



Alamo Plaza Advisory Committee
MINUTES
Tuesday, August 5, 2014
1:00 P.M. – 5:00 P.M.
Central Library Auditorium

Councilmember Diego Bernal	Tri-Chair	Present
Marise McDermott	Tri-Chair	Present
Sue Ann Pemberton, FAIA	Tri-Chair	Present
Howard Peak	1994 Alamo Plaza Study Committee Representative	Present
Ramon J. Vasquez	History/Archeology Representative	Present
Dr. Steve Tomka	History/Archeology Representative	Absent
Dr. Sharon Skrobarcek	History/Archeology Representative	Present
Larry L. Laine	State of Texas Designee	Present
Mardi Arce	Federal Government Designee	Present
Frank Z. Ruttenberg	Private Property Owner Representative	Absent
Davis Phillips	Tourism Designee	Present
Roger Perez	District 1 Appointee	Present
Anthony Edwards	District 2 Appointee	Present
Patricia Mejia	District 3 Appointee	Present
Rudolph F. Rodriguez	District 4 Appointee	Present
Gabe Farias	District 5 Appointee	Absent
Rudi Rodriguez	District 6 Appointee	Absent
Ed Torres	District 7 Appointee	Present
Boone Powell, FAIA	District 8 Appointee	Present
Bill Brendel	District 9 Appointee	Present
Jack Judson	District 10 Appointee	Present

Others Present: Colleen Swain (CCDO), Sarah Esserlieu (CCDO), Mimi Quintanilla (Consultant, Facilitator), Alan Hantman (Consultant, Architect - present via Skype), Claudia Guerra (OHP), Pat Schneider (TCI), Jackie King (GLO)

DISABILITY ACCESS STATEMENT



All entrances to the San Antonio Central Library are accessible to persons with disabilities. Parking is available at the attached parking garage on Soledad Street. Auxiliary aids and services, including Deaf interpreters, must be requested forty-eight [48] hours prior to the meeting. For accessibility assistance, call (210) 207-7268 or 711 (Texas Relay Service for the Deaf).

1. Welcome, call to order by Tri-Chair, Councilmember Diego Bernal at 1:12 pm.
2. Colleen Swain discussed the process of the Request for Qualifications (RFQ) and Request for Proposal (RFP) process. She explained that the vision and guiding principles will inform the scope of work for the RFQ for a master planning team. The RFQ will evolve into the RFP, and in 2015 the City anticipates beginning the master planning process for the Alamo Plaza site.
3. Mimi Quintanilla reviewed the ground rules (see attached slide 2) and invited the public to attend the public meeting scheduled for August 26, 2014 from 6:00 to 8:00 p.m. at the Convention Center. After the public meeting, the public commentary will be taken into consideration for the vision and guiding principles that will inform the RFQ, which will be presented to the Quality of Life Committee, City Council B Session, and City Council for consideration. The master planning team would then be identified in 2015. The committee's role would be oversight of the master plan selection process and recommendations for the completion of the master plan.

Mimi Quintanilla then guided the discussion to select terminology to refer to the area. The options included Alamo Plaza, Alamo Plaza Site, the Plaza, the Alamo Site, the Alamo, the Alamo Compound, Mission San Antonio de Valero, and the Alamo Plaza Historic District. The committee discussed and selected 'the Alamo Mission Site' as an all-encompassing term that reflects the committee's intent that incorporates the entire site. Mimi Quintanilla agreed to update the working document to reflect the new terminology and reviewed the updates to the themes from the previous meeting (see attached slide 9). The committee was in agreement of the terminology of the four themes. Mimi Quintanilla reviewed the primary consideration for the Master Plan (see attached slide 10). There was a discussion about the semantics of 'retail experience.' The committee agreed to change the phrase to 'interpretation, visitor services, and appropriate amenities.'

Mimi Quintanilla moved on to the themes, starting with reviewing Theme A (see attached slide 11). No changes were requested. Mimi Quintanilla reviewed Theme B (see attached slide 12) and acknowledged that although the committee has chosen to use the term 'Alamo Mission Site,' in this theme it would be more appropriate to keep the term as 'the Alamo' as it refers to the Battle of 1836. The committee discussed minor changes in terminology, such as replacing 'determination' with 'self-rule' and 'explore' with 'convey.' Mimi Quintanilla reviewed Theme D (see attached slide 14). The committee discussed and agreed to replace the word 'changed' with 'transformed.'

4. Mimi Quintanilla reviewed the vision statements (see attached slide 15) and used HemisFair Park's vision statement as an example (see attached slide 16). Mimi Quintanilla guided the committee through the draft vision statements (see attached slide 17). Draft Vision A reflects the discussion at the last meeting that the majority of people come to the site because of the Battle of the Alamo. Boone Powell asked if the Republic of Texas should be included in the vision statements. There was general support to add it to Draft Vision A.

Boone Powell recommended rephrasing Draft Vision B to state 'include and interpret the stories of the diverse cultures.' There was general support for this change. He also recommended 'tell the Alamo's complete history' instead of 'telling.' There was general support for this change. Ramon

Vasquez requested making Draft Vision C first. The change was made. Boone Powell recommended rewording the first line of Draft Vision B to say ‘include and interpret the diverse cultures that contributed to the story of the Alamo.’ The committee discussed the importance of ensuring everyone sees their story at the Alamo, has a memorable experience, and makes a personal connection that is relevant to all who come. Mimi Quintanilla created a new Draft Vision D to reflect this sentiment: ‘engage visitors in connecting to the story of the Alamo.’ Marise McDermott recommended using the term ‘engage the visitor’ and discussed the use of holographic images to demonstrate history without having to reconstruct anything. Sue Ann Pemberton supported the term ‘engage’ because it’s more than just ‘telling.’ The committee discussed personal relevance, making a personal connection to the site, and having meaningful experiences. Anthony Edwards agreed that having language that engages people of all backgrounds allows people to feel a connectedness – that everyone that comes away with it has a piece of it. The committee agreed.

Mimi Quintanilla rephrased Draft Vision D to incorporate all aspects of the discussion: ‘engage people of all backgrounds in meaningful experiences so that everyone who visits comes away with a connection to the Alamo Mission Site.’ A discussion ensued confirming the importance of engaging people, making a personal connection, personal relevance, and the relevance to international visitors and the diversity of the people. Mimi Quintanilla revised the draft vision statement to read ‘engage people in meaningful experiences so that everyone who visits comes away with a personal connection.’

Boone Powell recommended changing ‘complete’ for ‘in depth history’ in Vision Statement C. Sue Ann Pemberton agreed because history is ongoing, so history can never be complete. Mimi Quintanilla changed the wording to state ‘engage visitors in ways to personally connect to the story.’ Jack Judson and Boone Powell agreed with the phrasing.

The committee discussed that the ‘Alamo Mission’ is a new term does not accurately reflect history, and for the sake of discussion, the committee agreed on this moniker to refer to everything the committee is trying to capture: the mission, the plaza, the surrounding area – everything in the site. It would serve as a temporary place-holder.

Mardi Arce recommended making the new Draft Vision D statement first, so that logically it will flow to engage the visitors first. Mimi Quintanilla made the requested change. Mardi Arce recommended rephrasing to ‘engage visitors to connect to the site by telling the story...’ The committee supported the change.

5. There was a short break at 2:07. The committee reconvened at 2:20.
6. The committee further discussed wording, phrasing and semantics in the themes and agreed to change ‘present the politics’ under the first bullet point in Theme B. A discussion ensued regarding the word ‘all’ in Theme C (see attached slide 13). ‘All’ is tacitly impossible but indicative of the committee’s intent of heightened inclusivity. The committee voted in favor of keeping the word ‘all’ in the document. A request was made to combine the second and third bullet points under Theme C as ‘regard the Alamo Mission Site with reverence and as a tribute to all who lived, fought, and died there.’ The committee agreed to this change. Mardi Arce requested that the two goals under Themes B and C

related to determination should be combined and moved to Theme C. The committee supported the change.

7. Mimi Quintanilla reviewed the draft vision. No changes were requested. Mimi Quintanilla reviewed the guiding principles (see attached slide 18) and those of HemisFair (see attached slide 19-20). She presented possible draft guiding principles pulled from the 1994 philosophy statements (see attached slide 21) and reformulated based on the committee's discussions to date (see attached slide 22). Marise McDermott discussed the importance of fiscal sustainability and having a sustainable business model. This led to a discussion about what should be preserved at the Alamo Mission Site – that it should be evidence-based conservation and preservation, and that any reconstruction should be based on archeological or hard evidence. There was discussion that history is ongoing and whether that should be acknowledged in the guiding principles and the inclusion of interpretive elements as an alternative to reconstruction in order to preserve what is there now. There was a discussion of what type of reconstruction is appropriate, whether the master planning team can work with World Heritage to work through reconstruction options, and that reconstruction is not off the table. Diego Bernal agreed, acknowledging that any proposals would have to go through the proper approvals to be sure it is acceptable. There was discussion of reconstruction as a popular method to portray history in the 1950s and 60s, but it has been replaced by technological improvements that can accurately demonstrate the appearance of a site at a given moment in time. Boone Powell discussed restoring the site to appear as it did in 1836 is unrealistic and advocated using digital technology. Diego Bernal suggested that the master planning team should have all tools available to them and that the master planning team will have to adhere to all city, state, and national laws. Furthermore, the committee will continue to serve in an oversight capacity through the master planning process.

Ramon Vasquez discussed the more than 1,000 buried at the site and the protections afforded by Texas cemetery laws. Mimi Quintanilla reminded the committee that the Campo Santos are included the themes and bullet points and asked the committee if 'preserving evidence-based features' encompasses the Campo Santos. The committee agreed that it did. Mimi Quintanilla discussed that history is ongoing and after the Battle of the Alamo, the Plaza had a very diverse mix of uses and buildings were constructed as part of the ongoing history of urbanization. She asked the committee whether that should be acknowledged in the guiding principles that history is ongoing. The committee agreed. A discussion ensued about preserving the importance of the 1836 battle, telling the story of what came before and after, and including the families that still conduct ceremonies in the shrine and in the Plaza. Sue Ann Pemberton recommended using 'embrace the continuum of living history' because history will continue to evolve as more research is done over time. The committee discussed the intent of the word 'access' as physical and intellectual – physical access refers to ease of mobility, and intellectual access refers to being understood by everyone from the five year old and the academic historian.

Patricia Mejia recommended changing the 'sustainability' guiding principle to include the social and economic impact. Mardi Arce recommended that the sustainable business model should be part of the unified leadership. Marise McDermott agreed. The committee discussed that sustainability should

be defined as social, economic, and environmental. Sue Ann Pemberton recommended adding ‘preservation and interpretation of evidence-based features’ to the guiding principles. Mimi Quintanilla recommended ‘embrace the continuum of history.’ The committee supported this change.

A discussion ensued about including a guiding principle to keep the prominence of the 1836 battle as the centerpiece, which would provide an opportunity to enhance the history of the Alamo pre- and post-1836 and tell a more inclusive history. Ramon Vasquez agreed but stated he disagrees with the way the story is being told now. He encouraged telling the Tejano history of the Battle of the Alamo. Mimi Quintanilla summarized that the 1836 Battle of the Alamo remains the entry point to telling all the other stories. The committee agreed. Rudolph Rodriguez commented that an entry point references a larger backdrop.

8. There was a short break at 3:33. The committee reconvened at 3:43.
9. The committee discussed wayfinding, connectivity to other city assets and sites, and whether there should be something in the guiding principles that addresses repeated visitation and continued learning. Marise McDermott recommended rephrasing to ‘sustainable business and interpretive model’ to mean that people come back repeatedly. Bill Brendel recommended including it with ‘premier visitor experience’ to encourage repeated visitation and argued that a premier visitor experience will mean people will return. Roger Perez recommended changing exhibits could be a way by which people will return and have different experiences with each visit. Diego Bernal agreed that the evolving exhibits could also apply to evolving technologies. Marise McDermott agreed and suggested that it should be included in the business plan and funding structure.

A discussion ensued that connectivity in this sense is contemporaneous with the mission and the battle as opposed to current connectivity. The committee agreed that wayfinding is essential. Boone Powell stated that the guiding principles should show that the Alamo is a key part of the city. The committee discussed promoting racial understanding and healing as part of the guiding principles. A lively discussion ensued resulting in simplifying the phrasing to ‘1836 is the entry point’ and including reconciliation and healing as part of the continuum of history. Diego Bernal agreed that the story has to show how much the site means to different people and that the committee has the responsibility to not perpetuate the ‘us vs. them’ story of the Alamo. The personal connection needs to be articulated. Ramon Vasquez agreed because after the Battle of the Alamo, things didn’t just stop. It’s a continuous series of events, which is a part of the reconciliation. It is San Antonio’s history, and some families have been here since the 1700s. Sue Ann Pemberton stated that perhaps it should fall under ‘embrace the continuum of history, understanding and healing.’

Mimi Quintanilla reviewed the guiding principles. The committee discussed issues related to ‘access’ including multigenerational accessibility, programming, tourists and visitors, and physical accessibility for people of all abilities. Davis Phillips recommended clarifying ‘access’ and ‘sustainability’ for those who have not had the benefit of the committee discussion. Mimi Quintanilla suggested adding a sentence or two to describe the guiding principles may be beneficial.



The committee discussed the upcoming public meeting. Colleen Swain explained that at the public meeting, there will first be an explanation of the committee’s formation, charge, process, and background. Then the vision, guiding principles, themes and goals that the committee has worked on will be presented and input from the community will be taken. There was general agreement that in order to make the most of public feedback, the document presented to the public is should not be in its final form. The committee would reconvene after the public meeting to review public feedback. The committee discussed the format of the public meeting as a workshop or charrette with an opportunity for citizens to speak. A three-minute limit was agreed upon. The committee discussed their role during the public meeting and the value of hearing the feedback firsthand. Mimi Quintanilla added that having the ability to also write down feedback for the committee will be beneficial for those who do not feel comfortable speaking in front of a large audience. A discussion ensued about timing as the meeting is only scheduled for two hours. The committee discussed extending the time for the public meeting and recommended postponing the follow-up meeting after the public meeting to allow time to sift through all of the public comments. Mimi Quintanilla agreed that the follow-up meeting will be postponed and the committee will be notified of the new date.

10. Mimi Quintanilla thanked the committee. Meeting adjourned at 4:37 pm.

ATTACHMENT 1
PowerPoint Presentation

Alamo Plaza

Advisory Committee

Ground Rules

- All comments are good and will be considered
- Focus on the topic of discussion and the task
- Be clear and concise in making your comments and expressing your thoughts
- Be a good listener and respect all points of view– listening does not require agreement
- Avoid talking while others are speaking
- Respect agreements about time
- Conversations and challenges are a part of the process
- **Tri-Chairs or Staff will speak for the Committee**

Process

- **Discussions at meetings are between the committee members and consultants and include staff as requested by the Tri-Chairs**

- **The Public Meeting on August 26 is the opportunity for comments and input by the public**
- **Based on public input, Committee will refine and revise Vision and Guiding Principles for inclusion in the RFQ**
- **Presentation to the Quality of Life Committee**
- **Presentation at City Council B Session**
- **Presentation to City Council for consideration of recommended 1994 updates, Vision, Guiding Principles and Request for Qualifications.**
- **Issue RFQ and then RFP**
- **Master Plan team to be identified in 2015**
- **Committee provides general oversight of the development of the master plan selection process and makes recommendations for completion**

Communications

- All meetings are open to the public
- A quorum consists of a simple majority

For More Information

If you would like more information contact:

Colleen Swain, Assistant Director

Center City Development and Operations Department
210.207.4089 or Colleen.Swain@sanantonio.gov

Sarah Esserlieu

Center City Development & Operations Department
210.207.0108 or Sarah.Esserlieu@sanantonio.gov

Public Meeting

August 26
6:00 pm – 8:00 pm
Convention Center
Room 103

What are we managing?

The Alamo Plaza

The Alamo Plaza Site

The Plaza

The Alamo Site

The Alamo

The Alamo Compound

The Mission San Antonio de Valero

The Alamo Plaza Historic District



Updated Themes

- A. The evolution of settlements and cultures at Alamo Plaza
- B. Tell the story of the 1836 Battle of the Alamo
- C. The Alamo Mission is a place of remembrance
- D. Alamo Plaza represents a continuum of urban development and commerce in San Antonio

Primary consideration for the Master Plan

Alamo Plaza should be the premier historic destination in Texas

- a) Provide an enriched, high-quality visitor experience that includes, interpretation, visitor services and amenities, and appropriate retail experiences

Theme A

The evolution of settlements and cultures at Alamo Plaza

2014 Goals

- Tell the story of the environment and the Native Americans
- Tell the story of the Spanish influence and settlement, including the three types of towns: the Indian-Led Mission Towns/Pueblos, the Soldier/Settler Town, the Civilian Town
- Tell the story of the Mexicans, the settlement by Americans and other Texian immigrant cultures, and the coming of the Revolution

Theme B

Tell the story of the Battle of the Alamo

2014 Goals

- Explore the politics of the Texas Revolution
- Provide background to set the stage for the Battle: September 1835 to February 22, 1836
- Provide ways to understand the geography of the battlefield site
- Be inclusive in telling all sides of the military story
- Tell the story of the local population's participation and reaction to the battle
- Interpret the role of the Alamo as an ongoing symbol of determination

Theme C

The Alamo Mission is a place of remembrance

2014 Goals

- Recognize all the cultures and events that have contributed to the history of the Alamo Plaza site
- Regard Alamo Plaza with reverence for all who lived, fought, and died there
- Recognize the Alamo experience as a tribute to those who lived, fought, and died there
- Provide background and context for the fight for self-determination (self-rule)

Theme D

Alamo Plaza represents a continuum of urban development and commerce in San Antonio

2014 Goals

- Interpret what the Alamo Plaza site looked like over the different periods of the 300 + year history of the plaza site and its relationship to other sites, other missions and related features
- Interpret how the Alamo Plaza site has changed over more than 300 years and how it continues to be a community gathering place

Vision Statements

- Concise way to express major goals and strategic objectives
- Direct all eyes towards the hoped-for results of short- and long-term decisions and actions

VISION

Becoming What You Desire

Aspiring to a different, stronger, more effective state of being

Focusing actions and means to achieve those ends

HemisFair Park Vision

The vision for the redevelopment of HemisFair is to create a vital mixed use area, centered on a city park which maintains and revitalizes the historic buildings while reconnecting the area to the adjacent neighborhoods and providing new mixed use development, compatible in scale with adjacent properties. HemisFair Park will continue to be an accessible neighborhood park that unifies the city, serves as a community gathering place, and is an opportunity for citizens to work, live, and play. HemisFair Park will have many special places and uses; some active, some quiet.

Alamo Plaza

Draft Visions

- A. Telling the story of the Battle of the Alamo and its impact on the city of San Antonio, the state of Texas, and the United States.
- B. Committed to including and interpreting the stories of the diverse cultures that contributed to the story of the Alamo through meaningful and memorable experiences for visitors.
- C. Telling the Alamo's complete history as a tribute to all who lived, fought, and died there.

Guiding Principles

Guide the behavior of the organization or site in all circumstances regardless of changes in goals, strategies, or management structure.

Hemisfair Park Guiding Principles

- 1.Connectivity
- 2.Development
- 3.Green Space
- 4.Balance
- 5.Preservation
- 6.Sustainability
- 7.Leadership

- 1) **Connectivity:** Linkages within HemisFair Park and to and from the adjacent areas are necessary to the Park's viability. Connectivity must address both pedestrian and vehicular access including parking.
- 2) **Development:** Mixed use development to include mixed income housing, commercial, institutional and civic uses is desired.
- 3) **Green Space:** Expand and preserve green space.
- 4) **Balance:** A balance between green space and development is necessary.
- 5) **Preservation:** Protection of historic buildings within HemisFair Park is mandatory. However, the strategic removal of non-historic or temporary buildings may be considered. Relating development to existing historic buildings is critical to creation of a unique and urban environment.
- 6) **Sustainability:** The redevelopment within HemisFair Park and its surrounding area should consider environmental, social and economic impacts in order to ensure a better quality of life for everyone, now and for future generations.
- 7) **Leadership:** The redevelopment of HemisFair Park requires long term dedicated civic leadership in order to be sustainable.

Can this philosophy help define the guiding principles?

1. The People
(Confluence of Cultures: the story of the diverse people living in and moving into the area and their cultures.)
2. The Stories
(Alamo Plaza as witness to the history of Texas and the City of San Antonio: the story of the events of Mission San Antonio de Valero)
3. The Sacrifice
(Alamo Plaza symbolizes the quest for self-determination)
4. New Scholarship
(Incorporate and interpret ongoing evidence-based research)

Alamo Plaza Guiding Principles Discussion Draft

Unified Leadership Under The Management Of A Single Steward (public and private)

Preservation

Access

Balance: Scholarship, Historical Context, Visitor Experience

Sustainability

Premier Visitor Experiences: Physical Space and Interpretation

Public Meeting

August 26
6:00 pm – 8:00 pm
Convention Center
Room 103

Thank You

for time and commitment
to the process

The following slides are
placeholders in case we need
them

San Antonio River Authority Vision

Leaders in Watershed
Solutions

Theme A

The evolution of settlements and cultures at Alamo Plaza

1994

Goals

2014

- To tell the story of the environment and the Native Americans
- To tell the story of the Spanish Settlement, including the three types of towns: the Mission-Led Indian Town, the Soldier/Settler Town, the Civilian Town
- To tell the story of the Mexican/Anglo American Settlement and the coming of the Revolution

- Tell the story of the environment and the Native Americans
- Tell the story of the Spanish influence and settlement, including the three types of towns: the Indian-Led Mission Towns/Pueblos, the Soldier/Settler Town, the Civilian Town
- Tell the story of the Mexicans, the settlement by Americans and other Texian immigrant cultures, and the coming of the Revolution

Theme B

Tell the story of the Battle of the Alamo

Goals

1994

- Tell all sides of the military story
- Tell the politics of the Texas Revolution
- Tell the local population reaction and participation in the battle
- The geography of the battlefield
- Tell the story of the 1836 Battle of the Alamo
- The Battle of the Alamo as a symbol

2014

- Explore the politics of the Texas Revolution
- Provide background to set the stage for the Battle: September 1835 to February 22, 1836
- Provide ways to understand the geography of the battlefield site
- Be inclusive in telling all sides of the military story
- Tell the story of the local population's participation and reaction to the battle
- Interpret the role of the Alamo as an ongoing symbol of determination

Theme C

The Alamo Mission is a place of remembrance

1994

Goals

2014

- Alamo Plaza should be regarded with reverence for all who died there
- Alamo Plaza should better represent a respectful entry point to the Alamo Church
- Alamo Plaza should be a place of remembrance
- Illustrate and describe the sacrifice for self-determination
- Recognize and remember all the cultures that have contributed

- Recognize all the cultures and events that have contributed to the history of the Alamo Plaza site
- Regard Alamo Plaza with reverence for all who lived, fought, and died there
- Recognize the Alamo experience as a tribute to those who lived, fought, and died there
- Provide background and context for the fight for self-determination (self-rule)

Theme D

Alamo Plaza represents a continuum of urban development and commerce in San Antonio

1994

Goals

2014

- Describe /illustrate what the Plaza looked like during all periods of history
- Describe/illustrate how the uses changed over time for all periods of history

- Interpret what the Alamo Plaza site looked like over the different periods of the 300 + year history of the plaza site and its relationship to other sites, other missions and related features
- Interpret how the Alamo Plaza site has changed over more than 300 years and how it continues to be a community gathering place