



CITY OF SAN ANTONIO
OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
04 September 2019**

The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session on Wednesday, September 04, 2019, in the Board Room at the Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo.

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

- Chairman Fezter called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

- The roll was called by the Executive Secretary.

Present: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.

Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

CHAIRMAN'S STATEMENT

ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Living Heritage Symposium, September 4-6
 - Rehabarama, September 7
 - Historic Homeowner Fair, September 21
 - For details and more information, visit www.sapreservation.com
 - Update on the Tobin Hill potential district and status on the requested windshield survey.
- COMMISSIONER VELASQUEZ CAME ON BOARD.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None

CONSENT A and B AGENDA

- **Consideration of Consent Agenda- A items:**
 - Item #A-1, Case No. 2019-492 856 GEMBLER RD

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve the consent Agenda A with staff stipulations. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

• **Consideration of Consent Agenda- B items Heard after 4:30pm:**

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD:

William Carson- DH Association- support 912 E CROCKETT ST and 831 BURLESON ST . Cases non-support- 415 N MESQUITE ST/105, 107, 109, 111 and 113 BROWN STREET, but supports staff's recommendations.

- o Item #B-1, Case No. 2019-443 503 N MESQUITE ST
- o Item #B-2, Case No. 2019-444 503 N MESQUITE ST
- o Item #B-3, Case No. 2019-464 601 BURNET ST
- o Item #B-4, Case No. 2019-440 118 DELAWARE
- o Item #B-6, Case No. 2019-398 2161 W KINGS HWY
- o Item #B-7, Case No. 2019-471 222 ADAMS ST
- o Item #B-17, Case No. 2019-390 327 E PARK AVE

- AGENDA B-5 WAS PULLED DUE TO CTBH ON PROJECT.
- AGENDA B-10 WAS POSTPONED BY APPLICANT.
- AGENDA B-13 WAS POSTONED BY APPLICANT.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve the consent agenda B with staff stipulations. Commissioner Bowman seconded the motions.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

Action: **THE MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA A ITEMS

• **Item # A-2. HDRC NO. 2019-447**

Applicant: Kayla Brooks/Tejas Sign Co. - A-1 Signs
ADDRESS: 315 E HOUSTON ST

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install signage at 315 E Houston. Within this request, the applicant has proposed the following:

1. One (1), internally illuminated channel letter sign to read "we work" to be located on the balcony wall above the historic Kress signage. The proposed sign is to feature an overall width of 29' – 1/6" and an overall height of 6' – 7/8" for a total size of 182.5 square feet. This sign will feature white acrylic faces with dual color perforated vinyl applications.
2. One (1) internally illuminated channel letter sign to read "we work" to be located on the east facing wall. The proposed sign is to feature an overall width of 33' – 5 1/4" and an overall height of approximately 7' for a total size of 237 square feet. This sign will feature white acrylic faces with dual color perforated vinyl applications.
3. One (1) internally illuminated channel letter sign to read "we work" to be located above the E Houston entrance canopy. The proposed sign is to feature an overall width of 13' – 11" and an overall height of 2'

- 10” for a total size of 40.2 square feet. This sign will feature white acrylic faces with dual color perforated vinyl applications.
- 4. Temporary vinyl window applications to be installed in the street level storefront system.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 6, Guidelines for Signage

A. GENERAL

- i. *Number and size*—Each building will be allowed one major and two minor signs. Total requested signage should not exceed 50 square feet.
- ii. *New signs*—Select the type of sign to be used based on evidence of historic signs or sign attachment parts along the building storefront where possible. Design signs to respect and respond to the character and/or period of the area in which they are being placed. Signs should identify the tenant without creating visual clutter or distracting from building features and historic districts.
- iii. *Scale*—Design signage to be in proportion to the facade, respecting the building’s size, scale and mass, height, and rhythms and sizes of window and door openings. Scale signage (in terms of its height and width) to be subordinate to the overall building composition.

B. HISTORIC SIGNS

- i. *Preservation*—Preserve historic signs, such as ghost signs or other signs characteristic of the building’s or district’s period of significance, whenever possible.
- ii. *Maintenance*—Repair historic signs and replace historic parts in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair.

C. PLACEMENT AND INSTALLATION

- i. *Location*—Place signs where historically located and reuse sign attachment parts where they exist. Do not erect signs above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall, or where they will disfigure or conceal architectural details, window openings, doors, or other significant details.
- ii. *Obstruction of historic features*—Avoid obscuring historic building features such as cornices, gables, porches, balconies, or other decorative elements with new signs.
- iii. *Damage*—Avoid irreversible damage caused by installing a sign. For example, mount a sign to the mortar rather than the historic masonry.
- iv. *Pedestrian orientation*—Orient signs toward the sidewalk to maintain the pedestrian oriented nature of the historic districts.

D. DESIGN

- i. *Inappropriate materials*—Do not use plastic, fiberglass, highly reflective materials that will be difficult to read, or other synthetic materials not historically used in the district.

