

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
AUGUST 17, 2011**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

ABSENT: Carpenter, Beyer

- Chairman's Statement
- Announcements
- Citizens to be Heard

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|----------------------|--|
| 1. Case No. 2011-148 | VFW Blvd @ San Antonio River |
| 2. Case No. 2010-171 | 313 Alamo Plaza
211 S. Flores (Bexar County Garage)
S. Alamo & Pereida St. (Liberty Bar Parking Lot)
1015 Navarro (Hotel Havana)
COSA – Office of Environmental Policy |
| 3. Case No. 2011-159 | 610 S. Frio Street |
| 4. Case No. 2007-193 | 1734 – 1826 Broadway |
| 5. Case No. 2011-110 | 517 N. Presa |
| 6. Case No. 2011-167 | 612 Urban Loop (617 Santa Rosa) |
| 7. Case No. 2011-164 | 108 E. Mistletoe |
| 8. Case No. 2011-163 | 155 Crofton |
| 9. Case No. 2011-158 | 808 E. Quincy |

Commissioner Maldonado pulled item 2 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Cabel pulled items 4 and 6 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

2. HDRC NO. 2011-171

Applicant: COSA – Office of Environmental Policy

Address: 313 Alamo Plaza – 211 S. Flores – S. Alamo/Pereida St. – 1015 Navarro

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Install additional B-Cycle Stations in multiple areas of Downtown San Antonio. (Phase II)
 - 313 Alamo Plaza
 - 211 S. Flores (Bexar County Garage)
 - Pereida St. (Liberty Bar Parking lot)
 - 1015 Navarro (Hotel Havana)

Catherine Ganey, Program Director, presented.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she is concerned with lack of details for the B-Cycle location at 313 Alamo Plaza.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve the B-Cycle Stations located at 211 S. Flores, Pereida St. and 1015 Navarro. The B-Cycle Station for 313 Alamo Plaza referred to an on site committee meeting.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

4. HDRC NO. 2007-193

Applicant: Criterion Broadway, LP

Address: 1734 – 1826 Broadway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Construct a mixed use project consisting of 230 multifamily units, office space, and retail and related recreational spaces.

Bret Riddick, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

6. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-167

Applicant: Tollette Construction Company

Address: 612 Urban Loop (617 Santa Rosa)

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Remove two existing brick chimneys at the rear of the structure. Use brick salvaged from chimneys to replace brick damaged by penetrations for electrical and mechanical systems and other alterations to the facades of the building.
- 2) Include an option in the plans to replace the existing wood columns at the front entry with fiberglass columns of the same dimension and design.
- 3) Replace existing attic window at the rear of the building with a louvered vent.
- 4) Close up two existing cellar window openings at the rear corner of the South elevation with 4" CMU. Masonry to be installed flush with the inside wall to maintain recessed appearance of existing openings.

These requests are part of a larger exterior restoration project under administrative review by staff.

Trey Tollette, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Shafer stated the proposed changes are significant.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

10. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-160

Applicant: Don Seidel

Address: 3903 N. St. Mary's

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

- 1) Demolish two buildings - a concession stand and retail/restroom facility.
- 2) Construct two replacement buildings - a concession building and retail/restroom facility.

Don Seidel, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Guarino asked the applicant if he has considered using the stone walls as part of the pavilions rather than demolishing. All the portions of the existing stone should be preserved.

Commissioner Connor stated there are many buildings in Brackenridge Park and the Zoo with this stone.

Commissioner Rodriguez stated she is not comfortable with removal of the stone walls. There is a wonderful opportunity to incorporate the exterior into the plan.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to refer to an on site meeting, Demolition Designation and Design Review Committee and also encourage the applicant to consider preserving the stone walls.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

11. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-161

Applicant: Zip Trip

Address: 2200 San Pedro Avenue

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Exceed the maximum signage square footage as required in historic district (50 sq. ft.).

Estimate of signage sq.ft currently at site 140 sq. ft.

Amir Mohammad, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Cabel stated the signage is excessive.

Commissioner Barrera stated the establishment would be more attractive with less signage clutter. Given what the other businesses are doing in the neighborhood, the signage should be less.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the signage is overwhelming.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve staff recommendation of 63 sq. ft. of signage as agreed to by the applicant.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

12. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-166

Applicant: Candid Rogers

Address: 124 Devine St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Remove multiple additions to original L-shaped home.
- 2) Remove existing concrete front porch and replace with a wood porch with cedar columns and standing seam shed roof.
- 3) Replace front bay window with two side by side double hung windows. Bay window is not original to the home.
- 4) Remove, restore and replace two historic existing 6/6 windows at west elevation. Install 3 new 6/6 double hung all wood windows on the Devine St. elevation to match the original 6/6 windows. Addition windows will be all wood windows.
- 5) Replace existing wood siding, rake and fascia boards with new siding of same size and material. Replace existing composition shingle roof with Galvanized standing seam metal roof.
- 6) Construct approximately 950 sq. ft. rear addition. Pier and beam foundation. Install flat seam metal siding on portions of the new addition to distinguish new construction from old. Standing seam metal roofing.
- 7) Remove existing chain link fencing. Construct new cedar slat fencing at sides of property. Fencing to be 4ft in height in front yard area and 6ft at rear. Install steel access gate at side of home.
- 8) Place two galvanized metal water cisterns at rear of site to collect roof rainwater for landscape watering.

Paint colors and a landscaping plan will be submitted at a later date.

Candid Rogers, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Guarino presented the committee report.

Commissioner Maldonado the proposed metal front façade would not be appropriate.

Commissioner Connor stated the metal siding would accentuate the fact that it is a modern intervention and not apart of the original house. The proposed siding would also break down the massing to a significant degree.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez approve of the redesigned plans presented August 17, 2011.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: Maldonado

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-162

Applicant: Alfredo Sandoval

Address: 405 Florida

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Reconstruct porch supports and install wood balustrade. Replace existing Corinthian porch columns with square wood posts.
- 2) Construct rear addition. Install salvaged wood windows on addition. Install new rear door.
- 3) Remove existing chimney.

Alfredo Sandoval, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Guarino stated the homes column rhythm is not symmetrical. The columns should be placed as they were originally placed.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the material and locations of the columns are inappropriate. The columns obstruct the view of the window and door.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve with the following stipulations: 1) 4 Corinthian columns in the front 2) 3 square wood columns to remain along the driveway

3) spacing of the two columns that flank the walkway be to the original location as shown in the photograph presented at 8/17/11 HDRC as not to obstruct the view of the door or window.

4) approval of item 2 as submitted.

Denial of item 3.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-165

Applicant: Anthony Hatcher

Address: 119 E. Kings Highway

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

Install decorative wrought iron fence with 18" x 18" square brick columns at front of property. Brick to closely match existing house. Fence to be 6ft in height with 8ft columns and will be set back 12" from crest of existing berm. Fence to include 11ft wrought iron gates at sidewalk steps and decorative driveway gate to match other fencing and gates.

Tony Hatcher, applicant, presented.

Wade Caldwell, Monte Vista Hist. Assoc., stated it is not appropriate to fence in the front yard. The street is characterized by its open vistas. Fencing in the front yard would dramatically impact the streetscape and character of this portion of Monte Vista.

Frank Davila, stated he opposes the proposed fence and believes the owner should adhere to staff recommendations.

Commissioner Guarino stated the fence is inappropriate particularly for the streetscape.

Commissioner Cone stated he is in accordance with staff recommendations.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Shafer deny the proposed case based on staff recommendation.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Meeting minutes: March 16, June 15, and July 6, 2011.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve March 16, June 15, and July 6, 2011 meeting minutes as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:00 p.m.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair