

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
OFFICIAL MINUTES  
SEPTEMBER 1, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 1:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Gonzalez, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

**PRESENT: Gonzalez, Cone, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino**

**ABSENT: Cabel, Brown**

**Commissioner Beyer arrived at 1:40 pm**

**Commissioner Connor arrived at 2:40 pm**

- Chairman’s Statement.
- Citizens to be Heard:
- Announcements:

Highlights of 2<sup>nd</sup> annual Historic Homeowner Fair

UTSA COA & OHP volunteer rehabilitation project at 934 Dawson

**Commissioner Guarino recused himself from the Consent Agenda.**

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- |                       |   |
|-----------------------|---|
| 1. Case No. 2010-255  | 555 Funston Place (Shade Structure)     |
| 2. Case No. 2010-254  | 555 Funston Place (Master Plan)         |
| 3. Case No. 2010-256  | 418 E. Evergreen                        |
| 4. Case No. 2010-252  | 3903 N. St. Mary’s                      |
| 5. Case No. 2010-227  | Mulberry Ave along Brackenridge Park    |
| 6. Case No. 2010-251  | 1430 E. Houston                         |
| 7. Case No. 2010-257  | 409 E. Houston                          |
| 8. Case No. 2010-266  | 107 King William                        |
| 9. Case No. 2010-263  | 200 E. Market                           |
| 10. Case No. 2010-010 | 2315 Avenue B                           |
| 11. Case No. 2010-248 | 8039 Challenger                         |
| 12. Case No. 2010-239 | 15 Burwood Lane                         |
| 13. Case No. 2010-260 | 306 Lamar                               |
| 14. Case No. 2010-253 | 628 E. Guenther                         |
| 15. Case No. 2010-250 | 324 Leigh                               |
| 16. Case No. 2010-261 | 233 Lindell                             |
| 17. Case No. 2010-258 | 406 E. Hildebrand                       |
| 18. Case No. 2010-125 | 107 El Paso St. (Bldg #2) <b>PULLED</b> |
| 19. Case No. 2010-236 | 600 E. Theo                             |
| 20. Case No. 2010-265 | 123 Losoya                              |
| 21. Case No. 2010-259 | 401 King William                        |
| 22. Case No. 2010-148 | 1018 E. Grayson St.                     |

Commissioner Cone made a request to pull Case No. 2010-125 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

**AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter**

**NAYS: None**

**RECUSED: Guarino**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**18. HDRC NO. 2010-125**

Applicant: RVK Architects

Address: 107 El Paso (Bldg. #2)

The applicant is requesting final approval for the following:

- 1) Add 4 feet tall metal letters & 'coffee cup' logo to the west side of the rooftop structure. Letters and logo will be back lit.
- 2) Add 20 inch tall metal letters & 4 feet tall 'coffee cup' logo to the south side building façade, facing the parking lot. Letters and logo will be back lit.
- 3) Paint 4 feet tall building address numbers onto the 3 metal cisterns in front of the south side building façade, facing the parking lot.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve as submitted.

**AYES: Cone, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino**

**NAYS: None**

**RECUSED: Gonzalez**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**23. HDRC NO. 2010-214**

Applicant: Celine Thomasson

Address: 183 Thorain

The applicant is requesting final approval to replace all the existing casement windows with new, energy efficient, vinyl clad single-hung windows.

Celine Thomasson, owner, presented request for window replacement.

Commissioner Maldonado stated usually when HDRC approves window replacements, the windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Commissioner Maldonado further indicated it is not appropriate to remove the windows just for cost energy efficiency.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated a thermal break would be ideal. He further asked the owner if they would consider window film, which could cut down the heat gain factor by 70 percent.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cone to grant denial based on staff's recommendation.

**AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**24. HDRC NO. 2010-264**

Applicant: Alvin Groves

Address: 125 E. Houston

The applicant is requesting final approval for the following:

- 1) Demolition of existing hardscape and the removal of existing landscaping.
- 2) Installation of new pavement.
- 3) Installation/transplantation of new & existing landscaping between the Embassy Suites and the River Walk.
- 4) Installation of exterior lighting, to include light poles along the River Walk and wall sconces on the Embassy Suites building.

Al Groves, project manager, presented request.

Commissioner Cone stated the applicant don't go back with stone but return to replacement panels to match existing.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve items 1, 3 and 4. Approval of item 2 with stipulations that the two existing Hugman panels to be reused into their original location. The four damaged Hugman panels are reproduced based on the original Hugman drawings. Pattern should match original. Applicant should present drawings to staff and have staff look at samples to ensure quality of work will be acceptable.

**AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Guarino**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**25. HDRC NO. 2010-176**

Applicant: City of San Antonio, Office of Historic Preservation

Address: 348 McKinley

Bobby Perez, 600 Navarro, made a request to continue HDRC Case 2010-176, 348 McKinley.

**26. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-267**

Applicant: LMN Architects

Address: 100 Auditorium Circle

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval for the following:

- 1) 1,750 seat Performance Hall with box tier and full stage house that will meet the highest standards for symphonic, operatic, theatrical and amplified presentations.
- 2) 230 seat flat floor Studio Theatre that allows for various theatrical configurations, music rehearsal and community events. A complete array of back of house technical and performance support spaces will be provided for both performance venues.
- 3) RiverWalk Connection: An outdoor performance venue accompanied by new landscaping, stairs and ramps that provides an accessible connection from the building and street level down to the RiverWalk. The plaza will provide an opportunity to host film series, staged performances, seated banquet events and many other gathering type activities.

To accommodate the new program spaces and achieve the high standards for acoustical quality, technical excellence and patron experience, a portion of the existing building is proposed to be demolished. The scope of demolition work includes the existing auditorium and surrounding support spaces. The existing Spanish Colonial

Revival style front and side facades will remain and new construction includes the renovation of the existing historic front facade and side arcades composed of Indiana limestone field stone detailing and single pane, true divided light steel windows. The building will be provided with completely new systems including structural, mechanical, electrical, lighting, fire protection, theatrical lighting and equipment, performance sound, telecommunications and security.

Demolition of existing site elements, paving and regrading is included. New site work includes new plantings, irrigation systems, paving, loading, site lighting and various hardscape elements.

Charles John, Fisher Heck Architects, introduced the team working on the project.

Rodney Smith, Managing Director for the Tobin Center for the Performing Arts, presented project background.

Mark Reddington, LMN Architects, presented detailed design.

Rollette Schreckenghost, S.A. Conservation Society, stated requested further clarification.

Commissioner Maldonado gave the committee report. Discussion of what was original before fire. Discussion of doors on front façade to remain and have them in open position. Discussion on changing front entrance by expanding landscaping and steps. Discussion of the connectivity to the west building and potential parking garage. Concern the lighting on the RiverWalk and window openings. Concern with site lines of the RiverWalk to the back of house and to the open area. Concern with the glass block around the crab legs and what would be viewable. The historical elements of the building should not be concealed. Important to differentiate new but be respectful of what was there.

Commissioner Carpenter indicated there was discussion on the resulting scale and height. He further stated that the design should be respectful; the scale seems overwhelming.

Commissioner Shafer stated the river frontage gives the building two personalities. He stated he would like to see effort to find uses for the historic building and suggested repair. Commissioner Shafer expressed concern with the overwhelming size of the structure from the RiverWalk side.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she has concerns with the massing and the veil (particularly the materials & lighting to be used). She indicated there is a lack of openings on the river level and excessive amount of landscaping that will conceal the historical elements. Commissioner Maldonado stated there is no sensitivity to the blending of the new construction to the historic structure. She expressed concern with the excessive amount of veil and the overwhelming massing that is coming forward to the front of the building.

Commissioner Cone stated if demolition should take place, then what goes back should be contemporary architecture. He indicated the veil goes beyond what is actually required by the architecture. The perception is that the buildings are much larger than they really are.

Commissioner Guarino stated the veil is a sensitive element and has gotten quite high.

Commissioner Beyer stated he is conceptually on board. He requested that the existing mature vegetation be retained as much as possible.

Commissioner Connor stated the scale is overwhelming.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to refer to the Design Review Committee for further in depth discussion.

**AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor, Guarino**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:45 p.m.

APPROVED



Tim Cone  
Chairperson