

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
OCTOBER 6, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 1:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Gonzalez, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

ABSENT: Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Shafer

- Chairman’s Statement.
- Citizens to be Heard:
- Announcements:
Preservation Networking Event
Archaeology Month Event

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|---|
| 1. Case No. 2010-356 | 3875 N. St. Mary’s Street PULLED |
| 2. Case No. 2010-359 | 105 S. St. Mary’s Street |
| 3. Case No. 2010-360 | 225 Madison |
| 4. Case No. 2010-125 | 107 El Paso St. (Bldg. #2) |
| 5. Case No. 2010-362 | 1001 S. Alamo |
| 6. Case No. 2010-364 | 186 Thorain |
| 7. Case No. 2010-367 | 600 E. Market PULLED |
| 8. Case No. 2010-368 | 105 Callaghan |
| 9. Case No. 2010-371 | 1123 Avenue B |
| 10. Case No. 2007-130 | 409 E. Houston |
| 11. Case No. 2010-358 | 3801 Broadway |
| 12. Case No. 2010-369 | 2201 Broadway |
| 13. Case No. 2010-350 | 536 Adams |

Commissioner Carpenter made a request to pull Case No. 2010-356 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Connor made a request to pull Case No. 2010-367 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2010-356

Applicant: City of San Antonio Parks & Recreation

Address: 3875 N. St. Mary's Street

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a 24" x 18" cast bronze plaque mounted on loose stone at ground level identifying the AIA San Antonio 25 year award in recognition of outstanding architectural design and achievement for the Japanese Tea Garden.

Commissioner Carpenter stated he would like to give recognition to the accomplishment of the Japanese Tea Garden.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cone to approve as submitted.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. HDRC NO. 2010-367

Applicant: Grand Hyatt of San Antonio

Address: 600 E. Market

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Place additional words and logos to an existing monument sign in the plaza for new businesses located inside the hotel.
- 2) Install a new menu board on the river level for the existing restaurant.
- 3) Install a shade canopy over outside seating area of the Lobby Bar.

Commissioner Connor stated he is concerned with the canopy design. There is a need for a canopy however the concern is the esthetics.

Mike Sedgemen, applicant, the curb design was just a suggestion by the architect.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Cone to approve items 1 and 2. Applicant to return to Design Review Committee with item 3.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC NO. 2010-370

Applicant: Wiese Hefty Design Build

Address: 109 W. Elsmere

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

- 1) (a) Construct a small swimming pool along with some additional stone paving in front of the garage and adjacent to the existing stone patio in the backyard. (b) A fence made of masonry block with a stucco finish built to match the existing fence along the alley will be added in front of the swimming pool for increased privacy and will include a wooden gate made of cedar planks which will open on to the existing driveway.
- 2) (a) Replace the existing garage door with a bi-folding door made of a wood frame and glazed panels. (b) add a cupola atop the roof ridge to allow more light into the space. Clay roof tiles removed for the addition of the cupola will be reused in the roof over the cupola. Operable awning windows will be used in the cupola for ventilation and the exterior material on the cupola will be cedar plank siding. (c) One small window and one door on the side of the garage will be removed and replaced with French doors that open onto the existing stone patio.

Commissioner Carpenter made a committee report. Concur with staff recommendations for 1(a) and 1(b)

Kristen Hefty, owner, presented her request.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant conceptual approval of the newly revised plan submitted on 10/1/10.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

15. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-361

Applicant: Traube Canvas Products

Address: 109 & 115 Alamo Plaza

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Add 2 awning signs for the Grand Promenade. One will be 2' high, 2' deep and 5' - 7" long. The other will be 1' - 9" high, 6' - 8" deep and 5' - 6" long. Color of material will be medium blue.
- 2) Replace 6 existing pennants with new ones. Color to match awnings and include the initials GP as a logo.

Todd Traube, applicant, stated the owners will address the master signage plan request.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Connor to delay action until a master signage plan is submitted.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-065

Applicant: Gilbert Ortiz

Address: 9822 Espada Rd.

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval for approval to construct an addition to the rear of the house.

Commissioner Carpenter made a brief committee report.

Al Tenorio, applicant, made a presentation.

Commissioner Cone stated the revised plans are more respectful of the house.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant conceptual approval of the new revised plan submitted 10/6/10.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-294

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: Crossover Properties LP

Address: 618 Broadway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic Significance.

