



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
05 June 2019**

The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session on Wednesday, June 05, 2019, in the Board Room at the Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

- Acting Chair Carpenter called the meeting to order at 3:18 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

- The roll was called by the Executive Secretary.

Present: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, and Bowman.

Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon .

CHAIRMAN'S STATEMENT

ANNOUNCEMENTS

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

- None

CONSENT A and B AGENDA

- **Consideration of Consent Agenda- A items:**
 - Item #A-1, Case No. 2019-260 107 N FLORES ST
 - Item #A-2, Case No. 2019-298 111 SOLEDAD ST
 - Item #A-3, Case No. 2019-100 306 E PARK AVE, 310 E PARK AVE
 - ITEM A-4 WAS PULLED AND NOT HEARD DUE TO RECUSALS AND NO QUORUM TO BE HEARD.
 - ITEM A-9 WAS WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT.

Motion: Commissioner Grube moved to approve the consent Agenda A with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman,.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- **Consideration of Consent Agenda- B items Heard after 4:30pm:**
 - Item #B-1, Case No. 2019-306 214 NELSON AVE

- o Item #B-2, Case No. 2019-281 6860 RAINTREE PATH
- o Item #B-3, Case No. 2019-282 4707 CRYSTAL HILL/5216 Shadow Mist, Crystal Hills Park
- o Item #B-4, Case No. 2019-289 217 PEREIDA ST
- o Item #B-5, Case No. 2019-307 123 CROFTON
- o Item #B-6, Case No. 2019-271 415 CEDAR ST
- o Item #B-7, Case No. 2019-293 8619 MISSION RD
- o Item #B-9, Case No. 2019-275 930 LAMAR ST
- o Item #B-10, Case No. 2019-276 930 LAMAR ST
- o Item #B-11, Case No. 2019-303 306 CALLAGHAN AVE
- o Item #B-12, Case No. 2019-312 173 LOVERA BLVD
- o Item #B-13, Case No. 2019-278 2265 AUSTIN HWY
- o Item #B-14, Case No. 2019-169 314 E ROSEWOOD AVE
- o Item #B-15, Case No. 2019-268 2134 W KINGS HWY

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to approve the consent agenda B with staff stipulations. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motions.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Garza, Martinez-Flores , Grube, Bowman.
 Nays: None.
 Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer and Laffoon.

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- ITEM B-8 AND B-16 WERE PULLED FROM CONSENT TO INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION DUE TO CITIZENS TO BE HEARD.
- ITEM B-21, 26, AND 30 WAS WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT.
- ITEM B-31 WAS POSTPONED BY APPLICANT.

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA A ITEMS

- **Item # A-5. HDRC NO. 2019-287**
 Applicant: Kris Feldman/CreoArc
 ADDRESS: 151 E TRAVIS ST

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct an eight story hotel structure on the vacant lot at 151 E Travis Street. The proposed new construction is to feature 112 hotel rooms, with both street and river level retail space.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

UDC Section 35-672. – Neighborhood Wide Design Standards

(a) Pedestrian Circulation. Pedestrian access shall be provided among properties to integrate neighborhoods.

(1) Provide sidewalks that link with existing sidewalks on adjoining properties. If no sidewalk currently exists on an adjoining property, the applicant will have discretion in the placement of the sidewalk provided the following criteria are met:

- A. Provide a sidewalk connection from one (1) side of the applicant's property to the other, parallel to the public right-of way, on the street sides of the property in all river improvement overlay districts

B. Provide a connection from the street level sidewalk to the Riverwalk at cross streets and bridges and other designated access points. This requirement may be waived if there is already a public connection from the street level to the Riverwalk.

C. In order to preserve the rural character of "RIO-6," the HPO, in coordination with the development services department, may waive the requirement of sidewalks.

• In "RIO-3," the width of the pathway along the river shall match those widths established in the historic Hugman drawings. If there are no sidewalks in the Hugman drawings, the path will not exceed eight (8) feet in width.

(2) Link the various functions and spaces on a site with sidewalks in a coordinated system.

Provide pedestrian sidewalks between buildings, parking areas and built features such as outdoor plazas and courtyards.

(3) Paving materials. Paving materials for pedestrian pathways shall use visually and texturally different materials than those used for parking spaces and automobile traffic.

A. Paving materials for pedestrian pathways shall be either:

i. Broom-finished, scored, sandblasted or dyed concrete;

ii. Rough or honed finished stone;

iii. Brick or concrete pavers; or

iv. Other materials that meet the performance standards of the above materials.

B. Asphalt is permitted for pedestrian pathways that also are designated as multi-use paths by the City of San Antonio. The public works department will maintain the designated multi-use path locations.

(4) Street Connections to River. Retain the interesting and unique situations where streets dead-end at the river, creating both visual and physical access to the river for the public.

(5) Pedestrian Access Along the Riverwalk Pathway Shall Not Be Blocked.

A. Queuing is prohibited on the Riverwalk pathway.

B. Hostess stations shall be located away from the Riverwalk pathway so as to not inhibit pedestrian flow on the Riverwalk pathway. That is, the hostess station shall not be located in such a manner to cause a patron who has stopped at the hostess stand to be standing on the Riverwalk pathway. Pedestrian flow shall be considered "inhibited" if a pedestrian walking along the pathway has to swerve, dodge, change direction or come to a complete stop to avoid a patron engaged at the hostess stand.

C. Tables and chairs shall be located a sufficient distance from the Riverwalk pathway so that normal dining and service shall not inhibit the flow of pedestrian traffic. See inhibited definition in subsection B. above.

(b) Automobile Access and Parking. Automobile circulation should be efficient, and conflicts with pedestrians minimized. Entry points for automobiles should be clearly defined and connections to auto circulation on adjoining properties are encouraged to facilitate access and reduce traffic on abutting public streets.

(1) Curb Cuts.

A. Limit curb cuts to two (2) on parking areas or structures facing only one (1) street, and one (1) for each additional street face. The prohibition of additional curb cuts may be waived by the HDRC where the intent of the standards are clearly met and specific site circulation patterns require an additional curb cut, such as on long parcels or at nodes.

B. Curb cuts may be no larger than twenty-five (25) feet zero (0) inches. Continuous curb cuts are prohibited.

C. Sharing curb cuts between adjacent properties, such as providing cross property access easements, is permitted.

(2) Location of Parking Areas. Automobile parking in new developments must be balanced with the requirements of active environments. Large expanses of surface parking lots have a negative impact on street activity and the pedestrian experience. New commercial and residential structures can accommodate parking needs and contribute to a pedestrian-friendly streetscape.

A. Locate parking areas, that is any off-street, ground level surface used to park cars or any parking structure, toward the interior of the site or to the side or rear of a building.

B. The extent of parking area that may be located along the street edge or riverside shall be limited to a

percentage of the lot line as per Table 672-1 as measured in a lineal direction parallel to the lot line. All parking within a thirty-foot setback from the above mentioned lot line shall comply with the requirements of the table. Where parking is located on corner sites only one (1) lot line has to meet the requirements of the table.

C. Parking lots should be avoided as a primary land use. Parking lots as a primary use are prohibited in RIO-3 and for all properties that fall within one hundred (100) feet of the river right-of-way in all RIO districts.

(3) Screen or Buffer Parking Areas From View of Public Streets, the River or Adjacent Residential Uses. (see Figure 672-2). Parking lots shall be screened with a landscape buffer as per the illustrations of bufferyards and Table 510-2 if the parking area meets one (1) of the following conditions:

- A. Within a fifty-foot setback from the edge of the river ROW use, at a minimum, type E; or
- B. Within a twenty-foot setback from a property line adjacent to a street use, at a minimum, type B; or
- C. Within a twenty-foot setback of commercial or industrial property that abuts a residential property use, at a minimum, type C.

(4) Parking Structures Shall Be Compatible With Buildings in the Surrounding Area. Parking garages should have retail space on the ground floor of a parking structure provided the retail space has at least fifty (50) percent of its linear street frontage as display windows. Parking structures may be made visually appealing with a mural or public art component approved by the HDRC on the parking structure. A parking garage will be considered compatible if:

- A. It does not vary in height by more than thirty (30) percent from another building on the same block face; and
- B. It uses materials that can be found on other buildings within the block face, or in the block face across the street.

(5) Parking Structures Shall Provide Clearly Defined Pedestrian Access. Pedestrian entrances and exits shall be accentuated with directional signage, lighting or architectural features so that pedestrians can readily discern the appropriate path of travel to avoid pedestrian/auto conflicts.

(6) Parking lots, structures, and hardscape shall not drain directly into the river without installation of appropriate water quality best management practices (WQ BMPs). Acequias shall not be used for any type of drainage.

(c) Views. The river's course (both natural and manmade), and San Antonio's street pattern, creates unique views of certain properties from the public ROW. These properties often occur at prominent curves in the river or where a street changes direction and a property appears to be a terminus at the end of a street.

(1) Architectural Focal Point. When a property is situated in such a manner as to appear to be the terminus at the end of the street or at a prominent curve in the river, the building shall incorporate into its design an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. (see Figure 672-3) An architectural feature will be considered to be a focal point through any of the following methods, but not limited to:

- A. Additional height.
- B. Creation of a tower.
- C. Variation in roof shape.
- D. Change of color or materials.
- E. Addition of a design enhancement feature such as:
 - i. Embellished entrance areas.
 - ii. Articulated corners, especially when entrance is at corner, rounded or chamfered corners ease the transitions from one street facade to the adjoining facade.
 - iii. Recessed or projecting balconies and entrances.

Billboards, advertising and signage are expressly prohibited as appropriate focal points.

UDC Section 35-673. – Site Design Standards

(a) Solar Access. The intent of providing and maintaining solar access to the San Antonio River is to protect the river's specific ecoclimate. The river has a special microclimate of natural and planted vegetation that requires certain levels and balanced amounts of sunlight, space and water. Development must be designed to respect and protect those natural requirements, keeping them in balance and not crowding or altering them so that vegetation

does not receive more or less space and water, but particularly sunlight, than is required for normal expected growth.

(1) Building Massing to Provide Solar Access to the River. Building massing shall be so designed as to provide direct sunlight to vegetation in the river channel as defined:

A. The area to be measured for solar access shall be a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge or from the river's edge to the building face, whichever is lesser, parallel to the river for the length of the property.

B. The solar calculations shall be measured exclusive to the applicant's property; that is, shades and shadows of other buildings shall not be included in the calculations. The solar calculations shall only measure the impact of new construction and additions. The shading impact of historic buildings on the site may be excluded from the calculations.

C. The defined area shall receive a minimum of 5.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the winter solstice, and 7.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the summer solstice.

D. Those properties located on the south side of the river (whose north face is adjacent to the river) shall only be required to measure the sunlight in the 30-foot setback on the opposite bank of the river.

E. Those properties within the river improvement overlay district not directly adjacent to the river are still subject to the provisions of this section. To determine the solar access effect of these buildings on the river the applicant must measure the nearest point to the river of an area defined by a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge, parallel to the river for the length of their property that would be affected by their building. For those buildings on the south side of the river, the 30-foot setback shall be measured only on the opposite bank.

F. However, in those cases where the above conditions cannot be met due to the natural configuration of the river, existing street patterns, or existing buildings, the HDRC may approve a buildings mass and height as allowed by table 674-2.

G. If there is a conflict with this section and another section of this chapter this section shall prevail.

(2) Prohibition of Structures, Buildings, Roofs or Skywalks Over the River Channel. No structure, building, roof or skywalk may be constructed over the river channel, or by-pass channel with the exception of structures for flood control purposes, open air pedestrian bridges at ground or river level, and street bridges. The river channel is the natural course of the river as modified for flood control purposes and the Pershing-Catalpa ditch.

(b) Building Orientation. Buildings should be sited to help define active spaces for area users, provide pedestrian connections between sites, help animate the street scene and define street edges. Consideration to both the street and riverside should be given. The placement of a building on a site should therefore be considered within the context of the block, as well as how the structure will support the broader design goals for the area.

(1) Two or More Buildings on a Site.

A. Cluster buildings to create active open spaces such as courtyards along the street and river edges. Site plazas and courtyards, if possible, so that they are shaded in the summer and are sunny in the winter.

(2) Primary and Secondary Entrances

A. Orient a building's primary entrance toward the street with subordinate entrances located on the riverside and/or the interior of the property. On a major thoroughfare street it is acceptable to provide the primary entrance through a common courtyard and then to a street.

B. The primary entrance shall be distinguished by architectural features such as, but not limited to: an entry portal; change in material or color; change in scale of other openings; addition of columns, lintels or canopies.

C. Secondary entrances shall have architectural features that are subordinate to the primary entrance in scale and detail. For purposes of this division subordinate means that the entrance is smaller in height and width, and has fewer or simpler architectural elements.

(c) Topography and Drainage. The natural contours of occasional hillsides and riverbanks contribute to the distinct character of the San Antonio River and shall be considered in site designs for new development. Site plans shall minimize the need for cut and fill. It should be considered as an opportunity for positive enhancements through the creative use of terraces and retaining walls.

(1) Visual Impacts of Cut and Fill. Divide a grade change of more than ten (10) vertical feet into a series of benches and terraces. Terrace steep slopes following site contours. When creating site benches, use sloped "transitional areas" as part of the required landscaping is appropriate.

(2) Minimize the Potential for Erosion at the Riverbank. Grade slopes at a stable angle not to exceed four to one (4:1) and provide plant material that will stabilize the soil such as vigorous ground covers, vines or turf planting that are native and noninvasive species as found on the permissible plant list maintained by the parks and recreation department. Use of stabilizing materials such as geo-web or geo-grid is permitted as long as plant material is used to conceal the grid. Use of terraced walls is permitted when there is a slope of more than four to one (4:1).

(3) Retaining Walls. Limit the height of a retaining wall to less than six (6) feet. If the retaining wall must exceed six (6) feet, a series of six-foot terrace walls is acceptable. Walls at dams and locks are excluded from this requirement. If in the opinion of the historic preservation officer a higher wall is consistent with the adopted conceptual plan of the river, a higher wall (not to exceed twelve (12) feet) is allowed. Materials used for the walls may include limestone, stucco, brick, clay, tile, timber, or textured concrete. (see Figure 673-2)

(4) Enhance or Incorporate Acequias Into The Landscape Design and Drainage Scheme of the Site. Where archeological evidence indicates a site contains or has contained a Spanish colonial acequia, incorporate the original path of the acequia as a natural drainageway or a landscape feature of the site by including it as part of the open space plan, and a feature of the landscape design.

(5) Design of Stormwater Management Facilities to be a Landscape Amenity. Where above ground stormwater management facilities are required, such facilities shall be multi-purpose amenities. For example, water quality features can be included as part of the site landscaping and detention facilities can be included as part of a hardscape patio. Using an open concrete basin as a detention pond is prohibited.

(6) Walls and Fences at Detention Areas.

A. When the topography of the site exceeds a four to one (4:1) slope and it becomes necessary to use a masonry wall as part of the detention area, use a textured surface and incorporate plant materials, from the plant list maintained by the parks department, that will drape over the edge to soften the appearance of the structure.

B. The use of solid board or chain link fence with or without slats is prohibited. A welded wire, tubular steel, wrought iron or garden loop is permitted.

(7) Roof Drainage into the River.

A. All roof drainage and other run-off drainage shall conform to public works department standards so that they drain into sewer and storm drains rather than the river. Drainage of this type shall not be piped into the river unless the outlet is below the normal waterline of the river at normal flow rates.

B. All downspouts or gutters draining water from roofs or parapets shall be extended underground under walks and patios to the San Antonio River's edge or stormwater detention facility so that such drainage will not erode or otherwise damage the Riverwalk, landscaping or river retaining walls.

C. All piping and air-conditioning wastewater systems shall be kept in good repair. Water to be drained purposely from these systems, after being tested and adjudged free from pollution, shall be drained in the same manner prescribed in subsection (7)A. above.

(d) Riverside Setbacks. Riverside setbacks for both buildings and accessory structures are established to reinforce the defined character of the specific river improvement overlay district and help to define an edge at the river pathway that is varied according to the relationship of the river and the street. In the more urban areas, buildings should align closer to the river edge, while in more rural areas the buildings should be set farther away.

(1) Minimum setback requirements are per the following Table 673-1.

Description	RIO-1	RIO-2	RIO-3	RIO-4	RIO-5	RIO-6
Riverside Setback	20 FT	15 FT	0 FT	20 FT	50 ft	100 FT

(2) Designation of a development node district provides for a minimum riverside setback of zero (0) feet.

(e) Landscape Design. Lush and varied landscapes are part of the tradition of the San Antonio River. These design standards apply to landscaping within an individual site. Additional standards follow that provide more specific standards for the public pathway along the river and street edges.

(1) Provide Variety in Landscape Design. Provide variety in the landscape experience along the river by varying landscape designs between properties. No more than seventy-five (75) percent of the landscape materials, including plants, shall be the same as those on adjacent properties. (see Figure 673-4).

(2) Planting Requirements in Open Space Abutting the River. On publicly-owned land leased by the adjoining property owner, if applicable, and/or within privately owned setbacks adjacent to the river, a minimum percentage of the open space, excluding building footprint, lease space under bridges and parking requirements, are required to be planted according to Table 673-2.

A. Planting requirements in RIO-4, RIO-5, and RIO-6 should continue the restoration landscape efforts along the river banks. Planting in these RIO districts is to be less formal so as to maintain the rural setting of the river.

B. In "RIO-3," if existing conditions don't meet the standards as set out in Table 673-2, the owner or lessee will not have to remove paving to add landscaping in order to meet the standards until there is a substantial remodeling of the outdoor area. Substantial remodeling will include replacement of seventy-five (75) percent of the paving materials, or replacement of balcony and stair structures.

(f) Plant Materials. A number of soil conditions converge in the San Antonio area to create unique vegetation ecosystems. Along the route of the San Antonio River, the soil conditions vary greatly from the northern boundary near Hildebrand to the city limits near Mission San Francisco de la Espada (Mission Espada) and therefore native and indigenous plants will vary accordingly. Landscaping should reflect the unique soil characteristics of the specific site.

(1) Incorporate Existing Vegetation. Extend the use of landscape materials, including plants, shrubs and trees that are used in the public areas of the river onto adjacent private areas to form a cohesive design.

(2) Use indigenous and noninvasive species characteristic of the specific site as found on the permissible plant list maintained by the parks and recreation department or the Unified Development Code Plant List found in Appendix

E. In "RIO-3," plantings of tropical and semi-tropical plants with perennial background is permitted.

(3) Install Trees to Provide Shade and to Separate Pedestrians From Automobile Traffic. Install street trees along the property line or in the ROW abutting all streets according to minimum requirement standards established in subsection 35-512(b), except where this conflicts with existing downtown Tri-Party improvements in "RIO-3." In "RIO-3" the owner has the option of placing trees at the property line, or along the street edge.

