

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
JANUARY 16, 2013**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 P.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

ABSENT: Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Zuniga

- Chairman’s Statement
- Election of Officers for 2013

Shanon Miller, Historic Preservation Officer, opened up the nominations for HDRC Chair.

Commissioner Carpenter nominated Commissioner Cone for Chairperson and was seconded by Commissioner Guarino.

No other nominations for HDRC Chair. Nominations closed.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Shanon Miller opened up the nominations for HDRC Vice-Chair.

Commissioner Connor nominated Commissioner Scott Carpenter for Vice-Chair and was seconded by Commissioner Barrera.

No other nominations for HDRC Vice-Chair. Nominations closed.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2012-314 | 100 W. Houston |
| 2. Case No. 2012-316 | 301 E. Travis |
| 3. Case No. 2013-015 | Park Drive at Mission Trail |
| 4. Case No. 2013-016 | 300 E. Houston |
| 5. Case No. 2011-222 | 429 W. Mistletoe |
| 6. Case No. 2007-266 | 1401 S. Flores |
| 7. Case No. 2012-191 | 604 Avenue A |
| 8. Case No. 2012-125 | 128 City St. |
| 9. Case No. 2012-024 | 2002 W. Gramercy |
| 10. Case No. 2013-012 | 1201 Navarro St. |
| 11. Case No. 2013-019 | 1024 S. Alamo |
| 12. Case No. 2013-010 | 1023 N. Pine |
| 13. Case No. 2013-008 | 254 E. Rosewood Ave. |
| 14. Case No. 2011-141 | 211 N. Alamo |

- 15. Case No. 2012-348 215 Barrera
- 16. Case No. 2013-022 559 E. Huisache Ave.
- 17. Case No. 2013-020 Market St. Realignment/Cesar Chavez & Alamo Complete Streets
- 18. Case No. 2013-023 Westside Landmarks

1202 Buena Vista St, 2322 Buena Vista St, 433 Castroville Rd, 915 Castroville Rd, 1107 Culebra Rd, 1408 El Paso St, 1412 El Paso St, 1426 El Paso St, 1302 Guadalupe St, 1001 N San Marcos, 1619 N San Marcos, 913 S Brazos St, 816 S Colorado St, 107 S Elmendorf, 115 S Zarzamora, 1403 Saunders, 1617 W Commerce St, 2300 W Commerce St, 3103 W Commerce St, 3526 W Commerce St, 1619 W Poplar St, 1115 Guadalupe St, 1107 Guadalupe St, 1601 Guadalupe St

- 19. Case No. 2013-021 801 E. Houston
- 20. Case No. 2013-013 337 W. Commerce

Commissioner Guarino pulled item 1 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Carpenter pulled item 18 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2012-314

Applicant: San Antonio Bike Share

Address: 100 W. Houston

Withdrawn per applicant.

18. HDRC NO. 2013-023

Applicant: Office of Historic Preservation

Address: Westside Lanmarks

1202 Buena Vista St, 2322 Buena Vista St, 433 Castroville Rd, 915 Castroville Rd, 1107 Culebra Rd, 1408 El Paso St, 1412 El Paso St, 1426 El Paso St, 1302 Guadalupe St, 1001 N San Marcos, 1619 N San Marcos, 913 S Brazos St, 816 S Colorado St, 107 S Elmendorf, 115 S Zarzamora, 1403 Saunders, 1617 W Commerce St, 2300 W Commerce St, 3103 W Commerce St, 3526 W Commerce St, 1619 W Poplar St, 1115 Guadalupe St, 1107 Guadalupe St, 1601 Guadalupe St

The applicant is requesting a Finding of Historic Significance for twenty-four properties that were surveyed as part of the Westside Cultural Resource Survey and identified as architecturally, historically and culturally significant. The Office of Historic Preservation held several public meetings as part of this process to solicit public feedback and to determine which properties were potentially eligible for landmark designation. The Westside Cultural Resource Survey initiative began in 2011 to identify, document, and protect places of significance on the Westside as a way of celebrating the rich history and cultural heritage of this part of San Antonio. In response to the recent loss of historic structures and efforts by the community to promote historic preservation, the OHP has partnered with a number of community organizations and volunteers to identify places that are significant to San Antonio’s Westside. Community partners include the Westside Preservation Alliance, the Esperanza Peace and Justice Center, the San Antonio Conservation Society, the Westside Development Corporation, and the Old Spanish Trail Centennial (OST 100). The properties identified as eligible for landmark designation here include both commercial and residential buildings.

