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**22. HDRC NO. 2012-080**

Applicant: Scott E. Hays

Address: 351 E. Huisache

Withdrawn per the applicant.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:00 P.M.

APPROVED

  
Tim Cone  
Chair