(g) Paving Materials. An important San Antonio landscape tradition is the use of decorative surfaces for paving and other landscape structures. Paving materials and patterns should be carefully chosen to preserve and enhance the pedestrian experience.

(1) Vary Walkway, Patio and Courtyard Paving to Add Visual Interest on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River. Pervious paving is encouraged where feasible and appropriate to the site.

A. A maximum of six hundred (600) square feet is allowed for a single paving material before the paving material must be divided or separated with a paving material that is different in texture, pattern, color or material. A separation using a different material must be a minimum of twenty-four (24) inches wide, the full width of the pathway.

B. A maximum of one hundred (100) lineal feet is allowed in a walkway before the pattern must change in districts "RIO-2," "RIO-3," and "RIO-4." A maximum of five hundred twenty-eight (528) lineal feet is allowed before the pattern must change in districts "RIO-1," "RIO-5" and "RIO-6." The change of material at five hundred twenty-eight (528) lineal feet will define and delineate one-tenth-mile markers.

C. In "RIO-3," the Riverwalk pathway shall be delineated by using a separate material that is clearly distinguished from the adjacent patio paving materials. If the historic Hugman drawings indicate a sidewalk width and pattern on the site, that paving pattern and material shall be replicated.

(h) Site Walls and Fences. Site walls and fences are used to help divide spaces, screen unsightly objects and provide privacy. However, the character of the San Antonio River is such that walls shall not be erected in such a way as to block views of the river from public spaces.

(1) Use of Site Walls to Define Outdoor Spaces.

A. Use of low scale walls (twenty-four (24) inches to forty-eight (48) inches) to divide space, create a variety in landscaping and define edges is permitted.

B. Solid walls (up to seventy-two (72) inches) are permitted to: screen mechanical equipment, garbage

- receptacles and other unsightly areas; and provide privacy at the back of lots up to the front building face.
- (2) Site Wall and Fence Materials.
- A. On properties abutting the river, site walls and fence materials may be constructed of: stone, block, tile, stucco, wrought iron, tubular steel, welded wire or a combination of masonry and metal, cedar posts and welded wire or garden loop or other materials having similar characteristics. All other properties, not abutting the river may use the above listed materials plus wood fencing.
- B. All chain link fences are prohibited for properties abutting the river. For properties that do not abut the river chain link is only allowed in the rear yard if not readily visible from the right-of-way. Barbed wire, razor wire, and concertina are prohibited in all RIO districts.
- (i) Street Furnishings. Street furnishings are exterior amenities, including but not limited to, tables, chairs, umbrellas, landscape pots, wait stations, valet stations, bicycle racks, planters, benches, bus shelters, kiosks, waste receptacles and similar items that help to define pedestrian use areas. Handcrafted street furnishings are particularly important in San Antonio, and therefore this tradition of craftsmanship and of providing street furniture is encouraged.
- (1) Prohibited Street Furnishings in Riverwalk Area. The following street furnishings are prohibited within the publicly owned portion of the Riverwalk area, whether or not the property is leased, and on the exterior of the riverside of buildings directly adjacent to the publicly owned portion of the river:
- A. Vending machines.
- B. Automatic teller machines.
- C. Pay phones.
- D. Photo booths.
- E. Automated machines such as, but not limited to, penny crunching machines, blood pressure machines, fortune-telling machines, video games, animated characters and other machines that are internally illuminated, or have moving parts, or make noise, or have flashing lights.
- F. Inanimate figures such as horses, kangaroos, bears, gorillas, mannequins or any such animal, cartoon or human figure. This section does not affect public art as defined in Appendix "A" of this chapter.
- G. Monitors (i.e., television screens, computer screens).
- H. Speakers.
- (2) Street Furnishing Materials.
- A. Street furnishings shall be made of wood, metal, stone, terra cotta, cast stone, hand-sculpted concrete, or solid surfacing material, such as Corian or Surell.
- B. Inexpensive plastic resin furnishings are prohibited.
- (3) Advertising on Street Furnishings.
- A. No commercial logos, trademarks, decals, product names whether specific or generic, or names of businesses and organizations shall be allowed on street furnishings.
- B. Product or business advertising is prohibited on all street furnishings.
- C. Notwithstanding the restrictions above, applications may be approved for purposes of donor or non-profit recognition.
- (4) Street furnishings, such as tables and chairs may not be stored (other than overnight storage) in such a way as to be visible from the river pathway.
- (j) Lighting. Site lighting should be considered an integral element of the landscape design of a property. It should help define activity areas and provide interest at night. At the same time, lighting should facilitate safe and convenient circulation for pedestrians, bicyclists and motorists. Overspill of light and light pollution should be avoided.
- (1) Site Lighting. Site lighting shall be shielded by permanent attachments to light fixtures so that the light sources are not visible from a public way and any offsite glare is prevented.
- A. Site lighting shall include illumination of parking areas, buildings, pedestrian routes, dining areas, design features and public ways.
- B. Outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall have average ambient light levels of between one (1) and three (3) foot-candles with a minimum of 0.5-foot candles and a maximum

of six (6) foot-candles at any point measured on the ground plane. Interior spaces visible from the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level shall use light sources with no more than the equivalent lumens of a one hundred-watt incandescent bulb. Exterior balconies, porches and canopies adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall use light sources with the equivalent lumens of a sixty-watt incandescent bulb with average ambient light levels no greater than the lumen output of a one hundred-watt incandescent light bulb as long as average foot candle standards are not exceeded. Accent lighting of landscape or building features including specimen plants, gates, entries, water features, art work, stairs, and ramps may exceed these standards by a multiple of 2.5. Recreational fields and activity areas that require higher light levels shall be screened from the river hike and bike pathways with a landscape buffer.

C. Exterior light fixtures that use the equivalent of more than one hundred-watt incandescent bulbs shall not emit a significant amount of the fixture's total output above a vertical cut-off angle of ninety (90) degrees. Any structural part of the fixture providing this cut-off angle must be permanently affixed.

D. Lighting spillover to the publicly owned areas of the river or across property lines shall not exceed one-half (1/2) of one (1) foot-candle measured at any point ten (10) feet beyond the property line.

(2) Provide Lighting for Pedestrian Ways That is Low Scaled for Walking. The position of a lamp in a pedestrian-way light shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height above the ground.

(3) Light Temperature and Color.

A. Light temperature and color shall be between 2500° K and 3500° K with a color rendition index (CRI) of eighty (80) or higher, respectively. This restriction is limited to all outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way and from the interior spaces adjoining the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level. Levels shall be determined by product specifications.

(4) Minimize the Visual Impacts of Exterior Building Lighting.

A. All security lighting shall be shielded so that the light sources are not visible from a public way.

B. Lighting (uplighting and downlighting) that is positioned to highlight a building or outdoor artwork shall be aimed at the object to be illuminated, not pointed into the sky.

C. Fixtures shall not distract from, or obscure important architectural features of the building. Lighting fixtures shall be a subordinate feature on the building unless they are incorporated into the over-all design scheme of the building.

(5) Prohibited Lighting on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River.

A. Flashing lights.

B. Rotating lights.

C. Chaser lights.

D. Exposed neon.

E. Seasonal decorating lights such as festoon, string or rope lights, except between November 20 and January 10.

F. Flood lamps.

(6) Minimize the visual impacts of lighting in parking areas in order to enhance the perception of the nighttime sky and to prevent glare onto adjacent properties. Parking lot light poles are limited to thirty (30) feet in height, shall have a 90° cutoff angle so as to not emit light above the horizontal plane.

(k) Curbs and Gutters.

(1) Construct Curb and Gutter Along the Street Edge of a Property.

A. Install curbs and gutter along the street edge at the time of improving a parcel.

B. In order to preserve the rural character of RIO-5 and RIO-6, the HPO in coordination with public works and the development services department may waive the requirement of curbs and gutters.

(l) Access to Public Pathway Along the River. These requirements are specifically for those properties adjacent to the river to provide a connection to the publicly owned pathway along the river. The connections are to stimulate and enhance urban activity, provide path connections in an urban context, enliven street activity, and protect the ambiance and character of the river area.

(1) A stair, ramp or elevator connecting the publicly owned pathway at the river to private property along the river is allowed by right at the following locations:

- A. At all street and vehicular bridge crossings over the river.
- B. Where publicly owned streets dead end into the river.
- C. Where the pedestrian pathway in the Riverwalk area is located at the top of bank and there is a two-foot or less grade change between the private property and the pathway.

(2) If there is a grade change greater than two (2) feet between the private property and the publicly owned pathway at the river then the following conditions apply:

A. Access to the publicly owned pathway is limited to one (1) connection per property, with the exception that connections are always allowed at street and vehicular bridge crossings. For example if one (1) property extends the entire block face from street crossing to street crossing the owner would be allowed three (3) access points if the distance requirements were met.

B. The minimum distance between access points shall be ninety-five (95) feet. Only street and vehicular bridge connections are exempted. Mid-block access points must meet this requirement.

C. Reciprocal access agreements between property owners are permitted.

(3) Clearly define a key pedestrian gateway into the site from the publicly owned pathway at the river with distinctive architectural or landscape elements.

A. The primary gateway from a development to the publicly owned pathway at the river shall be defined by an architectural or landscape element made of stone, brick, tile, metal, rough hewn cedar or hand-formed concrete or through the use of distinctive plantings or planting beds.

(m) Buffering and Screening. The manner in which screening and buffering elements are designed on a site greatly affects the character of the river districts. In general, service areas shall be screened or buffered. "Buffers" are considered to be landscaped berms, planters or planting beds; whereas, more solid "screens" include fences and walls. When site development creates an unavoidable negative visual impact on abutting properties or to the public right-of-way, it shall be mitigated with a landscape design that will buffer or screen it.

(1) Landscape Buffers Shall be Used in the Following Circumstances: To buffer the edges of a parking lot from pedestrian ways and outdoor use areas, (such as patios, and courtyards), and as an option to screening in order to buffer service areas, garbage disposal areas, mechanical equipment, storage areas, maintenance yards, equipment storage areas and other similar activities that by their nature create unsightly views from pedestrian ways, streets, public ROWs and adjoining property.

(2) Screening Elements Shall be Used in the Following Circumstances: To screen service areas, storage areas, or garbage areas from pedestrian ways.

(3) Exceptions for Site Constraints. Due to site constraints, in all RIOs and specifically for "RIO-3" where there is less than ten (10) feet to provide for the minimum landscape berm, a screen may be used in conjunction with plantings to meet the intent of these standards. For example a low site wall may be combined with plant materials to create a buffer with a lesser cross sectional width.

(4) Applicable Bufferyard Types. Table 510-2 establishes minimum plant materials required for each bufferyard type. For purposes of this section, type C shall be the acceptable minimum type.

(5) Applicable Screening Fence and Wall Types. Screening fences and walls shall be subject to conditions of subsection 35-673(h), Walls and Fences.

(n) Service Areas and Mechanical Equipment. Service areas and mechanical equipment should be visually unobtrusive and should be integrated with the design of the site and building. Noise generated from mechanical equipment shall not exceed city noise regulations.

(1) Locate service entrances, waste disposal areas and other similar uses adjacent to service lanes and away from major streets and the river.

A. Position utility boxes so that they cannot be seen from the public Riverwalk path, or from major streets, by locating them on the sides of buildings and away from pedestrian and vehicular routes. Locating them within interior building corners, at building offsets or other similar locations where the building mass acts as a shield from public view is preferred.

B. Orient the door to a trash enclosure to face away from the street when feasible.

C. Air intake and exhaust systems, or other mechanical equipment that generates noise, smoke or odors, shall not be located at the pedestrian level.

(2) Screening of service entrance shall be compatible with the buildings on the block face.

A. When it would be visible from a public way, a service area shall be visually compatible with the buildings on the block face.

B. A wall will be considered compatible if it uses the same material as other buildings on the block, or is painted a neutral color such as beige, gray or dark green or if it is in keeping with the color scheme of the adjacent building.

(o) Bicycle Parking. On-site bicycle parking helps promote a long term sustainable strategy for development in RIO districts. Bicycle parking shall be placed in a well lit and accessible area. UDC bicycle parking requirements in UDC 35-526 can be met through indoor bicycle storage facilities in lieu of outdoor bike rack fixtures.

Sec. 35-674. Building Design Principles

(a) Architectural Character. A basic objective for architectural design in the river improvement overlay districts is to encourage the reuse of existing buildings and construction of new, innovative designs that enhance the area, and help to establish distinct identities for each of the zone districts. At the same time, these new buildings should reinforce established building traditions and respect the contexts of neighborhoods.

When a new building is constructed, it shall be designed in a manner that reinforces the basic character-defining features of the area. Such features include the way in which a building is located on its site, the manner in which it faces the street and its orientation to the river. When these design variables are arranged in a new building to be similar to those seen traditionally, visual compatibility results.

(b) Mass and Scale. A building shall appear to have a "human scale." In general, this scale can be accomplished by using familiar forms and elements interpreted in human dimensions. Exterior wall designs shall help pedestrians establish a sense of scale with relation to each building. Articulating the number of floors in a building can help to establish a building's scale, for example, and prevent larger buildings from dwarfing the pedestrian.

(1) Express facade components in ways that will help to establish building scale.

A. Treatment of architectural facades shall contain a discernible pattern of mass to void, or windows and doors to solid mass. Openings shall appear in a regular pattern, or be clustered to form a cohesive design. Architectural elements such as columns, lintels, sills, canopies, windows and doors should align with other architectural features on the adjacent facades.

(2) Align horizontal building elements with others in the blockface to establish building scale.

A. Align at least one (1) horizontal building element with another horizontal building element on the same block face. It will be considered to be within alignment if it is within three (3) feet, measured vertically, of the existing architectural element.

(3) Express the distinction between upper and lower floors.

A. Develop the first floor as primarily transparent. The building facade facing a major street shall have at least fifty (50) percent of the street level facade area devoted to display windows and/or windows affording some view into the interior areas. Multi-family residential buildings with no retail or office space are exempt from this requirement.

(4) Where a building facade faces the street or river and exceeds the maximum facade length allowed in Table 674-1 divide the facade of building into modules that express traditional dimensions.

A. The maximum length of an individual wall plane that faces a street or the river shall be as shown in Table 674-1.

Table 674-1

Description	RIO-1	RIO-2	RIO-3	RIO-4	RIO-5	RIO-6
Maximum Facade Length	50 ft.	50 ft.	30 ft.	75 ft.	75 ft.	50 ft.

B. If a building wall plane facing the street or river and exceeds the length allowed in Table 674-1, employ at least two (2) of the following techniques to reduce the perceived mass:

- Change materials with each building module to reduce its perceived mass; or
- Change the height with each building module of a wall plane. The change in height shall be at least ten (10) percent of the vertical height; or

- Change the roof form of each building module to help express the different modules of the building mass; or
 - Change the arrangement of windows and other facade articulation features, such as, columns, pilasters or strap work, which divides large planes into smaller components.
- (5) Organize the Mass of a Building to Provide Solar Access to the River.
- A. One (1) method of doing so is to step the building down toward the river to meet the solar access requirements of subsection 35-673(a).
 - B. Another method is to set the building back from the river a distance sufficient to meet the solar access requirements of subsection 35-673(a).
- (c) Height. Building heights vary along the river corridor, from one-story houses to high-rise hotels and apartments. This diversity of building heights is expected to continue. However, within each zone, a general similarity in building heights should be encouraged in order to help establish a sense of visual continuity. In addition, building heights shall be configured such that a comfortable human scale is established along the edges of properties and views to the river and other significant landmarks are provided while allowing the appropriate density for an area.
- (1) The maximum building height shall be as defined in Table 674-2.
- A. Solar access standards subsection 35-673(a), and massing standards subsection 35-674(b) also will affect building heights.

Table 674-2

Description	RIO-1	RIO-2	RIO-3	RIO-4	RIO-5	RIO-6
Maximum # of Stories	5	10	None	7	5	4
Maximum Height in Feet	60 ft.	120 ft.	None	84 ft.	60 ft.	50 ft.

(3) On the street-side, the building facade shall appear similar in height to those of other buildings found traditionally in the area. If fifty (50) percent of the building facades within a block face are predominantly lower than the maximum height allowed, the new building facade on the street-side shall align with the average height of those lower buildings within the block face, or with a particular building that falls within the fifty (50) percent range. However, the remainder of the building may obtain its maximum height by stepping back fifteen (15) feet from the building face.

(4) Designation of a development node provides for the ability to increase the building height by fifty (50) percent from the requirements set out in article VI.

(d) Materials and Finishes. Masonry materials are well established as primary features along the river corridor and their use should be continued. Stucco that is detailed to provide a texture and pattern, which conveys a human scale, is also part of the tradition. In general, materials and finishes that provide a sense of human scale, reduce the perceived mass of a building and appear to blend with the natural setting of the river shall be used, especially on major structures.

(1) Use indigenous materials and traditional building materials for primary wall surfaces. A minimum of seventy-five (75) percent of walls (excluding window fenestrations) shall be composed of the following:

- A. Modular masonry materials including brick, stone, and rusticated masonry block, tile, terra-cotta, structural clay tile and cast stone. Concrete masonry units (CMU) are not allowed.
- B. Other new materials that convey the texture, scale, and finish similar to traditional building materials.
- C. Stucco and painted concrete when detailed to express visual interest and convey a sense of scale.
- D. Painted or stained wood in a lap or shingle pattern.

(2) The following materials are not permitted as primary building materials and may be used as a secondary material only:

- A. Large expanses of high gloss or shiny metal panels.
- B. Mirror glass panels. Glass curtain wall buildings are allowed in RIO-3 as long as the river and street levels comply with 35-674(d)(1) above.

(3) Paint or Finish Colors.

- A. Use natural colors of indigenous building materials for properties that abut the Riverwalk area.

B. Use matte finishes instead of high glossy finishes on wall surfaces. Wood trim and metal trim may be painted with gloss enamel.

C. Bright colors may highlight entrances or architectural features.

(e) Facade Composition. Traditionally, many commercial and multi-family buildings in the core of San Antonio have had facade designs that are organized into three (3) distinct segments: First, a "base" exists, which establishes a scale at the street level; second a "mid-section," or shaft is used, which may include several floors. Finally a "cap" finishes the composition. The cap may take the form of an ornamental roof form or decorative molding and may also include the top floors of the building. This organization helps to give a sense of scale to a building and its use should be encouraged. In order to maintain the sense of scale, buildings should have the same setback as surrounding buildings so as to maintain the street-wall pattern, if clearly established.