E. LIGHTING

- i. *Lighting sources*—Use only indirect or bare-bulb sources that do not produce glare to illuminate signs. All illumination shall be steady and stationary. Internal illumination should not be used.
- ii. *Neon lighting*—Incorporate neon lighting as an integral architectural element or artwork appropriate to the site, if used.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items #1 through #4 with the following stipulations:

- i. That all proposed signage be modified to feature either halo or indirect lighting as to not produce an internal glowing cabinet.
- ii. That the proposed signage facing south be relocated to the penthouse wall where it will not interfere or negatively impact the historic Kress signage.
- iii. That all temporary signage be removed at the time of installation of permanent signage.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Virginia Van Cleave.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter moved to approve with staff stipulations. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon,
Nays: NONE .
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES AND 0 NAY. 4 ABSENT

• **Item # A-3. HDRC NO. 2019-474**

Applicant: George Lowery/GLA Permitting
ADDRESS: 3310 SAN PEDRO AVE

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing freestanding pole sign with a new, dual face, internally illuminated monument sign. The proposed sign will measure fourteen (14) feet in height with an internally illuminated cabinet that is to read “The Original Taco Cabana Mexican Patio Café”. The proposed cabinet will feature aluminum faces with white channel letters. The proposed cabinet will feature approximately nineteen (19) square feet per side for a total size of 48 square feet. This does not include the base or other sign structure. The proposed cabinet will also feature up lighting front the base.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 6, Guidelines for Signage

A. GENERAL

- i. *Number and size*—Each building will be allowed one major and two minor signs. Total requested signage should not exceed 50 square feet.
- ii. *New signs*—Select the type of sign to be used based on evidence of historic signs or sign attachment parts along the building storefront where possible. Design signs to respect and respond to the character and/or period of the area in which they are being placed. Signs should identify the tenant without creating visual clutter or distracting from building features and historic districts.
- iii. *Scale*—Design signage to be in proportion to the facade, respecting the building’s size, scale and mass, height, and rhythms and sizes of window and door openings. Scale signage (in terms of its height and width) to be subordinate to the overall building composition.

C. PLACEMENT AND INSTALLATION

- i. *Location*—Place signs where historically located and reuse sign attachment parts where they exist. Do not erect signs above the cornice line or uppermost portion of a facade wall, or where they will disfigure or conceal architectural details, window openings, doors, or other significant details.
- ii. *Obstruction of historic features*—Avoid obscuring historic building features such as cornices, gables, porches, balconies, or other decorative elements with new signs.
- iii. *Damage*—Avoid irreversible damage caused by installing a sign. For example, mount a sign to the mortar rather than the historic masonry.
- iv. *Pedestrian orientation*—Orient signs toward the sidewalk to maintain the pedestrian oriented nature of the historic districts.

D. DESIGN

- i. *Inappropriate materials*—Do not use plastic, fiberglass, highly reflective materials that will be difficult to read, or other synthetic materials not historically used in the district.
- ii. *Appropriate materials*—Construct signs of durable materials used for signs during the period of the building's construction, such as wood, wrought iron, steel, aluminum, and metal grill work.
- iii. *Color*—Limit the number of colors used on a sign to three. Select a dark background with light lettering to make signs more legible.
- iv. *Typefaces*—Select letter styles and sizes that complement the overall character of the building façade. Avoid hard-to-read or overly intricate styles.

E. LIGHTING

- i. *Lighting sources*—Use only indirect or bare-bulb sources that do not produce glare to illuminate signs. All illumination shall be steady and stationary. Internal illumination should not be used.
- ii. *Neon lighting*—Incorporate neon lighting as an integral architectural element or artwork appropriate to the site, if used.

F. PROHIBITED SIGNS

i. An abbreviated list of the types of signs prohibited within San Antonio’s historic districts and on historic landmarks is provided below. Refer to UDC Section 35- 612(j) and Chapter 28 of the Municipal Code for more detailed information on prohibited signs.

- Billboards, junior billboards, portable signs, and advertising benches.
- Pole signs.
- Revolving signs or signs with a kinetic component.
- Roof mounted signs, except in the case of a contributing sign.
- Digital and/or LED lighted signs, not to include LED light sources that do not meet the definition of a sign.
- Moored balloons or other floating signs that are tethered to the ground or to a structure.
- Any sign which does not identify a business or service within the historic district or historic landmark.
- Any non-contributing sign which is abandoned or damaged beyond 50 percent of its replacement value, including parts of old or unused signs.
- Notwithstanding the above, signs designated as a contributing sign or structure by the historic preservation officer shall not be prohibited unless or until such designation is revoked.

4. Freestanding Signs

A. GENERAL

- i. *Appropriate usage*—Freestanding signs are most appropriate in locations where building forms are set back from the street, such as in areas where historic residences have been adapted for office or retail uses, or in commercial districts where they may be used to identify parking areas or other accessory uses.
- ii. *Placement*—Place freestanding signs near the public right-of-way where they are clearly visible to passing pedestrians and motorists, a minimum of five feet from the street right-of-way and ten feet from all interior side lot lines. No freestanding sign should be placed in a manner that obstructs the pedestrian walkway.
- iii. *Number*—Limit the number of freestanding signs per platted lot to one, unless the lot fronts more than one street, in which case, one sign is allowed on each street on which the lot has frontage.
- iv. *Monument signs*—Do not use “suburban-style” monument signs or electronic messaging signs not historically found in San Antonio’s historic districts.

B. DESIGN

- i. *Height*—Limit the height of freestanding signs to no more than six feet.
- ii. *Area*— The size of new signs should be appropriate within the historic context, and should not exceed 25 square feet on either side, for a total of 50 square feet. Appropriate size shall be determined by considering historic precedent, sign patterns within historic districts, and conditions specific to individual properties.
- iii. *Structural supports*—Use subtle structural elements (in terms of their scale and mass) with historically compatible materials to support a freestanding sign.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of the replacement of the existing sign with the following stipulations:

- i. That the proposed replacement sign feature a simpler massing, preferably with only one monument element.
- ii. That the proposed height be reduced to not exceed six (6) feet in height, per the Guidelines.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Tony Garcia opposed to case.

Motion: Commissioner Fish motioned to continue HDRC hearing due to missing applicant. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon,
Nays: NONE .
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES AND 0 NAY. 4 ABSENT

• **Item #A-4. HDRC NO. 2019-477**
ADDRESS: 849 E COMMERCE ST
APPLICANT: Ashley Schriedel/Alamo Sign Solutions

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct an elevated outdoor seating area.
2. Install one (1) set of internally illuminated channel letters to read “Bar & Grill” to feature 13’ – 1 1/16” in width and 1’ – 8” in height for a total size of approximately 19 square feet. The proposed sign will feature vinyl faces. This sign will be located within the existing arcade, facing the river lagoon.
3. Install one (1) set of internally illuminated channel letters to read “Landshark” to feature 22’ – 4 ¼” in width and 3’ – 0” inches in height for a total size of approximately 67 square feet. The proposed sign will feature vinyl faces. This sign will be located within the existing arcade, facing the river lagoon.
4. Install one (1) internally illuminated patio sign with internally illuminated channel letters to read “Landshark, Bar & Grill”. The proposed sign is to feature ten (10) feet in width and two (2) feet in height for a total size of twenty (20) square feet. The sign will be mounted on a proposed patio.
5. Install one (1) neon sign to read “Fins Up San Antonio” to feature 2’ – 8” in width and 1’ – 8” in height for a total size of approximately 4.4 square feet (This sign is prohibited per the UDC and is not to be considered).
6. Install one (1) internally illuminated, circular wall sign to read “Landshark Surfshack” to feature 7’ – 4” in width and 7’ – 6” in height for a total size of approximately 44 square feet.
7. Install one menu board in the form of a surf board adjacent to the primary entrance and a surf board light to feature signage.
8. Install one branded beach chair to feature signage that reads “Landshark San Antonio” at the public right of way.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Unified Development Code, Section 35-678 – Signs and Billboards in the RIO

UDC Section 35-678. – Signs and Billboards in the RIO

(a) General Provisions.

(1) This section governs all exterior signs and all interior signs hung within ten (10) feet of an exterior fenestration, or those signs intended to be read by exterior patrons.

A. All signage within an RIO district shall conform to all city codes and must have approval of the historic preservation officer prior to installation.

B. Permits must be obtained following approval of a certificate of appropriateness.

C. No sign shall be painted, constructed, erected, remodeled, refaced, relocated, expanded or otherwise altered until it has been approved and a permit has been obtained from the development services department in accordance with the provisions of this section and applicable city code.

D. Signs, visual displays or graphics shall advertise only the business on the premises unless otherwise allowed in this section.

E. Temporary displays for permitted events are authorized if in accordance with chapter 28 of the City Code of San Antonio, Texas.

(2) When reviewing applications for signage the historic preservation officer and the historic and design review commission shall consider the visual impact on nearby historic resources.

A. Signs should respect and respond to the environment and landmark or district character in which constructed.

B. Signs should respect and respond to the river improvement overlay districts character and the historic Riverwalk.

C. The content or advertising message carried by permitted signs shall pertain to the business located on the same premises as the sign or to any otherwise lawful noncommercial message that does not direct attention to a business operated for profit, or to a commodity or service for sale, provided that signs erected on buildings with multiple businesses within shall pertain to any such business within.

(3) For signs with changeable message panels, the changeable message area of the sign shall not exceed twenty-five (25) percent of the total sign area, except for gasoline price signs which shall not exceed seventy-five (75) percent of the total sign area. Electronic changeable message boards shall be prohibited.

(4) The name of a business may be changed through the administrative approval process if the sign conforms to the provisions of this section, and if the color, size, and style of lettering, and illumination of the sign remain the same.

(5) Provisions under this section shall comply with chapter 28 of the City Code of San Antonio, Texas. In cases where provisions under this section are stricter or a sign is designated as a contributing structure, then this section shall control.

(6) Special consideration should be given to the character of the sign itself proposed in the application, and whether the proposed sign has inherently historic characteristics which may fall outside of the guidelines presented below but which would contribute to the historic district, landmark or area for which it is being proposed. Additionally, when reviewing applications for signage the historic preservation officer and the historic and design review commission shall consider the visual impact on nearby historic resources.

(7) Memorials, markers, naming rights of public property, and recognition of charitable donations given to the City of San Antonio shall be additionally governed by any formal action passed by city council.

(b) Sign Definitions. For signage definitions, refer to subsection 35-612(b) and chapter 28 of the City Code.

(c) Standards for Sign Design and Placement. In considering whether to recommend approval or disapproval of an application to construct or alter signage on a building, object, site, or structure in a river improvement overlay district, review shall be guided by the following standards in addition to any specific design guidelines approved by city council.

(1) Primary sign design considerations shall be identification and legibility. Size, scale, height, color and location of signs shall be harmonious with, and properly related to, the overall character of the district and structure. Sign materials shall be compatible with that of the building facade. Highly reflective materials that will be difficult to read are not permitted.

(2) Signs which describe, point, or direct the reader to a specific place or along a specific course, such as "entrance," "exit," and "disabled persons access," as well as government signs, shall be reviewed but shall not be included in total allowable signage area. Emergency signs shall be exempt from historic and design review commission approval.

(3) All graphic elements shall reinforce the architectural integrity of any building. Signs shall not disfigure, damage, mar, alter, or conceal architectural features or details and shall be limited to sizes that are in scale with the architecture and the streetscape. Emblems and symbols of identification used as principal structural or architectural design elements on a facade shall not be included in the total allowable signage per facade per structure when approved. Review shall be guided by the building's proportion and scale when such elements are incorporated.