The properties proposed for a Finding of Historic Significance are:

- NCB 2342 BLK 7 LOT 1
- NCB 2332 BLK 18 LOT 6 & W 30 FT OF 5
- NCB 8177 BLK 113 LOT 16, 17, 18 & P-105 (PT OF CLOSED ALLEY)
- NCB 11250 BLK LOT 5
- NCB 2072 BLK 4 LOT 1-2- 3
- NCB 2437 BLK D LOT 50 PLAZA GUADALUPE UNIT-4
- NCB 2437 BLK D LOT 49 PLAZA GUADALUPE UNIT-4
- NCB 2437 BLK D LOT W 43 FT OF 1 & W 43 FT OF N 22.9 FT OF 2
- NCB 2444 BLK 1 LOT 19 AND 20
- NCB 2158 BLK 3 LOT S 79.87 FT OF 24
- NCB 1013 BLK 3 LOT 25 ROBERT M ESCAMILLA SUBD
- NCB 2444 BLK 1 LOT S 37.75 FT OF 39 & 40 & LOT IRR SE 0.06 ACRES OF 42
- NCB 2440 (EL RINCONCITO SUBDIVISION), BLOCK 2 LOT 19
- NCB 2324 BLK 3 LOT S 60 FT OF 1 AND 2
- NCB 2322 BLK 1 LOT 7&8 AND 9
- NCB 2349 BLK 4 LOT 23 AND 24
- NCB 2302 BLK 4 LOT E IRR 42 FT OF 5 & NE TRI 26 FT OF 6
- NCB 2316 BLK 11 LOT 1 THRU 12 (97% OF TOTAL PROPERTY) REEFER TO 02316-011-0010 and NCB 2316 BLK 11 LOT 1 THRU 12 (3% OF TOTAL PROPERTY) REEFER TO 02316-011-0011
- NCB 2287 BLK 2 LOT 18, 19, 20, 21, & 22
- NCB 3681 BLK 89 LOT 13
- NCB 1041 BLK 4 LOT 20 NE TRI 21 FT OF 18 & E IRR 20.47 FT OF 19 AT 1619 POPLAR ST W
- NCB 2439 BLK 3 LOT 8
- NCB 2439 BLK 3 LOT 7
- NCB 2436 BLK B LOT 28B

FINDINGS:

- a. The structures identified here as eligible for historic landmark designation represent important examples of architectural styles and resources of historic and cultural significance. Based on the research conducted and public comments received throughout the process, these resources are valued by the Westside community.
- b. Over the course of the last year, more than 90 sites have been identified and researched. The survey is an ongoing initiative, and the 24 potential landmarks identified for designation here represent the first phase of landmark designation.
- c. Numerous public meetings have been held as part of this initiative, including a Kick-Off Event for the Westside Cultural Resource Survey in February 2011, a community meeting to solicit public feedback on the over 90 identified sites in August 2012, and a public meeting for property owners of selected potential landmarks in December 2012.
- d. As documented in the report titled "Westside Potential Landmark Designation Initiative Phase I" prepared by OHP staff, each of these twenty-four properties meets at least three of the Criteria for Evaluation, referenced above, in accordance with the process for considering designation of a historic landmark, as outlined in the UDC Section 35-607.

Staff recommends approval of a Finding of Historic Significance for the twenty-four properties specified above.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter for approval for a Finding of Historic Significance for the twenty-four properties specified above.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

21. HDRC NO. 2013-004

Applicant: Rosemond Properties, Inc.

Address: 342 Furr Dr.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a new retaining wall along the street edge in front of the existing house. The proposed wall would be tiered, with two levels and a 36" wide strip of landscaping between them. The wall will be poured concrete. Each section of the wall will be 12" high.