In contrast, the traditional treatment of facades along the riverside has been more modest. This treatment is largely a result of the fact that the riverside was a utilitarian edge and was not oriented to the public. Today, even though orienting buildings to the river is a high priority objective, it is appropriate that these river-oriented facades be simpler in character than those facing the street.

(1) Street Facade. Buildings that are taller than the street-wall (sixty (60) feet) shall be articulated at the stop of the street wall or stepped back in order to maintain the rhythm of the street wall. Buildings should be composed to include a base, a middle and a cap.

A. High rise buildings, more than one hundred (100) feet tall, shall terminate with a distinctive top or cap. This can be accomplished by:

- i. Reducing the bulk of the top twenty (20) percent of the building by ten (10) percent.
- ii. By stepping back the top twenty (20) percent of the building.
- iii. Changing the material of the cap.

B. Roof forms shall be used to conceal all mechanical equipment and to add architectural interest to the structure.

C. Roof surfaces should include strategies to reduce heat island effects such as use of green roofs, photo voltaic panels, and/or the use of roof materials with high solar reflectivity.

(2) Fenestration. Windows help provide a human scale and so shall be proportioned accordingly.

D. Curtain wall systems shall be designed with modulating features such as projecting horizontal and/or vertical mullions.

(3) Entrances. Entrances shall be easy to find, be a special feature of the building, and be appropriately scaled.

A. Entrances shall be the most prominent on the street side and less prominent on the river side.

B. Entrances shall be placed so as to be highly visible.

C. The scale of the entrance is determined by the prominence of the function and or the amount of use.

D. Entrances shall have a change in material and/or wall plane.

E. Entrances should not use excessive storefront systems.

(4) Riverside facade. The riverside facade of a building shall have simpler detailing and composition than the street facade.

A. Architectural details such as cornices, sills, lintels, door surrounds, water tables and other similar details should use simple curves and handcrafted detailing.

B. Stone detailing shall be rough hewn, and chiseled faced. Smooth faced stone is not permitted as the primary building material, but can be used as accent pieces.

C. Facades on the riverside shall be asymmetrical, pedestrian scale, and give the appearance of the back of a building. That is, in traditional building along the river, the backs of building were designed with simpler details, and appear less formal than the street facades.

(g) Awnings, Canopies and Arcades. (See Figure 674-2) The tradition of sheltering sidewalks with awnings, canopies and arcades on commercial and multi-family buildings is well established in San Antonio and is a practice that should be continued. They offer shade from the hot summer sun and shelter from rainstorms, thereby facilitating pedestrian activity. They also establish a sense of scale for a building, especially at the ground level. Awnings and canopies are appropriate locations for signage. Awnings with signage shall comply with any master signage plan on file with the historic preservation officer for the property. Awnings and canopies installed at street level within the public right-of-way require licensing with the city's capital improvements management

services (CIMS) department. Canopies, balconies and awnings installed at river level within the public right-of-way require licensing with the city's downtown operations department.

- (1) If awnings, arcades and canopies are to be used they should accentuate the character-defining features of a building.
 - A. The awning, arcade or canopy shall be located in relationship to the openings of a building. That is, if there are a series of awnings or canopies, they shall be located at the window or door openings. However awnings, canopies and arcades may extend the length of building to provide shade at the first floor for the pedestrian.
 - B. Awnings, arcades and canopies shall be mounted to highlight architectural features such as moldings that may be found above the storefront.
 - C. They should match the shape of the opening.
 - D. Simple shed shapes are appropriate for rectangular openings.
 - E. Odd shapes and bubble awnings are prohibited except where the shape of an opening requires a bubble awning, or historic precedent shows they have been previously used on the building.
 - F. Canopies, awnings and arcades shall not conflict with the building's proportions or with the shape of the openings that the awning or canopy covers.
 - G. Historic canopies shall be repaired or replaced with in-kind materials.
- (2) Materials and Color.
 - A. Awnings and canopies may be constructed of metal, wood or fabric. Certain vinyl is allowed if it has the appearance of natural fiber as approved by the HDRC.
 - B. Awning color shall coordinate with the building. Natural and earth tone colors are encouraged. Fluorescent colors are not allowed. When used for signage it is appropriate to choose a dark color for the canopy and use light lettering for signage.
- (3) Incorporating lighting into the design of a canopy is appropriate.
 - A. Lights that illuminate the pedestrian way beneath the awning are appropriate.
 - B. Lights that illuminate the storefront are appropriate.
 - C. Internally illuminated awnings that glow are prohibited.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends conceptual approval based on findings a through t with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant explore ways to reduce the impact or eliminate the cantilever over the River Walk area.
- ii. That fenestration and other façade separating elements be added to the south and east facades as noted in finding n.
- iii. That all mechanical and service equipment be screened from view at the public right of way as noted in finding h.
- iv. That a detailed landscaping plan be submitted when returning for final approval as noted in finding g.
- v. That the applicant install dark colored windows that feature metal materials that are recessed at least two (2) inches within facades as noted in finding o.
- vi. That the applicant submit a master signage plan for review and approval by the HDRC that includes both building and tenant signage, and that the vertical "Artista" sign be eliminated as noted in finding q.
- vii. That no outdoor furniture impede upon the public right of way at the River Walk or street levels as noted in finding r.
- viii. That a detailed lighting plan be submitted for review and approval when returning for final approval as noted in finding s.
- ix. **ARCHAEOLOGY** – Archaeological investigations shall be required. The archaeological scope of work should be submitted to the Office of Historic Preservation archaeologists for review and approval prior to beginning the archaeological investigation. The project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved for conceptual approval with staff stipulations. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, and Bowman.
Nays: NONE .
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES AND 0 NAY. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item #A-6. HDRC NO. 2019-297**

ADDRESS: 3020 BROADWAY

APPLICANT: Brandon Moffett

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct an addition to the existing building and expand the existing parking lot to the east to the vacant lot at 108 and 110 Ira.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

UDC Section 35-672. – Neighborhood Wide Design Standards

(a) Pedestrian Circulation. Pedestrian access shall be provided among properties to integrate neighborhoods.

(1) Provide sidewalks that link with existing sidewalks on adjoining properties. If no sidewalk currently exists on an adjoining property, the applicant will have discretion in the placement of the sidewalk provided the following criteria are met:

A. Provide a sidewalk connection from one (1) side of the applicant's property to the other, parallel to the public right-of-way, on the street sides of the property in all river improvement overlay districts

B. Provide a connection from the street level sidewalk to the Riverwalk at cross streets and bridges and other designated access points. This requirement may be waived if there is already a public connection from the street level to the Riverwalk.

C. In order to preserve the rural character of "RIO-6," the HPO, in coordination with the development services department, may waive the requirement of sidewalks.

- In "RIO-3," the width of the pathway along the river shall match those widths established in the historic Hugman drawings. If there are no sidewalks in the Hugman drawings, the path will not exceed eight (8) feet in width.

(2) Link the various functions and spaces on a site with sidewalks in a coordinated system.

Provide pedestrian sidewalks between buildings, parking areas and built features such as outdoor plazas and courtyards.

(3) Paving materials. Paving materials for pedestrian pathways shall use visually and texturally different materials than those used for parking spaces and automobile traffic.

A. Paving materials for pedestrian pathways shall be either:

- i. Broom-finished, scored, sandblasted or dyed concrete;
- ii. Rough or honed finished stone;
- iii. Brick or concrete pavers; or
- iv. Other materials that meet the performance standards of the above materials.

B. Asphalt is permitted for pedestrian pathways that also are designated as multi-use paths by the City of San Antonio. The public works department will maintain the designated multi-use path locations.

(4) Street Connections to River. Retain the interesting and unique situations where streets dead-end at the river, creating both visual and physical access to the river for the public.

(5) Pedestrian Access Along the Riverwalk Pathway Shall Not Be Blocked.

A. Queuing is prohibited on the Riverwalk pathway.

B. Hostess stations shall be located away from the Riverwalk pathway so as to not inhibit pedestrian flow on the Riverwalk pathway. That is, the hostess station shall not be located in such a manner to cause a patron who has stopped at the hostess stand to be standing on the Riverwalk pathway. Pedestrian flow shall be considered "inhibited" if a pedestrian walking along the pathway has to swerve, dodge, change direction or come to a complete stop to avoid a patron engaged at the hostess stand.

C. Tables and chairs shall be located a sufficient distance from the Riverwalk pathway so that normal dining and service shall not inhibit the flow of pedestrian traffic. See inhibited definition in subsection B. above.

(b) Automobile Access and Parking. Automobile circulation should be efficient, and conflicts with pedestrians minimized. Entry points for automobiles should be clearly defined and connections to auto circulation on adjoining properties are encouraged to facilitate access and reduce traffic on abutting public streets.

(1) Curb Cuts.

A. Limit curb cuts to two (2) on parking areas or structures facing only one (1) street, and one (1) for each additional street face. The prohibition of additional curb cuts may be waived by the HDRC where the intent of the standards are clearly met and specific site circulation patterns require an additional curb cut, such as on long parcels or at nodes.

B. Curb cuts may be no larger than twenty-five (25) feet zero (0) inches. Continuous curb cuts are prohibited.

C. Sharing curb cuts between adjacent properties, such as providing cross property access easements, is permitted.

(2) Location of Parking Areas. Automobile parking in new developments must be balanced with the requirements of active environments. Large expanses of surface parking lots have a negative impact on street activity and the pedestrian experience. New commercial and residential structures can accommodate parking needs and contribute to a pedestrian-friendly streetscape.

A. Locate parking areas, that is any off-street, ground level surface used to park cars or any parking structure, toward the interior of the site or to the side or rear of a building.

B. The extent of parking area that may be located along the street edge or riverside shall be limited to a percentage of the lot line as per Table 672-1 as measured in a lineal direction parallel to the lot line. All parking within a thirty-foot setback from the above mentioned lot line shall comply with the requirements of the table. Where parking is located on corner sites only one (1) lot line has to meet the requirements of the table.

C. Parking lots should be avoided as a primary land use. Parking lots as a primary use are prohibited in RIO-3 and for all properties that fall within one hundred (100) feet of the river right-of-way in all RIO districts.

(3) Screen or Buffer Parking Areas From View of Public Streets, the River or Adjacent Residential Uses. (see Figure 672-2). Parking lots shall be screened with a landscape buffer as per the illustrations of bufferyards and Table 510-2 if the parking area meets one (1) of the following conditions:

A. Within a fifty-foot setback from the edge of the river ROW use, at a minimum, type E; or

B. Within a twenty-foot setback from a property line adjacent to a street use, at a minimum, type B; or

C. Within a twenty-foot setback of commercial or industrial property that abuts a residential property use, at a minimum, type C.

(4) Parking Structures Shall Be Compatible With Buildings in the Surrounding Area. Parking garages should have retail space on the ground floor of a parking structure provided the retail space has at least fifty (50) percent of its linear street frontage as display windows. Parking structures may be made visually appealing with a mural or public art component approved by the HDRC on the parking structure. A parking garage will be considered compatible if:

A. It does not vary in height by more than thirty (30) percent from another building on the same block face; and

B. It uses materials that can be found on other buildings within the block face, or in the block face across the street.

(5) Parking Structures Shall Provide Clearly Defined Pedestrian Access. Pedestrian entrances and exits shall be accentuated with directional signage, lighting or architectural features so that pedestrians can readily discern the appropriate path of travel to avoid pedestrian/auto conflicts.

(6) Parking lots, structures, and hardscape shall not drain directly into the river without installation of appropriate water quality best management practices (WQ BMPs). Acequias shall not be used for any type of drainage.

(c) Views. The river's course (both natural and manmade), and San Antonio's street pattern, creates unique views of certain properties from the public ROW. These properties often occur at prominent curves in the river or where a street changes direction and a property appears to be a terminus at the end of a street.

(1) Architectural Focal Point. When a property is situated in such a manner as to appear to be the terminus at the end of the street or at a prominent curve in the river, the building shall incorporate into its design an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. (see Figure 672-3) An architectural feature will be considered to be a focal point through any of the following methods, but not limited to:

A. Additional height.

B. Creation of a tower.

C. Variation in roof shape.

D. Change of color or materials.

E. Addition of a design enhancement feature such as:

i. Embellished entrance areas.

ii. Articulated corners, especially when entrance is at corner, rounded or chamfered corners ease the transitions from one street facade to the adjoining facade.

iii. Recessed or projecting balconies and entrances.

Billboards, advertising and signage are expressly prohibited as appropriate focal points.

UDC Section 35-673. – Site Design Standards

(a) Solar Access. The intent of providing and maintaining solar access to the San Antonio River is to protect the river's specific ecoclimate. The river has a special microclimate of natural and planted vegetation that requires certain levels and balanced amounts of sunlight, space and water. Development must be designed to respect and protect those natural requirements, keeping them in balance and not crowding or altering them so that vegetation does not receive more or less space and water, but particularly sunlight, than is required for normal expected growth.

(1) Building Massing to Provide Solar Access to the River. Building massing shall be so designed as to provide direct sunlight to vegetation in the river channel as defined:

A. The area to be measured for solar access shall be a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge or from the river's edge to the building face, which ever is lesser, parallel to the river for the length of the property.

B. The solar calculations shall be measured exclusive to the applicant's property; that is, shades and shadows of other buildings shall not be included in the calculations. The solar calculations shall only measure the impact of new construction and additions. The shading impact of historic buildings on the site may be excluded from the calculations.

C. The defined area shall receive a minimum of 5.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the winter solstice, and 7.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the summer solstice.

D. Those properties located on the south side of the river (whose north face is adjacent to the river) shall only be required to measure the sunlight in the 30-foot setback on the opposite bank of the river.

E. Those properties within the river improvement overlay district not directly adjacent to the river are still subject to the provisions of this section. To determine the solar access effect of these buildings on the river the applicant must measure the nearest point to the river of an area defined by a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge, parallel to the river for the length of their property that would be affected by their building. For those buildings on the south side of the river, the 30-foot setback shall be measured only on the opposite bank.

F. However, in those cases where the above conditions cannot be met due to the natural configuration of the river, existing street patterns, or existing buildings, the HDRC may approve a buildings mass and height as allowed by table 674-2.

G. If there is a conflict with this section and another section of this chapter this section shall prevail.

(2) Prohibition of Structures, Buildings, Roofs or Skywalks Over the River Channel. No structure, building, roof or skywalk may be constructed over the river channel, or by-pass channel with the exception of structures for flood control purposes, open air pedestrian bridges at ground or river level, and street bridges. The river channel is the natural course of the river as modified for flood control purposes and the Pershing-Catalpa ditch.

(b) Building Orientation. Buildings should be sited to help define active spaces for area users, provide pedestrian connections between sites, help animate the street scene and define street edges. Consideration to both the street and riverside should be given. The placement of a building on a site should therefore be considered within the context of the block, as well as how the structure will support the broader design goals for the area.

(1) Two or More Buildings on a Site.

A. Cluster buildings to create active open spaces such as courtyards along the street and river edges. Site plazas and courtyards, if possible, so that they are shaded in the summer and are sunny in the winter.

(2) Primary and Secondary Entrances

A. Orient a building's primary entrance toward the street with subordinate entrances located on the riverside and/or the interior of the property. On a major thoroughfare street it is acceptable to provide the primary entrance through a common courtyard and then to a street.

B. The primary entrance shall be distinguished by architectural features such as, but not limited to: an entry portal; change in material or color; change in scale of other openings; addition of columns, lintels or canopies.

C. Secondary entrances shall have architectural features that are subordinate to the primary entrance in scale and detail. For purposes of this division subordinate means that the entrance is smaller in height and width, and has fewer or simpler architectural elements.

(c) Topography and Drainage. The natural contours of occasional hillsides and riverbanks contribute to the distinct character of the San Antonio River and shall be considered in site designs for new development. Site plans shall minimize the need for cut and fill. It should be considered as an opportunity for positive enhancements through the creative use of terraces and retaining walls.

(1) Visual Impacts of Cut and Fill. Divide a grade change of more than ten (10) vertical feet into a series of benches and terraces. Terrace steep slopes following site contours. When creating site benches, using sloped "transitional areas" as part of the required landscaping is appropriate.

(2) Minimize the Potential for Erosion at the Riverbank. Grade slopes at a stable angle not to exceed four to one (4:1) and provide plant material that will stabilize the soil such as vigorous ground covers, vines or turf planting that are native and noninvasive species as found on the permissible plant list maintained by the parks and recreation department. Use of stabilizing materials such as geo-web or geo-grid is permitted as long as plant material is used to conceal the grid.

Use of terraced walls is permitted when there is a slope of more than four to one (4:1).

(3) Retaining Walls. Limit the height of a retaining wall to less than six (6) feet. If the retaining wall must exceed six (6) feet, a series of six-foot terrace walls is acceptable. Walls at dams and locks are excluded from this requirement. If in the opinion of the historic preservation officer a higher wall is consistent with the adopted conceptual plan of the river, a higher wall (not to exceed twelve (12) feet) is

allowed. Materials used for the walls may include limestone, stucco, brick, clay, tile, timber, or textured concrete. (see Figure 673-2)

(4) Enhance or Incorporate Acequias Into The Landscape Design and Drainage Scheme of the Site. Where archeological evidence indicates a site contains or has contained a Spanish colonial acequia, incorporate the original path of the acequia as a natural drainageway or a landscape feature of the site by including it as part of the open space plan, and a feature of the landscape design.

(5) Design of Stormwater Management Facilities to be a Landscape Amenity. Where above ground stormwater management facilities are required, such facilities shall be multi-purpose amenities. For example, water quality features can be included as part of the site landscaping and detention facilities can be included as part of a hardscape patio. Using an open concrete basin as a detention pond is prohibited.

(6) Walls and Fences at Detention Areas.

A. When the topography of the site exceeds a four to one (4:1) slope and it becomes necessary to use a masonry wall as part of the detention area, use a textured surface and incorporate plant materials, from the plant list maintained by the parks department, that will drape over the edge to soften the appearance of the structure.

B. The use of solid board or chain link fence with or without slats is prohibited. A welded wire, tubular steel, wrought iron or garden loop is permitted.

(7) Roof Drainage into the River.

A. All roof drainage and other run-off drainage shall conform to public works department standards so that they \drain into sewer and storm drains rather than the river. Drainage of this type shall not be piped into the river unless the outlet is below the normal waterline of the river at normal flow rates.

B. All downspouts or gutters draining water from roofs or parapets shall be extended underground under walks and patios to the San Antonio River's edge or stormwater detention facility so that such drainage will not erode or otherwise damage the Riverwalk, landscaping or river retaining walls.

C. All piping and air-conditioning wastewater systems shall be kept in good repair. Water to be drained purposely from these systems, after being tested and adjudged free from pollution, shall be drained in the same manner prescribed in subsection (7)A. above.

(d) Riverside Setbacks. Riverside setbacks for both buildings and accessory structures are established to reinforce the defined character of the specific river improvement overlay district and help to define an edge at the river pathway that is varied according to the relationship of the river and the street. In the more urban areas, buildings should align closer to the river edge, while in more rural areas the buildings should be set farther away.

(1) Minimum setback requirements are per the following Table 673-1.

Description	RIO-1	RIO-2	RIO-3	RIO-4	RIO-5	RIO-6
Riverside Setback	20 FT	15 FT	0 FT	20 FT	50 ft	100 FT

(2) Designation of a development node district provides for a minimum riverside setback of zero (0) feet.

(e) Landscape Design. Lush and varied landscapes are part of the tradition of the San Antonio River. These design standards apply to landscaping within an individual site. Additional standards follow that provide more specific standards for the public pathway along the river and street edges.

(1) Provide Variety in Landscape Design. Provide variety in the landscape experience along the river by varying landscape designs between properties. No more than seventy-five (75) percent of the landscape materials, including plants, shall be the same as those on adjacent properties. (see Figure 673-4).

(2) Planting Requirements in Open Space Abutting the River. On publicly-owned land leased by the adjoining property owner, if applicable, and/or within privately owned setbacks adjacent to the river, a minimum percentage of the open space, excluding building footprint, lease space under bridges and parking requirements, are required to be planted according to Table 673-2.

A. Planting requirements in RIO-4, RIO-5, and RIO-6 should continue the restoration landscape efforts along the river banks. Planting in these RIO districts is to be less formal so as to maintain the rural setting of the river.

B. In "RIO-3," if existing conditions don't meet the standards as set out in Table 673-2, the owner or lessee will not have to remove paving to add landscaping in order to meet the standards until there is a substantial remodeling of the outdoor area. Substantial remodeling will include replacement of seventy-five (75) percent of the paving materials, or replacement of balcony and stair structures.

(f) Plant Materials. A number of soil conditions converge in the San Antonio area to create unique vegetation ecosystems. Along the route of the San Antonio River, the soil conditions vary greatly from the northern boundary near Hildebrand to the city limits near Mission San Francisco de la Espada (Mission Espada) and therefore native and indigenous plants will vary accordingly. Landscaping should reflect the unique soil characteristics of the specific site.

(1) Incorporate Existing Vegetation. Extend the use of landscape materials, including plants, shrubs and trees that are used in the public areas of the river onto adjacent private areas to form a cohesive design.

(2) Use indigenous and noninvasive species characteristic of the specific site as found on the permissible plant list maintained by the parks and recreation department or the Unified Development Code Plant List found in Appendix E. In "RIO-3," plantings of tropical and semi-tropical plants with perennial background is permitted.

(3) Install Trees to Provide Shade and to Separate Pedestrians From Automobile Traffic. Install street trees along the property line or in the ROW abutting all streets according to minimum requirement standards established in subsection 35-512(b), except where this conflicts with existing downtown Tri-Party improvements in "RIO-3." In "RIO-3" the owner has the option of placing trees at the property line, or along the street edge.

(g) Paving Materials. An important San Antonio landscape tradition is the use of decorative surfaces for paving and other landscape structures. Paving materials and patterns should be carefully chosen to preserve and enhance the pedestrian experience.

(1) Vary Walkway, Patio and Courtyard Paving to Add Visual Interest on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River. Pervious paving is encouraged where feasible and appropriate to the site.

A. A maximum of six hundred (600) square feet is allowed for a single paving material before the paving material must be divided or separated with a paving material that is different in texture, pattern, color or material. A separation using a different material must be a minimum of twenty-four (24) inches wide, the full width of the pathway.

B. A maximum of one hundred (100) lineal feet is allowed in a walkway before the pattern must change in districts "RIO-2," "RIO-3," and "RIO-4." A maximum of five hundred twenty-eight (528) lineal feet is allowed before the pattern must change in districts "RIO-1," "RIO-5" and "RIO-6." The change of material at five hundred twenty-eight (528) lineal feet will define and delineate one-tenth-mile markers.

C. In "RIO-3," the Riverwalk pathway shall be delineated by using a separate material that is clearly distinguished from the adjacent patio paving materials. If the historic Hugman drawings indicate a sidewalk width and pattern on the site, that paving pattern and material shall be replicated.

(h) Site Walls and Fences. Site walls and fences are used to help divide spaces, screen unsightly objects and provide privacy. However, the character of the San Antonio River is such that walls shall not be erected in such a way as to block views of the river from public spaces.

(1) Use of Site Walls to Define Outdoor Spaces.

A. Use of low scale walls (twenty-four (24) inches to forty-eight (48) inches) to divide space, create a variety in landscaping and define edges is permitted.

B. Solid walls (up to seventy-two (72) inches) are permitted to: screen mechanical equipment, garbage receptacles and other unsightly areas; and provide privacy at the back of lots up to the front building face.

(2) Site Wall and Fence Materials.

A. On properties abutting the river, site walls and fence materials may be constructed of: stone, block, tile, stucco, wrought iron, tubular steel, welded wire or a combination of masonry and metal, cedar posts

and welded wire or garden loop or other materials having similar characteristics. All other properties, not abutting the river may use the above listed materials plus wood fencing.

B. All chain link fences are prohibited for properties abutting the river. For properties that do not abut the river chain link is only allowed in the rear yard if not readily visible from the right-of-way. Barbed wire, razor wire, and concertina are prohibited in all RIO districts.

(i) Street Furnishings. Street furnishings are exterior amenities, including but not limited to, tables, chairs, umbrellas, landscape pots, wait stations, valet stations, bicycle racks, planters, benches, bus shelters, kiosks, waste receptacles and similar items that help to define pedestrian use areas. Handcrafted street furnishings are particularly important in San Antonio, and therefore this tradition of craftsmanship and of providing street furniture is encouraged.

(1) Prohibited Street Furnishings in Riverwalk Area. The following street furnishings are prohibited within the publicly owned portion of the Riverwalk area, whether or not the property is leased, and on the exterior of the riverside of buildings directly adjacent to the publicly owned portion of the river:

A. Vending machines.

B. Automatic teller machines.

C. Pay phones.

D. Photo booths.

E. Automated machines such as, but not limited to, penny crunching machines, blood pressure machines, fortune-telling machines, video games, animated characters and other machines that are internally illuminated, or have moving parts, or make noise, or have flashing lights.

F. Inanimate figures such as horses, kangaroos, bears, gorillas, mannequins or any such animal, cartoon or human figure. This section does not affect public art as defined in Appendix "A" of this chapter.

G. Monitors (i.e., television screens, computer screens).

H. Speakers.

(2) Street Furnishing Materials.

A. Street furnishings shall be made of wood, metal, stone, terra cotta, cast stone, hand-sculpted concrete, or solid surfacing material, such as Corian or Surell.

B. Inexpensive plastic resin furnishings are prohibited.

(3) Advertising on Street Furnishings.

A. No commercial logos, trademarks, decals, product names whether specific or generic, or names of businesses and organizations shall be allowed on street furnishings.

B. Product or business advertising is prohibited on all street furnishings.

C. Notwithstanding the restrictions above, applications may be approved for purposes of donor or non-profit recognition.

(4) Street furnishings, such as tables and chairs may not be stored (other than overnight storage) in such a way as to be visible from the river pathway.

(j) Lighting. Site lighting should be considered an integral element of the landscape design of a property. It should help define activity areas and provide interest at night. At the same time, lighting should facilitate safe and convenient circulation for pedestrians, bicyclists and motorists. Overspill of light and light pollution should be avoided.

(1) Site Lighting. Site lighting shall be shielded by permanent attachments to light fixtures so that the light sources are not visible from a public way and any offsite glare is prevented.

A. Site lighting shall include illumination of parking areas, buildings, pedestrian routes, dining areas, design features and public ways.

B. Outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall have average ambient light levels of between one (1) and three (3) foot-candles with a minimum of 0.5-foot candles and a maximum of six (6) foot-candles at any point measured on the ground plane. Interior spaces visible from the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level shall use light sources with no more than the equivalent lumens of a one hundred-watt incandescent bulb. Exterior balconies, porches and canopies adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall use light sources with the equivalent lumens of a

sixty-watt incandescent bulb with average ambient light levels no greater than the lumen output of a one hundred-watt incandescent light bulb as long as average foot candle standards are not exceeded. Accent lighting of landscape or building features including specimen plants, gates, entries, water features, art work, stairs, and ramps may exceed these standards by a multiple of 2.5. Recreational fields and activity areas that require higher light levels shall be screened from the river hike and bike pathways with a landscape buffer.

C. Exterior light fixtures that use the equivalent of more than one hundred-watt incandescent bulbs shall not emit a significant amount of the fixture's total output above a vertical cut-off angle of ninety (90) degrees. Any structural part of the fixture providing this cut-off angle must be permanently affixed.

D. Lighting spillover to the publicly owned areas of the river or across property lines shall not exceed one-half (½) of one (1) foot-candle measured at any point ten (10) feet beyond the property line.

(2) Provide Lighting for Pedestrian Ways That is Low Scaled for Walking. The position of a lamp in a pedestrian-way light shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height above the ground.

(3) Light Temperature and Color.

A. Light temperature and color shall be between 2500° K and 3500° K with a color rendition index (CRI) of eighty (80) or higher, respectively. This restriction is limited to all outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way and from the interior spaces adjoining the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level. Levels shall be determined by product specifications.

(4) Minimize the Visual Impacts of Exterior Building Lighting.

A. All security lighting shall be shielded so that the light sources are not visible from a public way.

B. Lighting (uplighting and downlighting) that is positioned to highlight a building or outdoor artwork shall be aimed at the object to be illuminated, not pointed into the sky.

C. Fixtures shall not distract from, or obscure important architectural features of the building. Lighting fixtures shall be a subordinate feature on the building unless they are incorporated into the over-all design scheme of the building.

(5) Prohibited Lighting on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River.

A. Flashing lights.

B. Rotating lights.

C. Chaser lights.

D. Exposed neon.

E. Seasonal decorating lights such as festoon, string or rope lights, except between November 20 and January 10.

F. Flood lamps.

(6) Minimize the visual impacts of lighting in parking areas in order to enhance the perception of the nighttime sky and to prevent glare onto adjacent properties. Parking lot light poles are limited to thirty (30) feet in height, shall have a 90° cutoff angle so as to not emit light above the horizontal plane.

(k) Curbs and Gutters.

(1) Construct Curb and Gutter Along the Street Edge of a Property.

A. Install curbs and gutter along the street edge at the time of improving a parcel.

B. In order to preserve the rural character of RIO-5 and RIO-6, the HPO in coordination with public works and the development services department may waive the requirement of curbs and gutters.

(l) Access to Public Pathway Along the River. These requirements are specifically for those properties adjacent to the river to provide a connection to the publicly owned pathway along the river. The connections are to stimulate and enhance urban activity, provide path connections in an urban context, enliven street activity, and protect the ambiance and character of the river area.

(1) A stair, ramp or elevator connecting the publicly owned pathway at the river to private property along the river is allowed by right at the following locations:

A. At all street and vehicular bridge crossings over the river.

B. Where publicly owned streets dead end into the river.

C. Where the pedestrian pathway in the Riverwalk area is located at the top of bank and there is a two-foot or less grade change between the private property and the pathway.

(2) If there is a grade change greater than two (2) feet between the private property and the publicly owned pathway at the river then the following conditions apply:

A. Access to the publicly owned pathway is limited to one (1) connection per property, with the exception that connections are always allowed at street and vehicular bridge crossings. For example if one (1) property extends the entire block face from street crossing to street crossing the owner would be allowed three (3) access points if the distance requirements were met.

B. The minimum distance between access points shall be ninety-five (95) feet. Only street and vehicular bridge connections are exempted. Mid-block access points must meet this requirement.

C. Reciprocal access agreements between property owners are permitted.

(3) Clearly define a key pedestrian gateway into the site from the publicly owned pathway at the river with distinctive architectural or landscape elements.

A. The primary gateway from a development to the publicly owned pathway at the river shall be defined by an architectural or landscape element made of stone, brick, tile, metal, rough hewn cedar or hand-formed concrete or through the use of distinctive plantings or planting beds.

(m) Buffering and Screening. The manner in which screening and buffering elements are designed on a site greatly affects the character of the river districts. In general, service areas shall be screened or buffered. "Buffers" are considered to be landscaped berms, planters or planting beds; whereas, more solid "screens" include fences and walls. When site development creates an unavoidable negative visual impact on abutting properties or to the public right-of-way, it shall be mitigated with a landscape design that will buffer or screen it.

(1) Landscape Buffers Shall be Used in the Following Circumstances: To buffer the edges of a parking lot from pedestrian ways and outdoor use areas, (such as patios, and courtyards), and as an option to screening in order to buffer service areas, garbage disposal areas, mechanical equipment, storage areas, maintenance yards, equipment storage areas and other similar activities that by their nature create unsightly views from pedestrian ways, streets, public ROWs and adjoining property.

(2) Screening Elements Shall be Used in the Following Circumstances: To screen service areas, storage areas, or garbage areas from pedestrian ways.

(3) Exceptions for Site Constraints. Due to site constraints, in all RIOs and specifically for "RIO-3" where there is less than ten (10) feet to provide for the minimum landscape berm, a screen may be used in conjunction with plantings to meet the intent of these standards. For example a low site wall may be combined with plant materials to create a buffer with a lesser cross sectional width.

(4) Applicable Bufferyard Types. Table 510-2 establishes minimum plant materials required for each bufferyard type. For purposes of this section, type C shall be the acceptable minimum type.

(5) Applicable Screening Fence and Wall Types. Screening fences and walls shall be subject to conditions of subsection 35-673(h), Walls and Fences.

(n) Service Areas and Mechanical Equipment. Service areas and mechanical equipment should be visually unobtrusive and should be integrated with the design of the site and building. Noise generated from mechanical equipment shall not exceed city noise regulations.

(1) Locate service entrances, waste disposal areas and other similar uses adjacent to service lanes and away from major streets and the river.

A. Position utility boxes so that they cannot be seen from the public Riverwalk path, or from major streets, by locating them on the sides of buildings and away from pedestrian and vehicular routes. Locating them within interior building corners, at building offsets or other similar locations where the building mass acts as a shield from public view is preferred.

B. Orient the door to a trash enclosure to face away from the street when feasible.

C. Air intake and exhaust systems, or other mechanical equipment that generates noise, smoke or odors, shall not be located at the pedestrian level.

(2) Screening of service entrance shall be compatible with the buildings on the block face.

A. When it would be visible from a public way, a service area shall be visually compatible with the buildings on the block face.

B. A wall will be considered compatible if it uses the same material as other buildings on the block, or is painted a neutral color such as beige, gray or dark green or if it is in keeping with the color scheme of the adjacent building.

(o) Bicycle Parking. On-site bicycle parking helps promote a long term sustainable strategy for development in RIO districts. Bicycle parking shall be placed in a well lit and accessible area. UDC bicycle parking requirements in UDC 35-526 can be met through indoor bicycle storage facilities in lieu of outdoor bike rack fixtures.

Sec. 35-674.02. - Building Design Principles in RIO-7.

This section provides policies and standards for the design of commercial, multi-family developments in excess of eight (8) units, and single-family developments in excess of five (5) units, institutional developments, and industrial buildings within the river improvement overlay districts. In general, principles align with the standards and guidelines established for the Downtown Business District.

(a) Mass and Scale. A building shall appear to have a "human scale." In general, this scale can be accomplished by using familiar forms and elements interpreted in human dimensions. Exterior wall designs shall help pedestrians establish a sense of scale with relation to each building. Articulating the number of floors in a building can help to establish a building's scale, for example, and prevent larger buildings from dwarfing the pedestrian.

(1) Reduce large floor plates and varying a building's height through the creation of smaller structures or facades when designing large projects that consume half a block or more. Sculpt a building's mass to avoid large bulky structures, which provide more visual monotony than variety. It is the well-balanced variety of building massing and textures of shadow, light and materials that in total adds to the richness of the built environment.

(2) Design building massing to reinforce the street wall with well-scaled elements or structures that are sensitive to the neighborhood context.

A. Divide large building facades into a series of appropriately scaled modules so that no building segment is more than ninety (90) feet in length. Consider dividing a larger building into "modules" that are similar in scale.

B. Monolithic slab-like structures that wall off views and overshadow the surrounding neighborhood are discouraged.

C. New buildings over seventy-five (75) feet tall should incorporate design elements that provide a base, middle and a top. Buildings less than seventy-five (75) feet should have a pedestrian scaled base with a cornice, eave, or other architectural element that gives the building a discernable edge at the top story.

D. Where a new building is infilled between an existing historic buildings on a block:

i. The new building should, to the extent possible, maintain the alignment of horizontal elements along the block.

ii. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those seen in the area, particularly the window fenestration.

iii. Align at least one (1) horizontal building element with another horizontal building element on the same block face. It will be considered to be within alignment if it is within three (3) feet, measured vertically, of the existing architectural element.

(b) Height. Building heights vary along the creek corridor, from one-story houses to high-rises. This diversity of building heights is expected to continue. Building heights shall be configured such that a comfortable human scale is established along the edges of properties and views to the creek and other significant landmarks are provided while allowing the appropriate density for an area.

A. The maximum building height and creek-side building step-backs shall be as defined in Table 674-3.

B. Building step-backs shall be at least fifteen (15) feet.

C. Buildings may be built to the height allowed without stepping back by aligning the lower floors with step-back-line creating more street level open space between the building and the creek.

(1) High-rise towers above ten (10) stories are encouraged in RIO-7a and allowed in RIO-7b when not in conflict with the Historic Design Guidelines. Towers are not allowed to form a continuous wall along the creek but shall

be carefully sited to provide both views and privacy. Tower forms should be simple yet elegant and add a sculptural quality to the Downtown San Antonio skyline.

- A. Towers should be combined with other building forms along the creek including townhouses, stacked flats, and mid-rise mixed-use buildings to create a variety of residential and office opportunities.
- B. Towers should have their massing designed to reduce overall bulk and to appear slender as they ascend higher.
- C. Towers may extend directly up from the property line at the street and are not required to be setback.
- D. Tower siting and massing should maintain key views toward important natural or man-made features.
- E. Design the middle segment or tower of the building to break up the overall bulk into smaller segments and address impacts such as shadowing and views. Reduce the perception of mass through architectural detailing such as changes of materials and color.
- F. Design the top of buildings to be a "fifth facade" that may be distinctive against the skyline when looked up to or viewed from above. A well-designed roofline creates opportunities for sky views and views to distinctive landmarks; creates opportunities for sunlight to reach the ground, and orients the public when wayfinding. Design the top of the building and/or the top of its podium to include opportunity for communal outdoor amenity space and/or a place for environmental innovation such as green roofs, rainwater recovery and solar panels.
- G. Towers should be designed to achieve a simple faceted geometry and large vertical plane movement. They should not appear overwrought or to have over-manipulated elements.
- H. Towers that emulate a more streamline modern style should provide variation through subtle details in the curtain wall, and the articulation of a human-scaled base at the street level.
- I. If a project has more than one tower, they should be complementary to each other and employ the same architectural design approach.
- J. Generally, buildings over one hundred fifty (150) feet tall should not be historicized. They should represent contemporary interventions in the skyline.
- K. A tower's primary building entrances should be designed at a scale appropriate to the overall size and design of the tower and be clearly marked.
- L. A building's top should be delineated with a change of detail and meet the sky with a thinner form, or tapered point. Unarticulated, flat-topped buildings are not desired in Downtown San Antonio's skyline.
- M. Mechanical Penthouses should be integrated into the tower design and should not appear as a separate element, as shown in Figure 5.7.

(2) Low-rise and mid-rise buildings are encouraged in RIO-7c, RIO-7d, and RIO-7e. (3) In RIO 7-d, organize the mass of the building to step back from established residential neighborhoods. Where a commercial, mixed-use residential, multi-family or industrial use abuts a single-family residential development, or is across the street from a single-family residential development, the following standards shall apply:

- A. The massing of the building shall not exceed twenty-five (25) feet in height at the setback line. The building mass can continue upward within a 45-degree building envelope for a distance of fifty (50) feet measured horizontally from the building face, at which point the building massing may continue vertically to the height established in subsection 35-674(c).

(c) Materials and Finishes. After establishing a new building's overall massing and vertical and horizontal variation, it is important to develop a building's visual character at the level of material choices and detailing. The interplay of materials, windows and other elements should support the larger design principles as articulated by the architect. Ensure that buildings have architecturally detailed facades, where publicly visible, with no blank or featureless sides in anticipation of abutting to potential development in later phases or on adjacent land.

(1) Buildings are supposed to aim for a "timeless design" and employ sustainable materials and careful detailing that have proven longevity.

- A. San Antonio has strong sun conditions. Use deep reveals to get shadow lines and if colors are desired, saturated colors and evaluate these outside on site.
- B. Feature long-lived and local materials such as split limestone, brick and stone. The material palette should provide variety, reinforce massing and changes in the horizontal or vertical plane.
- C. Use especially durable materials on ground floor facades.

D. Generally, stucco is not desirable on the ground floor as it is not particularly durable. Detail buildings with rigor and clarity to reinforce the architect's design intentions and to help set a standard of quality to guild the built results.

E. To provide visual variety and depth, layer the building skin and provide a variety of textures that bear a direct relationship to the building's massing and structural elements. The skin should reinforce the integrity of the design concept and the building's structural elements as seen in Figure 7.5 and 7.6 of the Downtown Design Guide and not appear as surface pastiche.

F. Layering can also be achieved through extension of two (2) adjacent building planes that are extended from the primary facade to provide a modern sculptural composition.

G. Cut outs (often used to create sky gardens) should be an appropriate scale and provide a comfortable, usable outdoor space.

H. Design curtain walls with detail and texture, while employing the highest quality materials.

I. Design the color palette for a building to reinforce building identity and complement changes in the horizontal or vertical plane.

J. Value-added materials, such as stone should be placed at the base of the building, especially at the first floor level. Select materials suitable for a pedestrian urban environment. Impervious materials such as stone, metal or glass should be used on the building exterior. Materials will be made graffiti resistant or be easily repainted.

K. Corner buildings at prominent intersections require a higher standard of articulation, detailing, and architectural treatment than other buildings within the middle of the block.

L. RIO-7e is a mixed-use transition area with single family houses, some masonry commercial buildings, concrete warehouses, and long metal sheds built next to railroad sidings. In this district, the historic preservation officer may approve non-traditional building materials, like corrugated metal siding and concrete panels, if well detailed and compatible with the traditional building forms and scale of the district.

(2) Prohibited Exterior Materials.

A. Imitation stone (fiberglass or plastic);

B. Plywood or decorative exterior plywood;

C. "Lumpy" stucco, CMU;

D. Rough sawn or "natural" (unfinished) wood, EIFS;

E. Used brick with no fired face (salvaged from interior walls);

F. Imitation wood siding;

G. Plastic panels.

(e) Pedestrian Orientation. New buildings should follow the principles of good urban design, creating active street and creek facades and focusing on enhancing the public realm of the streets and the creek.

(1) Buildings ought to create a familiar rhythm relative to the overall street. The rhythm and pattern helps to tie the street together visually and provides the pedestrian with a standard measurement of progress. Reinforcement of this facade rhythm is encouraged in new buildings, even if a singular structure (see Figure 7.1 in the Downtown Design Guide).

(2) New development ought to respect the existing fabric of the community by reflecting historic mixed-use development patterns, through the use of building indentations, relationship to the street, first floor plate height, breaks in buildings for open space, and changes in color to avoid monolithic and monochromatic developments.

(3) Horizontal Variation. Vary the horizontal plane of a building to provide visual interest and enrich the pedestrian experience, while contributing to the quality and definition of the street wall.

A. Provide well-marked entrances to cue access and use. Enhance all public entrances to a building through the use of compatible architectural or graphic treatment. Main building entrance shall read differently from retail storefronts, restaurant, and commercial entrances.

B. Avoid continuous massing longer than ninety (90) feet not articulated with shadow relief, projections and recessed. If massing extends beyond the is length, it needs to be visibly articulated as several smaller masses using different material, vertical breaks, such as expressed bay widths, or other architectural elements.

C. Horizontal variation should be of an appropriate scale and reflect changes in the building uses or structure as seen in Figure 7.2.4 of the Downtown Design Guide.

D. Vary details and materials horizontally to provide scale and three-dimensional qualities to the building.

E. While blank street wall facades are discouraged, there is usually one side of the building that is less prominent (often times called "back of house").

(4) Vertical Variation. Both classical and modern buildings can exhibit basic principles of visual order in the vertical plane—often with a distinct base (street and pedestrian lower levels), a middle (core mid-section, and often consistent for multiple floors of a mid- to high-rise building), and a top (the upper level that distinguishes a building and defines how it "meets the sky") as seen in Figure 7.3 of the Downtown Design Guide.

A. Modern or contemporary building designs often layer this principle with more variation and syncopation to create interesting architectural composition as seen in Figure 7.4 of the Downtown Design Guide. Whenever a new infill building is proposed between two (2) existing structures, every attempt should be made to maintain the characteristic rhythm, proportion, and spacing of existing door and window openings. B. Variation in the vertical plane of a building ought to define the building's uses and visually differentiate ground floor uses, from core functions and how the building "meets the sky."

i. Employ a different architectural treatment on the ground floor facade than on the upper floors, and feature high quality materials that add scale, texture and variety at the pedestrian level.

ii. Vertically articulate the street wall facade, establishing different treatment for the building's base, (middle and top) and use balconies, fenestration, or other elements to create an interesting pattern of projections and recesses.

iii. Provide an identifiable break between the building's ground floors and upper floors designed for office or other use. This break may include a change in material, change in fenestration pattern or similar means.

iv. In order to respect existing historic datums, the cornice or roof line of historic structures should be reflected with a demarcation on new infill structures whenever possible.

v. On facades exposed to the sun, employ shade and shadow created by reveals, surface changes, overhangs, and sunshades to provide sustainable benefits and visual interest.

vi. Buildings taller than seventy-five (75) feet should employ at least two (2) vertical breaks or reveals greater than three (3) feet in depth to divide the bulkiness of the mass.

(5) Fenestration. Provide high-performance, well-detailed windows and doors that add to the depth and scale of a building's facade.

A. Windows are to be as transparent as possible at the ground floor of the building, with preference given to grey, low-e glass (eighty-eight (88) percent light transmission).

B. Window placement, size, material and style should help define a building's architectural style and integrity.

C. In buildings other than curtain wall buildings, windows should be recessed (set back) from the exterior building wall, except where inappropriate to the building's architectural style. Generally, the required recess may not be accomplished by the use of plantings around the window.

D. Windows and doors should be well-detailed where they meet the exterior wall to provide adequate weather protection and to create a shadow line.

E. Windows on upper floors should be proportioned and placed in relation to grouping of storefront or other windows and elements in the base floor. Windows should have a vertical emphasis.

F. Glazing. Incorporate glazing that contributes to a warm, inviting environment for interior spaces.

i. Ground-floor window and door glazing should be transparent and non-reflective.

ii. Above the ground floor, both curtain wall and window and door glazing should have the minimum reflectivity needed to achieve energy efficiency standards. Non-reflective coating or tints are preferred.

iii. A limited amount of translucent glazing at the ground floor may be used to provide privacy.

(6) Street Wall. In order to support a pedestrian-oriented public realm, retail or commercial streets should be framed by buildings uniformly placed at the sidewalk with no setback as seen in Figure 5.5 of the Downtown Design Guide. The height of the street wall is an important element in shaping the character of the public realm.

Design building walls along the sidewalk (Street Walls) to define the street and to provide a comfortable scale for pedestrians.

- A. Street walls should be located against the back of sidewalk.
- B. Walls above the ground floor that step back from the ground floor street wall are considered to be part of the street wall.
- C. Breaks in the street wall should be limited to those necessary to accommodate pedestrian pass-through, public plazas, entry forecourts, permitted vehicular access driveways, and hotel drop-offs.
- D. An identifiable break should be provided between a building's retail floors (ground level and, in some cases, second and third floors) and upper floors. This break may consist of a change in material, change in fenestration, or similar means.
- E. Vertical breaks should also be taken into account with fenestration such as columns or bays.
- F. When a property is situated in such a manner as to appear to be the terminus at the end of a street or at a prominent curve in the creek, buildings should incorporate an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. These features may include:
 - i. Enhanced building facade.
 - ii. Enhanced garden or landscape in an open space.
 - iii. Variation in roof shape.
 - iv. Change material and color.
 - v. Tower element.

(7) In contrast to the design of buildings along the sidewalks described in (b)(9) the creek side of buildings should not establish a uniform, aligned wall but rather a series of related and connected gardens, plazas, and patios. These On-site Open Spaces (see subsection 35-673(q)) should be integrated with the San Pedro Creek Improvements Project. Where a building facade faces the creek it should recognize the historic proportions of lots and resulting building forms. Lots were generally seventy (70) to ninety (90) feet wide along the creek but several hundred feet deep. The resulting building forms are long bar-shapes running perpendicular to the creek.

A. The best views of the creek are generally perpendicular to the creek not parallel to the creek.

Rectangular buildings should have the narrow face parallel to the creek and the long face perpendicular to the creek. See Figure 674-1. i. Bends in the creek provide a unique opportunity for siting buildings to maximize views and may provide unique challenges. The Historic Preservation Officer may consider different building orientations for these sites if the overall goals for RIO-7 are met.

B. Buildings are not allowed to have a continuous, flat facade lot-line to lot-line along the creek property line. Building massing should turn perpendicular to the creek and form gardens, courts, patios, paseos, and plazas between buildings and/or different building masses. Windows, balconies, or other ways of viewing these publically accessible open spaces is high encouraged. The following On-Site Open Spaces required by building length may be used as one of the On-Site Open Spaces required by Table 673-3. i. The maximum length of a building wall plane is ninety (90) feet. Buildings with facades longer than ninety (90) feet must use side-yard courts, courtyards, or forecourts to divide the facade into modules less than ninety (90) feet long. ii. Buildings or a collection of buildings built concurrently with a creek-face longer than two hundred seventy (270) feet are required to have a forecourt, courtyard, creek-side plaza, garden, paseo, or pedestrian-oriented service drive to divide the mass of the building and provide publicly accessible open space. iii. Single developments with three hundred (300) linear feet of creek frontage or greater should have at least two (2) distinct building types or building heights along the creek property line with no more than seventy (70) percent of any one building type. Building types are defined in Downtown Design Guidelines. iv. Buildings that setback more than thirty (30) feet from the creek-side setback line and provide publicly accessible gardens, patios, plazas, or terraces are not required to provide additional publicly accessible open spaces. v. Sites that are five hundred fifty (550) feet or longer should provide mid-block paseos, pedestrian oriented mid-block service drives and fire lane, or pedestrian friendly public access and should connect from a public street to another public street, public alley, or the San Pedro Creek. Where San Antonio Public Works and/or Texas Department of Transportation (TxDOT) has provided approval, per Chapter 8 Section C of the Downtown Design Guide, connections should try to align within one hundred (100) feet of the mid-block connection.

(8) Develop the first floor to activate the creek paseos and street sidewalks.

A. In mixed-use buildings, retail buildings, or office buildings the creek side facade should be primarily transparent with seventy-five (75) percent of the length of the facade devoted to display windows and/or windows affording some view into the interior areas or offices. Facades facing Primary and Secondary Pedestrian Streets listed in subsection 35-672(b)(1)D Curb Cuts should have at least fifty (50) [percent] of the facade devoted to windows. Facades facing side streets should have at least twenty-five (25) percent of the facade devoted to windows. Side-street facades should contribute to the pedestrian friendly environment and activate the street when possible. These facades are important in activating the connections from the surrounding neighborhoods to the creek.

B. In multi-family residential buildings with no retail, arrange support facilities, management offices, and building amenities along the creek and streets with a minimum of seventy-five (75) percent of the exterior facade associated with these spaces. Provide building and ground floor residential unit entrances to pedestrian paths that connect to the high-bank paseo or publicly accessible path at the top-of-bank along the low-bank paseo.

C. Institutional and civic buildings should arrange functions and entrances to provide access and views to internal functions.

D. Alternate arrangements that provide creek and street activation may be approved by the historic preservation officer.

(9) Design ground floor space for retail or other active uses, orienting tenant spaces to the street and creek and maximizing storefronts and entries along the sidewalks to sustain street level interest and promote pedestrian traffic.

A. Locate active uses along the street and creek facade to enhance the building's relationship to the public realm. Uses include: lobbies, dining rooms, seating areas, offices, retail stores, community or institutional uses, and residences.

B. Ground floor retail space shall be provided to a depth of at least twenty-five (25) feet from the front facade and shall include an average fourteen (14) foot to zero (0) inch floor-to-ceiling height, with heights above fourteen (14) feet being very desirable.

C. The primary entrance to each street level tenant that does not have its frontage along a public street shall be provided from a pedestrian paseo, courtyard or plaza, which is connected to the public street, creek, or alley.

D. Wall openings, such as storefront windows and doors, shall comprise at least seventy (70) percent of a commercial building's street and creek level facade as seen in Figure 3.2. of the Downtown Design Guide.

E. Clear glass for wall openings, i.e., doors and windows, shall be used along all street-level commercial facades for maximum transparency, especially in conjunction with retail and hotel uses as illustrated in Figure 3.3 of the Downtown Design Guide. Dark tinted, reflective or opaque glazing is not permitted for any required wall opening along commercial street level facades.

F. A building's primary entrance, defined as the entrance which provides the most direct access to a building's main lobby and is kept unlocked during business hours, shall be located on a public street or on a courtyard, plaza or paseo that is connected to and visible from a public street or the San Pedro Creek.

G. At least one building entrance/exit, which may be either a building or tenant and resident entrance, shall be provided along each street frontage.

H. Use clear windows and doors to make the pedestrian level facade highly transparent and accessible. Along retail streets, provide a nearly continuous band of windows. Ensure doorways in glass walls exhibit sufficient contrast to be clearly visible.

I. The facades on downtown commercial streets should be detailed as storefronts, except where the proposed ground floor use is live and work units, residential units or other non-commercial building types as seen in Figure 3.1.10 of the Downtown Design Guide. Where non-residential streets intersect, the ground floor retail space should wrap the corner onto the intersecting streets wherever possible.

J. Residential units with separate entries should include windows or glass doors on the ground floor that look out onto the street.

K. If a residential unit's individual entry along the street is the unit's primary entry, it should be accessible from the sidewalk.

- L. More public entrances than the minimum specified by code, including building and or tenant and resident entrances are highly encouraged. Incorporate a pedestrian-oriented scale at the street and river level.
- (10) Incorporate a pedestrian-oriented scale at the street and creek level.
- A. Awnings and canopies shall be fabricated of woven fabric, glass, metal or other permanent material compatible with the building's architecture
 - B. Street wall massing, articulation and detail, street level building entrances and storefront windows and doors, as well as the use of quality materials and decorative details should be used to promote pedestrian-scaled architecture along the street.
 - C. Architectural features that reinforce the retail character of the ground floor street and creek wall and/or help define the pedestrian environment along the sidewalk, such as canopies, awnings, and overhangs, are encouraged and should be integral to the architecture of the building.
 - D. The design of the ground floors of hotels should exhibit a series of public space and entries that equally welcome the general public as well as guests. The first floor should be as transparent as possible. Hotel uses such as bars, lounges, restaurants, cafes, spas and other uses open to the public should exhibit a direct pedestrian connection from the public right-of-way whenever possible Don't waste valuable street frontage on "back of house" uses.
 - E. Electrical transformers, mechanical equipment and other equipment should not be located along the ground floor street wall. Electrical transformers, mechanical equipment, other equipment, enclosed stairs, storage spaces, blank walls, and other elements that are not pedestrian-oriented should not be located within one hundred (100) feet of the corner property line as seen in Figure 3.6 of the Downtown Design Guide or visible from public right-of-way.
- (11) Street Entrances. Design building entries to be clearly visible from the street as well as to promote pedestrian comfort, safety, orientation and accessibility. In order to increase personal safety, entries and associated open spaces should be designed to avoid the creation of isolated areas and to maintain lines of sight into and out of a space.
- A. Reinforce a building's entry with one or more of the following architectural treatments:
 - i. Extra height lobby space;
 - ii. Distinctive doorways;
 - iii. Decorative lighting;
 - iv. Distinctive entry canopy;
 - v. Projected or deep recessed entry;
 - vi. Building name and address integrated into the facade;
 - vii. Artwork integrated into the facade or sidewalk;
 - viii. A change in paving material, texture, or color within the property line;
 - ix. Distinctive landscaping, including plants, water features and seating.
 - B. The primary street entrance of single buildings will be off the public sidewalk in RIO-7a, RIO-7b, and RIO-7c as seen in Figure 7.7 of the Downtown Design Guide.
 - i. In RIO-7d and RIO-7e, entrances may be off of a walkway connected to both the public sidewalk and the parking area as shown in Figure 673-1.
 - ii. In projects with multiple buildings arranged on one site, building entrances may be off of pedestrian paths connecting streets with the creek or courtyards and plazas within a site similar to Figure 672-2.
 - C. Strong colors should emphasize architectural details and entrances.
 - D. Deep recessed entries into the building are encouraged.
- (12) Creek Side Facade and Entrances. The Creekside of buildings should be responsive to the park-side of an urban building. Materials may be less formal, trellises and pergolas may be used in place of more traditional street side canopies and formal entries.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of the proposed modifications and site work with the following stipulations:

- i. That the two curb cuts immediately adjacent to the intersection of Broadway and Ira be eliminated based on finding d.
- ii. That the applicant submit a detailed landscaping plan to staff for review and approval that includes landscaping elements in each of the existing landscape islands and buffers found on site as well as automobile screening for the lot at 108/110 Ira, as noted in findings f and g.
- iii. That the applicant submit a detailed signage package for review and approval by the Commission that does not feature more than three signs that total fifty (50) square feet, and that the existing pole sign is removed as noted in finding k.
- iv. That the applicant screen and buffer all mechanical equipment from view at the public right of way as noted in finding h.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Grube made a motion to postpone until next hearing due to absent applicant. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman.
Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

- **Item #A-7. HDRC NO. 2019-286**
 APPLICANT: 1139 SE MILITARY DR
 ADDRESS: Jesse Valdez/The Letter Shop LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install an internally illuminated, channel letter wall sign. The proposed sign will read “SpinXpress Laundry” and feature an overall length of 47’ – 5” and an overall height of 5’ – 4” for a total size of approximately 291 square feet. The proposed channel letters will feature plastic faces and aluminum frames.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Signage

General Principles

The following General Principles for signage will be considered during the review process in conjunction with the guidelines contained in this section.

Principle #1: Respect the Historic Context – New signs should complement, rather than compete with, the character of a historic building and the surrounding district. Not all allowed signage types are appropriate to individual historic districts or landmarks. Therefore, careful consideration should be given to historic context, building forms, and site layout when selecting, designing, and reviewing new signage. Appropriate uses for individual signage types are addressed in this subsection, as applicable.

Principle #2: Encourage a Visually Interesting Streetscape Free of Clutter – Signs have the ability to create a visually pleasing streetscape as well as improve pedestrian and traffic safety; however they can also be distracting if not designed properly. Consider the overall number, type, and design of signs used on individual buildings and along the streetscape to ensure new signs respect the historic surroundings and do not result in visual clutter.

Principle #3: Reinforce the Pedestrian Oriented Nature of Commercial Uses – Signage was historically most prevalent in areas and on buildings that were used for commercial purposes; however, as San Antonio’s historic districts evolve over time, the adaptive re-use of individual structure or specific districts will result in the

introduction of signage in more areas and on more building types. Regardless of the location or building type, signage should be designed and scaled with pedestrians in mind.

1. General

A. GENERAL

- i. *Number and size*—Each building will be allowed one major and two minor signs. Total requested signage should not exceed 50 square feet.
- ii. *New signs*—Select the type of sign to be used based on evidence of historic signs or sign attachment parts along the building storefront where possible. Design signs to respect and respond to the character and/or period of the area in which they are being placed. Signs should identify the tenant without creating visual clutter or distracting from building features and historic districts.
- iii. *Scale*—Design signage to be in proportion to the facade, respecting the building's size, scale and mass, height, and rhythms and sizes of window and door openings. Scale signage (in terms of its height and width) to be subordinate to the overall building composition.

B. HISTORIC SIGNS

- i. *Preservation*—Preserve historic signs, such as ghost signs or other signs characteristic of the building's or district's period of significance, whenever possible.
- ii. *Maintenance*—Repair historic signs and replace historic parts in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair.

C. PLACEMENT AND INSTALLATION

- i. *Location*—Place signs where historically located and reuse sign attachment parts where they exist. Do not erect signs above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall, or where they will disfigure or conceal architectural details, window openings, doors, or other significant details.
- ii. *Obstruction of historic features*—Avoid obscuring historic building features such as cornices, gables, porches, balconies, or other decorative elements with new signs.
- iii. *Damage*—Avoid irreversible damage caused by installing a sign. For example, mount a sign to the mortar rather than the historic masonry.
- iv. *Pedestrian orientation*—Orient signs toward the sidewalk to maintain the pedestrian oriented nature of the historic districts.

D. DESIGN

- i. *Inappropriate materials*—Do not use plastic, fiberglass, highly reflective materials that will be difficult to read, or other synthetic materials not historically used in the district.
- ii. *Appropriate materials*—Construct signs of durable materials used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, aluminum, and metal grill work.
- iii. *Color*—Limit the number of colors used on a sign to three. Select a dark background with light lettering to make signs more legible.
- iv. *Typefaces*—Select letter styles and sizes that complement the overall character of the building façade. Avoid hard-to-read or overly intricate styles.

E. LIGHTING

- i. *Lighting sources*—Use only indirect or bare-bulb sources that do not produce glare to illuminate signs. All illumination shall be steady and stationary. Internal illumination should not be used.
- ii. *Neon lighting*—Incorporate neon lighting as an integral architectural element or artwork appropriate to the site, if used.

A. GENERAL

- i. *Mounting devices*—Construct sign frames and panels that will be used to be attach signs to the wall of a building of wood, metal, or other durable materials appropriate to the building's period of construction.
- ii. *Structural supports*—Utilize sign hooks, expansion bolts, or through bolts with washers on the inside of the wall depending upon the weight and area of the sign, and the condition of the wall to which it is to be attached.
- iii. *Appropriate usage*—Limit the use of projecting and wall-mounted signs to building forms that historically used these types of signs, most typically commercial storefronts. To a lesser degree, these signage types may also be appropriate in areas where residential building forms have been adapted for office or retail uses, if sized accordingly.

B. PROJECTING SIGNS

- i. *Placement*—Mount projecting signs perpendicularly to a building or column while allowing eight feet of overhead clearance above public walkways.
- ii. *Public right-of-way*—Limit the extension of projecting signs from the building facade into the public right-of-way for a maximum distance of eight feet or a distance equal to two-thirds the width of the abutting sidewalk, whichever distance is greater.
- iii. *Area*—Projecting signs should be scaled appropriately in response to the building façade and number of tenants.

C. WALL-MOUNTED SIGNS

- i. *Area*—Limit the aggregate area of all wall-mounted signs to twenty-five percent of a building facade.
- ii. *Projection*—Limit the projection of wall-mounted signs to less than twelve inches from the building wall.
- iii. *Placement*—Locate wall signs on existing signboards—the area above the storefront windows and below the second story windows—when available. Mount wall signs to align with others on the block if an existing signboard is not available.
- iv. Channel letters—Avoid using internally-illuminated, wall-mounted channel letters for new signs unless historic precedent exists. Reverse channel letters may be permitted.

Mission Historic District Design Manual, Section 5, Guidelines for Signage

A. GENERAL

- i. *Provision* — Signage in the Mission Historic District should adhere to the Historic Design Guidelines unless amended by the following provisions for signage in this section of the Mission Manual.
- ii. *Sign types* — Use sign types that are appropriate to the character and context of the area principally along the Mission Historic District Primary Road Corridors. Sign types that are not listed as a preferred type in the table below will be considered on a case by case basis.

D. LIGHTING

- i. *Indirect Lighting* — Use of indirect or concealed lighting of sign surfaces where the source of lighting is not visible to observers is encouraged. Light fixtures providing indirect lighting to a sign surface, awning, or portion of the building may be observable and should be of high quality, for exterior use and exposure, and considered part of the overall design of the sign and the facade.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through e. Staff recommends the following:

- i. That the applicant proposes a sign that does not exceed five (5) feet in height to be consistent with the previously approved master signage plan, as noted in finding b. The proposed sign should be scaled appropriate for the height five feet. Signage may be approved administratively if consistent with the previously approved master signage plan.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to approve as submitted at HDRC hearing. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, AND 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- **Item #A-8. HDRC NO. 2019-292**
ADDRESS: 2917 ROOSEVELT AVE
APPLICANT: John Britten/Britten Lift and Installation

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install an internally illuminated sign on the parapet wall to replace the existing, non-illuminated sign. The applicant has proposed for the sign to feature two (2) feet in height and eight (8) feet in width for a total size of sixteen (16) square feet.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Signage

General Principles

The following General Principles for signage will be considered during the review process in conjunction with the guidelines contained in this section.

Principle #1: Respect the Historic Context – New signs should complement, rather than compete with, the character of a historic building and the surrounding district. Not all allowed signage types are appropriate to individual historic districts or landmarks. Therefore, careful consideration should be given to historic context, building forms, and site layout when selecting, designing, and reviewing new signage. Appropriate uses for individual signage types are addressed in this subsection, as applicable.

Principle #2: Encourage a Visually Interesting Streetscape Free of Clutter – Signs have the ability to create a visually pleasing streetscape as well as improve pedestrian and traffic safety; however they can also be distracting if not designed properly. Consider the overall number, type, and design of signs used on individual buildings and along the streetscape to ensure new signs respect the historic surroundings and do not result in visual clutter.

Principle #3: Reinforce the Pedestrian Oriented Nature of Commercial Uses – Signage was historically most prevalent in areas and on buildings that were used for commercial purposes; however, as San Antonio's historic districts evolve over time, the adaptive re-use of individual structure or specific districts will result in the introduction of signage in more areas and on more building types. Regardless of the location or building type, signage should be designed and scaled with pedestrians in mind.

1. General

A. GENERAL

- i. *Number and size*—Each building will be allowed one major and two minor signs. Total requested signage should not exceed 50 square feet.
- ii. *New signs*—Select the type of sign to be used based on evidence of historic signs or sign attachment parts along the building storefront where possible. Design signs to respect and respond to the character and/or period of the area in which they are being placed. Signs should identify the tenant without creating visual clutter or distracting from building features and historic districts.
- iii. *Scale*—Design signage to be in proportion to the facade, respecting the building's size, scale and mass, height, and rhythms and sizes of window and door openings. Scale signage (in terms of its height and width) to be subordinate to the overall building composition.

B. HISTORIC SIGNS

- i. *Preservation*—Preserve historic signs, such as ghost signs or other signs characteristic of the building's or district's period of significance, whenever possible.
- ii. *Maintenance*—Repair historic signs and replace historic parts in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair.

C. PLACEMENT AND INSTALLATION

- i. *Location*—Place signs where historically located and reuse sign attachment parts where they exist. Do not erect signs above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall, or where they will disfigure or conceal architectural details, window openings, doors, or other significant details.
- ii. *Obstruction of historic features*—Avoid obscuring historic building features such as cornices, gables, porches, balconies, or other decorative elements with new signs.
- iii. *Damage*—Avoid irreversible damage caused by installing a sign. For example, mount a sign to the mortar rather than the historic masonry.
- iv. *Pedestrian orientation*—Orient signs toward the sidewalk to maintain the pedestrian oriented nature of the historic districts.

D. DESIGN

- i. *Inappropriate materials*—Do not use plastic, fiberglass, highly reflective materials that will be difficult to read, or other synthetic materials not historically used in the district.
- ii. *Appropriate materials*—Construct signs of durable materials used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, aluminum, and metal grill work.
- iii. *Color*—Limit the number of colors used on a sign to three. Select a dark background with light lettering to make signs more legible.
- iv. *Typefaces*—Select letter styles and sizes that complement the overall character of the building façade. Avoid hard-to-read or overly intricate styles.

E. LIGHTING

- i. *Lighting sources*—Use only indirect or bare-bulb sources that do not produce glare to illuminate signs. All illumination shall be steady and stationary. Internal illumination should not be used.
- ii. *Neon lighting*—Incorporate neon lighting as an integral architectural element or artwork appropriate to the site, if used.

A. GENERAL

- i. *Mounting devices*—Construct sign frames and panels that will be used to be attach signs to the wall of a building of wood, metal, or other durable materials appropriate to the building's period of construction.
- ii. *Structural supports*—Utilize sign hooks, expansion bolts, or through bolts with washers on the inside of the wall depending upon the weight and area of the sign, and the condition of the wall to which it is to be attached.
- iii. *Appropriate usage*—Limit the use of projecting and wall-mounted signs to building forms that historically used these types of signs, most typically commercial storefronts. To a lesser degree, these signage types may also be appropriate in areas where residential building forms have been adapted for office or retail uses, if sized accordingly.

B. PROJECTING SIGNS

- i. *Placement*—Mount projecting signs perpendicularly to a building or column while allowing eight feet of overhead clearance above public walkways.
- ii. *Public right-of-way*—Limit the extension of projecting signs from the building facade into the public right-of-way for a maximum distance of eight feet or a distance equal to two-thirds the width of the abutting sidewalk, whichever distance is greater.
- iii. *Area*—Projecting signs should be scaled appropriately in response to the building façade and number of tenants.

C. WALL-MOUNTED SIGNS

- i. *Area*—Limit the aggregate area of all wall-mounted signs to twenty-five percent of a building facade.
- ii. *Projection*—Limit the projection of wall-mounted signs to less than twelve inches from the building wall.
- iii. *Placement*—Locate wall signs on existing signboards—the area above the storefront windows and below the second story windows—when available. Mount wall signs to align with others on the block if an existing signboard is not available.
- iv. *Channel letters*—Avoid using internally-illuminated, wall-mounted channel letters for new signs unless historic precedent exists. Reverse channel letters may be permitted.

Mission Historic District Design Manual, Section 5, Guidelines for Signage

A. GENERAL

- i. *Provision* — Signage in the Mission Historic District should adhere to the Historic Design Guidelines unless amended by the following provisions for signage in this section of the Mission Manual.
- ii. *Sign types* — Use sign types that are appropriate to the character and context of the area principally along the Mission Historic District Primary Road Corridors. Sign types that are not listed as a preferred type in the table below will be considered on a case by case basis.

D. LIGHTING

- i. *Indirect Lighting* — Use of indirect or concealed lighting of sign surfaces where the source of lighting is not visible to observers is encouraged. Light fixtures providing indirect lighting to a sign surface, awning, or portion of the building may be observable and should be of high quality, for exterior use and exposure, and considered part of the overall design of the sign and the facade.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through c. Staff recommends that the applicant install a noncabinet sign that meets the standards of the Guidelines for Signage and the Mission Historic District Design Manual.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve a reduced cabinet sign as proposed without internal illuminations, and allow external illumination.
Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, and Bowman.
Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA B ITEMS

• **Item # B-8. HDRC NO. 2019-288**

ADDRESS: 231 WICKES
APPLICANT: Joseph Alderete

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Remove an existing concrete retaining wall.
2. Construct a new privacy fence.
3. Replace an existing walkway with a new walkway in the same location, to match the existing in profile and material.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.
- ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.
- iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The

appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure.

vi. *Screening incompatible uses*—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.

ii. *Location*—Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*— Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items #1 through #3 based on findings a through d with the following stipulation:

- i. That the proposed privacy fence does not exceed six (6) feet in height and does not exceed the property line. Placement should be verified at the time of permitting.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Margaret Leeds opposed to case.

Motion: Commissioner Grube made a motion to approve with staff stipulations. Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube.
Nay: Fish and Bowman.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 4 AYES, and 2 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

• **Item #B-16. HDRC NO. 2019-309**

ADDRESS: 2140 W MAGNOLIA AVE

APPLICANT: Steve Lopez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the stucco façade on the primary structure with woodlap siding to match the rear accessory structure.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.
- ii. *Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or striping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing.
- iii. *Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.
- iv. *Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See General Paint Type Recommendations in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information.
- v. *Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.
- ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.
- iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

2. Materials: Masonry and Stucco

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Paint*—Avoid painting historically unpainted surfaces. Exceptions may be made for severely deteriorated material where other consolidation or stabilization methods are not appropriate. When painting is acceptable, utilize a water permeable paint to avoid trapping water within the masonry.
- ii. *Clear area*—Keep the area where masonry or stucco meets the ground clear of water, moisture, and vegetation.
- iii. *Vegetation*—Avoid allowing ivy or other vegetation to grow on masonry or stucco walls, as it may loosen mortar and stucco and increase trapped moisture.
- iv. *Cleaning*—Use the gentlest means possible to clean masonry and stucco when needed, as improper cleaning can damage the surface. Avoid the use of any abrasive, strong chemical, sandblasting, or high-pressure cleaning method.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Patching*—Repair masonry or stucco by patching or replacing it with in-kind materials whenever possible. Utilize similar materials that are compatible with the original in terms of composition, texture, application technique, color, and detail, when in-kind replacement is not possible. EIFS is not an appropriate patching or replacement material for stucco.
- ii. *Repointing*—The removal of old or deteriorated mortar should be done carefully by a professional to ensure that masonry units are not damaged in the process. Use mortar that matches the original in color, profile, and composition when repointing. Incompatible mortar can exceed the strength of historic masonry and results in deterioration. Ensure that the new joint matches the profile of the old joint when viewed in section. It is recommended that a test panel is prepared to ensure the mortar is the right strength and color.
- iii. *Removing paint*—Take care when removing paint from masonry as the paint may be providing a protectant layer or hiding modifications to the building. Use the gentlest means possible, such as alkaline poultice cleaners and strippers, to remove paint from masonry.
- iv. *Removing stucco*—Remove stucco from masonry surfaces where it is historically inappropriate. Prepare a test panel to ensure that underlying masonry has not been irreversibly damaged before proceeding.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of the replacement of stucco siding with woodlap siding with the stipulation that the applicant explores the retention of stucco on the offset central bay of the front façade. The applicant is required to submit a siding specification to staff for review and approval prior to obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Maricella Gutierrez and Imelda Campos opposed to application.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made to approve with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman.
Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item #B-17. HDRC NO. 2019-259**

ADDRESS: 119 BUFORD

APPLICANT: Mark Granato/Granato Custom Homes

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a one story, single family residential structure on the vacant lot at 119 Buford, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

- i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

- i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
- v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

- i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.
- ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.
- iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.
- iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.
- v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

- i. *Impervious surfaces* —Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.
- ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.
- iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

- i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.
- ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

- i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.
- ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.
- iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.
- iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.
- v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

- i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.

ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.

iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.

ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.

iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

RECOMMENDATION:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through n with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant confirm that the proposed setback is greater than those of the neighboring historic structures.
- ii. That the applicant incorporate additional fenestration on the east façade.
- iii. That the proposed aluminum clad wood windows feature meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- iv. That horizontal siding feature an exposed profile of four inches and a thickness of approximately ¾”. A composite siding should feature smooth finishes and mitered corners. Window and door trim should feature thicknesses that are appropriate for the thickness of the siding; at least 1 inch, and should be installed abutting the siding.
- v. That all mechanical equipment be screened from view from the public right of way.
- vi. That the proposed ribbon strip driveway not exceed ten (10) feet in width.
- vii. That the proposed front sidewalk be concrete and feature a width of approximately three feet to match those found historically on the block.
- viii. That the applicant submit a detailed landscaping plan to staff for review and approval.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish move to postpone until next HDRC due to absent applicant.
Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman.

Nay: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

• **Item # B-18. HDRC NO. 2019-224**

ADDRESS: 515 BURLESON ST

APPLICANT: Stephanie Padua/TexPro Painting and Renovations

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Replace nine (9) wood windows with a number of vinyl windows:
 - a) A set of 3 windows converted to 2 windows under the front gable
 - b) A set of 3 windows converted to 2 windows in the front porch
 - c) A side window with a raised sill height
 - d) A side window with a lowered head height
 - e) A horizontal window converted to 3 windows on rear side.
- 2) Repair and replace wood window trim and siding as necessary
- 3) Reconstruct the front wood steps
- 4) Paint the exterior including pressure washing

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.

ii. *Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or stripping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing.

iii. *Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.

iv. *Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See General Paint Type Recommendations in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information.

v. *Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Facade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.

ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.

iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.

- iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
- v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend window replacement based on findings b through e. If the commission is compelled to approve window replacement, staff recommends the following stipulations:

- i. A site visit is scheduled for staff to access the condition of each individual window to determine which must be repaired and which are eligible for replacement.
- ii. When windows are determined to be beyond repair, new windows should be the historic windows in material, size, configuration, and number of window openings including the standard stipulations: *Meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.* The applicant is to submit the windows specifications to staff prior to purchase and installation.

Staff recommends approval of front porch steps reconstruction with the stipulation that the applicant provides a measured drawing and constructs a step profile that is consistent with the Guidelines. Railing and decking details should also be reviewed by staff if required by safety code.

Staff recommends approval of wood repairs and paint with the stipulation that the work is done in-kind and that traditional pressure washing is avoided.

CASE COMMENT: WORK PRIOR TO APPROVAL – On a site visit conducted on March 29, 2019, staff found a number of windows have been removed and replaced with vinyl windows, the pilaster and porthole windows were removed, and areas of siding have been replaced in-kind. The applicant committed to restoring the pilaster and porthole windows to their original configuration and submitted a request for the remaining items on April 16, 2019 to be heard at the next HDRC hearing. Staff advise the applicant to store the original windows in a safe location until the conclusion of the commission hearing. A \$500 post-work application fee will be assessed based on the commission action and ability to restore the original windows if they have not been discarded or further damaged.

DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE – At the May 01, 2019 HDRC hearing, the commission referred the request to a Design Review Committee (DRC) site visit. The Design Review Committee reviewed this request on May 22, 2019, and commented on each violation item. Committee members agreed that the restoring the wood windows in the front façade to its original location and configuration is imperative and that vinyl windows on the side or rear may be screened with wood window screens. Committee members each agreed that the windows at the time of the visit are in a reparable condition and advise that the homeowner or family consider attending a wood window workshop.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Monica Savino speaks to oppose the case.

Motion: Commissioner Harris moved to go with DRC recommendations to return front façade to original with original windows on site adding window screens to all other windows on property; and with

staff stipulations for the front porch and wood repairs and paint to be completed within 12 months. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores Carpenter, Grube, Bowman,
Nays: None .
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **MOTION PASSED 8 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

- **Item # B-19. HDRC NO. 2019-301**
ADDRESS: 1939 W GRAMERCY PLACE
APPLICANT: Bruce Graham

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Restore three (3), existing wood windows and reconstruct two (2) wood windows to be installed on the front façade with wood screens.
2. Replace ten (10) wood windows with vinyl windows on the side and rear elevations to be installed with wood screens

This request is in response to the violation case for replacement of all wood windows with vinyl windows, which was referred to committee at the September 19, 2018, HDRC hearing and withdrawn by the applicant at the October 17, 2018, hearing.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.

- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail

RECOMMENDATIONS:

- i. Staff recommends approval of item 1 (three repaired and two reconstructed wood windows on the front facade) with the stipulation that specifications for an appropriate reconstruction and installation are submitted to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. Staff does not recommend approval of item 2 (ten wood windows replaced with vinyl on the side and rear facades). If the remaining windows have been permanently discarded or are deteriorated beyond repair, replacement windows should match the original wood windows in size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and should meet the following specifications: *Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.*

If the commission is compelled to approve item 2, the installation of vinyl windows as currently installed, staff stipulates that specifications for an appropriate configuration and installation of the windows screens are submitted to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. As installed, no inset exists to properly hang wood window screens.

CASE COMMENT: COMPLIANCE - On a site visit conducted on August 22, 2018, staff found that a number of wood windows had been replaced with vinyl. Staff identified at least two wholly intact wood windows were still on site and advised the applicant to store them until the conclusion of the HDRC hearing. The applicant submitted an application to staff on August 29, 2018.

UPDATED REQUEST – The applicant has proposed two options in seeking compliance: Option A includes four (4) wood windows on the front façade and Option B includes four (4) wood windows on the front façade and one (1) on the front-most side elevation. The applicant has also requested to install wood screens over all wood and vinyl windows in an effort to screen non-conforming elements. Staff finds that all windows should be returned to their original, one-over-one wood window matching in profile, depth, size, location, and trim.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Grube moved to approve option B- with 5 wood windows and woodscreens on all windows and the setback placement; and that applicant work with staff for the trim to be administratively approved. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT.**

• **Item # B-20. HDRC NO. 2019-243**

ADDRESS: 2218 W MAGNOLIA AVE

APPLICANT: Rufino Hernandez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace the wood front door with a steel door with ornamental glazing
2. Install a full-width wood porch with a shed roof over existing concrete steps
3. Install limestone skirting throughout primary structure.
4. Replace minimal traditional window trim with Craftsman style trim
5. Construct a rear accessory structure.
6. Install front yard retaining wall.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. *Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.

x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.

ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials.

Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.

iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.

iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.

v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

8. Architectural Features: Foundations

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Replacement features*—Ensure that features such as decorative vents and grilles and lattice panels are replaced in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not possible, use features matching in size, material, and design. Replacement skirting should consist of durable, proven materials, and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact.

4. Guidelines for New Construction

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.

ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.

iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.

iv. *Windows and doors*—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions.

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used.

ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

5. Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of items 1 through 5 based on findings a through k. Staff recommends the applicant return the modified elements to their original condition and address the accessory structure's inconsistencies with the Guidelines.

Staff recommends approval of item 6 based on finding l with the stipulation that the height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

CASE COMMENT:

WORK PRIOR TO APPROVAL – The applicant voluntarily disclosed during the submission of the application that the request items had already neared completion prior to approval.

DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE – At the May 15, 2019 HDRC hearing, the commission referred the request to a Design Review Committee (DRC) meeting. The Design Review Committee reviewed this request on May 22, 2019, and commented on each violation item, summarized in finding l.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Harris made a motion to approve item 1-2, 4 and 6 with staff stipulations. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, and Grube,
Nays: Fish and Bowman.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **MOTION PASSED 4 AYES, and 2 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item # B-22. HDRC NO. 2018-631**

ADDRESS: 321 N HACKBERRY ST

APPLICANT: Roberto Elizondo

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct one, 2.5-story residential structure and two, 2-story residential structures on the vacant lot at 321 N Hackberry, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

- i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.
- ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

- i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

- i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.
- ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.
- iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

- i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.
- ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

- i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.
- ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.
- iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.
- iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district.

Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.

iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or

wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.

ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.

iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant historically located.

ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

- i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.
- ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.
- iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

- i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.
- ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.
- iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through q with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant confirm that the proposed setbacks on N Hackberry and Armstrong are equal to or greater than those found associated with the adjacent historic structures as noted in findings c and e.
- ii. That the applicant comply with foundation height requirements as noted in finding h.
- iii. That the applicant explore shorter alley building heights to be similar in height to those found historically on the alley.
- iv. That composite, horizontal siding should feature an exposed profile of four inches and a thickness of approximately $\frac{3}{4}$ ". A composite siding should feature smooth finishes and mitered corners. Window and door trim should feature thicknesses that are appropriate for the thickness of the siding; at least 1 inch, and should be installed abutting the siding. Additionally, staff finds that column details should be submitted to staff for review and approval.
- v. That double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- vi. That a detailed landscaping plan be submitted for review and approval that incorporates landscaping elements that are comparable to those found in front yards of historic structures within the district, that low scale plantings be installed to buffer the expanded alley way from front yards of each structure. Landscaping materials should include natural turf and plantings. Entire yards should not be landscaped with decomposed granite, gravel, or like materials.
- vii. That the proposed driveways do not exceed ten (10) feet in width.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Monica Savino, Joseph Garcia, and Ofelia Delgado are opposed to case.

Motion: Commissioner Grube made a motion to refer to DRC- Design Review Committee. Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Garza, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, and Connor.

Action: **Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

• **Item # B-23. HDRC NO. 2019-294**

ADDRESS: 107 PASO HONDO

APPLICANT: Cotton Estes/HighCotton Architects

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Perform foundation repair and install a wood, shi lap skirting to the front porch.
2. Perform rehabilitative scopes of work to the front porch including the removal of the existing, concrete porch steps, the installation of new tongue and groove decking, and the re-framing of the front porch.
3. Perform rehabilitative scopes of work to the brick masonry facades including repair to limestone window sills.
4. Replace the existing, standing seam metal roof in-kind.
5. Install skylights into the non-primary roof slopes of the roof structure.
6. Construct a rear addition to feature 70 square feet in size in the location of an existing, enclosed rear porch.
7. Replace the existing, wood windows with new wood windows.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

2. Materials: Masonry and Stucco

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Paint*—Avoid painting historically unpainted surfaces. Exceptions may be made for severely deteriorated material where other consolidation or stabilization methods are not appropriate. When painting is acceptable, utilize a water permeable paint to avoid trapping water within the masonry.
- ii. *Clear area*—Keep the area where masonry or stucco meets the ground clear of water, moisture, and vegetation.
- iii. *Vegetation*—Avoid allowing ivy or other vegetation to grow on masonry or stucco walls, as it may loosen mortar and stucco and increase trapped moisture.
- iv. *Cleaning*—Use the gentlest means possible to clean masonry and stucco when needed, as improper cleaning can damage the surface. Avoid the use of any abrasive, strong chemical, sandblasting, or high-pressure cleaning method.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Patching*—Repair masonry or stucco by patching or replacing it with in-kind materials whenever possible. Utilize similar materials that are compatible with the original in terms of composition, texture, application technique, color, and detail, when in-kind replacement is not possible. EIFS is not an appropriate patching or replacement material for stucco.
- ii. *Repointing*—The removal of old or deteriorated mortar should be done carefully by a professional to ensure that masonry units are not damaged in the process. Use mortar that matches the original in color, profile, and composition when repointing. Incompatible mortar can exceed the strength of historic masonry and results in deterioration. Ensure that the new joint matches the profile of the old joint when viewed in section. It is recommended that a test panel is prepared to ensure the mortar is the right strength and color.
- iii. *Removing paint*—Take care when removing paint from masonry as the paint may be providing a protectant layer or hiding modifications to the building. Use the gentlest means possible, such as alkaline poultice cleaners and strippers, to remove paint from masonry.
- iv. *Removing stucco*—Remove stucco from masonry surfaces where it is historically inappropriate. Prepare a test panel to ensure that underlying masonry has not been irreversibly damaged before proceeding.

3. Materials: Roofs

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

vi. *Materials: metal roofs*—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

9. Outbuildings, Including Garages

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing outbuildings*—Preserve existing historic outbuildings where they remain.
- ii. *Materials*—Repair outbuildings and their distinctive features in-kind. When new materials are needed, they should match existing materials in color, durability, and texture. Refer to maintenance and alteration of applicable materials above, for additional guidelines.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Garage doors*—Ensure that replacement garage doors are compatible with those found on historic garages in the district (e.g., wood paneled) as well as with the principal structure. When not visible from the public right-of-way, modern paneled garage doors may be acceptable.
- ii. *Replacement*—Replace historic outbuildings only if they are beyond repair. In-kind replacement is preferred; however, when it is not possible, ensure that they are reconstructed in the same location using similar scale, proportion, color, and materials as the original historic structure.
- iii. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct outbuildings based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the primary building and historic patterns in the district. Add permanent foundations to existing outbuildings where foundations did not historically exist only as a last resort.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. *Height*—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff recommends approval of item number 1, foundation repair and shiplap skirting installation based on finding c.
2. Staff recommends approval of item number 2, front porch repair based on finding d.
3. Staff recommends approval of item number 3, masonry repair based on finding e.
4. Staff recommends approval of item number 4, roof replacement based on finding f with the following stipulation:
 - i. That panels feature 18 to 21 inches in width, seams feature 1 to 2 inches in height and a crimped ridge seam and galvalume finish are used. A roofing inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of installation to ensure that all materials are consistent with staff's stipulation.
5. Staff recommends approval of item number 5, skylight installation based on finding g with the following stipulation:
 - i. That the skylights should feature a reduced profile so that the protrusion from the skylights does not create irregularities within the roof slope.
6. Staff recommends approval of item number 6, the construction of a rear addition based on findings h through l with the following stipulation:
 - i. That the proposed metal roof feature specifications that match the replacement roof, as stipulated in item 4.
7. Staff does not recommend approval of item number 8, wood windows replacement based on finding n. Staff recommends that the applicant restore the original, wood windows.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve items 1-4 and 6 with staff stipulations; Item 5 as submitted; Items 7 as proposed. With the additional stipulations to salvage whatever is possible. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

• **Item # B-24. HDRC NO. 2019-308**

ADDRESS: 403 SAINT ANTHONY AVE

APPLICANT: Edith Stockhardt

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to place a metal storage container in the rear yard.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition w

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

- iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.
- iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

B. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

Salvaged materials—Incorporate salvaged historic materials where possible within the context of the overall design of the new structure.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.
- ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.
- iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.
- iv. *Windows and doors*—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions.
- v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

- i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used.
- ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of the storage container based on findings a through b with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant relocate the container entirely behind the primary structure in the rear yard. The applicant is required to submit an updated site plan to staff that reflects this change prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant paints the storage unit in a color that is pulled from the primary structure to minimize the structure's visual impact from the public right-of-way.
- iii. That the applicant explores ways to increase the landscape buffer in the planting strip along Dumoulin Ave.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Patti Zaiontz.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve temporary 24 month structure to be revisited with staff and the future owner or current owner if they so wish within 24 months; and with the additional stipulation that the house be repainted reviewed by staff and landscaped within that time period. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

• **Item # B-25. HDRC NO. 2019-291**

ADDRESS: 307 DELAWARE
APPLICANT: Robert V Elizondo III

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Enclose an original front door with siding.
2. Enclose two existing window openings on the east facades with siding.
3. Install a small rectangular window measuring approximately 1x2 feet on the east façade.
4. Modify the front porch columns and remove an original decorative column detail.
5. Construct a rear addition totaling approximately 228 square feet.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.

- ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. *Height*—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

2. Massing and Form of Non-Residential and Mixed-Use Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, additions should not fundamentally alter the scale and character of the block when viewed from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Preferred location*—Place additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize the visual impact on the original structure from the public right of way. An addition to the front of a building is inappropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, and orientation as the principal structure for additions, particularly for those that are visible from the public right-of-way.
- iv. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design additions to historic buildings to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- v. *Transitions between old and new*—Distinguish additions as new without distracting from the original structure. For example, rooftop additions should be appropriately set back to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. For side or rear additions utilize setbacks, a small change in detailing, or a recessed area at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Height*—Limit the height of side or rear additions to the height of the original structure. Limit the height of rooftop additions to no more than 40 percent of the height of original structure.
- ii. *Total addition footprint*—New additions should never result in the doubling of the historic building footprint. Full-floor rooftop additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

- i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

- i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

5. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, cable lines, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Where service areas cannot be located at the rear of the property, compatible screens or buffers will be required.

B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

6. Designing for Energy Efficiency

A. BUILDING DESIGN

i. *Energy efficiency*—Design additions and new construction to maximize energy efficiency.

ii. *Materials*—Utilize green building materials, such as recycled, locally-sourced, and low maintenance materials whenever possible.

iii. *Building elements*—Incorporate building features that allow for natural environmental control – such as operable windows for cross ventilation.

iv. *Roof slopes*—Orient roof slopes to maximize solar access for the installation of future solar collectors where compatible with typical roof slopes and orientations found in the surrounding historic district.

B. SITE DESIGN

i. *Building orientation*—Orient new buildings and additions with consideration for solar and wind exposure in all seasons to the extent possible within the context of the surrounding district.

ii. *Solar access*—Avoid or minimize the impact of new construction on solar access for adjoining properties.

C. SOLAR COLLECTORS

i. *Location*—Locate solar collectors on side or rear roof pitch of the primary historic structure to the maximum extent feasible to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way while maximizing solar access. Alternatively, locate solar collectors on a garage or outbuilding or consider a ground-mount system where solar access to the primary structure is limited.

ii. *Mounting (sloped roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a sloped roof. Select collectors that are similar in color to the roof surface to reduce visibility.

iii. *Mounting (flat roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a flat roof to the maximum extent feasible. Where solar access limitations preclude a flush mount, locate panels towards the rear of the roof where visibility from the public right-of-way will be minimized.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff does not recommend approval of the removal of an existing front door based on finding b. Staff recommends that the door and trim be reinstalled to match the original configuration.

Item 2, Staff does not recommend approval of the removal of two existing window openings based on finding c. Staff recommends that the windows and trim be reinstalled to match the original configuration.

Item 3, Staff does not recommend approval of the installation of a small rectangular window on the east façade based on finding d. Staff recommends that the opening be removed and the original fenestration configuration be reinstalled as noted in Item 2 above.

Item 4, Staff does not recommend approval of the porch column modifications based on finding e. Staff recommends that the porch columns and architectural detailing be reinstalled.

Item 5, Staff recommends approval of the rear addition based on findings f through k. A Certificate of Appropriateness for the addition will not be issued until the outstanding violations have been resolved.

CASE COMMENTS:

VIOLATION – The applicant submitted an application for a rear addition to be heard at the June 5, 2019, HDRC hearing. Upon review of the property’s existing condition, it was discovered that the removal of the front door, enclosure of existing windows, installation of a new window, and front porch modifications were performed without receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness or applicable permits. Post-work application fees have not been paid.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to deny Item 1-follow staff recommendation, Item 2-3 to approve the window that had been installed in the shower area and the removal of that window, Item 4 to be denied and needs to revert back to the original configuration, Item 5 move to approve rear addition based on findings f-k, and item 6 approval of reinstallation of historic window that was adjacent to the bathroom window. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, and Bowman.
Nays: None .
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- **Item # B-27. HDRC NO. 2019-310**
ADDRESS: 1431 W ROSEWOOD AVE
APPLICANT: Paul Peralez

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace approximately 9 existing wood windows with new Pella brand wood windows.
2. Replace approximately 2 non-original aluminum windows with new Pella brand wood windows.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff does not recommend approval of the original wood window replacement based on findings a through c. Staff recommends that the applicant repair the existing wood windows in place. If there are assemblies that are deteriorated beyond repair, the applicant must submit evidence to that effect to staff in the form of a window schedule and photographs. If an assembly is deemed deteriorated beyond repair by staff, staff recommends that new windows meet the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant installs one-over-one wood windows to match the existing configuration as closely as possible. Vinyl or composite windows are not appropriate. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add

thickness. The final specification should be submitted to staff for review prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the non-original replacement based on finding d.

Staff recommends approval of relocating the side door to the rear based on finding d with the stipulation that infill should match in siding, trim, and configuration.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve Items 1 and 2.
Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter Grube, Bowman,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

• **Item # B-28. HDRC NO. 2019-311**

ADDRESS: 1704 SAN FERNANDO ST

APPLICANT: Thomas Casias

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to :

1. Wrap the front columns with wood.
2. Replace the asphalt shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof.
3. Remove an original window opening and an original door opening at the rear of the structure and enclose with siding.
4. Replace an existing modified window at the rear of the structure and restore the original size.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.
- ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.
- iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or

wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.

ii. *Location* – Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the fence as installed based on findings a through d. Staff recommends that the applicant proposes an alternative fence design that complies with the Historic Design Guidelines and city permitting requirements as outlined in UDC Section 35-514, such as vertical wood pickets, cattle panel, or wrought iron.

CASE COMMENTS:

VIOLATION – The requested fence was installed prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness or permit. The installation occurred sometime after April 2016.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to postpone until next HDRC Hearing by Commission. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter Grube, Bowman.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

- **Item # B-29. HDRC NO. 2019-313**

ADDRESS: 801 LABOR

APPLICANT: Ernesto Urbano/Urban Stone Custom Builders LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace approximately 9 existing wood windows with new Pella brand wood windows.
2. Replace approximately 2 non-original aluminum windows with new Pella brand wood windows.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. *Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.

iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.

iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.

v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff recommends approval of the front porch column modifications based on finding b with the following stipulations:

- i. That the columns be no wider than 6x6". The applicant is required to submit a detailed elevation and plan drawing that clearly indicates all relevant dimensions for staff review and approval prior to obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the installation of a standing seam metal roof based on finding c with the following stipulations:

- i. That the standing seam metal roof features panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches tall, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. An on-site inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of work to verify that the roofing material matches the approved specifications.
- ii. That all chimney, flue, and related existing roof details are preserved.

Item 3, Staff does not recommend approval of the removal and enclosure of the existing window and door openings based on finding d. Staff recommends that the existing openings be retained. Staff finds that the window opening may be modified to an opening that is consistent with original sizes found on the historic structure.

Item 4, Staff recommends approval of the rear window replacement and opening modification based on finding e with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant submits a detailed elevation drawing with dimensions for staff review and approval prior to obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant submits a final window specification for the proposed wood windows to staff for review and approval. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve Items 1-2, and 4 with staff with stipulations, and Item 3 is approved as submitted. Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote:
Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter Grube, Bowman,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

• **Item # B-32. HDRC NO. 2019-302**

ADDRESS: 131 ADAMS ST

APPLICANT: Daniel Sexton /Buffalo Contracting

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing, wood fan lite door with a wood door featuring ornamental rectangular lites and a metal kick plate.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

6. *Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens*

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of door replacement based on finding c with the stipulation that a door style that is appropriate to the American Foursquare/Craftsman style is submitted to staff for verification.

CASE COMMENT:

COMPLIANCE – On a site visit on May 9, 2019, staff found that the front door had been replaced prior to approval. The applicant was cooperative to submit an application to be heard at the next available HDRC hearing.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve application.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter Grube, Bowman,

Nays: None.

Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

• **Item # B-33. HDRC NO. 2019-315**

ADDRESS: 310 CALLAGHAN AVE

APPLICANT: Justin Ferdinand/Alamo Wealth Builders, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Remove a non-original rear door opening and patio cover to infill with siding
2. Remove a non-original rear-side aluminum window opening to infill with siding
3. Install a 3' by 11' rear addition and rear deck, including replacement of an original window opening for a door.
4. Repair eight (8) one-over-one wood windows and install wood screens

5. Replace front porch columns and railing from wrought iron to wood
6. Remove corner-facing front door from the bay window wall to infill with siding
7. Relocate the front-facing front door one-foot (1') closer to the bay window
8. Install stucco-textured Hardie skirting panels around the foundation
9. Install a four-foot (4') tall wrought iron fence with solid horizontal wood solar gate in the front yard
10. Install an eight-foot (8') tall horizontal wood fence in the rear yard
11. Install a concrete ribbon driveway with crushed rocks
12. Demolish approximately half of a rear accessory structure, maintaining the other half on the structure on the rear neighbor's property.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

3. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
- iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
- v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

8. Architectural Features: Foundations

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Replacement features*—Ensure that features such as decorative vents and grilles and lattice panels are replaced in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not possible, use features matching in size, material, and design. Replacement skirting should consist of durable, proven materials, and should either match the existing siding or be applied to have minimal visual impact.

3. Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal facade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. *Height*—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

- i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

- i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

5. Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
- v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible use.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.

ii. *Location* – Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

UDC Sec. 35-514. - Fences

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*— Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items 1-6, 8-11 with the following stipulations:

i. All new wood siding should feature a 117 profile

ii. The rear wood window removed for the addition and patio should be salvaged and relocated to another portion of the rear elevation.

iii. A measured drawing or mock-up of an appropriate wood window screen should be submitted to staff for verification.

iv. The new wood columns and railing should feature the standard specifications: The proposed railings should feature both a top and bottom rail. The bottom rail should feature a vertical orientation and should be installed approximately three to four inches above the porch decking. Both top and bottom rails should be constructed from 2"x4" members. The proposed railing should not feature an overall height of more than three (3) feet. ii. The wood columns should be six inch (6") square with capital and base trim, and feature a chamfered corner The applicant may provide an updated measured drawing or request the standard specifications from staff. No installation of wood decking or new skirting is requested at this time.

v. The foundation should feature lap skirting constructed of wood or smooth Hardie comparable to the historic siding of the structure; faux wood grain texture is not allowed.

vi. The front yard fence turns at the corner of the yard and returns to the corner of the house rather than span across the driveway; the gate should be located behind the front façade plane of the house or removed from the design; no portion of the front yard fence is to exceed four-feet (4') in height.

vii. No portion of the rear privacy fence is to exceed six-feet (6') in height/

viii. The ribbon driveway is to feature concrete ribbons no wider than two-feet (2') with a total width no wider than ten-feet (10').

Staff does not recommend approval of item 7, relocating the front door , or item 12, demolishing half of a shared rear accessory structure.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Bowman made a motion to approve Items 1-6 and 8-11, and deny Item 7. Item 12 is withdrawn. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter Grube, Bowman,
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT

• **Item # B-34. HDRC NO. 2019-273**

ADDRESS: 1434 FULTON AVE

APPLICANT: Jessica Mata

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to demolish a rear accessory structure

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Unified Development Code Sec. 35-614. - Demolition.

Demolition of a historic landmark constitutes an irreplaceable loss to the quality and character of the City of San Antonio. Accordingly, these procedures provide criteria to prevent unnecessary damage to the quality and character of the city's historic districts and character while, at the same time, balancing these interests against the property rights of landowners.

(a) Applicability. The provisions of this section apply to any application for demolition of a historic landmark (including those previously designated as historic exceptional or historic significant) or a historic district.

(1) Historic Landmark. No certificate shall be issued for demolition of a historic landmark unless the applicant provides sufficient evidence to support a finding by the commission of unreasonable economic hardship on the applicant. In the case of a historic landmark, if an applicant fails to prove unreasonable economic hardship, the applicant may provide to the historic and design review commission additional information regarding loss of significance as provided in subsection

(c) in order to receive a historic and design review commission recommendation for a certificate for demolition.

(2) Entire Historic District. If the applicant wishes to demolish an entire designated historic district, the applicant must provide sufficient evidence to support a finding by the commission of economic hardship on the applicant if the application for a certificate is to be approved.

(3) Property Located in Historic District and Contributing to District Although Not Designated a Landmark. No certificate shall be issued for property located in a historic district and contributing to the district although not designated a landmark unless the applicant provides sufficient evidence to support a finding by the commission of unreasonable economic hardship on the applicant if the application for a certificate is disapproved. When an applicant fails to prove unreasonable economic hardship in such cases, the applicant may provide additional information regarding loss of significance as provided in subsection (c) in order to receive a certificate for demolition of the property.

(b) Unreasonable Economic Hardship.

(1) Generally. The historic and design review commission shall be guided in its decision by balancing the historic, architectural, cultural and/or archaeological value of the particular landmark or eligible landmark against the special merit of the proposed replacement project. The historic and design review commission shall not consider or be persuaded to find unreasonable economic hardship based on the presentation of circumstances or items that are not unique to the property in question (i.e. the current economic climate).

(2) Burden of Proof. The historic and design review commission shall not consider or be persuaded to find unreasonable economic hardship based on the presentation of circumstances or items that are not unique to the property in question (i.e., the current economic climate). When a claim of unreasonable economic hardship is made, the owner must provide sufficient evidence to support a finding by the commission that:

A. The owner cannot make reasonable beneficial use of or realize a reasonable rate of return on a structure or site, regardless of whether that return represents the most profitable return possible, unless the highly significant endangered, historic and cultural landmark, historic and cultural landmarks district or demolition delay designation, as applicable, is removed or the proposed demolition or relocation is allowed;

B. The structure and property cannot be reasonably adapted for any other feasible use, whether by the current owner or by a purchaser, which would result in a reasonable rate of return; and

C. The owner has failed to find a purchaser or tenant for the property during the previous two (2) years, despite having made substantial ongoing efforts during that period to do so. The evidence of unreasonable economic hardship introduced by the owner may, where applicable, include proof that the owner's affirmative obligations to maintain the structure or property make it impossible for the owner to realize a reasonable rate of return on the structure or property.

(3) Criteria. The public benefits obtained from retaining the cultural resource must be analyzed and duly considered by the historic and design review commission. As evidence that an unreasonable economic hardship exists, the owner may submit the following information to the historic and design review commission by affidavit:

A. For all structures and property:

i. The past and current use of the structures and property;

ii. The name and legal status (e.g., partnership, corporation) of the owners;

iii. The original purchase price of the structures and property;

iv. The assessed value of the structures and property according to the two (2) most recent tax assessments;

v. The amount of real estate taxes on the structures and property for the previous two (2) years;

vi. The date of purchase or other acquisition of the structures and property;

vii. Principal balance and interest rate on current mortgage and the annual debt service on the structures and property, if any, for the previous two (2) years;

viii. All appraisals obtained by the owner or applicant within the previous two (2) years in connection with the owner's purchase, financing or ownership of the structures and property;

ix. Any listing of the structures and property for sale or rent, price asked and offers received;

x. Any consideration given by the owner to profitable adaptive uses for the structures and property;

xi. Any replacement construction plans for proposed improvements on the site;

xii. Financial proof of the owner's ability to complete any replacement project on the site, which may include but not be limited to a performance bond, a letter of credit, an irrevocable trust for completion of improvements, or a letter of commitment from a financial institution; and

xiii. The current fair market value of the structure and property as determined by a qualified appraiser.

xiv. Any property tax exemptions claimed in the past five (5) years.

B. For income producing structures and property:

i. Annual gross income from the structure and property for the previous two (2) years;

ii. Itemized operating and maintenance expenses for the previous two (2) years; and

iii. Annual cash flow, if any, for the previous two (2) years.

C. In the event that the historic and design review commission determines that any additional information described above is necessary in order to evaluate whether an unreasonable economic hardship exists, the historic and design review commission shall notify the owner. Failure by the owner to submit such information to the historic and design review commission within fifteen (15) days after receipt of such notice, which time may be extended by the historic and design review commission, may be grounds for denial of the owner's claim of unreasonable economic hardship.

D. Construction cost estimates for rehabilitation, restoration, or repair, which shall be broken out by design discipline and construction trade, and shall provide approximate quantities and prices for labor and materials.

OHP shall review such estimates for completeness and accuracy, and shall retain outside consultants as needed to provide expert analysis to the HDRC. When a low-income resident homeowner is unable to meet the requirements

set forth in this section, then the historic and design review commission, at its own discretion, may waive some or all of the requested information and/or request substitute information that an indigent resident homeowner may obtain without incurring any costs. If the historic and design review commission cannot make a determination based on information submitted and an appraisal has not been provided, then the historic and design review commission may request that an appraisal be made by the city.

(c) Loss of Significance.

When an applicant fails to prove unreasonable economic hardship the applicant may provide to the historic and design review commission additional information which may show a loss of significance in regards to the subject of the application in order to receive historic and design review commission recommendation of approval of the demolition. If, based on the evidence presented, the historic and design review commission finds that the structure or property is no longer historically, culturally, architecturally or archeologically significant, it may make a recommendation for approval of the demolition. In making this determination, the historic and design review commission must find that the owner has provided sufficient evidence to support a finding by the commission that the structure or property has undergone significant and irreversible changes which have caused it to lose the historic, cultural, architectural or archeological significance, qualities or features which qualified the structure or property for such designation. Additionally, the historic and design review commission must find that such changes were not caused either directly or indirectly by the owner, and were not due to intentional or negligent destruction or a lack of maintenance rising to the level of a demolition by neglect. The historic and design review commission shall not consider or be persuaded to find loss of significance based on the presentation of circumstances or items that are not unique to the property in question (i.e. the current economic climate). For property located within a historic district, the historic and design review commission shall be guided in its decision by balancing the contribution of the property to the character of the historic district with the special merit of the proposed replacement project.

(d) Documentation and Strategy.

(1) Applicants that have received a recommendation for a certificate shall document buildings, objects, sites or structures which are intended to be demolished with 35mm slides or prints, preferably in black and white, and supply a set of slides or prints or provide a set of digital photographs in RGB color to the historic preservation officer. Digital photographs must have a minimum dimension of 3000 x 2000 pixels and resolution of 300 dpi.

(2) Applicants shall also prepare for the historic preservation officer a salvage strategy for reuse of building materials deemed valuable by the historic preservation officer for other preservation and restoration activities.

(3) Applicants that have received an approval of a certificate regarding demolition shall be permitted to receive a demolition permit without additional commission action on demolition, following the commission's recommendation of a certificate for new construction. Permits for demolition and construction shall be issued simultaneously if requirements of section 35-609, new construction, are met, and the property owner provides financial proof of his ability to complete the project.

(4) When the commission recommends approval of a certificate for buildings, objects, sites, structures designated as landmarks, or structures in historic districts, permits shall not be issued until all plans for the site have received approval from all appropriate city boards, commissions, departments and agencies. Permits for parking lots shall not be issued, nor shall an applicant be allowed to operate a parking lot on such property, unless such parking lot plan was approved as a replacement element for the demolished object or structure.

(e) Issuance of Permit. When the commission recommends approval of a certificate regarding demolition of buildings, objects, sites, or structures in historic districts or historic landmarks, permits shall not be issued until all plans for the site have received approval from all appropriate city boards, commissions, departments and agencies. Once the replacement plans are approved a fee shall be assessed for the demolition based on the approved replacement plan square footage. The fee must be paid in full prior to issuance of any permits and shall be deposited into an account as directed by the historic preservation officer for the benefit, rehabilitation or acquisition of local historic resources. Fees shall be as follows and are in addition to any fees charged by planning and development services:

0—2,500 square feet = \$2,000.00

2,501—10,000 square feet = \$5,000.00

10,001—25,000 square feet = \$10,000.00

25,001—50,000 square feet = \$20,000.00
Over 50,000 square feet = \$30,000.00

NOTE: Refer to City Code Chapter 10, Subsection 10-119(o) regarding issuance of a permit.

(f) The historic preservation officer may approve applications for demolition permits for non-contributing minor outbuildings within a historic district such as carports, detached garages, sheds, and greenhouses determined by the historic preservation officer to not possess historical or architectural significance either as a stand-alone building or structure, or as part of a complex of buildings or structures on the site.

(Ord. No. 98697 § 6) (Ord. No. 2010-06-24-0616, § 2, 6-24-10) (Ord. No. 2014-04-10-0229, § 4, 4-10-14)(Ord. No. 2015-10-29-0921 , § 2, 10-29-15)(Ord. No. 2015-12-17-1077 , § 2, 12-17-15)

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on finding b through d. Staff recommends the reconstruction of the lost structure.

CASE COMMENT:

VIOLATION – On March 13, 2019, following the submission of a Determination of Non-Contributing Status application by another applicant, the owner disclosed that the structure was already partially demolished. Staff conducted a site visit on March 14, 2019, to issue a Stop Work Order. Staff determined the structure to be contributing on March 22, 2019. The owner disagreed with staff’s determination and has requested to be expedited to municipal court for demolition without approval instead of the HDRC. The owner subsequently submitted an application on May 8, 2019, to be heard at the next HDRC hearing after a potential buyer and their realtor had contacted staff for compliance status.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to deny demolition and to go to board of adjustments. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter Grube, Bowman.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza, Connor, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Action: **Motion passed 6 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 5 ABSENT**

EXECUTIVE SESSION.

Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.

ADJOURNMENT.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:33 PM.

APPROVED

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read 'Scott Carpenter', is written over the printed name and title.

Scott Carpenter
Acting Chair