Jody Williams, San Antonio Conservation Society, made a statement for items 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22 and 23. The changes that have been made over the years to these properties are not irreversible. Each of them retains the important architectural characteristics which distinguish them as potential historic landmark buildings in the River North area. The SACS supports a finding of historic significance for 618, 801 and 701 Broadway, 411 Dallas, 217 Arden Grove, 624 N. Alamo and 803 Brooklyn.

Commissioner Cone stated the building has been altered significantly.

Anna Glover, OHP staff, stated the owner was unable to attend but was highly opposed to the designation.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to not recommend a finding of historic significance for 618 Broadway based on staff's recommendation.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

4. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-125

Applicant: RVK Architects

Address: 107 El Paso St. (Bldg. #2)

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Landscape the parking lots.
- 2) Install fencing and gates.
- 3) Install a monument sign.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Salas and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Gonzalez

THE MOTION CARRIED.

18. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-291

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: CBM Broadway LTD

Address: 801 Broadway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic Significance.

Robert Hanley, representative for owner, stated the owner opposes the designation.

Commissioner Cone stated the structure has little alteration. The building is in a strong location. He further stated the building has enough historical features for designation.

Commissioner Shafer stated the structure is worthy of designation.

Commissioner Cone stated the structure is unique example of its time.

Commissioner Carpenter stated the structure has had minor changes and its upkeep has been excellent.

Commissioner Guarino stated the detailing is clearly evident on the building.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated the building is nice but feels it is not historic.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve a finding of historic significance for 801 Broadway.

AYES: Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino

NAYS: Gonzalez, Connor

THE MOTION CARRIED.

19. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-292

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: Smothers-Bruni LTD Etal c/o Will Ochse

Address: 701 Broadway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic Significance.

Will Oxy, representative for owners, stated one of the owners does have interest in historic buildings however feels the structure at 701 Broadway does not. The building has been substantially altered.

Commissioner Cone stated there is enough of the historic fabric intact. The first floor bays have been in filled but could return to a significant structure with effort.

Commissioner Shafer stated the second floor is intact.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cone to approve a finding of historic significance for 701 Broadway.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino

NAYS: Connor

THE MOTION CARRIED.

20. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-280

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: Ann Hopman Hester

Address: 411 Dallas

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic Significance.

Elizabeth Porterfield, OHP Staff, stated the owner is opposed to the designation.

Commissioner Cone stated alterations have been made but could they could be reversed. The structure is a good example of a Queen Ann style in the neighborhood.

Commissioner Shafer stated the roof has been least altered.

Commissioner Guarino stated he has a problem with designation of the structure considering its condition.

Commissioner Connor stated he is concerned with designating too many properties and what could happen to the potential economic viability to some of the areas in the city.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve a finding of historic significance for 411 Dallas.

AYES: Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino

NAYS: Gonzalez, Connor

THE MOTION CARRIED.

21. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-282

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: Richard E. Langlois

Address: 217 Arden Grove

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic

Owner not present.

Commissioner Cone stated there have been alterations to the structure but as a whole it was intact for consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve a finding of historic significance for 217 Arden Grove.

AYES: Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino

NAYS: Gonzalez, Connor

THE MOTION CARRIED.

22. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-284

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: Mission Alamo Inc.

Address: 624 N. Alamo

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic

Owner not present.

Commissioner Cone stated the alterations made to the structure could be reversed and the predominant percentage was significant and intact.

Commissioner Connor stated the corner tower is distinctive.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve a finding of historic significance 624 N. Alamo Street for the tower element on the structure.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

23. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-286

Applicant: Designation & Demolition Committee of the HDRC

Owner: Liberty Properties

Address: 803 Brooklyn

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for Finding of Historic Significance.

Owner not present.

Commissioner Cone stated the building has been well maintained and alterations that have been made did not significantly alter the building.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve a finding of historic significance for 803 Brooklyn.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter

NAYS: Connor, Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

OTHER ITEMS:

- Appointments to Designation & Demolition Committee & Design Review Committee.
- Recommendation of proposed changes to signage sections of UDC

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cone to recommend approval of proposed changes to signage sections of UDC.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- May 19 & June 2, 2010 minutes.

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cone to approve May 19 & June 2, 2010 minutes.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:30 p.m.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chairperson