FINDINGS:

- a. Staff finds that currently there is no retaining wall at the street edge of this property and, in accordance with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 5.C, referenced above, retaining walls should not be introduced where they did not historically exist.
- b. While there are several examples of retaining walls at the street edge on this block of Furr Dr., staff finds that most of them are on the north side of the street—opposite 342 Furr—and have lawns with a more dramatic slope down at the sidewalk. The home at 342 Furr, as well as most of the homes on the south side of the block, have lawns with a more gentle slope down from the front of the buildings to the sidewalk, thus not requiring the construction of a retaining wall.
- c. Introducing a retaining wall in front of this home would significantly alter the appearance of the property from the street.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on these findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to deny based on findings.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

22. HDRC NO. 2013-017

Applicant: Amato Construction Services

Address: 130 Princess Pass

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a 600 square-foot, one-story addition to the west (rear) of the house. The addition will project approximately 8 feet off the north (side) façade and approximately 19 feet off the west (rear) façade. The addition will feature wood siding, trim, and roofing materials that match the existing materials of the house. New, one-over-one, single-hung aluminum windows to be installed in the addition will be concealed with wood screens to match the existing wood screens of the home.

FINDINGS:

- a. This particular structure is sited on a long, narrow lot and positioned on a slope. The addition to the rear and side of the structure would not be visible from the street consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 1.A.i.
- b. The roofline of the new addition would be similar but offset from the existing roofline, distinguishing the addition as a separate feature from the original structure consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 2.B.i and 2.B.v.
- c. The selected wood siding, trim, and roofing materials are appropriate for the style of the original structure consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 3.A.
- d. The submitted plans constitute the removal of 5, one-over-one original wood windows located on the back portion of the structure.
- e. The existing wood windows are in good condition, and could potentially be restored and reused in the addition. The preference of the applicant is to install new, energy efficient, single-hung aluminum windows. The applicant will either repair or replicate the existing wood screens found on the original structure to conceal the new aluminum windows.
- f. The applicant has agreed to donate the original wood windows to be reused for another project consistent with the Guidelines for Additions 3.C.i. if the HDRC does not require their reuse in the addition.

Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that any removed historic wood windows are restored and re-installed for use in the addition were allowable.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with the added stipulation that new wood sash windows are installed with a wood screen as agreed by the applicant, and that the original windows removed for the addition are donated for reuse.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

23. HDRC NO. 2013-014

Applicant: Esperanza Rendon

Address: 109 E. Woodlawn Ave.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing windows with new energy efficient windows in 5 locations of the home. The proposed new windows will be one over one vinyl frame.

FINDINGS:

- a. According to the Sanborn's Fire Insurance maps, this house was built between 1915-1924. Although the two story side sunroom and the front entry do not appear, a historic photo provided by the applicant shows they are both original to the structure.
- b. Windows are often character defining features of a house. Historic windows can be made energy efficient by making repairs and adding weather stripping. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations windows should be repaired rather than replaced. When damaged beyond repair, windows should be replaced in kind to match existing in size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance and detail. Vinyl is incompatible with historic materials and not an appropriate replacement for wood.
- c. The aluminum frame louvered window to the back of the home is likely not original to the structure. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations non-historic windows should be replaced with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building. Installing a one over one window instead of a louvered window is appropriate in this case.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. Staff recommends that the non-original window is replaced and that all other windows are repaired rather than replaced. If windows are damaged beyond repair, staff recommends in kind replacements to match existing.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter that the applicant work with staff on window material and design.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

24. HDRC NO. 2013-013

Applicant: Charles Barron

Address: 106 E. Lullwood

January 16, 2013

6

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace 20, original, double-hung wood windows at the residence with matching, Marvin Wood Ultimate Insert Double-Hung units. The replacement windows will be painted a terra-cotta color with Taupe Grey trim, same as existing.

FINDINGS:

- a. A site visit was conducted by staff on January 7, 2012. At that time, it was noted that the windows identified for replacement were in good condition, and that additional weather stripping and maintenance would restore the windows to efficient working order.
- b. Replacement windows often feature glazing that is highly reflective or tinted in nature, such as low-e glazing. Replacement glass should be close in appearance to historic glass in tint and reflectivity pursuant to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.vi.

Staff does not recommend approval. The windows identified for replacement are not deteriorated to an extent that warrants full replacement. Staff recommends that these windows be individually weatherized and maintained as necessary. If window replacement is approved by the HDRC, staff recommends the added stipulation that the selected glazing be colorless glass of the lowest reflectivity level possible.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to refer to an onsite visit.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:35 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair