



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
06 March 2019**

The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session on Wednesday, February 6, 2019, in the Board Room at the Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

- Acting Chair Fetzer called the meeting to order at 3:06 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

- The roll was called by the Executive Secretary.

Present: Wolff, Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer and Laffoon.

Absent: Guarino, Connor, Garza, and Bowman.

CHAIRMAN'S STATEMENT

ANNOUNCEMENTS

Commissioner Jeffrey Fetzer was appointed Acting Chair from this meeting on. Commissioner Scott Carpenter was appointed Vice Chair during this meeting.

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to approve the motion to appoint Acting Chair Fetzer and Vice Chair Carpenter. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Connor, Garza, and Bowman.

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, AND 0 NAYS.**

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

- Paul Kinnison and Christian Pesce.

CONSENT AGENDA

- Consideration of Consent Agenda items:
 - Item #1, Case No. 2019-088 115 W HOLLYWOOD AVE
 - Item #2, Case No. 2019-089 125 E CAROLINA ST
 - Item #3, Case No. 2019-090 244 LOVERA BLVD
 - Item #6, Case No. 2019-070 701 NOLAN/801 N OLIVE ST/Lockwood and Dignowity Park
 - Item #8, Case No. 2019-029 3903 N ST MARYS
 - Item #9, Case No. 2018-632 401 E HOUSTON ST
 - Item #11, Case No. 2019-077 826 N PINE ST

- o Item #12, Case No. 2019-064 307 E JOSEPHINE
- o Item #13, Case No. 2019-087 1829 N NEW BRAUNFELS AVE
- o Item #14, Case No. 2019-071 1839 E HOUSTON ST
- o Item #15, Case No. 2019-081 1839 E HOUSTON ST
- o Item #16, Case No. 2019-067 348 THOMAS JEFFERSON DR
- o Item #17, Case No. 2019-098 238 W HOLLYWOOD AVE
- o Item #18, Case No. 2018-619 416 KENDALL

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to approve the consent agenda with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motions.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Flores, Grube, Fetzter and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.
Abstain/Recusal: Carpenter

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, 1 RESCUSAL AND 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

- o CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS # 4, 7, AND 10 PULLED DUE TO CITIZENS TO HEARD.
- o CONSENT AGENDA ITEM # 5 PULLED DUE TO CONTINUATION ON ITEM 4.
- o INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEM #28 WAS WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT.
- o INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION ITEMS #23, 25, 27,29,30,31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37 and 38 HAVE BEEN POSTPONED UNTIL HDRC MEETING ON MARCH 20TH.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA ITEMS

- **Item #22. HDRC NO. 2019-080**
Applicant: Kristen Weber/Don B McDonald Architect
ADDRESS: 328 E JOSEPHINE

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to perform various scopes of work to the Boehler's Bar & House including the relocation of the Boehler's Bar and additions, exterior modifications and rehabilitation of the Boehler's Bar and House. Within this scope of work, the applicant has proposed the following:

Boehler's Bar:

1. Relocate the structure from its current location on E Grayson.
2. Rehabilitate original materials on each façade including door and entry fenestration, parapet walls, windows, wood siding, roof replacement and painting.
3. Install a new center bay window on the east façade's ground floor.
4. Install a new five bay dormer on the north and south façade.
5. Construct a kitchen addition to be clad in loose rubble limestone.
6. Construct a new restroom, elevator and dining addition on the west façade of the historic structure to be clad in wood siding and loose rubble limestone.
7. Construct an exterior balcony egress stair to be added to the north façade that is to include a balcony addition.
8. Construct a new awning between the Boehler's Bar and House.

Boehler's House:

9. Relocate the structure from its current location to a location further south on Avenue A.
10. Rehabilitate original materials on each including wood siding, window and door repair, roof replacement and painting.
11. Install new window adjacent to the proposed west addition.
12. Construct a screened porch addition to the front of the structure. No front porch currently exists.
13. Construct an addition to the west façade of the structure to feature restrooms.
14. Construct an addition to the south façade of the structure to feature dining.

