

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
JUNE 5, 2013**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 P.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor
ABSENT: Valenzuela, Salas, Rodriguez

- Chairman’s Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--------------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2012-229 | 9650 Espada Rd. |
| 2. Case No. 2013-109 | Brooks Schools of Aerospace Medicine |
| 3. Case No. 2013-141 | 1115 S. St. Mary’s |
| 4. Case No. 2013-151 | Inlet Plaza off of Josephine St. |
| 5. Case No. 2013-157 | 2332 N. St. Mary’s |
| 6. Case No. 2013-156 | 2250 Avenue B |
| 7. Case No. 2013-090 | 1815 Fredericksburg |
| 8. Case No. 2013-148 | 823 E. Magnolia |
| 9. Case No. 2013-158 | 114 Princess Pass |
| 10. Case No. 2013-162 | 554 W. Broadview |
| 11. Case No. 2013-159 | 1915 Broadway |
| 12. Case No. 2013-155 | Beacon Hill Linear Park |
| 13. Case No. 2013-154 | 144 Thorain |
| 14. Case No. 2009-106 | 117 E. French Place |
| 15. Case No. 2013-160 | 600 E. Market |
| 16. Case No. 2012-343 | 300 Blue star |
| 17. Case No. 2013-127 | 4919 Charles Katz Dr. |
| 18. Case No. 2013-152 | 115 W. Magnolia |
| 19. Case No. 2013-149 | 903 N. St. Mary’s St. |
| 20. Case No. 2013-089 | 1924 Howard |

Items 3, 13, 16 and 17 were pulled from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

3. HDRC NO. 2013-141

Applicant: John Harrison

Address: 1115 S. St. Mary’s

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct an exterior stair and deck at the rear of the building to include a wood screen and HVAC enclosure;
2. Install a 4-foot cedar and wire fence at the rear of the property to enclose an existing play area; and
3. Paint the entire building a blue-green color with white trim and red accents.

FINDINGS:

- a. The proposed stair is necessary to provide an additional means of egress for the building. It is located entirely at the rear of the building and would not be highly visible from the public right-of-way.
- b. The proposed construction and materials selection are consistent with the style and materials of the historic building. The screening and balusters are simple in design, consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 2.B.iv.
- c. The proposed fencing is appropriate for the property and within the King William Historic District, and is limited to the rear of the property. The proposed fence is consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 5.B.v.
- d. The selected paint colors are consistent with the style of the structure and represent a palette that is appropriate within the King William Historic District.

Staff recommends approval as submitted based on the findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Shafer as submitted based on findings a through d.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC NO. 2013-154

Applicant: Carl Lobitz

Address: 144 Thorain

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace the existing concrete walkway approach with crushed granite. The existing concrete approach is approximately 4 feet wide and the proposed crushed granite will maintain the same dimension.
2. Replace a strip of grass on the west side of the existing concrete driveway with crushed granite. The proposed crushed granite will be installed between the existing driveway and an existing stone curb feature approximately 5 to 6 feet west of the driveway.

FINDINGS:

- a. Staff finds that the existing concrete approach to the home is a character defining feature of the property and that throughout Olmos Park Terrace, walkway approaches are typically concrete.
- b. The existing concrete walkway approach is in disrepair.

c. The proposal to replace the concrete approach with crushed granite of the same dimension represents a change of material, but will maintain the existing rhythm established by concrete approaches to homes along Thorain.

d. While the proposed replacement of the approach with crushed granite would be a potentially reversible modification, staff finds that every effort should be made to replace the approach in kind with concrete, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 5.A.ii.

e. Installing crushed granite along the west side of the existing driveway should incorporate plantings, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 3.B.iii.

1. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted. Staff recommends that the applicant replace the concrete approach in kind based on findings a and d.

2. Staff recommends approval with the stipulation that plantings be incorporated into the crushed granite strip based on finding e.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant denial of item 1. Approval of item 2 with the stipulation that plantings be incorporated into the crushed granite strip based on finding e.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC NO. 2012-343

Applicant: Irby Hightower, Alamo Architects

Address: 300 Blue Star

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to:

Redevelop Blue Star II, which is the former Big Tex Grain site just south of the existing Blue Star Arts Complex on the San Antonio River. The proposed site will include mixed-use development with approximately 321 apartments and 6,500 square feet of commercial space. Blue Star St. runs through this site and development will occur along both sides with three and four story buildings. Parking will be accommodated with a surface lot screened from the river by a building, on-street parking along Blue Star St. and a parking garage wrapped on all sides with residential units and commercial space. The project will also tie into the existing hike-bike trail along the river through a small plaza with outdoor seating surrounded by commercial spaces. The site will include a courtyard for residents which will also connect to the hike-bike trail.

The existing nine-story grain elevator attached to metal silos will be stabilized. There are seventeen corrugated metal silos and other remnants of grain loading structure and processing silos on site which are proposed to be partially or entirely dismantled and reused as landscape elements including shade structures, seat walls, privacy fences, and possibly work spaces.

