



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
17 July 2019**

The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session on Wednesday, July 17, 2019, in the Board Room at the Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

- Acting Chair Fezter called the meeting to order at 3:04 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

- The roll was called by the Executive Secretary.

Present: Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Absent: Fernandez, Garza, and Connor.

- **Commissioner Fernandez arrived at 3:06pm- after roll call.**

CHAIRMAN'S STATEMENT

ANNOUNCEMENTS

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

CONSENT A and B AGENDA

- **Consideration of Consent Agenda- A items:**
 - Item #A-1, Case No. 2019-368 306 W MARKET ST
 - Item #A-2, Case No. 2019-361 1507 MISSION RD
 - Item #A-3, Case No. 2018-597 514 W QUINCY
 - Item #A-4, Case No. 2019-360 329 N MAIN AVE

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve the consent Agenda A with staff stipulations. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Garza, and Connor.

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

- Evelyn Brown

• **Consideration of Consent Agenda- B items Heard after 4:30pm:**

- Item #B-1, Case No. 2019-371 2500 E COMMERCE ST
- Item #B-2, Case No. 2019-378 309 DEVINE ST
- Item #B-3, Case No. 2019-377 309 DEVINE ST
- Item #B-4, Case No. 2019-353 431 E FRENCH PLACE
- Item #B-5, Case No. 2019-369 700 CULBERSON AVE
- Item #B-7, Case No. 2019-344 104 BEAUREGARD
- Item #B-8, Case No. 2019-383 322 W ELSMERE PLACE
- Item #B-9, Case No. 2019-384 322 W ELSMERE PLACE
- Item #B-10, Case No. 2019-350 742 DENVER BLVD
- Item #B-11, Case No. 2019-370 8701 MYSTIC PARK
- Item #B-12, Case No. 2019-386 MARTIN LUTHER KING, JR PLAZA / E HOUSTON ST AT N NEW BRAUNFELS AVE
- Item #B-14, Case No. 2019-363 405 GILLESPIE
- Item #B-15, Case No. 2019-373 311 REFUGIO ST
- Item #B-20, Case No. 2019-343 414 DONALDSON AVE

- AGENDA B-6 WAS PULLED BY CHAIRMAN FETZER TO ASK A COUPLE OF QUESTIONS.
- AGENDA B-13 WAS MOVED TO INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION
- AGENDA B-20 WAS MOVED TO CONSENT BY STAFF DUE TO APPLICANT COMPLIANCE TO STIPULATIONS.
- AGENDA B-24 WAS WITHDRAWN BY APPLICANT.

Motion: Commissioner Harris moved to approve the consent agenda B with staff stipulations.
Commissioner Bowman seconded the motions.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Garza and Connor.

Action: THE MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA A ITEMS

- **Item # A-5. HDRC NO. 2019-359**
APPLICANT: Lee Fordham/Harrison USA LLC
ADDRESS: 103 W GRAYSON ST

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1. Construct an addition to connect the two existing structures on the site. This will include the removal of some existing walls and roof elements.
2. Perform exterior maintenance and alterations to the two existing structures including repair to existing exterior materials, painting, roof replacement, the installation of overhead rolling doors, window replacement, and the

addition of a cooler and kitchen area for the existing corner building. A new dumpster with screening is proposed for the southern end of the site with access to Grayson Street.

3. Perform landscaping and hardscaping work to include connecting to an existing stair to provide access to the River Walk and creating stadium seating in the Right of Way, which will disturb existing landscaping and hardscaping.
4. Install exterior lighting.
5. Install exterior signage.
6. Install site furnishings including patio furniture.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

UDC Section 35-672. – Neighborhood Wide Design Standards

(a) Pedestrian Circulation. Pedestrian access shall be provided among properties to integrate neighborhoods.

(1) Provide sidewalks that link with existing sidewalks on adjoining properties. If no sidewalk currently exists on an adjoining property, the applicant will have discretion in the placement of the sidewalk provided the following criteria are met:

- A. Provide a sidewalk connection from one (1) side of the applicant's property to the other, parallel to the public right-of way, on the street sides of the property in all river improvement overlay districts
- B. Provide a connection from the street level sidewalk to the Riverwalk at cross streets and bridges and other designated access points. This requirement may be waived if there is already a public connection from the street level to the Riverwalk.
- C. In order to preserve the rural character of "RIO-6," the HPO, in coordination with the development services department, may waive the requirement of sidewalks.
 - In "RIO-3," the width of the pathway along the river shall match those widths established in the historic Hugman drawings. If there are no sidewalks in the Hugman drawings, the path will not exceed eight (8) feet in width.

(2) Link the various functions and spaces on a site with sidewalks in a coordinated system.

Provide pedestrian sidewalks between buildings, parking areas and built features such as outdoor plazas and courtyards.

(3) Paving materials. Paving materials for pedestrian pathways shall use visually and texturally different materials than those used for parking spaces and automobile traffic.

- A. Paving materials for pedestrian pathways shall be either:
 - i. Broom-finished, scored, sandblasted or dyed concrete;
 - ii. Rough or honed finished stone;
 - iii. Brick or concrete pavers; or
 - iv. Other materials that meet the performance standards of the above materials.

B. Asphalt is permitted for pedestrian pathways that also are designated as multi-use paths by the City of San Antonio. The public works department will maintain the designated multi-use path locations.

(4) Street Connections to River. Retain the interesting and unique situations where streets dead-end at the river, creating both visual and physical access to the river for the public.

(5) Pedestrian Access Along the Riverwalk Pathway Shall Not Be Blocked.

A. Queuing is prohibited on the Riverwalk pathway.

B. Hostess stations shall be located away from the Riverwalk pathway so as to not inhibit pedestrian flow on the Riverwalk pathway. That is, the hostess station shall not be located in such a manner to cause a patron who has stopped at the hostess stand to be standing on the Riverwalk pathway. Pedestrian flow shall be considered "inhibited" if a pedestrian walking along the pathway has to swerve, dodge, change direction or come to a complete stop to avoid a patron engaged at the hostess stand.

C. Tables and chairs shall be located a sufficient distance from the Riverwalk pathway so that normal dining and service shall not inhibit the flow of pedestrian traffic. See inhibited definition in subsection B. above.

(b) Automobile Access and Parking. Automobile circulation should be efficient, and conflicts with pedestrians minimized.

Entry points for automobiles should be clearly defined and connections to auto circulation on adjoining properties are encouraged to facilitate access and reduce traffic on abutting public streets.

(1) Curb Cuts.

A. Limit curb cuts to two (2) on parking areas or structures facing only one (1) street, and one (1) for each additional street face. The prohibition of additional curb cuts may be waived by the HDRC where the intent of the standards are clearly met and specific site circulation patterns require an additional curb cut, such as on long parcels or at nodes.

B. Curb cuts may be no larger than twenty-five (25) feet zero (0) inches. Continuous curb cuts are prohibited.

C. Sharing curb cuts between adjacent properties, such as providing cross property access easements, is permitted.

(2) Location of Parking Areas. Automobile parking in new developments must be balanced with the requirements of active environments. Large expanses of surface parking lots have a negative impact on street activity and the pedestrian experience. New commercial and residential structures can accommodate parking needs and contribute to a pedestrian-friendly streetscape.

A. Locate parking areas, that is any off-street, ground level surface used to park cars or any parking structure, toward the interior of the site or to the side or rear of a building.

B. The extent of parking area that may be located along the street edge or riverside shall be limited to a percentage of the lot line as per Table 672-1 as measured in a lineal direction parallel to the lot line. All parking within a thirty-foot setback from the above mentioned lot line shall comply with the requirements of the table. Where parking is located on corner sites only one (1) lot line has to meet the requirements of the table.

C. Parking lots should be avoided as a primary land use. Parking lots as a primary use are prohibited in RIO-3 and for all properties that fall within one hundred (100) feet of the river right-of-way in all RIO districts.

(3) Screen or Buffer Parking Areas From View of Public Streets, the River or Adjacent Residential Uses. (see Figure 672-2). Parking lots shall be screened with a landscape buffer as per the illustrations of bufferyards and Table 510-2 if the parking area meets one (1) of the following conditions:

A. Within a fifty-foot setback from the edge of the river ROW use, at a minimum, type E; or

B. Within a twenty-foot setback from a property line adjacent to a street use, at a minimum, type B; or

C. Within a twenty-foot setback of commercial or industrial property that abuts a residential property use, at a minimum, type C.

(4) Parking Structures Shall Be Compatible With Buildings in the Surrounding Area. Parking garages should have retail space on the ground floor of a parking structure provided the retail space has at least fifty (50) percent of its linear street frontage as display windows. Parking structures may be made visually appealing with a mural or public art component approved by the HDRC on the parking structure. A parking garage will be considered compatible if:

A. It does not vary in height by more than thirty (30) percent from another building on the same block face; and

B. It uses materials that can be found on other buildings within the block face, or in the block face across the street.

(5) Parking Structures Shall Provide Clearly Defined Pedestrian Access. Pedestrian entrances and exits shall be accentuated with directional signage, lighting or architectural features so that pedestrians can readily discern the appropriate path of travel to avoid pedestrian/auto conflicts.

(6) Parking lots, structures, and hardscape shall not drain directly into the river without installation of appropriate water quality best management practices (WQ BMPs). Acequias shall not be used for any type of drainage.

(c) Views. The river's course (both natural and manmade), and San Antonio's street pattern, creates unique views of certain properties from the public ROW. These properties often occur at prominent curves in the river or where a street changes direction and a property appears to be a terminus at the end of a street.

(1) Architectural Focal Point. When a property is situated in such a manner as to appear to be the terminus at the

end of the street or at a prominent curve in the river, the building shall incorporate into its design an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. (see Figure 672-3) An architectural feature will be considered to be a focal point through any of the following methods, but not limited to:

- A. Additional height.
- B. Creation of a tower.
- C. Variation in roof shape.
- D. Change of color or materials.
- E. Addition of a design enhancement feature such as:
 - i. Embellished entrance areas.
 - ii. Articulated corners, especially when entrance is at corner, rounded or chamfered corners ease the transitions from one street facade to the adjoining facade.
 - iii. Recessed or projecting balconies and entrances.Billboards, advertising and signage are expressly prohibited as appropriate focal points.

UDC Section 35-673. – Site Design Standards

(a) Solar Access. The intent of providing and maintaining solar access to the San Antonio River is to protect the river's specific ecoclimate. The river has a special microclimate of natural and planted vegetation that requires certain levels and balanced amounts of sunlight, space and water. Development must be designed to respect and protect those natural requirements, keeping them in balance and not crowding or altering them so that vegetation does not receive more or less space and water, but particularly sunlight, than is required for normal expected growth.

(1) Building Massing to Provide Solar Access to the River. Building massing shall be so designed as to provide direct sunlight to vegetation in the river channel as defined:

- A. The area to be measured for solar access shall be a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge or from the river's edge to the building face, whichever is lesser, parallel to the river for the length of the property.
- B. The solar calculations shall be measured exclusive to the applicant's property; that is, shades and shadows of other buildings shall not be included in the calculations. The solar calculations shall only measure the impact of new construction and additions. The shading impact of historic buildings on the site may be excluded from the calculations.
- C. The defined area shall receive a minimum of 5.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the winter solstice, and 7.5 hours of direct sunlight, measured at the summer solstice.
- D. Those properties located on the south side of the river (whose north face is adjacent to the river) shall only be required to measure the sunlight in the 30-foot setback on the opposite bank of the river.
- E. Those properties within the river improvement overlay district not directly adjacent to the river are still subject to the provisions of this section. To determine the solar access effect of these buildings on the river the applicant must measure the nearest point to the river of an area defined by a thirty-foot setback from the river's edge, parallel to the river for the length of their property that would be affected by their building. For those buildings on the south side of the river, the 30-foot setback shall be measured only on the opposite bank.
- F. However, in those cases where the above conditions cannot be met due to the natural configuration of the river, existing street patterns, or existing buildings, the HDRC may approve a buildings mass and height as allowed by table 674-2.
- G. If there is a conflict with this section and another section of this chapter this section shall prevail.

(2) Prohibition of Structures, Buildings, Roofs or Skywalks Over the River Channel. No structure, building, roof or skywalk may be constructed over the river channel, or by-pass channel with the exception of structures for flood control purposes, open air pedestrian bridges at ground or river level, and street bridges. The river channel is the natural course of the river as modified for flood control purposes and the Pershing-Catalpa ditch.

(b) Building Orientation. Buildings should be sited to help define active spaces for area users, provide pedestrian connections between sites, help animate the street scene and define street edges. Consideration to both the street and riverside should be given. The placement of a building on a site should therefore be considered within the context of the block, as well as how the structure will support the broader design goals for the area.

(1) Two or More Buildings on a Site.

A. Cluster buildings to create active open spaces such as courtyards along the street and river edges. Site plazas and courtyards, if possible, so that they are shaded in the summer and are sunny in the winter.

(2) Primary and Secondary Entrances

A. Orient a building's primary entrance toward the street with subordinate entrances located on the riverside and/or the interior of the property. On a major thoroughfare street it is acceptable to provide the primary entrance through a common courtyard and then to a street.

B. The primary entrance shall be distinguished by architectural features such as, but not limited to: an entry portal; change in material or color; change in scale of other openings; addition of columns, lintels or canopies.

C. Secondary entrances shall have architectural features that are subordinate to the primary entrance in scale and detail. For purposes of this division subordinate means that the entrance is smaller in height and width, and has fewer or simpler architectural elements.

(c) Topography and Drainage. The natural contours of occasional hillsides and riverbanks contribute to the distinct character of the San Antonio River and shall be considered in site designs for new development. Site plans shall minimize the need for cut and fill. It should be considered as an opportunity for positive enhancements through the creative use of terraces and retaining walls.

(1) Visual Impacts of Cut and Fill. Divide a grade change of more than ten (10) vertical feet into a series of benches and terraces. Terrace steep slopes following site contours. When creating site benches, using sloped "transitional areas" as part of the required landscaping is appropriate.

(2) Minimize the Potential for Erosion at the Riverbank. Grade slopes at a stable angle not to exceed four to one (4:1) and provide plant material that will stabilize the soil such as vigorous ground covers, vines or turf planting that are native and noninvasive species as found on the permissible plant list maintained by the parks and recreation department. Use of stabilizing materials such as geo-web or geo-grid is permitted as long as plant material is used to conceal the grid. Use of terraced walls is permitted when there is a slope of more than four to one (4:1).

(3) Retaining Walls. Limit the height of a retaining wall to less than six (6) feet. If the retaining wall must exceed six (6) feet, a series of six-foot terrace walls is acceptable. Walls at dams and locks are excluded from this requirement. If in the opinion of the historic preservation officer a higher wall is consistent with the adopted conceptual plan of the river, a higher wall (not to exceed twelve (12) feet) is allowed. Materials used for the walls may include limestone, stucco, brick, clay, tile, timber, or textured concrete. (see Figure 673-2)

(4) Enhance or Incorporate Acequias Into The Landscape Design and Drainage Scheme of the Site. Where archeological evidence indicates a site contains or has contained a Spanish colonial acequia, incorporate the original path of the acequia as a natural drainageway or a landscape feature of the site by including it as part of the open space plan, and a feature of the landscape design.

(5) Design of Stormwater Management Facilities to be a Landscape Amenity. Where above ground stormwater management facilities are required, such facilities shall be multi-purpose amenities. For example, water quality features can be included as part of the site landscaping and detention facilities can be included as part of a hardscape patio. Using an open concrete basin as a detention pond is prohibited.

(6) Walls and Fences at Detention Areas.

A. When the topography of the site exceeds a four to one (4:1) slope and it becomes necessary to use a masonry wall as part of the detention area, use a textured surface and incorporate plant materials, from the plant list maintained by the parks department, that will drape over the edge to soften the appearance of the structure.

B. The use of solid board or chain link fence with or without slats is prohibited. A welded wire, tubular steel, wrought iron or garden loop is permitted.

(7) Roof Drainage into the River.

A. All roof drainage and other run-off drainage shall conform to public works department standards so that they drain into sewer and storm drains rather than the river. Drainage of this type shall not be piped into the river unless the outlet is below the normal waterline of the river at normal flow rates.

B. All downspouts or gutters draining water from roofs or parapets shall be extended underground under walks and patios to the San Antonio River's edge or stormwater detention facility so that such drainage will not erode or otherwise damage the Riverwalk, landscaping or river retaining walls.

C. All piping and air-conditioning wastewater systems shall be kept in good repair. Water to be drained purposely from these systems, after being tested and adjudged free from pollution, shall be drained in the same manner prescribed in subsection (7)A. above.

(d) Riverside Setbacks. Riverside setbacks for both buildings and accessory structures are established to reinforce the defined character of the specific river improvement overlay district and help to define an edge at the river pathway that is varied according to the relationship of the river and the street. In the more urban areas, buildings should align closer to the river edge, while in more rural areas the buildings should be set farther away.

(1) Minimum setback requirements are per the following Table 673-1.

Description	RIO-1	RIO-2	RIO-3	RIO-4	RIO-5	RIO-6
Riverside Setback	20 FT	15 FT	0 FT	20 FT	50 ft	100 FT

(2) Designation of a development node district provides for a minimum riverside setback of zero (0) feet.

(e) Landscape Design. Lush and varied landscapes are part of the tradition of the San Antonio River. These design standards apply to landscaping within an individual site. Additional standards follow that provide more specific standards for the public pathway along the river and street edges.

(1) Provide Variety in Landscape Design. Provide variety in the landscape experience along the river by varying landscape designs between properties. No more than seventy-five (75) percent of the landscape materials, including plants, shall be the same as those on adjacent properties. (see Figure 673-4).

(2) Planting Requirements in Open Space Abutting the River. On publicly-owned land leased by the adjoining property owner, if applicable, and/or within privately owned setbacks adjacent to the river, a minimum percentage of

the open space, excluding building footprint, lease space under bridges and parking requirements, are required to be planted according to Table 673-2.

A. Planting requirements in RIO-4, RIO-5, and RIO-6 should continue the restoration landscape efforts along the river banks. Planting in these RIO districts is to be less formal so as to maintain the rural setting of the river.

B. In "RIO-3," if existing conditions don't meet the standards as set out in Table 673-2, the owner or lessee will not have to remove paving to add landscaping in order to meet the standards until there is a substantial remodeling of the outdoor area. Substantial remodeling will include replacement of seventy-five (75) percent of the paving materials, or replacement of balcony and stair structures.

(f) Plant Materials. A number of soil conditions converge in the San Antonio area to create unique vegetation ecosystems.

Along the route of the San Antonio River, the soil conditions vary greatly from the northern boundary near Hildebrand to

the city limits near Mission San Francisco de la Espada (Mission Espada) and therefore native and indigenous plants will

vary accordingly. Landscaping should reflect the unique soil characteristics of the specific site.

(1) Incorporate Existing Vegetation. Extend the use of landscape materials, including plants, shrubs and trees that are

used in the public areas of the river onto adjacent private areas to form a cohesive design.

(2) Use indigenous and noninvasive species characteristic of the specific site as found on the permissible plant list

maintained by the parks and recreation department or the Unified Development Code Plant List found in Appendix

E. In "RIO-3," plantings of tropical and semi-tropical plants with perennial background is permitted.

(3) Install Trees to Provide Shade and to Separate Pedestrians From Automobile Traffic. Install street trees along the

property line or in the ROW abutting all streets according to minimum requirement standards established in subsection 35-512(b), except where this conflicts with existing downtown Tri-Party improvements in "RIO-3." In "RIO-3" the owner has the option of placing trees at the property line, or along the street edge.

(g) Paving Materials. An important San Antonio landscape tradition is the use of decorative surfaces for paving and other landscape structures. Paving materials and patterns should be carefully chosen to preserve and enhance the pedestrian experience.

(1) Vary Walkway, Patio and Courtyard Paving to Add Visual Interest on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River. Pervious paving is encouraged where feasible and appropriate to the site.

A. A maximum of six hundred (600) square feet is allowed for a single paving material before the paving material must be divided or separated with a paving material that is different in texture, pattern, color or material. A separation using a different material must be a minimum of twenty-four (24) inches wide, the full width of the pathway.

B. A maximum of one hundred (100) lineal feet is allowed in a walkway before the pattern must change in districts "RIO-2," "RIO-3," and "RIO-4." A maximum of five hundred twenty-eight (528) lineal feet is allowed before the pattern must change in districts "RIO-1," "RIO-5" and "RIO-6." The change of material at five hundred twenty-eight (528) lineal feet will define and delineate one-tenth-mile markers.

C. In "RIO-3," the Riverwalk pathway shall be delineated by using a separate material that is clearly distinguished from the adjacent patio paving materials. If the historic Hugman drawings indicate a sidewalk width and pattern on the site, that paving pattern and material shall be replicated.

(h) Site Walls and Fences. Site walls and fences are used to help divide spaces, screen unsightly objects and provide privacy. However, the character of the San Antonio River is such that walls shall not be erected in such a way as to block views of the river from public spaces.

(1) Use of Site Walls to Define Outdoor Spaces.

A. Use of low scale walls (twenty-four (24) inches to forty-eight (48) inches) to divide space, create a variety in landscaping and define edges is permitted.

B. Solid walls (up to seventy-two (72) inches) are permitted to: screen mechanical equipment, garbage receptacles and other unsightly areas; and provide privacy at the back of lots up to the front building face.

(2) Site Wall and Fence Materials.

A. On properties abutting the river, site walls and fence materials may be constructed of: stone, block, tile, stucco, wrought iron, tubular steel, welded wire or a combination of masonry and metal, cedar posts and welded wire or garden loop or other materials having similar characteristics. All other properties, not abutting the river may use the above listed materials plus wood fencing.

B. All chain link fences are prohibited for properties abutting the river. For properties that do not abut the river chain link is only allowed in the rear yard if not readily visible from the right-of-way. Barbed wire, razor wire, and concertina are prohibited in all RIO districts.

(i) Street Furnishings. Street furnishings are exterior amenities, including but not limited to, tables, chairs, umbrellas, landscape pots, wait stations, valet stations, bicycle racks, planters, benches, bus shelters, kiosks, waste receptacles and similar items that help to define pedestrian use areas. Handcrafted street furnishings are particularly important in San Antonio, and therefore this tradition of craftsmanship and of providing street furniture is encouraged.

(1) Prohibited Street Furnishings in Riverwalk Area. The following street furnishings are prohibited within the publicly owned portion of the Riverwalk area, whether or not the property is leased, and on the exterior of the riverside of buildings directly adjacent to the publicly owned portion of the river:

A. Vending machines.

B. Automatic teller machines.

C. Pay phones.

D. Photo booths.

E. Automated machines such as, but not limited to, penny crunching machines, blood pressure machines, fortune-telling machines, video games, animated characters and other machines that are internally illuminated, or have moving parts, or make noise, or have flashing lights.

F. Inanimate figures such as horses, kangaroos, bears, gorillas, mannequins or any such animal, cartoon or human figure. This section does not affect public art as defined in Appendix "A" of this chapter.

G. Monitors (i.e., television screens, computer screens).

H. Speakers.

(2) Street Furnishing Materials.

A. Street furnishings shall be made of wood, metal, stone, terra cotta, cast stone, hand-sculpted concrete, or solid surfacing material, such as Corian or Surell.

B. Inexpensive plastic resin furnishings are prohibited.

(3) Advertising on Street Furnishings.

A. No commercial logos, trademarks, decals, product names whether specific or generic, or names of businesses and organizations shall be allowed on street furnishings.

B. Product or business advertising is prohibited on all street furnishings.

C. Notwithstanding the restrictions above, applications may be approved for purposes of donor or non-profit recognition.

(4) Street furnishings, such as tables and chairs may not be stored (other than overnight storage) in such a way as to be visible from the river pathway.

(j) Lighting. Site lighting should be considered an integral element of the landscape design of a property. It should help define activity areas and provide interest at night. At the same time, lighting should facilitate safe and convenient circulation for pedestrians, bicyclists and motorists. Overspill of light and light pollution should be avoided.

(1) Site Lighting. Site lighting shall be shielded by permanent attachments to light fixtures so that the light sources are not visible from a public way and any offsite glare is prevented.

A. Site lighting shall include illumination of parking areas, buildings, pedestrian routes, dining areas, design features and public ways.

B. Outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall have average ambient light levels of between one (1) and three (3) foot-candles with a minimum of 0.5-foot candles and a maximum of six (6) foot-candles at any point measured on the ground plane. Interior spaces visible from the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level shall use light sources with no more than the equivalent lumens of a one hundred-watt incandescent bulb. Exterior balconies, porches and canopies adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way shall use light sources with the equivalent lumens of a sixty-watt incandescent bulb with average ambient light levels no greater than the lumen output of a one hundred-watt incandescent light bulb as long as average foot candle standards are not exceeded. Accent lighting of landscape or building features including specimen plants, gates, entries, water features, art work, stairs, and ramps may exceed these standards by a multiple of 2.5. Recreational fields and activity areas that require higher light levels shall be screened from the river hike and bike pathways with a landscape buffer.

C. Exterior light fixtures that use the equivalent of more than one hundred-watt incandescent bulbs shall not emit a significant amount of the fixture's total output above a vertical cut-off angle of ninety (90) degrees. Any structural part of the fixture providing this cut-off angle must be permanently affixed.

D. Lighting spillover to the publicly owned areas of the river or across property lines shall not exceed one-half (½) of one (1) foot-candle measured at any point ten (10) feet beyond the property line.

(2) Provide Lighting for Pedestrian Ways That is Low Scaled for Walking. The position of a lamp in a pedestrian-way light shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height above the ground.

(3) Light Temperature and Color.

A. Light temperature and color shall be between 2500° K and 3500° K with a color rendition index (CRI) of eighty (80) or higher, respectively. This restriction is limited to all outdoor spaces adjoining and visible from the river right-of-way and from the interior spaces adjoining the river right-of-way on the river level and ground floor level. Levels shall be determined by product specifications.

(4) Minimize the Visual Impacts of Exterior Building Lighting.

A. All security lighting shall be shielded so that the light sources are not visible from a public way.

B. Lighting (uplighting and downlighting) that is positioned to highlight a building or outdoor artwork shall be aimed at the object to be illuminated, not pointed into the sky.

C. Fixtures shall not distract from, or obscure important architectural features of the building. Lighting fixtures shall be a subordinate feature on the building unless they are incorporated into the over-all design scheme of the building.

(5) Prohibited Lighting on the Riverside of Properties Abutting the River.

A. Flashing lights.

B. Rotating lights.

C. Chaser lights.

D. Exposed neon.

E. Seasonal decorating lights such as festoon, string or rope lights, except between November 20 and January 10.

F. Flood lamps.

(6) Minimize the visual impacts of lighting in parking areas in order to enhance the perception of the nighttime sky and to prevent glare onto adjacent properties. Parking lot light poles are limited to thirty (30) feet in height, shall have a 90° cutoff angle so as to not emit light above the horizontal plane.

(k) Curbs and Gutters.

(1) Construct Curb and Gutter Along the Street Edge of a Property.

A. Install curbs and gutter along the street edge at the time of improving a parcel.

B. In order to preserve the rural character of RIO-5 and RIO-6, the HPO in coordination with public works and the development services department may waive the requirement of curbs and gutters.

(1) Access to Public Pathway Along the River. These requirements are specifically for those properties adjacent to the river to provide a connection to the publicly owned pathway along the river. The connections are to stimulate and enhance urban activity, provide path connections in an urban context, enliven street activity, and protect the ambiance and character of the river area.

(1) A stair, ramp or elevator connecting the publicly owned pathway at the river to private property along the river is allowed by right at the following locations:

A. At all street and vehicular bridge crossings over the river.

B. Where publicly owned streets dead end into the river.

C. Where the pedestrian pathway in the Riverwalk area is located at the top of bank and there is a two-foot or less grade change between the private property and the pathway.

(2) If there is a grade change greater than two (2) feet between the private property and the publicly owned pathway at the river then the following conditions apply:

A. Access to the publicly owned pathway is limited to one (1) connection per property, with the exception that connections are always allowed at street and vehicular bridge crossings. For example if one (1) property extends the entire block face from street crossing to street crossing the owner would be allowed three (3) access points if the distance requirements were met.

B. The minimum distance between access points shall be ninety-five (95) feet. Only street and vehicular bridge connections are exempted. Mid-block access points must meet this requirement.

C. Reciprocal access agreements between property owners are permitted.

(3) Clearly define a key pedestrian gateway into the site from the publicly owned pathway at the river with distinctive architectural or landscape elements.

A. The primary gateway from a development to the publicly owned pathway at the river shall be defined by an architectural or landscape element made of stone, brick, tile, metal, rough hewn cedar or hand-formed concrete or through the use of distinctive plantings or planting beds.

(m) Buffering and Screening. The manner in which screening and buffering elements are designed on a site greatly affects the character of the river districts. In general, service areas shall be screened or buffered. "Buffers" are considered to be landscaped berms, planters or planting beds; whereas, more solid "screens" include fences and walls. When site development creates an unavoidable negative visual impact on abutting properties or to the public right-of-way, it shall be mitigated with a landscape design that will buffer or screen it.

(1) Landscape Buffers Shall be Used in the Following Circumstances: To buffer the edges of a parking lot from pedestrian ways and outdoor use areas, (such as patios, and courtyards), and as an option to screening in order to buffer service areas, garbage disposal areas, mechanical equipment, storage areas, maintenance yards, equipment storage areas and other similar activities that by their nature create unsightly views from pedestrian ways, streets, public ROWs and adjoining property.

(2) Screening Elements Shall be Used in the Following Circumstances: To screen service areas, storage areas, or garbage areas from pedestrian ways.

(3) Exceptions for Site Constraints. Due to site constraints, in all RIOs and specifically for "RIO-3" where there is less than ten (10) feet to provide for the minimum landscape berm, a screen may be used in conjunction with plantings to meet the intent of these standards. For example a low site wall may be combined with plant materials to create a buffer with a lesser cross sectional width.

(4) Applicable Bufferyard Types. Table 510-2 establishes minimum plant materials required for each bufferyard type. For purposes of this section, type C shall be the acceptable minimum type.

(5) Applicable Screening Fence and Wall Types. Screening fences and walls shall be subject to conditions of subsection 35-673(h), Walls and Fences.

(n) Service Areas and Mechanical Equipment. Service areas and mechanical equipment should be visually unobtrusive and should be integrated with the design of the site and building. Noise generated from mechanical equipment shall not exceed city noise regulations.

(1) Locate service entrances, waste disposal areas and other similar uses adjacent to service lanes and away from major streets and the river.

A. Position utility boxes so that they cannot be seen from the public Riverwalk path, or from major streets, by locating them on the sides of buildings and away from pedestrian and vehicular routes.

Locating them within interior building corners, at building offsets or other similar locations where the building mass acts as a shield from public view is preferred.

B. Orient the door to a trash enclosure to face away from the street when feasible.

C. Air intake and exhaust systems, or other mechanical equipment that generates noise, smoke or odors, shall not be located at the pedestrian level.

(2) Screening of service entrance shall be compatible with the buildings on the block face.

A. When it would be visible from a public way, a service area shall be visually compatible with the buildings on the block face.

B. A wall will be considered compatible if it uses the same material as other buildings on the block, or is painted a neutral color such as beige, gray or dark green or if it is in keeping with the color scheme of the adjacent building.

(o) Bicycle Parking. On-site bicycle parking helps promote a long term sustainable strategy for development in RIO districts. Bicycle parking shall be placed in a well lit and accessible area. UDC bicycle parking requirements in UDC 35-526 can be met through indoor bicycle storage facilities in lieu of outdoor bike rack fixtures.

Sec. 35-674.02. - Building Design Principles in RIO-7.

This section provides policies and standards for the design of commercial, multi-family developments in excess of eight(8) units, and single-family developments in excess of five (5) units, institutional developments, and industrial buildings within the river improvement overlay districts. In general, principles align with the standards and guidelines established for the Downtown Business District.

(a) Mass and Scale. A building shall appear to have a "human scale." In general, this scale can be accomplished by using familiar forms and elements interpreted in human dimensions. Exterior wall designs shall help pedestrians establish a sense of scale with relation to each building. Articulating the number of floors in a building can help to establish a building's scale, for example, and prevent larger buildings from dwarfing the pedestrian.

(1) Reduce large floor plates and varying a building's height through the creation of smaller structures or facades when designing large projects that consume half a block or more. Sculpt a building's mass to avoid large bulky structures, which provide more visual monotony than variety. It is the well-balanced variety of building massing and textures of shadow, light and materials that in total adds to the richness of the built environment.

(2) Design building massing to reinforce the street wall with well-scaled elements or structures that are sensitive to the neighborhood context.

A. Divide large building facades into a series of appropriately scaled modules so that no building segment is more than ninety (90) feet in length. Consider dividing a larger building into "modules" that are similar in scale.

B. Monolithic slab-like structures that wall off views and overshadow the surrounding neighborhood are discouraged.

C. New buildings over seventy-five (75) feet tall should incorporate design elements that provide a base, middle and a top. Buildings less than seventy-five (75) feet should have a pedestrian scaled base with a cornice, eave, or other architectural element that gives the building a discernable edge at the top story.

D. Where a new building is infilled between an existing historic buildings on a block:

i. The new building should, to the extent possible, maintain the alignment of horizontal elements along the block.

ii. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those seen in the area, particularly the window fenestration.

iii. Align at least one (1) horizontal building element with another horizontal building element on the same block face. It will be considered to be within alignment if it is within three (3) feet, measured vertically, of the existing architectural element.

(b) Height. Building heights vary along the creek corridor, from one-story houses to high-rises. This diversity of building heights is expected to continue. Building heights shall be configured such that a comfortable human scale is established along the edges of properties and views to the creek and other significant landmarks are provided while allowing the appropriate density for an area.

A. The maximum building height and creek-side building step-backs shall be as defined in Table 674-3.

B. Building step-backs shall be at least fifteen (15) feet.

C. Buildings may be built to the height allowed without stepping back by aligning the lower floors with step-back-line creating more street level open space between the building and the creek.

(1) High-rise towers above ten (10) stories are encouraged in RIO-7a and allowed in RIO-7b when not in conflict with the Historic Design Guidelines. Towers are not allowed to form a continuous wall along the creek but shall be carefully sited to provide both views and privacy. Tower forms should be simple yet elegant and add a sculptural quality to the Downtown San Antonio skyline.

A. Towers should be combined with other building forms along the creek including townhouses, stacked flats, and mid-rise mixed-use buildings to create a variety of residential and office opportunities.

B. Towers should have their massing designed to reduce overall bulk and to appear slender as they ascend higher.

C. Towers may extend directly up from the property line at the street and are not required to be setback.

D. Tower siting and massing should maintain key views toward important natural or man-made features.

E. Design the middle segment or tower of the building to break up the overall bulk into smaller segments and address impacts such as shadowing and views. Reduce the perception of mass through architectural detailing such as changes of materials and color.

F. Design the top of buildings to be a "fifth facade" that may be distinctive against the skyline when looked up to or viewed from above. A well-designed roofline creates opportunities for sky views and views to distinctive landmarks; creates opportunities for sunlight to reach the ground, and orients the public when wayfinding. Design the top of the building and/or the top of its podium to include opportunity for communal outdoor amenity space and/or a place for environmental innovation such as green roofs, rainwater recovery and solar panels.

G. Towers should be designed to achieve a simple faceted geometry and large vertical plane movement. They should not appear overwrought or to have over-manipulated elements.

H. Towers that emulate a more streamline modern style should provide variation through subtle details in the curtain wall, and the articulation of a human-scaled base at the street level.

I. If a project has more than one tower, they should be complementary to each other and employ the same architectural design approach.

J. Generally, buildings over one hundred fifty (150) feet tall should not be historicized. They should represent contemporary interventions in the skyline.

K. A tower's primary building entrances should be designed at a scale appropriate to the overall size and design of the tower and be clearly marked.

L. A building's top should be delineated with a change of detail and meet the sky with a thinner form, or tapered point. Unarticulated, flat-topped buildings are not desired in Downtown San Antonio's skyline.

M. Mechanical Penthouses should be integrated into the tower design and should not appear as a separate element, as shown in Figure 5.7.

(2) Low-rise and mid-rise buildings are encouraged in RIO-7c, RIO-7d, and RIO-7e. (3) In RIO 7-d, organize the mass of the building to step back from established residential neighborhoods. Where a commercial, mixed-use residential, multi-family or industrial use abuts a single-family residential development, or is across the street from a single-family residential development, the following standards shall apply:

A. The massing of the building shall not exceed twenty-five (25) feet in height at the setback line. The building mass can continue upward within a 45-degree building envelope for a distance of fifty (50) feet measured horizontally from the building face, at which point the building massing may continue vertically to the height established in subsection 35-674(c).

(c) Materials and Finishes. After establishing a new building's overall massing and vertical and horizontal variation, it is important to develop a building's visual character at the level of material choices and detailing. The interplay of materials, windows and other elements should support the larger design principles as articulated by the architect. Ensure that buildings have architecturally detailed facades, where publicly visible, with no blank or featureless sides in anticipation of abutting to potential development in later phases or on adjacent land.

(1) Buildings are supposed to aim for a "timeless design" and employ sustainable materials and careful detailing that have proven longevity.

A. San Antonio has strong sun conditions. Use deep reveals to get shadow lines and if colors are desired, saturated colors and evaluate these outside on site.

B. Feature long-lived and local materials such as split limestone, brick and stone. The material palette should provide variety, reinforce massing and changes in the horizontal or vertical plane.

C. Use especially durable materials on ground floor facades.

D. Generally, stucco is not desirable on the ground floor as it is not particularly durable. Detail buildings with rigor and clarity to reinforce the architect's design intentions and to help set a standard of quality to guild the built results.

E. To provide visual variety and depth, layer the building skin and provide a variety of textures that bear a direct relationship to the building's massing and structural elements. The skin should reinforce the integrity of the design concept and the building's structural elements as seen in Figure 7.5 and 7.6 of the Downtown Design Guide and not appear as surface pastiche.

F. Layering can also be achieved through extension of two (2) adjacent building planes that are extended from the primary facade to provide a modern sculptural composition.

G. Cut outs (often used to create sky gardens) should be an appropriate scale and provide a comfortable, usable outdoor space.

H. Design curtain walls with detail and texture, while employing the highest quality materials.

I. Design the color palette for a building to reinforce building identity and complement changes in the horizontal or vertical plane.

J. Value-added materials, such as stone should be placed at the base of the building, especially at the first floor level. Select materials suitable for a pedestrian urban environment. Impervious materials such as stone, metal or glass should be used on the building exterior. Materials will be made graffiti resistant or be easily repainted.

K. Corner buildings at prominent intersections require a higher standard of articulation, detailing, and architectural treatment than other buildings within the middle of the block.

L. RIO-7e is a mixed-use transition area with single family houses, some masonry commercial buildings, concrete warehouses, and long metal sheds built next to railroad sidings. In this district, the historic preservation officer may approve non-traditional building materials, like corrugated metal siding and

concrete panels, if well detailed and compatible with the traditional building forms and scale of the district.

(2) Prohibited Exterior Materials.

- A. Imitation stone (fiberglass or plastic);
- B. Plywood or decorative exterior plywood;
- C. "Lumpy" stucco, CMU;
- D. Rough sawn or "natural" (unfinished) wood, EIFS;
- E. Used brick with no fired face (salvaged from interior walls);
- F. Imitation wood siding;
- G. Plastic panels.

(e) Pedestrian Orientation. New buildings should follow the principles of good urban design, creating active street and creek facades and focusing on enhancing the public realm of the streets and the creek.

(1) Buildings ought to create a familiar rhythm relative to the overall street. The rhythm and pattern helps to tie the street together visually and provides the pedestrian with a standard measurement of progress. Reinforcement of this facade rhythm is encouraged in new buildings, even if a singular structure (see Figure 7.1 in the Downtown Design Guide).

(2) New development ought to respect the existing fabric of the community by reflecting historic mixed-use development patterns, through the use of building indentations, relationship to the street, first floor plate height, breaks in buildings for open space, and changes in color to avoid monolithic and monochromatic developments.

(3) Horizontal Variation. Vary the horizontal plane of a building to provide visual interest and enrich the pedestrian experience, while contributing to the quality and definition of the street wall.

A. Provide well-marked entrances to cue access and use. Enhance all public entrances to a building through the use of compatible architectural or graphic treatment. Main building entrance shall read differently from retail storefronts, restaurant, and commercial entrances.

B. Avoid continuous massing longer than ninety (90) feet not articulated with shadow relief, projections and recessed. If massing extends beyond the is length, it needs to be visibly articulated as several smaller masses using different material, vertical breaks, such as expressed bay widths, or other architectural elements.

C. Horizontal variation should be of an appropriate scale and reflect changes in the building uses or structure as seen in Figure 7.2.4 of the Downtown Design Guide.

D. Vary details and materials horizontally to provide scale and three-dimensional qualities to the building.

E. While blank street wall facades are discouraged, there is usually one side of the building that is less prominent (often times called "back of house").

(4) Vertical Variation. Both classical and modern buildings can exhibit basic principles of visual order in the vertical plane—often with a distinct base (street and pedestrian lower levels), a middle (core mid-section, and often consistent for multiple floors of a mid- to high-rise building), and a top (the upper level that distinguishes a building and defines how it "meets the sky") as seen in Figure 7.3 of the Downtown Design Guide.

A. Modern or contemporary building designs often layer this principle with more variation and syncopation to create interesting architectural composition as seen in Figure 7.4 of the Downtown Design Guide. Whenever a new infill building is proposed between two (2) existing structures, every attempt should be made to maintain the characteristic rhythm, proportion, and spacing of existing door and

window openings.

B. Variation in the vertical plane of a building ought to define the building's uses and visually differentiate ground floor uses, from core functions and how the building "meets the sky."

i. Employ a different architectural treatment on the ground floor facade than on the upper floors, and feature high quality materials that add scale, texture and variety at the pedestrian level.

ii. Vertically articulate the street wall facade, establishing different treatment for the building's base, (middle and top) and use balconies, fenestration, or other elements to create an interesting pattern of projections and recesses.

iii. Provide an identifiable break between the building's ground floors and upper floors designed for office or other use. This break may include a change in material, change in fenestration

pattern or similar means.

iv. In order to respect existing historic datums, the cornice or roof line of historic structures should be reflected with a demarcation on new infill structures whenever possible.

v. On facades exposed to the sun, employ shade and shadow created by reveals, surface changes, overhangs, and sunshades to provide sustainable benefits and visual interest.

vi. Buildings taller than seventy-five (75) feet should employ at least two (2) vertical breaks or reveals greater than three (3) feet in depth to divide the bulkiness of the mass.

(5) Fenestration. Provide high-performance, well-detailed windows and doors that add to the depth and scale of a building's facade.

A. Windows are to be as transparent as possible at the ground floor of the building, with preference given to grey, low-e glass (eighty-eight (88) percent light transmission).

B. Window placement, size, material and style should help define a building's architectural style and integrity.

C. In buildings other than curtain wall buildings, windows should be recessed (set back) from the exterior building wall, except where inappropriate to the building's architectural style. Generally, the required recess may not be accomplished by the use of plantings around the window.

D. Windows and doors should be well-detailed where they meet the exterior wall to provide adequate weather protection and to create a shadow line.

E. Windows on upper floors should be proportioned and placed in relation to grouping of storefront or other windows and elements in the base floor. Windows should have a vertical emphasis.

F. Glazing. Incorporate glazing that contributes to a warm, inviting environment for interior spaces.

i. Ground-floor window and door glazing should be transparent and non-reflective.

ii. Above the ground floor, both curtain wall and window and door glazing should have the minimum reflectivity needed to achieve energy efficiency standards. Non-reflective coating or tints are preferred.

iii. A limited amount of translucent glazing at the ground floor may be used to provide privacy.

(6) Street Wall. In order to support a pedestrian-oriented public realm, retail or commercial streets should be framed by buildings uniformly placed at the sidewalk with no setback as seen in Figure 5.5 of the Downtown Design Guide. The height of the street wall is an important element in shaping the character of the public realm. Design building walls along the sidewalk (Street Walls) to define the street and to provide a comfortable scale for pedestrians.

A. Street walls should be located against the back of sidewalk.

B. Walls above the ground floor that step back from the ground floor street wall are considered to be part of the street wall.

C. Breaks in the street wall should be limited to those necessary to accommodate pedestrian pass-through, public plazas, entry forecourts, permitted vehicular access driveways, and hotel drop-offs.

D. An identifiable break should be provided between a building's retail floors (ground level and, in some cases, second and third floors) and upper floors. This break may consist of a change in material, change in fenestration, or similar means.

E. Vertical breaks should also be taken into account with fenestration such as columns or bays.

F. When a property is situated in such a manner as to appear to be the terminus at the end of a street or a prominent curve in the creek, buildings should incorporate an architectural feature that will provide a focal point at the end of the view. These features may include:

i. Enhanced building facade.

ii. Enhanced garden or landscape in an open space.

iii. Variation in roof shape. iv. Change material and color.

v. Tower element.

(7) In contrast to the design of buildings along the sidewalks described in (b)(9) the creek side of buildings should not establish a uniform, aligned wall but rather a series of related and connected gardens, plazas, and patios. These On-site Open Spaces (see subsection 35-673(q)) should be integrated with the San Pedro Creek Improvements Project. Where a building facade faces the creek it should recognize the historic proportions of lots and resulting

building forms. Lots were generally seventy (70) to ninety (90) feet wide along the creek but several hundred feet deep. The resulting building forms are long bar-shapes running perpendicular to the creek.

A. The best views of the creek are generally perpendicular to the creek not parallel to the creek. Rectangular buildings should have the narrow face parallel to the creek and the long face perpendicular to the creek. See Figure 674-1. i. Bends in the creek provide a unique opportunity for siting buildings to maximize views and may provide unique challenges. The Historic Preservation Officer may consider different building orientations for these sites if the overall goals for RIO-7 are met.

B. Buildings are not allowed to have a continuous, flat facade lot-line to lot-line along the creek property line. Building massing should turn perpendicular to the creek and form gardens, courts, patios, paseos, and plazas between buildings and/or different building masses. Windows, balconies, or other ways of viewing these publically accessible open spaces is high encouraged. The following On-Site Open Spaces required by building length may be used as one of the On-Site Open Spaces required by Table 673-3. i. The maximum length of a building wall plane is ninety (90) feet. Buildings with facades longer than ninety (90) feet must use side-yard courts, courtyards, or forecourts to divide the facade into modules less than ninety (90) feet long. ii. Buildings or a collection of buildings built concurrently with a creek-face longer than two hundred seventy (270) feet are required to have a forecourt, courtyard, creek-side plaza, garden, paseo, or pedestrian-oriented service drive to divide the mass of the building and provide publicly accessible open space. iii. Single developments with three hundred (300) linear feet of creek frontage or greater should have at least two (2) distinct building types or building heights along the creek property line with no more than seventy (70) percent of any one building type. Building types are defined in Downtown Design Guidelines. iv. Buildings that setback more than thirty (30) feet from the creek-side setback line and provide publicly accessible gardens, patios, plazas, or terraces are not required to provide additional publicly accessible open spaces. v. Sites that are five hundred fifty (550) feet or longer should provide mid-block paseos, pedestrian oriented mid-block service drives and fire lane, or pedestrian friendly public access and should connect from a public street to another public street, public alley, or the San Pedro Creek. Where San Antonio Public Works and/or Texas Department of Transportation (TxDOT) has provided approval, per Chapter 8 Section C of the Downtown Design Guide, connections should try to align within one hundred (100) feet of the mid-block connection.

(8) Develop the first floor to activate the creek paseos and street sidewalks.

A. In mixed-use buildings, retail buildings, or office buildings the creek side facade should be primarily transparent with seventy-five (75) percent of the length of the facade devoted to display windows and/or windows affording some view into the interior areas or offices. Facades facing Primary and Secondary Pedestrian Streets listed in subsection 35-672(b)(1)D Curb Cuts should have at least fifty (50) [percent] of the facade devoted to windows. Facades facing side streets should have at least twenty-five (25) percent of the facade devoted to windows. Side-street facades should contribute to the pedestrian friendly environment and activate the street when possible. These facades are important in activating the connections from the surrounding neighborhoods to the creek.

B. In multi-family residential buildings with no retail, arrange support facilities, management offices, and building amenities along the creek and streets with a minimum of seventy-five (75) percent of the exterior facade associated with these spaces. Provide building and ground floor residential unit entrances to pedestrian paths that connect to the high-bank paseo or publicly accessible path at the top-of-bank along the low-bank paseo.

C. Institutional and civic buildings should arrange functions and entrances to provide access and views to internal functions.

D. Alternate arrangements that provide creek and street activation may be approved by the historic preservation officer.

(9) Design ground floor space for retail or other active uses, orienting tenant spaces to the street and creek and maximizing storefronts and entries along the sidewalks to sustain street level interest and promote pedestrian traffic.

A. Locate active uses along the street and creek facade to enhance the building's relationship to the public realm. Uses include: lobbies, dining rooms, seating areas, offices, retail stores, community or institutional uses, and residences.

B. Ground floor retail space shall be provided to a depth of at least twenty-five (25) feet from the front facade and shall include an average fourteen (14) foot to zero (0) inch floor-to-ceiling height, with heights above fourteen (14) feet being very desirable.

C. The primary entrance to each street level tenant that does not have its frontage along a public street shall be provided from a pedestrian paseo, courtyard or plaza, which is connected to the public street, creek, or alley.

D. Wall openings, such as storefront windows and doors, shall comprise at least seventy (70) percent of a commercial building's street and creek level facade as seen in Figure 3.2. of the Downtown Design Guide.

E. Clear glass for wall openings, i.e., doors and windows, shall be used along all street-level commercial facades for maximum transparency, especially in conjunction with retail and hotel uses as illustrated in Figure 3.3 of the Downtown Design Guide. Dark tinted, reflective or opaque glazing is not permitted for any required wall opening along commercial street level facades.

F. A building's primary entrance, defined as the entrance which provides the most direct access to a building's main lobby and is kept unlocked during business hours, shall be located on a public street or on a courtyard, plaza or paseo that is connected to and visible from a public street or the San Pedro Creek.

G. At least one building entrance/exit, which may be either a building or tenant and resident entrance, shall be provided along each street frontage.

H. Use clear windows and doors to make the pedestrian level facade highly transparent and accessible. Along retail streets, provide a nearly continuous band of windows. Ensure doorways in glass walls exhibit sufficient contrast to be clearly visible.

I. The facades on downtown commercial streets should be detailed as storefronts, except where the proposed ground floor use is live and work units, residential units or other non-commercial building types as seen in Figure 3.1.10 of the Downtown Design Guide. Where non-residential streets intersect, the ground floor retail space should wrap the corner onto the intersecting streets wherever possible.

J. Residential units with separate entries should include windows or glass doors on the ground floor that look out onto the street.

K. If a residential unit's individual entry along the street is the unit's primary entry, it should be accessible from the sidewalk.

L. More public entrances than the minimum specified by code, including building and or tenant and resident entrances are highly encouraged. Incorporate a pedestrian-oriented scale at the street and river level.

(10) Incorporate a pedestrian-oriented scale at the street and creek level.

A. Awnings and canopies shall be fabricated of woven fabric, glass, metal or other permanent material compatible with the building's architecture

B. Street wall massing, articulation and detail, street level building entrances and storefront windows and doors, as well as the use of quality materials and decorative details should be used to promote pedestrian-scaled architecture along the street.

C. Architectural features that reinforce the retail character of the ground floor street and creek wall and/or help define the pedestrian environment along the sidewalk, such as canopies, awnings, and overhangs, are encouraged and should be integral to the architecture of the building.

D. The design of the ground floors of hotels should exhibit a series of public space and entries that equally welcome the general public as well as guests. The first floor should be as transparent as possible. Hotel uses such as bars, lounges, restaurants, cafes, spas and other uses open to the public should exhibit a direct pedestrian connection from the public right-of-way whenever possible Don't waste valuable street frontage on "back of house" uses.

E. Electrical transformers, mechanical equipment and other equipment should not be located along the ground floor street wall. Electrical transformers, mechanical equipment, other equipment, enclosed stairs, storage spaces, blank walls, and other elements that are not pedestrian-oriented should not be located within one hundred (100) feet of the corner property line as seen in Figure 3.6 of the Downtown Design Guide or visible from public right-ofway.

(11) Street Entrances. Design building entries to be clearly visible from the street as well as to promote pedestrian

comfort, safety, orientation and accessibility. In order to increase personal safety, entries and associated open spaces should be designed to avoid the creation of isolated areas and to maintain lines of sight into and out of a space.

A. Reinforce a building's entry with one or more of the following architectural treatments:

- i. Extra height lobby space;
- ii. Distinctive doorways;
- iii. Decorative lighting;
- iv. Distinctive entry canopy;
- v. Projected or deep recessed entry;
- vi. Building name and address integrated into the facade;
- vii. Artwork integrated into the facade or sidewalk;
- viii. A change in paving material, texture, or color within the property line;
- ix. Distinctive landscaping, including plants, water features and seating.

B. The primary street entrance of single buildings will be off the public sidewalk in RIO-7a, RIO-7b, and RIO-7c as seen in Figure 7.7 of the Downtown Design Guide.

- i. In RIO-7d and RIO-7e, entrances may be off of a walkway connected to both the public sidewalk and the parking area as shown in Figure 673-1.
- ii. In projects with multiple buildings arranged on one site, building entrances may be off of pedestrian paths connecting streets with the creek or courtyards and plazas within a site similar to Figure 672-2.

C. Strong colors should emphasize architectural details and entrances.

D. Deep recessed entries into the building are encouraged. (12) Creek Side Facade and Entrances. The Creekside of buildings should be responsive to the park-side of an urban building. Materials may be less formal, trellises and pergolas may be used in place of more traditional street side canopies and formal entries.

UDC Section. 35-675. Archaeology.

When an HDRC application is submitted for commercial development projects within a river improvement overlay district the city archeologist shall review the project application to determine if there is potential of containing intact archaeological deposits utilizing the following documents/methods:

- (1)The Texas Sites Atlas for known/recorded sites, site data in the files of the Texas Archeological Research Laboratory and the Texas Historical Commission;
- (2)USGS maps;
- (3)Soil Survey maps;
- (4)Distance to water;
- (5)Topographical data;
- (6)Predictive settlement patterns;
- (7)Archival research and historic maps;
- (8)Data on file at the office of historic preservation.

If after review the city archeologist determines there is potential of containing intact archaeological deposits, an archaeological survey report shall be prepared and submitted. If, after review by the city archeologist, a determination is made that the site has little to no potential of containing intact archaeological deposits, the requirement for an archaeological survey report may be waived.

Upon completion of a survey, owners of property containing inventoried archaeological sites are encouraged to educate the public regarding archaeological components of the site and shall coordinate any efforts with the office of historic preservation.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends conceptual approval of items 1 through 6 with the following stipulations:

- i. That an alternative material be used in place of the proposed CMU, or that the applicant clad the CMU with stucco or plaster as noted in finding d.
- ii. That a tree protection and preservation plan be developed and submitted for future HDRC consideration.

- iii. That the proposed dumpster enclosure be completely relocated within the site to a mid-block condition on Elmira instead of Grayson.
- iv. That the applicant take steps to preserve the two significant graffiti elements located on the corner building and ensure that they remain visible to the public.
- v. That the applicant coordinate with the San Antonio River Authority regarding direct access adjacent to the San Antonio River Authority, landscaping and maintenance boundaries, storm water control measures, and design development related to the proposed stadium seating. Design details will require further review by the HDRC.
- vi. That the applicant submit details regarding lighting and signage, and site furnishings as noted in findings g through i. Total signage area is not to exceed fifty (50) square feet per the UDC.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Federica Kushner in support of case..

Motion: Commissioner Grube moved to approve with staff stipulations for conceptual approval. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: NONE .
Absent: Garza and Connor.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES AND 0 NAY. 2 ABSENT**

- **Item #A-6. HDRC NO. 2019-365**
ADDRESS: 517 E HOUSTON ST
APPLICANT: Michael Litofsky

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to modify a previously approved design to include a glass storefront on the E Houston Street side.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

10. Commercial Facades

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Character-defining features*—Preserve character-defining features such as cornice molding, upper-story windows, transoms, display windows, kickplates, entryways, tiled paving at entryways, parapet walls, bulkheads, and other features that contribute to the character of the building.
- ii. *Windows and doors*—Use clear glass in display windows. See Guidelines for Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens for additional guidance.
- iii. *Missing features*—Replace missing features in-kind based on evidence such as photographs or match the style of the building and the period in which it was designed.
- iv. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials or materials appropriate to the time period of the original commercial facade when making repairs.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *New features*—Do not introduce new facade elements that alter or destroy the historic building character, such as adding inappropriate materials; altering the size or shape of windows, doors, bulkheads, and transom openings; or altering the façade from commercial to residential. Alterations should not disrupt the rhythm of the commercial block.

2. Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

ii. *Historical commercial facades*—Return non-historic facades to the original design based on photographic evidence. Keep in mind that some non-original facades may have gained historic importance and should be retained. When evidence is not available, ensure the scale, design, materials, color, and texture is compatible with the historic building. Consider the features of the design holistically so as to not include elements from multiple buildings and styles.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the design amendment based on finding c. The applicant may submit another design that is consistent with the Guidelines or based on historic photographic evidence to be submitted for review – or continue with the design approved in May 2015 and again in May 2019.

CASE COMMENT:

COMPLIANCE CASE – On May 1, 2019, the commission approved the reconstruction of the storefront with the removal of the unapproved ClearBoarding within 90 days. At this time, the applicant has proposed to amend the design before initiating construction.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Patricia Seidenberger opposed to case.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to continue with HDRC due to missing applicant. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Garza, Connor, and Grube.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

• **Item #A-7. HDRC NO. 2019-284**

APPLICANT: Historic Preservation Office
ADDRESS: Tobin Hill Community Association

REQUEST:

Discussion and possible action regarding potential new historic districts located within the existing boundaries of the Tobin Hill Community Association.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends to do a windshield survey for initial assessment for contributing and non-contributing boundaries for historic district assessment. Using the information from the initial survey staff could then into more depth in surveying areas that could potentially contribute to discussion of boundaries.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter moved to recommend a further surveillance of the Tobin Hill Community Association for contribution and non-contributing and individual landmark structures to be conducted by staff, volunteers, and people of the neighborhood to give commissioners more information for advisory on the case. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.

Absent: Garza and Connor.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, AND 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA B ITEMS

• **Item # B-6. HDRC NO. 2019-037**

ADDRESS: 1000 BROADWAY

APPLICANT: Beth Wells/Bender Wells Clark Design

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting final approval to:

1. Construct a fenced, off-leash dog park.
2. Install a Portland-Loo single restroom facility.
3. Install new pedestrian sidewalks and decorative paving.
4. Install various park amenities, including picnic tables, a drinking fountain, and trash receptacles.
5. Install site plantings and low-impact development features.
6. Install site lighting.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

UDC Sec. 35-641. - Design Considerations for Historic and Design Review Commission Recommendations.

In reviewing an application, the historic and design review commission shall be aware of the importance of attempting to find a way to meet the current needs of the City of San Antonio, lessee or licensee of public property. The historic and design review commission shall also recognize the importance of recommending approval of plans that will be reasonable to implement. The best urban design standards possible can and should be employed with public property including buildings and facilities, parks and open spaces, and the public right-of-way. Design and construction on public property should employ such standards because the use of public monies for design and construction is a public trust. Public commitment to quality design should encourage better design by the private sector. Finally, using such design standards for public property improves the identity and the quality of life of the surrounding neighborhoods.

UDC Sec 35-642. – New Construction of Buildings and Facilities:

In considering whether to recommend approval or disapproval of a certificate, the historic and design review commission shall be guided by the following design considerations. These are not intended to restrict imagination, innovation or variety, but rather to assist in focusing on design principles, which can result in creative solutions that will enhance the city and its neighborhoods. Good and original design solutions that meet the individual requirements of a specific site or neighborhood are encouraged and welcomed.

(a) Site and Setting.

- (1) Building sites should be planned to take into consideration existing natural climatic and topographical features. The intrusive leveling of the site should be avoided. Climatic factors such as sun, wind, and temperature should become an integral part of the design to encourage design of site-specific facilities which reinforces the individual identity of a neighborhood and promotes energy efficient facilities.
- (2) Special consideration should be given to maintain existing urban design characteristics, such as setbacks, building heights, streetscapes, pedestrian movement, and traffic flow. Building placement should enhance or create focal points and views. Continuity of scale and orientation shall be emphasized.
- (3) Accessibility from streets should be designed to accommodate safe pedestrian movement as well as vehicular traffic. Where possible, parking areas should be screened from view from the public right-of-way by attractive fences, berms, plantings or other means.
- (4) Historically significant aspects of the site shall be identified and if possible incorporated into the site

design. Historic relationships between buildings, such as plazas or open spaces, boulevards or axial relationships should be maintained.

(b) Building Design.

(1) Buildings for the public should maintain the highest quality standards of design integrity. They should elicit a pride of ownership for all citizens. Public buildings should reflect the unique and diverse character of San Antonio and should be responsive to the time and place in which they were constructed.

(2) Buildings shall be in scale with their adjoining surroundings and shall be in harmonious conformance to the identifying quality and characteristics of the neighborhood. They shall be compatible in design, style and materials. Reproductions of styles and designs from a different time period are not encouraged, consistent with the secretary of the interior's standards. Major horizontal and vertical elements in adjoining sites should be respected. (3) Materials shall be suitable to the type of building and design in which they are used. They shall be durable and easily maintained. Materials and designs at pedestrian level shall be at human scale, that is they shall be designed to be understood and appreciated by someone on foot. Materials should be selected that respect the historic character of the surrounding area in texture, size and color.

(4) Building components such as doors, windows, overhangs, awnings, roof shapes and decorative elements shall all be designed to contribute to the proportions and scale of their surrounding context. Established mass/void relationships shall be maintained. Patterns and rhythms in the streetscape shall be continued.

(5) Colors shall be harmonious with the surrounding environment, but should not be dull. Choice of color should reflect the local and regional character. Nearby historic colors shall be respected.

(6) Mechanical equipment or other utility hardware should be screened from public view with materials compatible with the building design. Where possible, rooftop mechanical equipment should be screened, even from above. Where feasible, overhead utilities should also be underground or attractively screened. Exterior lighting shall be an integral part of the design. Interior lighting shall be controlled so that the spillover lighting onto public walkways is not annoying to pedestrians.

(7) Signs which are out of keeping with the character of the environment in question should not be used. Excessive size and inappropriate placement on buildings results in visual clutter. Signs should be designed to relate harmoniously to exterior building materials and colors. Signs should express a simple clear message with wording kept to a minimum.

(8) Auxiliary design. The site should take into account the compatibility of landscaping, parking facilities, utility and service areas, walkways and appurtenances. These should be designed with the overall environment in mind and should be in visual keeping with related buildings, structures and places.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends final approval based on findings a through h with the following stipulations:

- i. **ARCHAEOLOGY** – The project shall comply with all federal, state, and local laws, rules, and regulations regarding archaeology.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to approve with staff stipulations. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Garza, and Connor.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

• **Item #B-13. HDRC NO. 2019-381**

ADDRESS: 534 MISSION ST

APPLICANT: Curtis Muller

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install sixteen (16) solar panels on the primary structure.
2. Install ten (10) solar panels on the rear accessory structure.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

6. Designing for Energy Efficiency

C. SOLAR COLLECTORS

- i. *Location*—Locate solar collectors on side or rear roof pitch of the primary historic structure to the maximum extent feasible to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way while maximizing solar access. Alternatively, locate solar collectors on a garage or outbuilding or consider a ground-mount system where solar access to the primary structure is limited.
- ii. *Mounting (sloped roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a sloped roof. Select collectors that are similar in color to the roof surface to reduce visibility.
- iii. *Mounting (flat roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a flat roof to the maximum extent feasible. Where solar access limitations preclude a flush mount, locate panels towards the rear of the roof where visibility from the public right-of-way will be minimized.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through c with the following stipulations:

- i. That the solar panels maintain at least 18” of separation from the roof eaves.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Margaret Leads.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made to deny application.
Commissioner Laffoon seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Garza, and Connor.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

• **Item #B-16. HDRC NO. 2019-283**

ADDRESS: 138 S JOSEPHINE TOBIN

APPLICANT: Melissa Douglas/Douglas Architects, Inc

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to:

1. Demolish the historic structure located at 138 S Josephine Tobin. The structure is contributing to the Woodlawn Lake and Park Historic District.
2. Construct a new 1-story community center.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Unified Development Code Section 35-614. – Demolition.

Demolition of a historic landmark constitutes an irreplaceable loss to the quality and character of the City of San Antonio. Accordingly, these procedures provide criteria to prevent unnecessary damage to the quality and character of the city's historic districts and character while, at the same time, balancing these interests against the property rights of landowners.

(a)Applicability. The provisions of this section apply to any application for demolition of a historic landmark (including those previously designated as historic exceptional or historic significant) or a historic district.

(3)Property Located in Historic District and Contributing to District Although Not Designated a Landmark. No certificate shall be issued for property located in a historic district and contributing to the district although not designated a landmark unless the applicant demonstrates clear and convincing evidence supporting an unreasonable economic hardship on the applicant if the application for a certificate is disapproved. When an applicant fails to prove unreasonable economic hardship in such cases, the applicant may provide additional information regarding loss of significance as provided in subsection (c)(3) in order to receive a certificate for demolition of the property.

(b)Unreasonable Economic Hardship.

(1)Generally. The historic and design review commission shall be guided in its decision by balancing the historic, architectural, cultural and/or archaeological value of the particular landmark or eligible landmark against the special merit of the proposed replacement project. The historic and design review commission shall not consider or be persuaded to find unreasonable economic hardship based on the presentation of circumstances or items that are not unique to the property in question (i.e. the current economic climate).

(2)Burden of Proof. The historic and design review commission shall not consider or be persuaded to find unreasonable economic hardship based on the presentation of circumstances or items that are not unique to the property in question (i.e. the current economic climate). When a claim of unreasonable economic hardship is made, the owner must prove by a preponderance of the evidence that:

A. The owner cannot make reasonable beneficial use of or realize a reasonable rate of return on a structure or site, regardless of whether that return represents the most profitable return possible, unless the highly significant endangered, historic and cultural landmark, historic and cultural landmarks district or demolition delay designation, as applicable, is removed or the proposed demolition or relocation is allowed;

B. The structure and property cannot be reasonably adapted for any other feasible use, whether by the current owner or by a purchaser, which would result in a reasonable rate of return; and

C. The owner has failed to find a purchaser or tenant for the property during the previous two (2) years, despite having made substantial ongoing efforts during that period to do so. The evidence of unreasonable economic hardship introduced by the owner may, where applicable, include proof that the owner's affirmative obligations to maintain the structure or property make it impossible for the owner to realize a reasonable rate of return on the structure or property.

(3)Criteria. The public benefits obtained from retaining the cultural resource must be analyzed and duly considered by the historic and design review commission. As evidence that an unreasonable economic hardship exists, the owner may submit the following information to the historic and design review commission by affidavit:

A. For all structures and property:

i. The past and current use of the structures and property;

ii. The name and legal status (e.g., partnership, corporation) of the owners;

iii. The original purchase price of the structures and property;

iv. The assessed value of the structures and property according to the two (2) most recent tax assessments;

v. The amount of real estate taxes on the structures and property for the previous two (2) years;

vi. The date of purchase or other acquisition of the structures and property;

vii. Principal balance and interest rate on current mortgage and the annual debt service on the structures and property, if any, for the previous two (2) years;

- viii. All appraisals obtained by the owner or applicant within the previous two (2) years in connection with the owner's purchase, financing or ownership of the structures and property;
- ix. Any listing of the structures and property for sale or rent, price asked and offers received;
- x. Any consideration given by the owner to profitable adaptive uses for the structures and property;
- xi. Any replacement construction plans for proposed improvements on the site;
- xii. Financial proof of the owner's ability to complete any replacement project on the site, which may include but not be limited to a performance bond, a letter of credit, a trust for completion of improvements, or a letter of commitment from a financial institution; and
- xiii. The current fair market value of the structure and property as determined by a qualified appraiser.
- xiv. Any property tax exemptions claimed in the past five (5) years.

B. For income producing structures and property:

- i. Annual gross income from the structure and property for the previous two (2) years;
- ii. Itemized operating and maintenance expenses for the previous two (2) years; and
- iii. Annual cash flow, if any, for the previous two (2) years.

C. In the event that the historic and design review commission determines that any additional information described above is necessary in order to evaluate whether an unreasonable economic hardship exists, the historic and design review commission shall notify the owner. Failure by the owner to submit such information to the historic and design review commission within fifteen (15) days after receipt of such notice, which time may be extended by the historic and design review commission, may be grounds for denial of the owner's claim of unreasonable economic hardship. When a low-income resident homeowner is unable to meet the requirements set forth in this section, then the historic and design review commission, at its own discretion, may waive some or all of the requested information and/or request substitute information that an indigent resident homeowner may obtain without incurring any costs. If the historic and design review commission cannot make a determination based on information submitted and an appraisal has not been provided, then the historic and design review commission may request that an appraisal be made by the city.

(d) Documentation and Strategy.

(1) Applicants that have received a recommendation for a certificate shall document buildings, objects, sites or structures which are intended to be demolished with 35mm slides or prints, preferably in black and white, and supply a set of slides or prints to the historic preservation officer.

(2) Applicants shall also prepare for the historic preservation officer a salvage strategy for reuse of building materials deemed valuable by the historic preservation officer for other preservation and restoration activities.

(3) Applicants that have received an approval of a certificate regarding demolition shall be permitted to receive a demolition permit without additional commission action on demolition, following the commission's recommendation of a certificate for new construction. Permits for demolition and construction shall be issued simultaneously if requirements of section 35-609, new construction, are met, and the property owner provides financial proof of his ability to complete the project.

(4) When the commission recommends approval of a certificate for buildings, objects, sites, structures designated as landmarks, or structures in historic districts, permits shall not be issued until all plans for the site have received approval from all appropriate city boards, commissions, departments and agencies. Permits for parking lots shall not be issued, nor shall an applicant be allowed to operate a parking lot on such property, unless such parking lot plan was approved as a replacement element for the demolished object or structure.

(e) Issuance of Permit. When the commission recommends approval of a certificate regarding demolition of buildings, objects, sites, or structures in historic districts or historic landmarks, permits shall not be issued until all plans for the site have received approval from all appropriate city boards, commissions, departments and agencies. Once the replacement plans are approved a fee shall be assessed for the demolition based on the approved replacement plan square footage. The fee must be paid in full prior to issuance of any permits and shall be deposited into an account as directed by the historic preservation officer for the benefit, rehabilitation or acquisition of local historic resources. Fees shall be as follows and are in addition to any fees charged by planning and development services:

0—2,500 square feet = \$2,000.00

2,501—10,000 square feet = \$5,000.00

10,001—25,000 square feet = \$10,000.00
25,001—50,000 square feet = \$20,000.00
Over 50,000 square feet = \$30,000.00

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

- iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.
- iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

- i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

RECOMMENDATION:

The proposed project requests the demolition of a contributing structure in a local historic district.

If the HDRC finds that the criteria for establishing an unreasonable economic hardship have not been met and that a loss of significance has not occurred, the existing structure should be incorporated into the design of the project proposal to the fullest extent possible and also meet the following stipulations:

- i. That the landscaping along the street frontage is significantly increased and that additional parking lot trees and shrubbery be introduced as noted in finding 2d.

- ii. That the design includes an interpretative element. A gallery of images and video paying tribute to Berta Almaguer should be incorporated in the lobby (or other highly visible and sizeable area approved by HDRC). The gallery should include interpretative text describing Ms. Almaguer's contributions to the cultural heritage of San Antonio using research and materials existing in archives of the City of San Antonio Parks and Recreation Department.
- iii. That the Bertha Almaguer building name be retained.

If the HDRC finds that the criteria for establishing an unreasonable economic hardship have been met or failing that finds that a loss of significance has occurred, and if the HDRC is satisfied with the merits of the design proposal as it relates to the historic significance of the site, and thus approves the request for demolition, then staff makes the following recommendations regarding the requested new construction:

Item 2, Staff recommends conceptual approval based on findings 2a through 2f with the following stipulations.

- iv. That the applicant provides a comprehensive salvage plan for the existing materials and reuses as much material as possible in the new structure, particularly the façade bricks, chimney bricks, and structural beams. Plans for material reuse within the new structure should be clearly illustrated in the submittal for final approval.
- v. That the landscaping along the street frontage is significantly increased and that additional parking lot trees and shrubbery be introduced as noted in finding 2d.
- vi. That the design includes an interpretative element. A gallery of images and video paying tribute to Berta Almaguer should be incorporated in the lobby (or other highly visible and sizeable area approved by HDRC). The gallery should include interpretative text describing Ms. Almaguer's contributions to the cultural heritage of San Antonio using research and materials existing in archives of the City of San Antonio Parks and Recreation Department.
- vii. That the Bertha Almaguer building name be retained.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Patricia Seidenberger opposed case. Chery Perez, Letty Rodriguez, Rosa Acevedo, Araceli Rodriguez, Diana Rosa Almanguer Orellana support case. Torrey Stanley Carlton, Tami Kigley (Craig Bunch yielded time), Anisa Schell opposed to case Lilia Gonzalez, Vivian Gregory, Yvonne Casteno support case. Paula Sullivan support case. Valerie Cortez opposed to case. Martin Acevedo support case. Kathleen Trenchard and Josie Austin opposed to case. Elia Reyna, Alejandro Soto, Elena Castillo, Drea Garza support case. Anne Torey opposed to case. Francine Agueros and Xavier Borrego support case.

Motion: Commissioner Fish move to approve stipulations 4,5,6, and 7. Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
 Nay: None.
 Absent: Garza, and Connor.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

- **Item # B-17. HDRC NO. 2019-379**
 ADDRESS: 910 N HACKBERRY ST
 APPLICANT: Cy Goudge/JCG Homes

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval for construction of two, 2-story, residential structures on the vacant lot at 910 N Hackberry, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District. At this time, the applicant has provided a site plan and information regarding height for review.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific

historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.

iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.

ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.

iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.

iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.

v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

i. *Impervious surfaces*—Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.

ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees*—Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

- i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.
- ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.
- iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.
- iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.
- v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

- i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.
- ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

- i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.
- ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.
- iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

- i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.
- ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.
- iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.
- ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.
- iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.
- iv. *Windows and doors*—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions.

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used.

ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends conceptual approval based on findings a through o with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant amend the proposed setbacks to feature setbacks that are greater than those of the adjacent historic structures, including porches, as noted in finding d.
- ii. That the applicant utilize roof forms that are found historically within the district and those that minimize perceived height, as noted in finding f.
- iii. That the applicant include a foundation height that is within one (1) foot of those found historically on this block as noted in finding h.
- iv. That the applicant confirm that the proposed lot coverage is less than fifty (50) percent, per the Guidelines, as noted in finding i.
- v. That the propose driveways not exceed ten (10) feet in height, as noted in finding j.
- vi. That the proposed attached carport either be separated from the proposed new construction and shifted toward the rear of the lot, or eliminated as noted in finding m.
- vii. That the applicant follow staff’s specifications for materials, window materials and architectural details, as noted in finding n.
- viii. That both structures feature a unique design as noted in finding o.
- ix. That the applicant provide further analysis of existing building heights and develop a height that is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines. As designs develop, the applicant should utilize 1 and ½ story massing or roof forms that mitigate the visual impacts of a two-story house on this block of N Pine.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Grube moved to approve with staff stipulations 2-9 for conceptual approval. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None .
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: **MOTION PASSED 9AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

• Item # B-18. HDRC NO. 2019-356

ADDRESS: 914 N PINE ST and 918 N PINE

APPLICANT: David Ericsson/Pine 14 & Pine 18 LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a one story residential structure to feature occupied attic space at 918 N Pine to front N Pine.

2. Construct a one story, rear accessory structure to be located at the rear of the lot at 914 N Pine.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

- iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.
- iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

- i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.

iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.

ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.

iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.

iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.

v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

i. *Impervious surfaces*—Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.

ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

- i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.
- ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.
- iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.
- iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.
- v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

- i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.
- ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

- i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.
- ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.
- iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

- i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.
- ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.
- iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.
- ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.
- iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.
- iv. *Windows and doors*—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions.

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used.

ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff does not recommend approval of item #1, the construction of a primary residential structure at 918 N Pine based on findings 1a through 1i. Staff recommends the following prior to the applicant receiving a recommendation for approval:

- i. That the applicant incorporate a traditional entrance as noted in finding 1a to include appropriate front door design and massing.
- ii. That the applicant confirm that the proposed front setback will not exceed that of the primary historic structure to the north at 922 N Pine as noted in finding 1b.
- iii. That the applicant incorporate traditional roof elements, such as eaves into the proposed side gabled roof as noted in finding 1e, as well as install a standing seam metal roof featuring panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. A low profile ridge cap may be used for new construction; however, this ridge cap must be submitted for review and approval by the Commission.
- iv. That the applicant incorporate traditional materials that are used historically for residential construction throughout the Dignowity Hill Historic District as noted in finding 1g.
- v. That a double-hung, one-over-one wood or aluminum-clad wood window be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- vi. That the applicant address various architectural elements that are neither consistent with the Guidelines nor in keeping with the historic character of the district as noted in finding 1i.

2. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2, the construction of an accessory structure at 914 N Pine based on findings 2a through 2f. Staff recommends the following prior to the application receiving an recommendation for approval:

- i. That the applicant consider an overall reduction in footprint to comply with the Guidelines as noted in finding 2c.
- ii. That the applicant incorporate traditional materials that are used historically for residential construction throughout the Dignowity Hill Historic District as noted in finding 2d and 2f.
- iii. That a double-hung, one-over-one wood or aluminum-clad wood window be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail.

Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

- iv. That the applicant incorporate traditional roof elements, such as eaves into the proposed front gabled roof as noted in finding 2g, as well as install a standing seam metal roof featuring panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. A low profile ridge cap may be used for new construction; however, this ridge cap must be submitted for review and approval by the Commission.

A foundation inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that appropriate setbacks are being installed. The foundation inspection shall be scheduled prior to the pouring of the foundation.

A roofing inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that an industrial or large ridge cap in not installed. The roofing inspection shall be scheduling prior to the installation of roofing materials.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: This case was postponed until August 7th hearing.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores , Carpenter,Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon .
Nays: None.
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: **Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT.**

• **Item # B-19. HDRC NO. 2019-320**

ADDRESS: 311 BARRERA

APPLICANT: Cotton Estes/HighCotton Architects

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a 2-story single family structure totaling approximately 2,100 square feet with an attached carport.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall

conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

C. RELATIONSHIP OF SOLIDS TO VOIDS

i. *Window and door openings*—Incorporate window and door openings with a similar proportion of wall to window space as typical with nearby historic facades. Windows, doors, porches, entryways, dormers, bays, and pediments shall be considered similar if they are no larger than 25% in size and vary no more than 10% in height to width ratio from adjacent historic facades.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

B. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

Salvaged materials—Incorporate salvaged historic materials where possible within the context of the overall design of the new structure.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- i. *Massing and form*—Design new garages and outbuildings to be visually subordinate to the principal historic structure in terms of their height, massing, and form.
- ii. *Building size* – New outbuildings should be no larger in plan than 40 percent of the principal historic structure footprint.
- iii. *Character*—Relate new garages and outbuildings to the period of construction of the principal building on the lot through the use of complementary materials and simplified architectural details.
- iv. *Windows and doors*—Design window and door openings to be similar to those found on historic garages or outbuildings in the district or on the principle historic structure in terms of their spacing and proportions.
- v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

B. SETBACKS AND ORIENTATION

- i. *Orientation*—Match the predominant garage orientation found along the block. Do not introduce front-loaded garages or garages attached to the primary structure on blocks where rear or alley-loaded garages were historically used.
- ii. *Setbacks*—Follow historic setback pattern of similar structures along the streetscape or district for new garages and outbuildings. Historic garages and outbuildings are most typically located at the rear of the lot, behind the principal building. In some instances, historic setbacks are not consistent with UDC requirements and a variance may be required.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

- i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

7. Designing for Energy Efficiency

A. BUILDING DESIGN

- i. *Energy efficiency*—Design additions and new construction to maximize energy efficiency.
- ii. *Materials*—Utilize green building materials, such as recycled, locally-sourced, and low maintenance materials whenever possible.
- iii. *Building elements*—Incorporate building features that allow for natural environmental control – such as operable windows for cross ventilation.
- iv. *Roof slopes*—Orient roof slopes to maximize solar access for the installation of future solar collectors where compatible with typical roof slopes and orientations found in the surrounding historic district.

B. SITE DESIGN

- i. *Building orientation*—Orient new buildings and additions with consideration for solar and wind exposure in all seasons to the extent possible within the context of the surrounding district.
- ii. *Solar access*—Avoid or minimize the impact of new construction on solar access for adjoining properties.

C. SOLAR COLLECTORS

- i. *Location*—Locate solar collectors on side or rear roof pitch of the primary historic structure to the maximum extent feasible to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way while maximizing solar access. Alternatively, locate solar collectors on a garage or outbuilding or consider a ground-mount system where solar access to the primary structure is limited.
- ii. *Mounting (sloped roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a sloped roof. Select collectors that are similar in color to the roof surface to reduce visibility.
- iii. *Mounting (flat roof surfaces)*—Mount solar collectors flush with the surface of a flat roof to the maximum extent feasible. Where solar access limitations preclude a flush mount, locate panels towards the rear of the roof where visibility from the public right-of-way will be minimized.

OHP Window Policy Document

Windows used in new construction should:

- Maintain traditional dimensions and profiles;
- Be recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are not recommended;
- Feature traditional materials or appearance. Wood windows are most appropriate. Double-hung, block frame windows that feature alternative materials may be considered on a case-by-case basis;
- Feature traditional trim and sill details. Paired windows should be separated by a wood mullion. The use of low-e glass is appropriate in new construction provided that hue and reflectivity are not drastically different from regular glass.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend conceptual approval at this time. Staff recommends that the applicant address the following stipulations prior to returning to the HDRC:

- i. That the front gable mass be set back from the side gable and porch mass as noted in findings d and g.
- ii. That the applicant proposes a primary-accessory structure relationship that is more consistent with the district and existing parking precedents as noted in findings m and o.
- iii. That the applicant explores more traditional window depths, configurations, and screen designs that reflect the existing proportions and patterns on the block as noted in finding j.
- iv. That the applicant proposes a front walkway condition that responds to the existing context of the district, like poured concrete or similar, as noted in finding r.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve with staff stipulations 3 and 4 as noted. Commissioner Harris seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: Grube.

Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: MOTION PASSED 8 AYES, and 1 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

• **Item # B-21. HDRC NO. 2019-340**

ADDRESS: 1104 NOLAN

APPLICANT: JENNY HERNANDEZ/HHGC, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construction a 1-story, single family residential structure on the vacant lot at 1104 Nolan, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district.

Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way. Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
- v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

- i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.
- ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.
- iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.
- iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.
- v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

- i. *Impervious surfaces*—Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.
- ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.

ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.

iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.

ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.

iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through o with the following stipulations:

- i. That the proposed new construction feature a setback that is equal to or greater than the adjacent historic structure, including the porch and porch roof as noted in finding b. This should be accomplished while maintaining a traditional form for the front bay.
- ii. That the applicant confirm that the proposed foundation height is consistent with the Guidelines as noted in finding g.
- iii. That the applicant install fenestration on the right (west) elevation and that all paired windows be separated by a mullion of at least six (6) inches in width as noted in finding i. The applicant has resubmitted a floor plan that notes additional fenestration as recommended; however, elevations should be submitted to reflect this addition.
- iv. That the proposed composite siding feature a thickness of 3/4 of an inch and mitered corners as noted in finding j.
- v. That the proposed aluminum clad wood windows feature a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and an architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening. Additionally, staff finds that a one over one window would be most appropriate for the Dignowity Hill Historic District.
- vi. That the proposed front porch depth be increased to at least six (6) feet in height and that this be accomplished without reducing the distance from the front face of the porch to the front face of the projecting bay as noted in finding l. Additionally, staff recommends that the proposed porch columns feature a width and depth of at least six (6) inches.
- vii. That the applicant submit a detailed landscaping plan to staff as noted in finding o.

A foundation inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that appropriate setbacks are being installed. The foundation inspection shall be scheduled prior to the pouring of the foundation.

A roofing inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that an industrial or large ridge cap in not installed. The roofing inspection shall be scheduling prior to the installation of roofing materials.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Valerie Cortez oppose to staff recommendation, but support case.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to modify stipulation 1- that the site plan be submitted prior to issuance of COA, and an additional stipulation that require bay area in the front be returned to its previous proportions on setback and that the driveway be extended by 20 ft beyond the porch. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Guarino, Garza.

Action: **Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

• **Item # B-22. HDRC NO. 2019-357**
ADDRESS: 831 LAMAR ST
APPLICANT: Octavio Viramontes/HACAM PROPERTIES LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct one, 1-story single-family residence on the vacant lot at 831 Lamar, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

- ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.
- iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.
- iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

- v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

- i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

- i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.
- ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.
- iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way. Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.

iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.

ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.

iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.

iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.

v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

i. *Impervious surfaces*—Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.

ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees*—Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

- i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.
- ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.
- iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.
- iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.
- v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

- i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.
- ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

- i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.
- ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.
- iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

- i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.
- ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.
- iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval based on findings a through n with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant provide a front setback that is equal to or greater than the setback for the existing historic home located immediately to the west based on finding d. The proposed setbacks should be accurately depicted in the application materials through field verification.
- ii. That the applicant confirm the proposed foundation height is within one (1) foot of those found historically on the block.
- iii. That the applicant increase window heights to be more consistent with those found historically in the district as noted in finding i.
- iv. That the proposed wood columns feature both capital and base trim and chamfered columns as noted in finding j.

- v. That the proposed windows feature meeting rails that are no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- vi. That the applicant lower the top plate of each wall to eliminate excess wall height, which will result in a proportionate façade arrangement as noted in finding l.
- vii. That the applicant submit a detailed landscaping plan for review and approval as noted in finding n.

A foundation inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that appropriate setbacks are being installed. The foundation inspection shall be scheduled prior to the pouring of the foundation.

A roofing inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff to ensure that an industrial or large ridge cap is not installed. The roofing inspection shall be scheduling prior to the installation of roofing materials.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Valerie Cortez support to project, but opposed to staff recommendations.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion for conceptual approval with the additional stipulation to determine the location of tree for setback.. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon,
Nays: None.
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

• **Item # B-23. HDRC NO. 2019-351**

ADDRESS: 9338 ESPADA RD

APPLICANT: Veronica Santellan

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a side addition.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. *Height*—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.
- ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.
- iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

Mission Historic District Design Manual, Section 2, Guidelines for Exterior Alterations and Additions

A. EXTERIOR ALTERATIONS IN GENERAL

- i. *Non-contributing structures* — Where a determination of non-contributing status has been provided for a structure, more flexibility may be considered in regards to facade alterations provided that overall design and architectural styles introduced remain respectful of the immediate historic context of the block and surrounding residential structures.

B. ADDITIONS

- i. *Minimize visual impact* — Additions should be located to the rear of a property whenever possible. If the rear is not a feasible location due to site restrictions, such as a contributing rear accessory structure, heritage landscape

element, or a small rear yard, alternative locations may be explored. A site analysis and site plan that demonstrates any restrictions must be submitted as part of an application if an alternative location is proposed.

ii. *Alternative locations* — A side or second story addition may be considered only if the rear of the lot has been determined to be unfeasible as demonstrated by a site analysis provided by the applicant.

C. SIDE ADDITIONS

i. *Setbacks* — Side additions must be set back from the front façade by at least 50% of the total side façade length. A greater setback is encouraged where feasible.

ii. *Width* — Side additions must not be greater than 30% of the width of the front façade of the primary structure.

iii. *Roof form* — Side additions must feature a subordinate roofline in height, while maintaining the original roof form (front or side gabled, hipped, etc.). Ridge lines that match the existing historic structure in height may be considered on a case-by-case basis, especially if ridge line continuity is a paramount feature of a particular historic style. The applicant must demonstrate the appropriateness of a matching ridge line in their application.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through f. Staff recommends that the applicant redesign the addition to better represent traditional residential building configurations and styles found within the region.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Grube made a motion to refer to DRD- Design Review Committee. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon
Nays: None.
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: Motion passed 8 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 3 ABSENT

- **Item # B-25. HDRC NO. 2019-376**

ADDRESS: 1110 VIRGINIA BLVD

APPLICANT: Logan Nichols

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace 19 windows on the side and rear elevations.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.

iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.

v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

12. Increasing Energy Efficiency

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Historic elements*—Preserve elements of historic buildings that are energy efficient including awnings, porches, recessed entryways, overhangs, operable windows, and shutters.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Weatherization*—Apply caulking and weather stripping to historic windows and doors to make them weather tight.
- ii. *Thermal performance*—Improve thermal performance of windows, fanlights, and sidelights by applying UV film or new glazing that reduces heat gain from sunlight on south and west facing facades only if the historic character can be maintained. Do not use reflective or tinted films.
- iii. *Windows*—Restore original windows to working order. Install compatible and energy-efficient replacement windows when existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Replacement windows must match the appearance, materials, size, design, proportion, and profile of the original historic windows.
- iv. *Reopening*—Consider reopening an original opening that is presently blocked to add natural light and ventilation.
- v. *Insulation*—Insulate unfinished spaces with appropriate insulation ensuring proper ventilation, such as attics, basements, and crawl spaces.
- vi. *Shutters*—Reinstall functional shutters and awnings with elements similar in size and character where they existed historically.
- vii. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency.
- viii. *Cool roofs*—Do not install white or —cool roofs when visible from the public right-of-way. White roofs are permitted on flat roofs and must be concealed with a parapet.

ix. *Roof vents*—Add roof vents for ventilation of attic heat. Locate new roof vents on rear roof pitches, out of view of the public right-of-way.

x. *Green Roofs*—Install green roofs when they are appropriate for historic commercial structures.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of the proposed window replacements, based on findings a and b. Staff recommends that the applicant return the structure to its previous condition by removing and replacing the currently installed vinyl windows with one of the following: the original wood windows (if available) or salvaged historic windows or custom-built wood windows that retain the original window dimensions. Wood replacement windows from a manufacturer are not appropriate.

CASE COMMENT:

The applicant has proposed to replace 19 windows on the primary structure. Staff conducted a site visit on June 26, 2019, and observed that 19 windows had been removed and replaced with vinyl windows without a Certificate of Appropriateness. Photographs, furnished by the applicant, of the primary structure prior to the removal of the windows indicate that the home previously featured wood windows that were likely original. During the site visit, the removed historic windows were not found on the property.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approval of replacement of 19 windows with new wood windows with the added stipulation that staff verify the product and that they meet the historic sizes with staff stipulations. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon,
Nays: None .
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: **Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

- **Item # B-26. HDRC NO. 2019-372**

ADDRESS: 410 DEVINE ST

APPLICANT: Stephanie Faulkner/FAULKNER WILLIAM & STEPHANIE

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct two enclosed wood landings on the front façade.
2. Install an eight foot rear privacy fence.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
- iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
- v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.
- ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.
- iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
- v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.
- ii. *Location* – Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff recommends approval based on findings a and b with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant install two simple wood stairs instead of enclosed landings on the primary elevation. The applicant is required to submit updated documents that reflect this change to staff for review and approval prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the new front yard fence based on findings c through d with the following stipulation:

- i. That the fence be a maximum of six feet in height, as noted in finding d. The final construction height of an approved fence may not exceed the maximum height as approved by the HDRC at any portion of the fence. Additionally, all fences must be permitted and meet the development standards outlined in UDC Section 35-514.

CASE COMMENT:

The applicant has proposed to replace 50-feet of existing fence on the south property line with a new fence consisting of metal posts and horizontal wood planks. Staff issued a Certificate of Appropriateness for the fence location and design only on June 13, 2019. Accordingly, staff only reviewed the proposed fence height under Item 2.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to approve item 1 with the stipulation that it is enclosed landing and skirting remain undisturbed and that items remain generally reversible, and approve item 2- with the height of 6 feet per staff stipulations. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None .
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

- **Item # B-27. HDRC NO. 2019-374**

ADDRESS: 813 BURLESON ST

APPLICANT: Melissa Iruegas

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Resize two (2) window openings on the side (east) and rear (north) elevations of the primary structure.
2. Replace seventeen (17) windows on the front (south), side (east and west), and rear elevations of the primary structure with wood windows.
3. Receive Historic Tax Certification.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

12. Increasing Energy Efficiency

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Historic elements*—Preserve elements of historic buildings that are energy efficient including awnings, porches, recessed entryways, overhangs, operable windows, and shutters.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Weatherization*—Apply caulking and weather stripping to historic windows and doors to make them weather tight.
- ii. *Thermal performance*—Improve thermal performance of windows, fanlights, and sidelights by applying UV film or new glazing that reduces heat gain from sunlight on south and west facing facades only if the historic character can be maintained. Do not use reflective or tinted films.
- iii. *Windows*—Restore original windows to working order. Install compatible and energy-efficient replacement windows when existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Replacement windows must match the appearance, materials, size, design, proportion, and profile of the original historic windows.
- iv. *Reopening*—Consider reopening an original opening that is presently blocked to add natural light and ventilation.

- v. *Insulation*—Insulate unfinished spaces with appropriate insulation ensuring proper ventilation, such as attics, basements, and crawl spaces.
- vi. *Shutters*—Reinstall functional shutters and awnings with elements similar in size and character where they existed historically.
- vii. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency.
- viii. *Cool roofs*—Do not install white or —cooll roofs when visible from the public right-of-way. White roofs are permitted on flat roofs and must be concealed with a parapet.
- ix. *Roof vents*—Add roof vents for ventilation of attic heat. Locate new roof vents on rear roof pitches, out of view of the public right-of-way.
- x. *Green Roofs*—Install green roofs when they are appropriate for historic commercial structures.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

UDC, Sec. 35-618. - Tax Exemption Qualifications.

(h) Assessed Valuation. In accordance with the provisions of this article, a building, site, or structure which meets the definition of a historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation and which is substantially rehabilitated and/or restored as certified by the historic and design review commission and approved by the city tax assessor-collector, shall have an assessed value for ad valorem taxation as follows regardless of ownership during the granted time period:

(2) A residential property shall have the assessed value for ad valorem taxation for a period of ten (10) tax years equal to the assessed value prior to preservation.

(i) Applicability. This exemption shall begin on the first day of the first tax year after verification of completion of the preservation required for certification; provided the building shall comply with the applicable zoning regulations for its use and location.

(j) Application. Application for a historic structure preservation tax exemption pursuant to this division is to be filed with the office of historic preservation. The historic preservation officer shall be the agent of the city for the purposes of administering this division provided that the historic preservation officer request a recommendation from the historic and design review commission. Each application shall be signed and sworn to by the owner of the property and shall:

(7) State the legal description of the property proposed for certification;

(8) Include an affidavit by the owner describing the historic significance of the structure in need of tax relief;

(9) Include a final complete set of plans for the historic structure's restoration or rehabilitation;

(10) Include a statement of costs for the restoration or rehabilitation work;

(11) Include a projection of the estimated construction, time and predicted completion date of the historic restoration or rehabilitation;

(12) Authorize the members of the historic and design review commission, the city tax assessor-collector and city officials to visit and inspect the property proposed for certification and the records and books of the owners as necessary to certify that the property in question is in substantial need of restoration or rehabilitation;

(7) Include a detailed statement of the proposed use for the property; and

(8) Provide any additional information to the historic and design review commission which the owner deems relevant or useful such as the history of the structure or access to the structure by the public.

Each application shall contain sufficient documentation confirming or supporting the information submitted therein. (k) Certification.

(3) Historic and Design Review Commission Certification. Upon receipt of the owner's sworn application the historic and design review commission shall make an investigation of the property and shall certify the facts to the

city tax assessor-collector within thirty (30) days along with the historic and design review commission's documentation for recommendation of either approval or disapproval of the application for exemption.

(4) Tax Assessor-Collector Approval. Upon receipt of the certified application for tax exemption as well as the recommendation of the historic and design review commission, the city's tax assessor-collector shall within thirty (30) days approve or disapprove eligibility of the property for tax relief pursuant to this division. In determining eligibility, the tax assessor-collector shall first determine that all the requirements of this division have been complied with and that only the historic structure and the land reasonably necessary for access and use thereof is to be provided favorable tax relief.

(l) Verification of Completion. Upon completion of the restoration and rehabilitation, together with a fee as specified in Appendix "C" of this chapter, the owner, who may not be the same as at the time of application, shall submit a sworn statement of completion acknowledging that the historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation has been substantially rehabilitated or restored as certified by the historic and design review commission.

The historic and design review commission, upon receipt of the sworn statement of completion, but no later than thirty (30) days thereafter, shall make an investigation of the property and shall recommend either approval or disapproval of the fact that the property has been substantially completed as required for certification. If the historic and design review commission recommends that it has not been substantially completed as so required, then the certified applicant may be required by the historic preservation officer to complete the restoration or rehabilitation in order to secure the tax exemption provided herein. If the verification of completion is favorable, the historic and design review commission shall recommend approval and the historic preservation office may notify the tax assessor-collector in writing of compliance. Thereafter, the tax assessor-collector shall provide the property with the historic tax exemption.

(m) Historic Preservation Tax Exemptions.

(1) Historic Preservation Tax Exemption for Residences in Need of Substantial Repair. In accordance with the provisions of this chapter, a historically significant residential building, which meets both the definitions of a historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation and of a residential property in Appendix "A" of this chapter, and is either individually designated or is located within the boundaries of a locally designated historic district which is substantially rehabilitated and is approved by the chief appraiser of the Bexar County Appraisal District, shall have an assessed value for ad valorem taxation as follows:

A. A residential property shall have no assessed value for ad valorem taxation for a period of five (5) tax years after verification, as defined in Appendix "A" to this chapter. Thereafter, the exempt property shall be reappraised at current market value and assessed at a fifty (50) percent rate for an additional consecutive five-year period.

B. This exemption shall begin on the first day of the first tax year after verification of completion of the substantial rehabilitation by the historic and design review commission, provided compliance with subsection (b) of this section. (n) Eligibility.

(1) The tax exemption options outlined in subsection (f), above, will remain in effect unless terminated by designation status being removed pursuant to subsection 35-606(g) of this article.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff recommends approval of the proposed fenestration modifications (i.e. the resizing of Windows #12 and 13, per the submitted site plan) based on findings a through b.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the replacement of only Windows #3, 6, 10, 11, 12, 13, and 14, per the submitted site plan, based on finding c, with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant submit final window specifications for the proposed replacement windows to staff for review and approval. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional

dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

- ii. In order to achieve consistency, the applicant may replace these seven (7) windows, as needed, with matching historic windows relocated from other locations on the primary structure.

Item 3, Staff recommends approval of Historic Tax Certification based on findings d through h with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant complies with the HDRC action regarding request items 1 and 2 regarding window replacement and fenestration modifications.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Grube made a motion to approve items 1-3 and with the additional stipulation of window detail to be reviewed by staff. Commissioner Martinez-Flores seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None .
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: **Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT**

• **Item # B-28. HDRC NO. 2019-274**

ADDRESS: 1024 DAWSON ST

APPLICANT: Mark Flinn

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replacement of two front wood window with same size vinyl windows
2. Replacement of a side wood window with a smaller vinyl bathroom window
3. Replacement of the front door
4. Receive Historic Tax Certification

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. *Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

OHP Window Policy Document

Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should:

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

Sec. 35-618. - Tax Exemption Qualifications.

(a) Assessed Valuation. In accordance with the provisions of this article, a building, site, or structure which meets the definition of a historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation and which is substantially rehabilitated and/or restored as certified by the historic and design review commission and approved by the city tax assessor-collector, shall have an assessed value for ad valorem taxation as follows regardless of ownership during the granted time period:

(1) A residential property shall have the assessed value for ad valorem taxation for a period of ten (10) tax years equal to the assessed value prior to preservation.

(b) Applicability. This exemption shall begin on the first day of the first tax year after verification of completion of the vpreservation required for certification; provided the building shall comply with the applicable zoning regulations for its use and location.

(c) Application. Application for a historic structure preservation tax exemption pursuant to this division is to be filed with the office of historic preservation. The historic preservation officer shall be the agent of the city for the purposes of administering this division provided that the historic preservation officer request a recommendation from the historic and design review commission. Each application shall be signed and sworn to by the owner of the property and shall:

- (1) State the legal description of the property proposed for certification;
 - (2) Include an affidavit by the owner describing the historic significance of the structure in need of tax relief;
 - (3) Include a final complete set of plans for the historic structure's restoration or rehabilitation;
 - (4) Include a statement of costs for the restoration or rehabilitation work;
 - (5) Include a projection of the estimated construction, time and predicted completion date of the historic restoration or rehabilitation;
 - (6) Authorize the members of the historic and design review commission, the city tax assessor-collector and city officials to visit and inspect the property proposed for certification and the records and books of the owners as necessary to certify that the property in question is in substantial need of restoration or rehabilitation;
 - (7) Include a detailed statement of the proposed use for the property; and
 - (8) Provide any additional information to the historic and design review commission which the owner deems relevant or useful such as the history of the structure or access to the structure by the public.
- Each application shall contain sufficient documentation confirming or supporting the information submitted therein.

(d) Certification.

(1) Historic and Design Review Commission Certification. Upon receipt of the owner's sworn application the historic and design review commission shall make an investigation of the property and shall certify the facts to the city tax assessor-collector within thirty (30) days along with the historic and design review commission's documentation for recommendation of either approval or disapproval of the application for exemption.

(2) Tax Assessor-Collector Approval. Upon receipt of the certified application for tax exemption as well as the recommendation of the historic and design review commission, the city's tax assessor-collector shall within thirty (30) days approve or disapprove eligibility of the property for tax relief pursuant to this division. In determining eligibility, the tax assessor-collector shall first determine that all the requirements of this division have been complied with and that only the historic structure and the land reasonably necessary for access and use thereof is to be provided favorable tax relief.

(e) Verification of Completion. Upon completion of the restoration and rehabilitation, together with a fee as specified in Appendix "C" of this chapter, the owner, who may not be the same as at the time of application, shall submit a sworn statement of completion acknowledging that the historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation has been substantially rehabilitated or restored as certified by the historic and design review commission. The historic and design review commission, upon receipt of the sworn statement of completion, but no later than thirty (30) days thereafter, shall make an investigation of the property and shall recommend either approval or disapproval of the fact that the property has been substantially completed as required for certification. If the historic and design review commission recommends that it has not been substantially completed as so required, then the certified applicant may be required by the historic preservation officer to complete the restoration or rehabilitation in order to secure the tax exemption provided herein. If the verification of completion is favorable, the historic and design review commission shall recommend approval and the historic preservation office may notify the tax assessor-collector in writing of compliance. Thereafter, the tax assessor-collector shall provide the property with the historic tax exemption.

(f) Historic Preservation Tax Exemptions.

(1) Historic Preservation Tax Exemption for Residences in Need of Substantial Repair. In accordance with the provisions of this chapter, a historically significant residential building, which meets both the definitions of a historically significant site in need of tax relief to encourage preservation and of a residential property in Appendix "A" of this chapter, and is either individually designated or is located within the boundaries of a locally designated historic district which is substantially rehabilitated and is approved by the chief appraiser of the Bexar County Appraisal District, shall have an assessed value for ad valorem taxation as follows:

A. A residential property shall have no assessed value for ad valorem taxation for a period of five (5) tax years after verification, as defined in Appendix "A" to this chapter. Thereafter, the exempt property shall be reappraised at current market value and assessed at a fifty (50) percent rate for an additional consecutive five-year period.

B. This exemption shall begin on the first day of the first tax year after verification of completion of the substantial rehabilitation by the historic and design review commission, provided compliance with subsection (b) of this section.

(g) Eligibility.

(1) The tax exemption options outlined in subsection (f), above, will remain in effect unless terminated by designation status being removed pursuant to subsection 35-606(g) of this article.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of items 1 through 4 based on findings b through e. To be eligible for Historic Tax Certification, the commission must first approve the outstanding items – or the applicant/owner performs the following corrections:

h. The two front vinyl windows are restored to their original material, size, and configuration. Specifications of replacement windows should be submitted to staff prior to installation.

i. The side vinyl window is restored to its original material, size, and configuration. To accommodate the bathroom, this window may be enclosed from the interior by installing a furr wall. An elevation drawing and specifications of the window should be submitted to staff prior to construction.

- j. The ornamentation in the door's glazing should be removed or the whole door may be replaced with an appropriate Craftsman style door.

CASE COMMENT:

COMPLIANCE – During the initial review for Historic Tax Certification to be heard at the June 5, 2019 HDRC hearing, staff found that a number of items were performed prior to approval. In communicating with the new owner and further investigation, staff finds that those items were performed previous owner. The new owner and applicant was cooperative to obtain administrative approval for appropriate items while the remaining three items have been added to the HDRC request with Tax Certification. The modifications by the previous owner was done circa January 2018 which is within the period of enforcement.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to approve with the stipulation that the front two windows be replaced with wood windows and that the doors glazing ornamentation be moved and placed with simple glazed in white. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fernandez, Fish, Harris, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Bowman, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None .
Absent: Garza, Connor.

Action: Motion passed 9 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 2 ABSENT

EXECUTIVE SESSION.

Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.

ADJOURNMENT.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:45 PM.

APPROVED

Jeffrey Fetzer
Acting Chair