Site Elements

15. Construct a courtyard on the southwestern corner of the site, near the intersection of E Grayson and Avenue A. The proposed courtyard is to feature an outdoor dining area.
16. Construct a parking lot on the lot at the corner of E Josephine and Avenue A.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of item 1 through 16 with the following stipulations:

- i. That additions and alterations be constructed in such a manner that if such additions or alterations were removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the building would be unimpaired.
- ii. That all loose rubble stone be eliminated as a cladding material. Alterations that have no historical basis and which seek to create an earlier appearance are prohibited. Staff recommends the applicant use brick or an alternative materials that is more in keeping with the period of development of the property.
- iii. That all new windows feature installation depths, materials and finishes that match those found historically on the structures.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to approve with staff stipulations except for the landscape area of the parking lot under the site element. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Wolff, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, and Laffoon,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.
Recusal: Fetzer.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, 1 RECUSAL AND 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT

- **Wolff left meeting at 3:32pm.**
- **Item #4. HDRC NO. 2019-068**
ADDRESS: 418 KINGS COURT
APPLICANT: Amy Perez/Kai Homes

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting Historic Tax Certification for the property at 418 Kings Ct.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of Historic Tax Certification based on findings a through e.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Paul Kinnison- 418 W. French Plaza

Motion: Commissioner Grube made a motion for approval as submitted.
Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor and Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item #5. HDRC NO. 2019-069**

APPLICANT: Amy Perez/Kai Homes

ADDRESS: 418 KINGS COURT

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting Historic Tax Verification for the property at 418 Kings Ct.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of Historic Tax Verification based on findings a through e.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter move to approve with staff stipulations. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor and Bowman.
Recusal: Carpenter

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, AND 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item #7. HDRC NO. 2019-079**

ADDRESS: 112 LINDELL PLACE

APPLICANT: Jim Bailey/Alamo Architects

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to amend a previously issued Certificate of Appropriateness in regards to the historic structure at 112 Lindell Place. The applicant has proposed to deconstruct and rebuild a portion of the exterior clay unit walls due to deterioration that has rendered them structurally unsound.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a and b with the stipulation that the proposed reconstructed walls match the original in appearance (profile, dimension, texture).

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Barbara Witte-Hawell and Raleigh Wood opposed to application.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion for approval with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS.5 ABSENT.

- **Item #10. HDRC NO. 2019-097.**
ADDRESS: 620 E CARSON
APPLICANT: OHP- Office of Historic Preservation

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting the review of demolition for the historic structure at 620 E Carson. The structure was damaged by fire on February 1, 2019.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends demolition based on findings a through d. Additionally, staff recommends that any salvageable materials that do not feature fire, smoke or water damage should be salvaged and not discarded during the demolition.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Robert Henderson and Rose Hill opposed to case. Cindy Tower in support of case.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to approve based on a-d, and agree with staff stipulations to salvage historical material. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor and Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

- **Item #19. HDRC NO. 2018-007**
ADDRESS: 525 & 527 E HUISACHE AVE
APPLICANT: David Bogle, R.A., AIA/SYNCRO Architecture Studio

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting final approval to:

1. Construct a rear addition to measure approximately 1,496 square feet.
2. Construct a new front porch with an ADA accessible ramp to measure approximately 459 square feet in footprint.
3. Relocate an existing window on the west elevation and install new fenestration.
4. Install new fiber cement siding on the existing structure where required.
5. Install a walkway and landscaping buffer in the front yard.
6. Install a new sidewalk to match the existing sidewalk configuration and materiality in the district.
7. Extend the existing concrete ribbon driveway through the site to the rear alley.
8. Install new hardscaping in the rear of the lot to accommodate four traditional parking spaces, an ADA accessible parking space and drop off area, and accessible route. The hardscaping will include a mixture of impervious poured concrete and pervious gravel.

9. Create a rear vehicular access configuration along the rear alley to provide access to multiple parking spots.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend final approval at this time based on findings a through w. Staff recommends that the applicant address the following items prior to returning to the HDRC:

- i. That the applicant retains the location of the existing casement window on the west elevation as noted in finding j.
- ii. That the applicant reduces the length of the ribbon driveway extension to be more consistent with development patterns in the district as noted in finding r.
- iii. That the applicant reduces the rear vehicular access width and configuration to be more consistent with the development pattern of the alleyway and the neighborhood as noted in findings u and v.
- iv. That the applicant reduces the overall pervious cover of the site as noted in findings f, r, u, and v through either the reduction of impervious hardscaping and/or a reduction in the size of the addition.
- v. That the applicant removes the proposed skylights from the primary structure as noted in finding i.
- vi. That the applicant provides detailed specification information for the proposed new windows as noted in finding k. Staff finds a wood or aluminum clad wood window to be most appropriate that meets the following stipulations: meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- vii. That the applicant provides detailed specifications for the proposed façade material for the addition as noted in finding l. If vertical siding is proposed, staff finds that the applicant should propose board and batten siding that features boards that are twelve (12) inches wide with battens that are 1 – ½” wide.

CASE COMMENTS:

The applicant met with the Design Review Committee (DRC) on January 10, 2018; February 14, 2018; October 23, 2018; November 14, 2018; and February 13, 2019. The discussions and an overall case history are outlined in finding c.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Melody Hull, Robert D. Simone, James Thurwalker, David Leal, Cee Winkler(9mins), Esther Contreras(6 mins), Paul Kinnison(6 mins), Tony Garcia(9 mins),John Shipley, and Pat Eisenhower opposed to case. Omar Khan and Michael Kim support the case.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to send to DRC for further review. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: Fish.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 5 AYES, and 1 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- **Translator left at 5:30pm.**

- **Item #20. HDRC NO. 2019-100**
ADDRESS: 306 & 310 E PARK AVE
APPLICANT: Patrick Christensen

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct ten single family townhomes on the vacant lots addressed 306 and 310 E Park Ave. Two of the townhomes will be 2-stories and the remaining eight will be 3-stories.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend conceptual approval at this time. Staff recommends that the applicant addresses the following inconsistencies prior to returning to the HDRC:

- i. That the applicant explores ways to increase the setback on E Park Ave to be more consistent with the adjacent historic structures as noted in finding e.
- ii. That fewer buildings are explored to be more in keeping with the established development pattern within the district based on finding c.
- iii. That the applicant explores a primary-accessory structure relationship or interior court condition in lieu of the orientation of the rear 8 buildings as noted in finding f.
- iv. That the applicant reduces the width of the two front buildings facing Park Ave and incorporates more consistent architectural features, including proportionate porch elements and a consistent solid to void relationship, to be more consistent with massing precedents in the district as noted in finding g.
- v. That the applicant develops individualized street elevations for each unit to be more consistent with the development pattern of the district as noted in finding n.
- vi. The applicant explores 1.5 to 2.5-story massing options or prototypes within the district boundary to respond to the dominant historic massing context of the historic neighborhood.
- vii. That the applicant incorporates a foundation height of at least 18 inches to be more consistent with the foundation heights of nearby historic structures as noted in finding h.
- viii. That the applicant proposes a fenestration pattern, window opening proportions, and materials that are more consistent with the Guidelines, the OHP Window Policy document, and the historic examples found in the Tobin Hill Historic District.
- ix. That the applicant reduces the central driveway width as noted in finding q.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Frederica Sanchez

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to refer to DRC. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, Laffoon,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.

- **Item #21. HDRC NO. 2019-082**
ADDRESS: 931 HAYS ST
APPLICANT: Adam Sanchez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a new, 2-story residential structure on the vacant lot at 931 Hays, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend conceptual approval at this time. Staff recommends that the applicant address the following items prior to receiving conceptual approval:

- i. That the applicant incorporate a setback that is equal to or greater than those found historically on the block, for both the primary and accessory structures. A setback plan showing those found historically on the block should be submitted to confirm the proposed setback's appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant provide a street elevation to confirm that the proposed new construction features a height that is appropriate for the block.
- iii. That a foundation height that is within one (1) foot of those found historically on the block be utilized.
- iv. That the applicant utilize a hipped roof to reduce the perceived massing of the proposed new construction.
- v. That the proposed horizontal Hardie siding should feature an exposure of four (4) inches and a smooth finish and that the proposed board and batten siding should feature boards that are no wider than twelve (12) inches wide and battens that are no wider than 1 – ½" inches wide. The incorporation of window shutters may be appropriate if they are functional and installed in a traditional manner.
- vi. That wood or aluminum clad wood windows be installed that feature an inset of two (2) inches within facades and should feature profiles that are found historically within the immediate vicinity. An alternative window material may be proposed provided that the window features meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- vii. That the proposed garage be detached from the primary structure and feature two garage doors and two garage door bays.
- viii. That the proposed driveway does not feature more than ten (10) feet of continuous paving.
- ix. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view from the public right of way.
- x. That the applicant submit a landscaping plan.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Christian Pesce.

Motion: Commissioner Fish motioned for conceptual approval with staff stipulations excluding stipulations iv. and vi—meant for the excluding detaching of the garage from primary structure. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Grube, Carpenter, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED 6 AYES, 0 NAYS, AND 5 ABSENT

- **Item #24. HDRC NO. 2019-096**
ADDRESS: 808 E CARSON
APPLICANT: Peggy Brimhall/Figurd

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install a steel carport structure at the rear of the property located at 914 N Pine, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District. The proposed carport structure will be located on an existing concrete pad.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends that the applicant install a wood or aluminum clad wood windows that meet the specifications outlined in finding b. If an aluminum window is approved by the Commission, the specifications noted in finding b in regards to meeting rail and stile dimensions, installation depth, trim and sill profiles and window colors should be added.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Richard Henderson and Cindy Tower opposed to application.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to continue next HDRC meeting with sample or provide more information to staff. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- **Item #26. HDRC NO. 2019-085**
ADDRESS: 825 DAWSON ST
APPLICANT: Jeffrey Post

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Demolish a rear, contributing accessory structure.
2. Modify the roof pitch of the primary historic structure to allow for occupied attic space.
3. Install front yard fencing.
4. Install rear yard privacy fencing.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the demolition of the rear accessory structure based on findings c through f. The applicant should submit a structural analysis to determine if a loss of structural integrity has occurred.
2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the modification of the existing roof structure based on finding g. Staff finds that if only the proposed addition’s roof featured an increase in height, the modification may be appropriate.
3. Staff does recommends approval of item #3, front yard fencing with the stipulation that the proposed fence feature a simple, vertical wood picket design. Fencing details must be submitted to staff for review and approval prior to installation. Front yard fencing is not to exceed four (4) feet in height.
4. Staff recommends approval of item #4 as submitted based on finding i.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Christian Pesce is opposed to case.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to approve item 1 – due to loss of significance, item 2- approve with staff stipulations and submit final documents for roof design, item 3- fence with staff stipulations, and item 4- with staff recommendation. An additional stipulation to salvage the historical material. Commissioner Grube second the motion.
Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item #35. HDRC NO. 2019-078**

ADDRESS: 124 GLORIETTA ST.

APPLICANT: Edward Casias

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install a side porch with a new door opening.
2. Install a rear addition with a window.
3. Replace 4 windows with 1 wood casement window in front and 3 vinyl clad windows on the side.
4. Remove 2 window openings to infill with siding.
5. Replace the front door.
6. Remove wood lap siding and install board-and-batten siding.
7. Replace two turned porch columns with square cedar posts and remove existing pilasters.
8. Install a front porch light.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of item number 2) the rear addition, and item number 8) the front porch light as proposed based on findings c and i.

Staff recommends approval of item number 5) door replacement based on finding f with the stipulation that it features a simple wood 6-panel door instead of the proposed metal clad door with ornamental glazing.

Staff recommends approval of item number 3) window replacement if the original wood sashed windows have been permanently discarded based on findings d with the stipulation that new windows are constructed of wood or aluminum clad wood with the standard specifications: *Meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.*

Staff does not recommend approval of items number 1) the construction of a side porch, item number 4) window opening removal, item number 6) the installation of board-and-batten siding, and item number 7) column replacement and pilaster removal.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Christian Pesce is opposed to case.

Motion: No Action Taken. Case postponed to next HDRC Hearing on March 20th hearing.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Wolff, Garza, and Bowman.

Action: Case will be heard in next HDRC on March 20th hearing. POSTPONED.

EXECUTIVE SESSION.

Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.

ADJOURNMENT.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:30 PM.

APPROVED



Jeffrey Fetzer
Acting Chair