(4) Graphics and signage may be illuminated by indirect, internal, or bare-bulb sources, providing that glare is not produced; by indirect light sources concealed by a hood or diffuser; by internal illumination with standard opal glass or other translucent material or with an equal or smaller light transmission factor. All illumination shall be steady and stationary. Neon lighting shall be permitted when used as an integral architectural element or artwork appropriate to the site. For purposes of this subsection, "Glare" shall mean an illumination level of six (6) Lux or greater at the

property boundary. If internal illumination is used, it shall be designed to be subordinate to the overall building composition. Light fixtures should reflect the design period of the building on which they are placed. The use of ambient light from storefront or streetlights is encouraged.

(5) Signage requests for multi-tenant buildings must complement existing signage with regards to size, number,

placement and design, unless such existing signage is not in conformity with regulations in this article. It is recommended that the building owner or their agent develop a master signage plan or signage guidelines for the total building or property. If a property has an approved master signage plan on file with the historic preservation officer, then applications for signage may be approved administratively at the discretion of the historic preservation officer provided that they comply with such master signage plan. Notwithstanding the above, signs may not exceed the maximum size and height limitation of signage contained in chapter 28, article 9.

(d) Proportion of Signs. For all signage, signage width and height must be in proportion to the facade, respecting the size, scale and mass of the facade, building height, and rhythms and sizes of window and door openings. The building facade shall be considered as part of an overall sign program but the sign shall be subordinate to the overall building composition. Additionally, signs shall respect and respond to the character and/or period of the area in which they are being placed.

(e) Number and Size of Signs.

(1) Number and Size. The historic and design review commission shall be guided in its decisions by the total number of businesses or services per building and the percentage of visible storefront occupied by each business or service. Applicants may apply for up to three (3) signs total. Total signage for all applicants shall not exceed fifty (50) square feet unless additional signs and/or additional total footage is approved. Additional square footage may be approved provided that the additional signage is in conformity with, and does not interfere with, the pedestrian experience on the Riverwalk. The additional square footage shall be based upon the size and scope of the site. Signs should reflect the type and speed of traffic they are meant to attract. Signs designed for pedestrians and drivers of slow moving cars should not be the same size as signs designed for highway traffic.

(2) Sign Area. The sign area shall be determined in the following manner:

A. Sign Areas. The area of a sign shall be computed on the actual area of the sign. Sign area shall be calculated as the area within a parallelogram, triangle, circle, semicircle or other regular geometric figure including all letters, figures, graphics or other elements of the sign, together with the framework or background of the sign. The supporting framework of the sign shall not be included in determining sign area unless such supporting framework forms an integral part of the sign display, as determined by the historic preservation officer. If the sign is located on a decorative fence or wall, when such fence or wall otherwise meets these or other ordinances or regulations and is clearly incidental to the display itself, the fence or wall shall not be included in the sign area. In the cases of signs with more than one (1) sign face, including but not restricted to double-faced signs, back-to-back signs, overhanging signs, and projecting signs, each side of the sign shall be included in total allowable signage area.

B. Channel Letter Signs. For channel letter signs, the sign area shall be the smallest rectangle that will encompass the limits of the writing, including spaces between the letters. Each advertising message shall be considered separately.

(3) Building Identification Signs. An additional building identification sign may be placed on a building with multiple tenants, if the building name is not the same as the business(s) housed within and such sign is recommended

for approval by the historic and design review commission. This type of sign is to identify a building as a destination, shall not exceed thirty-two (32) square feet, shall not be included in the total allowable signage area, and shall not include names of individual businesses.

(4) Freestanding Signs. Freestanding signs are allowed provided the sign does not interfere with pedestrian or vehicular traffic. Freestanding signs shall be perpendicular to the street, two-sided and no taller than six (6) feet. Freestanding signs shall not be located in the right-of-way.

A. Projecting Arm Signs. Signs hung from poles are allowed. Pole height shall not exceed six (6) feet and the pole diameter shall not exceed three (3) inches. Blade signs are not allowed to project over a sidewalk or other right-of-way.

(f) Allowable Signs Not Included in the Total Signage Area.

(1) Parking lot signs identifying entrances and exits to a parking lot or driveway, but only when there is one-way traffic flow. No more than one (1) sign shall be permitted for each driveway entrance or exit, and no corporate or business logos shall be permitted. Additionally, parking lot signs to identify divisions of the parking lot into sections and to control vehicular traffic and pedestrian traffic within the lot provided that no corporate or business

logos shall be permitted. Signs approved under this category shall not be included in the total allowable signage per structure.

(2) Dates of erection, monumental citations, commemorative tablets, insignia of local, state or federal government, and like when carved into stone, concrete or similar material or made of bronze, aluminum or other permanent type construction and made an integral part of the structure. Signs approved under this category shall not be included in the total allowable signage per structure.

(3) Information signs of a public or quasi-public nature identifying or locating a hospital, public building, college, publicly-owned parking area, historic area, major tourist attraction or similar public or quasi-public activity; and also including signs identifying restrooms or other facilities relating to such places or activities. Signs approved under this category shall not be included in the total allowable signage per structure.

(4) Incidental signs, including signs designating business hours, street numbers, credit card acceptance and the like provided that the signs are not freestanding, the total of all such signs shall not exceed four (4) square feet for each business, and the signs are non-illuminated. Incidental signs shall not be included in the total allowable signage per structure.

(5) Real estate signs, advertising the sale, rental or lease of the premises or part of the premises on which the signs are displayed. The maximum sign area shall be eight (8) square feet. Only one (1) sign will be permitted for each building for sale or lease that is adjacent to the Riverwalk. The sign is permitted to remain only while that particular building is for sale or the lease space is available.