FINDINGS:

a. This request received conceptual approval on December 19, 2012, with the following stipulations: that the site's connection to the river continue to be developed; that the existing grain building be retained for eventual reuse; and that at least four of the existing small silos be reused onsite. Staff finds that this application for final approval addresses each of the approved stipulations.

b. This application was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on November 27, 2012, at which time the committee noted the challenges of this site in terms of its long, narrow orientation, bordered by railroad tracks on one side and the San Antonio River on the other. The committee found that the proposed site plan is appropriate in terms of connecting this site to the Blue Star Arts Complex, but noted that it would be very important to continue the existing street through the site and

reconnect to Probandt. The committee also suggested that the applicant continue to develop the connection between this site and the hike & bike trail that passes it on the river side. The committee found that the applicant's intent to create a multi-use street through the site is appropriate and should be examined at the pedestrian scale on the river side of the property.

c. The proposed site plan for this property is consistent with the design objectives for RIO-4 as defined in the UDC Section 35-670.b, referenced above.

d. This site represents the transition from low density residential areas to industrial and higher density residential and mixed use sites. Due to this situation and in keeping with the UDC Section 35-670.b, staff finds that a higher density mixed use development is appropriate here.

e. Staff finds that the proposed scale of this development is appropriate for the location and will not adversely impact the San Antonio River.

f. The proposal to maintain and preserve some of the existing original architecture on the site, including the large grain building and some of the smaller silos, is appropriate and consistent with the UDC Section 35-670.b.

g. While placing a parking garage in a fairly prominent location on the site is not ideal, staff finds that wrapping it with residential units will help conceal the vehicles contained within and break down the scale of this structure. This gesture is also consistent with the UDC Sections 35-672.b and 35-673.m.

h. The proposed new buildings on this site respect the pedestrian scale through articulated facades and the use of awnings and balconies to help enliven the street edge. The concepts shown in these massing models and renderings are consistent with the UDC Section 35-674.a and 35-674.b, referenced above.

Staff recommends approval based on these findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve as submitted based on findings a through h.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC NO. 2013-127

Applicant: Michael Beaty

Address: 4919 Charles Katz Dr

No action was taken due to lack of quorum

21. HDRC NO. 2013-144

Applicant: Charlotte Wilson

Address: 259 E. Lullwood

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install 250 square feet of Dow Powerhouse solar shingles on the south-facing roof slope at 259 E Lullwood. The requested solar shingles install flush-mounted to the roof in a similar application as traditional shingles.

FINDINGS:

- a. The house at 259 E Lullwood was constructed circa 1930 in the Tudor Revival style. It has a steep, side-gabled roof at the front façade with a street-facing slope. It is a contributing property to the Monte Vista Historic District.
- b. The street-facing slope of the side-gabled roof is visible from the front of the property, although some existing vegetation does partially block direct views to the roof. Due to its visibility from the street, any change in materials to the roof should complement the historic integrity of the block.
- c. Staff finds that the requested solar shingles, although less prominent than raised solar panels, are a significant departure from traditional roofing materials found within the Monte Vista Historic District in terms of dimension, finish and profile.
- d. Staff has previously issued administrative approval for both solar panels and solar shingles located behind the side-gabled portion of the roof away from the street as well as on the garage at the rear of the property. The applicant has also received approval to replace the current roof with gray asphalt shingles. The current HDRC request is specific to the placement of solar shingles on the street-facing slope which offers preferred southern exposure.

Staff does not recommend approval based on the findings.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve with the stipulation the remainder of the roof is matched as closely as possible in color based on reversibility of the product.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: Carpenter

THE MOTION CARRIED.

22. HDRC NO. 2013-146

Applicant: Esteban Reyna

Address: 211 W. Wildwood

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1. Replace existing shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof. The proposed roof will be slate blue.
- 2. Construct a front porch. The proposed porch will extend 3 ft. from the front wall and will be supported with two 4"x4" columns, one at each corner of the existing stoop. The proposed porch will match the front porch of a similar house on Mariposa Street.

FINDINGS:

- a. Olmos Park Terrace was originally platted in 1931 by the Northside Improvement Company, with developer H.C. Thorman as president. Houses developed by H.C. Thorman were constructed of stone veneer over reinforced concrete with attached garages.
- b. According to the 1938 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, the house at 211 W. Wildwood was built in 1938 as part of the Olmos Park Terrace development in an English stone cottage style.
- c. English stone cottages throughout the Olmos Park Terrace Historic District typically have shingle roofs. Consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, a standing seam metal roof is not a typical roofing material found on stone houses within the district and the introduction of a metal roof would cause adverse effect to the structure and the district.

d. Many of the stone houses within the district have a small porch or roof overhang over the front door. Although, as seen on the 1911-1951 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map the house originally did not have a front porch, the design of this small addition will not detract from the integrity of the house or the district. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations this element is appropriate for the style and the historic pattern of the area.

1. Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. If a standing seam metal roof is approved, staff recommends that the new roof color is galvalume and not slate blue, that it not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double much seam instead, that ridges are less than 2" high and panels are 18-21" wide.
2. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on the findings above.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve staff recommendation that the new roof color is galvalume and not slate blue, that it not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double much seam instead, that ridges are less than 2" high and anels are 18-21" wide.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

23. HDRC NO. 2013-161

Applicant: Christina Villegas

Address: 379 Quentin

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace all existing wood frame windows with vinyl windows. The windows to the front of the house will have false divided lights and will be covered with wood screens.

FINDINGS:

- a. Windows are character defining features of historic buildings. Historic windows can be energy efficient when properly maintained. According to the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations windows should be repaired rather than replaced. If windows are deteriorated beyond repair, they should be repaired in kind to match existing in size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail. Pictures provided by the applicant show that although the windows are in disrepair, most of the existing windows are not damaged beyond repair.
- b. False divided lite windows are not an in kind replacement for true divided lite windows. Vinyl frame windows are not an in kind replacement for wood windows.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. If the request is approved, staff recommends including the following stipulations: that true divided lites are used and not false divided lites, that the replacement windows have the lowest reflectivity glass available, and that all windows are covered with wood screens.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to deny applicants request for vinyl windows. The front facing windows must be maintained or replaced with in kind material. The remaining windows must be repaired or replaced with in kind material.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

24. HDRC NO. 2013-150

Applicant: Tom Carle

Address: 301 W. Lullwood

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a freestanding L-shaped wooden ramp from the east-facing side door of the home at 301 W. Lullwood Avenue to the existing driveway at the rear of the home. The proposed ramp will rise to a level of approximately 24-26 inches and will have wooden handrails and a composite decking. The applicant proposes to screen the ramp with bushes similar to those already on the property.
2. Replace the existing side metal screen door with a new metal storm door of the same dimensions and repair the existing side door.

FINDINGS:

- a. According to the Monte Vista Historic District survey, the home at 301 W. Lullwood Avenue was built in 1927 in the Tudor style. It is considered a contributing feature to the district.
- b. The house at 301 W. Lullwood Avenue is at the corner of W. Lullwood Avenue and Belknap Street. The back of the property faces Hildebrand Avenue, which is the northern boundary of the Monte Vista Historic District. Belknap Street runs along the east side of the property.
- c. The proposed ramp will be located on the side of the home rather than the front and will be set back behind the front façade of the building, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 8.B.ii.
- d. The location of this home on a prominent corner property means that a ramp on the east side of the building will be visible from the street. However, there is not a door on the west side of the home and there is limited space for a ramp at the rear of the property.
- e. The design of the proposed ramp will allow it to be freestanding and it will not attach to the existing home, thus not causing permanent damage to the historic structure. Similarly, it will not require the modification of any existing door or opening. This is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 8.A.ii and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 10.
- f. Currently, there are several small trees/bushes located on the east side of the home which will serve to partially screen the proposed ramp from view. The applicant's proposal to plant more landscape elements similar to the existing is appropriate and will continue to screen the ramp from view from the street. Staff finds that a dense hedge of a sufficient height to fully screen the proposed ramp is appropriate. This is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 8.C.ii.
- g. The proposed use of wood for the structure of the ramp is compatible with the style and materials of the home. Simple wood railings, as proposed, in a color compatible with the structure will be visually unobtrusive, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 8.C.i.
- h. Staff finds that the circumstances in this case present a hardship and that a ramp is necessary to allow the homeowner to access the building. However, staff finds that this solution should not be left in place permanently. Reapplying to keep the proposed ramp in place each year until it is no longer needed would ensure that the solution is temporary for the duration that it is required.
- i. The applicant met with the Monte Vista Historical Association's Architectural Review Committee (ARC) on June 4, 2013. The committee found that screening the proposed ramp with a dense hedge and ensuring that this solution is in place only as long as it is needed will help minimize the impact of the ramp.
- j. The proposal to replace the existing metal screen door with a new metal storm door will not significantly alter the appearance of the home from the street or have an adverse effect on the historic integrity of the property.
- k. Repairing the existing side door, which is behind the existing screen door, will help preserve the historic integrity of the property and is in keeping with the Historic Design Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Section 6.A.ii.

1. Staff recommends approval based on findings c through h with the following stipulations:

1. The ramp be painted a similar color to the trim on the house based on finding g.
2. The ramp be screened by a dense planted hedge of at least 4 to 5 feet in height based on findings f and i.
3. The applicant or homeowner reapply to the Office of Historic Preservation each year to keep the proposed ramp in place as long as it is needed based on findings h and i.

2. Staff recommends approval as submitted based on findings j and k.

Approved with staff recommendation.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve with staff recommendations based on findings a through k.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:30 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair