

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
APRIL 21, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Gonzalez, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

ABSENT: Beyer, Salas

- Chairman’s Statement.
- Citizens to be Heard:
- Announcements: Preservation Month Activities
- The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|---------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2010-124 | 131 Taylor St. |
| 2. Case No. 2010-123 | 521 Madison |
| 3. Case No. 2010-122 | 335 Madison |
| 4. Case No. 2010-121 | 126 W. Rosewood |
| 5. Case No. 2010-118 | 100 E. Grayson, Bldg. 2 |
| 6. Case No. 2010-125 | 107 El Paso Bldg. 2 |
| 7. Case No. 2010-116 | 418 E. Locust St. PULLED |
| 8. Case No. 2010-106 | 426 Mission St. PULLED |
| 9. Case No. 2010-113 | 334 E. Summit PULLED |
| 10. Case No. 2009-256 | 317 Sadie St. |

Commissioner Cabel made a request to pull Case No. 2010-116 and 2010-106 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve the remaining items on the Consent Agenda with staff’s stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Gonzalez

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. HDRC NO. 2010 -116

Applicant: City of San Antonio, Office of Historic Preservation

Address: 418 E. Locust Street

The applicant is requesting a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board for demolition of the following:

1) Single story wood frame structure. Roof wood members are water damaged, rear portion of roof has collapsed, and interior walls are water damaged, vandalized and have holes. Exterior walls are listing and water damaged. Foundation, has failed, post have separated from floor beams. Front porch has separated from structure. Structure is posing a threat to life and safety.

DSDB recommends demolition per Chapter 6-156, subsections:

2) Single story wood frame shed. Roof, exterior walls, floors, interior wood members are water damaged and have holes.

DSDB recommends demolition per Chapter 6-156, subsections: 5, 7, 11, 12, and 15

Loretta Huddleston, San Antonio Conservation Society read into the record a letter from President Rollette Schreckenghost. SACS opposes demolition. The house contributes to Tobin Hill Historic District because of its age, architectural design and its scale.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve staff recommendations for necessary repairs to the home and approval for demolition of the accessory structure.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

8. HDRC NO. 2010-106

Applicant: Alberto Isunza

Address: 426 Mission Street

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to:

1) Restore an existing single story bungalow using the original materials and finishes.

2) Demolition of a recent small addition on the back of the existing structure, and a proposed 1,640sf single story addition on the back of the existing structure to include a master bedroom, a studio a living

area and a courtyard, with no exposure to the front of the property. One of the goals of the design is to conceal the addition from the street view, behind of an existing 6' wooden fence as well as a landscape screen, and to make clear the distinction between the existing building and the new, and preserving the qualities of the original bungalow.

Alberto Isunza, applicant presented general overview.

Commissioner Shafer expressed concerns with visibility from the street. A 6 foot fence would not be adequate to obscure the structure.

Commissioner Cone stated he would not feel comfortable voting on a Certificate of Appropriateness for something that zoning would need to restrict.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to refer to the Design Review Committee.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

9. HDRC NO. 2010-113

Applicant: Kathleen Viesca

Address: 334 E. Summit

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Install a 42-inch wide concrete flagstone sidewalk along the front property line. If flagstone is unacceptable, colored concrete would be preferred.
- 2) Replace an existing chain-link gate and fence with a wrought iron gate and fence.
- 3) Install 2 flagstone paths in front lawn area.

Kathleen Viesca, owner presented her request.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Cone to approve a 42" wide stained concrete sidewalk, flagstone path in front lawn and fence replacement.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

11. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-076

Applicant: Edward Flores

Address: 2230 W. Mistletoe

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to replace the deteriorated wood windows with vinyl windows.

Commissioner Cone made the committee report. The windows that have been ordered have an interior mutton which is inappropriate. A solution would be to place a wooden screen to provide the mutton pattern.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approval of 1 over 1 vinyl windows with a wood screen applied over the windows with the same minting design as the existing wood windows.

Consideration was given to the homeowner due to the hardship incurred.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

12. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-097

Applicant: Stephen & Wanda Bartley

Address: 138 Laurel Heights Place

The applicant is requesting a certificate of appropriateness to:

- 1) Demolish an existing garage and maid's quarters which have been attached. The applicant has provided a property inspection report from a licensed, professional inspector indicating the condition of the structure.
- 2) Construct a new gazebo in place of the existing garage. Construction materials to be wood, with green, asphalt shingle roof to match the existing house.

Steve Bartley, owner, presented proposed plans.

Commissioner Shafer presented committee report. Stated he observed rotting, termite damage, mold and asbestos shingles. Currently the structure is open to the elements.

Commissioner Connor stated he would be willing to support a demolition request but defer to the Demolition Committee.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve item 1 to demolish the existing garage & maids quarters and conceptual approval of item #2 with the stipulation that the owners meet with the Design Review Committee.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-109

Applicant: Hugh Daschbach

Address: 625 W. French Place

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to demolish a chimney located on the west facing roof and patch to match existing roofing material.

Applicant/owner not present.

Commissioner Cone feels there will be more requests for solar photovoltaic panels and could be handled correctly.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to grant denial of the applicant's request.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-099

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 1130 Mission Road

The applicant is requesting a recommendation to the Dangerous Structure Determination Board to:
1) Order the demolition of a single story wood framed structure. Foundation needs leveling, exterior walls; roof and overhang need repair/replacement.

2) Order the demolition of a single story wood framed accessory garage structure.

Diana Manila, owner presented case for demolition. The funds to repair the home would be an extreme economic hardship for her parents.

Commissioner Shafer presented committee report. The structure does have serious structural problems; slab porch is not connected to the structure and has a great deal of wood rot.

Commissioner Cone stated the garage and rear out building are very much a hazard and concur with demolition. The house structure does have structural concerns. There is severe differential movement in the floor structure, but beyond that the house is not a hazard.

Commissioner Shafer stated there is quite a bit of vacant land in the area.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado for a recommendation to the DSDB for demolition of the 2 out buildings and secure the main structure.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC CASE NO. 2009-139

Applicant: Bebb Francis

Address: 605 Camden

Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of medical facility. Project falls within the boundary of the River North Master Plan area. The proposed design is an attempt to adhere to the new Form Based Zoning requirements including:

1. parking concealed in the rear
2. building set backs that locate the building closer to the property lines
3. landscaped, pedestrian friendly, accessible walks,
4. building scale, height, and density according to T5 and T4 zone
5. façade elevations of scale, height and design appropriate to both neighboring properties

Francisco Gonzalez, applicant presented for final approval.

Commissioner Connor presented committee report.

Commissioner Carpenter stated from a material palette and usage it is a much stronger diagram with a strong tower element.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated there has been a great improvement of the project.

Commissioner Carpenter stated the material diagram is right.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter for approval of staff recommendations from stone to brick and the landscaping plan and signage plan to return to HDRC.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: Cone, Brown, Maldonado

THE MOTION FAILED.

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to refer to the Design Review Committee so that the applicant can present plans in context to clarify the landscaping, ramp and walkway.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-119

Applicant: David de la Hoya

Address: 328 Lexington

The applicant is requesting a Conceptual Approval for the following:

SITE WORK

- 1) Construction of approx. 130 linear feet of concrete block landscape/retaining wall, per attached drawings. The maximum finish height of any wall will be 9" below the bottom of foundation skirt. Exposed faces of all walls to be finished with horizontal strips of concrete, saw-cut from reclaimed concrete and set in mortar (similar to a brick installation).
- 2) Construction of approx. 105 linear feet of steel security fence on top of landscape/retaining wall, per attached plan and photographs.
- 3) Landscaping.
- 4) Tenant sign, to be located as shown on attached plan. Signage design will be submitted at a later date.

BUILDING MODIFICATIONS

- 1) New rear entrance, per attached drawings, including new accessible ramp.
- 2) Removal of side door and awning roof, north facade. Openings will be re-clad in wood siding, to match and join with existing wood siding.
- 3) Repair of wood siding, per attached annotated photographs.
- 4) Repair of front porch wood floor.
- 5) Repair or replacement of existing front concrete steps. If existing stairs cannot be repaired to code-

compliant state, they will be replaced with wood stairs and railings. Design of replacement stairs/railings to be submitted at a later date.

- 6) Replacement of 7 single-pane windows with double-hung windows to match existing.
- 7) Addition of foundation skirt along perimeter of exterior wall and shall extend down to existing grade. Skirt to be composed of wood siding to match existing wood siding, paint color to match existing.

Daryl Ohlenbusch, applicant, made a brief presentation.

Commissioner Maldonado asked the applicant to be respectful of the existing slope as opposed to turning it into a retaining wall and terracing it. There are landscaping opportunities without having to cut into it and changing the profile.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated he is sympathetic to the character define feature of landscaping, however he feels that retaining walls would be more appropriate.

Commissioner Connor stated retaining walls are very appropriate in this case. He also indicated that the structure would look much better without the two doors on the north side of the building.

Commissioner Shafer stated there should be a record of the fenestration elements. He further stated he is impressed with the landscaping plan.

Commissioner Cone stated he approves with the removal of the second door. The neighborhood has very few burms and feels that eliminating the berm would be appropriate. Concerning the vacant land, an option would be to move another house from the neighborhood to the vacant lot.

Commissioner Carpenter stated he has a concern with the cover entry in relationship to the rest of the building. The entry may be drawing a little more attention to itself.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant conceptual approval based on the discussion points.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Commissioner Brown left HDRC at 5:30 pm

18. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-117

Applicant: Ernesto Gomez

Address: 8100 S. Presa & 2310 Henderson Court

Mike Berg, applicant withdrew the case.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she would not support a chain link fence. She stated that there are other chain link fences in the area but possibly placed before the area was designated. Wrought iron would be more appropriate for new construction.

19. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-114

Applicant: Roy Galvan

Address: 432 Mary Louise

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Demolish a garage and covered car port.
- 2) construct new garage in front of existing garage and connect the two structures
- 3) replace wood windows on 1950's addition of main house

Roy Galvan, owner, made a brief presentation.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant conceptual approval with staff recommendations that the design be compatible with the style of the main historic house and not introduce new design elements such as arched openings. The main structure should be maintained without the addition of clerestory windows.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

20. HDRC CASE NO. 2009-385

Applicant: Jeremy August

Address: 501 Shook

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

- 1) Add a security wall to the perimeter of the property. The wall will be 6' on the sides and 3' in the front, with 1' wrought iron on top of it. It will be stucco and cinder block with pillars.
- 2) Restore a cement retaining wall at the edge of the property on Laurel Heights Blvd.

Applicant/owner was not present.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Cone to grant denial of the owner's request.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

15. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-065

Applicant: Gilbert Ortiz

Address: 9822 Espada Rd.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Demolish an existing residential building.
- 2) Construct new single family residence.

Owner not present.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to reset to May 5, 2010.

AYES: Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer' Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:45 p.m.

APPROVED



Xavier Gonzalez
Chairperson