(k) Prohibited Signs. The following signs are prohibited:

(1) Billboards, junior billboards, portable signs, and advertising benches;

(2) Any sign placed upon a building, object, site, or structure in any manner so as to disfigure, damage, or conceal any

window opening, door, or significant architectural feature or detail of any building;

(3) Any sign or sign spinner which advertises commercial off-premises businesses, products, activities, services, or events unless otherwise allowed in this article;

(4) Any sign which does not identify a business or service within the river improvement overlay district unless otherwise allowed in this article;

(5) Any non-contributing sign which is abandoned or damaged beyond fifty (50) percent of its replacement value, including parts of old or unused signs. All remnants such as supports, brackets and braces must also be removed;

(6) Any attachment to an already affixed sign which does not meet the provisions of the City Code;

(7) Roof mounted signs, except in the cases of landmark signs or unless approved in accordance with standards set forth in subsections (b) and (c) of this section. Contributing roof mounted signs may be resurfaced with an approved certificate of appropriateness. The square footage of roof mounted signs shall be included in the total allowable signage for the building;

(8) Pole-mounted cabinet signs and pylon signs;

(9) Digital displays, digital and/or LED lighted signs, not to include LED light sources that do not meet the definition of a sign, with or without rotating, flashing lettering, icons or images.

Except as provided below:

A. A public transportation agency may incorporate transit information signage into transit shelters, utilizing LED or digital technology, provided the signage is contained within or under the transit shelter, and is limited to five

(5) square feet of signage area, and one (1) sign per thirty (30) linear feet of pedestrian shelter.

B. A public transportation agency may incorporate transit information signage into a monument sign at transit stops, utilizing LED or digital technology, provided it is limited to five (5) square feet of signage area.

C. A public transportation agency may incorporate transit information signage into a monument sign at transit facilities (other than transit stops), utilizing LED or digital technology, provided it is limited to seven (7) square feet of signage area.

D. The historic preservation officer may impose additional restrictions on illumination to ensure that the character of signs are harmonious with the character of the structures on which they are to be placed and

designated landmarks or districts in the area, provided that such restrictions are reasonably related to other conforming signs and conforming structures in the area, do not unreasonably restrict the amount of signage allowed by this section, and are in keeping with the intent of this section. Among other things, consideration shall be given to the location and illumination of the sign in relation to the surrounding buildings, the use of appropriate materials, the size and style of lettering and graphics, and the type of lighting proposed.

E. Digital displays, digital and/or LED lighted signs are authorized in conjunction with a temporary display for a permitted event if in accordance with chapter 28 of the City Code of San Antonio, Texas.

(10) Revolving signs or signs with a moving component.

(11) Any sandwich board which conflicts with the Americans with Disabilities Act, or which disrupts or interferes with pedestrian or other traffic.

(12) Any sign that obscures a sign display by a public authority for the purpose of giving instructions or directions or other public information.

(13) Any sign which consists of pennants, ribbons, spinners or other similar moving devices.

(14) Any sign, except official notices and advertisements, which is nailed, tacked, posted or in any other manner attached to any utility pole or structure or supporting wire, cable, or pipe; or to any tree on any street or sidewalk or to public property of any description.

(15) Moored balloons, wind jammers or other floating or inflated signs that are tethered to the ground or to a structure.

(16) Any permanent or temporary sign affixed to, painted on, or placed in or upon any parked vehicle, parked trailer or other parked device capable of being towed, which is parked so as to advertise the business to the passing motorist or pedestrian; and whose primary purpose is to provide additional on-site signage or is to serve the function of an outdoor advertising sign. Excluded from this are vehicles or equipment that are in operating condition, currently registered and licensed to operate on public streets with a valid inspection sticker, and actively used in the daily function of the business to which such signs relate; vehicles/equipment engaged in active construction projects; vehicles or equipment offered for rent to the general public and stored on-premises and otherwise allowed under applicable city ordinance. Notwithstanding the above, signs designated as a contributing sign or structure.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

1. Staff recommends approval of item number #1, the construction of a patio with the following stipulations:

- i. That all signage be eliminated from the patio.
- ii. That the patio feature stone cladding to match that of the existing river/lagoon level elements.

2. – 6. Staff does not recommend approval of item #2 through #6, signage, based on findings d through h. Staff recommends that the applicant install one (1) sign featuring reverse lit channel letters that does not exceed eight (8) square feet.

7 – 8. Staff recommends approval of items #7 and #8 with the following stipulations:

- i. That the proposed menu board be installed in a 2'x2' case and not feature any signage or branding.
- ii. That the proposed overhead light be installed within the arcade and not feature any signage.

9. Staff does not recommend approval of item #9, the installation of a beach chair at the right of way based on finding j.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to reset to Sept. 18th hearing and to continue with HDRC hearing due to missing applicant. Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: **Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.**
Nay: **None.**
Absent: **Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.**

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

INDIVIDUAL CONSIDERATION AGENDA B ITEMS

• **Item # B-5. HDRC NO. 2019-479**

ADDRESS: 831 BURLESON ST

APPLICANT: Dianet Lopez Daniel/Delafield Investments, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant has requested a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. FRONT: Extend the existing front porch to the corner of the side addition featuring a rounded corner.
2. WEST SIDE: Remove two (2) windows and a door to install new door.
3. FENCE: Install a front yard wood picket fence.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. *Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.

ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.

iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.

ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials.

Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.

iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.

iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.

v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

5. Guidelines for Site Elements

2. Fences and Walls

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.

iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items 1 through 3 based on findings b through e with the following stipulations:

- i. That the new side door feature a matching frame and a simple 6-panel configuration or a style that relates to the historic structure
- ii. A site plan with the proposed fence line should be submitted to staff prior to final approval.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion postpone application due to missing applicant.
Commissioner Bowman seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: **Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.**
Nay: **None.**
Absent: **Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.**

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

• **Item #B-8. HDRC NO. 2019-422**

ADDRESS: 214 LOTUS ST

APPLICANT: Office of Hiostoric Preservation- Jose Gallegos representing Owner.

REQUEST:

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting a finding of historic significance for the property located at 1622 W Huisache.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Unified Development Code Sec. 35-606. - Designation Process for Historic Landmarks.

a. **Authority.** Requests for landmark designation may only be made by or with the concurrence of the property owner. In instances where a property owner does not consent to the landmark designation, the historic preservation officer shall request a resolution from city council to proceed with the designation process prior to any zoning commission hearing. Notwithstanding the foregoing, a request for landmark designation may be made and approved by the city council. To the extent that this subsection conflicts with any other provisions of this chapter, this paragraph shall control except for buildings, objects, sites, structures, or clusters heretofore designated as local landmarks or districts, National Register landmarks or districts, state historic landmarks or sites, or state archaeological landmarks or sites. Additionally, requests for designation shall be made on a form obtained from the city historic preservation officer through the office of historic preservation. Completed request forms shall be returned to the office of historic preservation for processing. All buildings, objects, sites, structures, or clusters heretofore designated by the city council as historic landmarks under any pre-existing ordinance of the City of San Antonio shall be accorded the protection of properties designated historic landmarks under this chapter and shall continue to bear the words "historic, exceptional" (HE) or "historic, significant" (HS) in their zoning designation.

b. Designation of Historic Landmarks.

1. **Initiation.** Any person, the historic and design review commission, zoning commission, the historic preservation officer, or the city council may initiate a historic landmark designation by filing an application with the historic preservation officer. Requests for designation shall be made on a form obtained from the city historic preservation officer. Completed request forms shall be returned to the office of historic preservation for processing. Owner consent for historic landmark designation shall be required unless a city council resolution to proceed with the designation has been approved. Additionally, owners may submit with the application a written description and photographs or other visual material of any buildings or structures that they wish to be considered for designation as non-contributing to the historic landmark.

2. **Decision.** The historic preservation officer shall refer a completed application for historic landmark designation to the historic and design review commission. Property owners of proposed historic landmarks shall be notified of the historic and design review commission hearing by the historic preservation officer by mail prior to a historic and design review commission hearing for historic landmark designation. Notice to property owners shall state the place, date, time and purpose of the historic and design review commission hearing. The historic preservation officer shall also send notice of the meeting to any registered neighborhood associations located within the proposed district boundary. The historic and design review commission shall

make and forward its recommendation to the zoning commission within forty-five (45) days from the date of submittal of the designation request by the historic preservation officer. Upon submittal of the historic and design review commission's recommendation, the proposed historic district or landmark designation shall be submitted to the zoning commission for its review recommendations along with its finding of historic significance. The zoning commission and the city council shall process the application as prescribed in section 35-421 of this chapter and this section. The zoning commission shall schedule a hearing on the historic and design review commission recommendation to be held within sixty (60) days of receipt of such recommendation and shall forward its recommendation to city council which shall schedule a hearing to be held within sixty (60) days of council's receipt of such recommendation. Upon passage of any ordinance designating a historic landmark, or removing or upgrading the designation of historic, the city clerk shall send notice of the fact by mail to the owner or owners of affected property.

Unified Development Code Sec. 35-607. – Designation Criteria for Historic Districts and Landmarks.

a. Process for Considering Designation of Historic Districts and Landmarks. Historic districts and landmarks shall be evaluated for designation using the criteria listed in subsection (b) and the criteria applied to evaluate properties for inclusion in the National Register. In order to be eligible for historic landmark designation, properties shall meet at least three (3) of the criteria listed. Historic districts shall consist of at least two (2) or more structures within a legally defined boundary that meet at least three (3) of the criteria. Additionally, all designated landmarks and districts shall demonstrate clear delineation of the legal boundaries of such designated resources.

b. Criteria for Evaluation.

- 5. Its embodiment of distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style valuable for the study of a period, type, method of construction, or use of indigenous materials;**
- 8. Its historical, architectural, or cultural integrity of location, design, materials, and workmanship;**
- 13. It bears an important and significant relationship to other distinctive structures, sites, or areas, either as an important collection of properties or architectural style or craftsmanship with few intrusions, or by contributing to the overall character of the area according to the plan based on architectural, historic or cultural motif.**

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of a finding of historic significance and that the Historic and Design Review Commission should recommend approval for the landmark designation of 214 Lotus St to the Zoning Commission and to the City Council based on findings a through g.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Virginia VanCleave and Cherise Rahr-Allegrini in support.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve application. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: **Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.**
Nay: **None.**
Absent: **Fernsnde, Harris , Connor Bowman.**

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS.4 ABSENT**

- **Item #B-9. HDRC NO. 2019-480**
ADDRESS: 415 N MESQUITE ST/105, 107, 109, 111 and 113 BROWN STREET
APPLICANT: MICHAEL PEREZ/MP2 URBAN DEVELOPMENT LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct five, multi-story residential structures on the vacant lots addressed as 105, 107, 109, 111 and 113 Brown Street and 415 N Mesquite Street, located within the Dignowity Hill Historic District. The lots are bounded by Brown Street to the south, N Mesquite to the east, and Brown Alley to the north. Each of the proposed structures will feature between approximately twenty-nine (29) and thirty-two (32) feet in height. The applicant has also proposed the construction of an open air carport to the north of Brown Alley.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 4, Guidelines for New Construction

1. Building and Entrance Orientation

A. FAÇADE ORIENTATION

i. *Setbacks*—Align front facades of new buildings with front facades of adjacent buildings where a consistent setback has been established along the street frontage. Use the median setback of buildings along the street frontage where a variety of setbacks exist. Refer to UDC Article 3, Division 2. Base Zoning Districts for applicable setback requirements.

ii. *Orientation*—Orient the front façade of new buildings to be consistent with the predominant orientation of historic buildings along the street frontage.

B. ENTRANCES

i. *Orientation*—Orient primary building entrances, porches, and landings to be consistent with those historically found along the street frontage. Typically, historic building entrances are oriented towards the primary street.

2. Building Massing and Form

A. SCALE AND MASS

i. *Similar height and scale*—Design new construction so that its height and overall scale are consistent with nearby historic buildings. In residential districts, the height and scale of new construction should not exceed that of the majority of historic buildings by more than one-story. In commercial districts, building height shall conform to the established pattern. If there is no more than a 50% variation in the scale of buildings on the adjacent block faces, then the height of the new building shall not exceed the tallest building on the adjacent block face by more than 10%.

ii. *Transitions*—Utilize step-downs in building height, wall-plane offsets, and other variations in building massing to provide a visual transition when the height of new construction exceeds that of adjacent historic buildings by more than one-half story.

iii. *Foundation and floor heights*—Align foundation and floor-to-floor heights (including porches and balconies) within one foot of floor-to-floor heights on adjacent historic structures.

B. ROOF FORM

i. *Similar roof forms*—Incorporate roof forms—pitch, overhangs, and orientation—that are consistent with those predominantly found on the block. Roof forms on residential building types are typically sloped, while roof forms on nonresidential building types are more typically flat and screened by an ornamental parapet wall.

ii. *Façade configuration*—The primary façade of new commercial buildings should be in keeping with established patterns. Maintaining horizontal elements within adjacent cap, middle, and base precedents will establish a consistent street wall through the alignment of horizontal parts. Avoid blank walls, particularly on elevations visible from the street. No new façade should exceed 40 linear feet without being penetrated by windows, entryways, or other defined bays.

D. LOT COVERAGE

i. *Building to lot ratio*—New construction should be consistent with adjacent historic buildings in terms of the building to lot ratio. Limit the building footprint for new construction to no more than 50 percent of the total lot area, unless adjacent historic buildings establish a precedent with a greater building to lot ratio.

3. Materials and Textures

A. NEW MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that complement the type, color, and texture of materials traditionally found in the district. Materials should not be so dissimilar as to distract from the historic interpretation of the

district. For example, corrugated metal siding would not be appropriate for a new structure in a district comprised of homes with wood siding.

ii. *Alternative use of traditional materials*—Consider using traditional materials, such as wood siding, in a new way to provide visual interest in new construction while still ensuring compatibility.

iii. *Roof materials*—Select roof materials that are similar in terms of form, color, and texture to traditionally used in the district.

iv. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alterations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

v. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use vinyl siding, plastic, or corrugated metal sheeting. Contemporary materials not traditionally used in the district, such as brick or simulated stone veneer and Hardie Board or other fiberboard siding, may be appropriate for new construction in some locations as long as new materials are visually similar to the traditional material in dimension, finish, and texture. EIFS is not recommended as a substitute for actual stucco.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design new buildings to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. While new construction should not attempt to mirror or replicate historic features, new structures should not be so dissimilar as to distract from or diminish the historic interpretation of the district.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the predominant architectural style along the block face or within the district when one exists. Details should be simple in design and should complement, but not visually compete with, the character of the adjacent historic structures or other historic structures within the district. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found within the district are inappropriate.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for new construction. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the structure is new. Modern materials should be implemented in a way that does not distract from the historic structure.

5. Garages and Outbuildings

A. DESIGN AND CHARACTER

v. *Garage doors*—Incorporate garage doors with similar proportions and materials as those traditionally found in the district.

6. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way.

B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.

ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.

iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.

iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.

v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.

ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.

iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.

iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.

v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

i. *Impervious surfaces*—Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.

ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

- i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.
- ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.
- iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.
- iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.
- v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

- i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.
- ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

- i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.
- ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.
- iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

- i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.
- ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.
- iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a through w. Staff finds that the applicant has not yet addressed all stipulations of conceptual approval, and that the proposed scale and character are inconsistent with the Guidelines. Staff recommends that the applicant address the following items prior to receiving a recommendation for approval:

- i. That the applicant propose alternatives to the attached garages to allow for their removal, such as the reduction of a residential structure. Attached garages are not found historically within the district and are not consistent with the Guidelines.
- ii. That the applicant continue to reduce the height of the proposed structure on N Mesquite to reduce its height adjacent to the historic, one story residential structure located at 413 N Mesquite as noted in finding k.
- iii. That the applicant either separate the middle structure, or proposed additional architectural elements that will reduce its perceived width as noted in finding j.

- iv. That the applicant incorporate additional windows that feature traditional profiles in place of square, fixed windows and that the applicant add fenestration to all outward facing facades as noted in finding n.
- v. That all fiber cement siding a feature four (4) inch exposure, a thickness of 3/4", mitered corners and a smooth finish. All board and batten siding should feature boards than are twelve inches in width and battens that are 1 -1/2" in width. The proposed standing seam metal roofs shall feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches in height, crimped ridge seams and a low profile ridge cap. An industrial ridge cap is not be used. The applicant shall submit specifications for all materials that are proposed prior to retuning for final approval.
- vi. That a double-hung, one-over-one wood windows or aluminum-clad wood windows be used. Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25" and stiles no wider than 2.25". White manufacturer's color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- vii. That the applicant modify various architectural details, including column proportions on both the residential structures and detached carport as noted in finding r.
- viii. That the applicant incorporate additional landscaping elements into the proposed site as noted in finding w.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Virginia VanCleave, Monica Savino, William Carson opposed to case.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to postpone decision in order for applicant to address the concerns to the commission. Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: **Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.**
Nay: **None.**
Absent: **Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.**

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

- **Item #B-11. HDRC NO. 2019-491**
ADDRESS: 525, 527 E HUISACHE AVE
APPLICANT: David Bogle/SYNCRO Studio

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Replace two existing casement windows with new composite sliding windows.
2. Install two new composite sliding windows on the west and east façade of the primary structure.
3. Install rounded skylights on the primary structure.
4. Construct a rear addition totaling approximately 860 square feet.
5. Perform hardscaping modifications, including the installation of a rear concrete parking pad, rear concrete walkway, and two rear porch slabs. The total added impervious coverage will measure approximately 850 square feet.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

1. Materials: Woodwork
 - A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Inspections*—Conduct semi-annual inspections of all exterior wood elements to verify condition and determine maintenance needs.
- ii. *Cleaning*—Clean exterior surfaces annually with mild household cleaners and water. Avoid using high pressure power washing and any abrasive cleaning or striping methods that can damage the historic wood siding and detailing.
- iii. *Paint preparation*—Remove peeling, flaking, or failing paint surfaces from historic woodwork using the gentlest means possible to protect the integrity of the historic wood surface. Acceptable methods for paint removal include scraping and sanding, thermal removal, and when necessary, mild chemical strippers. Sand blasting and water blasting should never be used to remove paint from any surface. Sand only to the next sound level of paint, not all the way to the wood, and address any moisture and deterioration issues before repainting.
- iv. *Repainting*—Paint once the surface is clean and dry using a paint type that will adhere to the surface properly. See General Paint Type Recommendations in Preservation Brief #10 listed under Additional Resources for more information.
- v. *Repair*—Repair deteriorated areas or refasten loose elements with an exterior wood filler, epoxy, or glue.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Façade materials*—Avoid removing materials that are in good condition or that can be repaired in place. Consider exposing original wood siding if it is currently covered with vinyl or aluminum siding, stucco, or other materials that have not achieved historic significance.
- ii. *Materials*—Use in-kind materials when possible or materials similar in size, scale, and character when exterior woodwork is beyond repair. Ensure replacement siding is installed to match the original pattern, including exposures. Do not introduce modern materials that can accelerate and hide deterioration of historic materials. Hardiboard and other cementitious materials are not recommended.
- iii. *Replacement elements*—Replace wood elements in-kind as a replacement for existing wood siding, matching in profile, dimensions, material, and finish, when beyond repair.

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.

- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

7. Architectural Features: Porches, Balconies, and Porte-Cocheres

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres*—Preserve porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres. Do not add new porches, balconies, or porte-cocheres where not historically present.
- ii. *Balusters*—Preserve existing balusters. When replacement is necessary, replace in-kind when possible or with balusters that match the originals in terms of materials, spacing, profile, dimension, finish, and height of the railing.
- iii. *Floors*—Preserve original wood or concrete porch floors. Do not cover original porch floors of wood or concrete with carpet, tile, or other materials unless they were used historically.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Front porches*—Refrain from enclosing front porches. Approved screen panels should be simple in design as to not change the character of the structure or the historic fabric.
- ii. *Side and rear porches*—Refrain from enclosing side and rear porches, particularly when connected to the main porch or balcony. Original architectural details should not be obscured by any screening or enclosure materials. Alterations to side and rear porches should result in a space that functions, and is visually interpreted as, a porch.
- iii. *Replacement*—Replace in-kind porches, balconies, porte-cocheres, and related elements, such as ceilings, floors, and columns, when such features are deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, the design should be compatible in scale, massing, and detail while materials should match in color, texture, dimensions, and finish.
- iv. *Adding elements*—Design replacement elements, such as stairs, to be simple so as to not distract from the historic character of the building. Do not add new elements and details that create a false historic appearance.
- v. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct porches, balconies, and porte-cocheres based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns.

12. Increasing Energy Efficiency

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Historic elements*—Preserve elements of historic buildings that are energy efficient including awnings, porches, recessed entryways, overhangs, operable windows, and shutters.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Weatherization*—Apply caulking and weather stripping to historic windows and doors to make them weather tight.
- ii. *Thermal performance*—Improve thermal performance of windows, fanlights, and sidelights by applying UV film or new glazing that reduces heat gain from sunlight on south and west facing facades only if the historic character can be maintained. Do not use reflective or tinted films.
- iii. *Windows*—Restore original windows to working order. Install compatible and energy-efficient replacement windows when existing windows are deteriorated beyond repair. Replacement windows must match the appearance, materials, size, design, proportion, and profile of the original historic windows.
- iv. *Reopening*—Consider reopening an original opening that is presently blocked to add natural light and ventilation.
- v. *Insulation*—Insulate unfinished spaces with appropriate insulation ensuring proper ventilation, such as attics, basements, and crawl spaces.

- vi. *Shutters*—Reinstall functional shutters and awnings with elements similar in size and character where they existed historically.
 - vii. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency.
 - viii. *Cool roofs*—Do not install white or —cool roofs when visible from the public right-of-way. White roofs are permitted on flat roofs and must be concealed with a parapet.
 - ix. *Roof vents*—Add roof vents for ventilation of attic heat. Locate new roof vents on rear roof pitches, out of view of the public right-of-way.
 - x. *Green Roofs*—Install green roofs when they are appropriate for historic commercial structures.
- Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. *Height*—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

- i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.
- ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.
- iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

- i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

5. Mechanical Equipment and Roof Appurtenances

A. LOCATION AND SITING

i. *Visibility*—Do not locate utility boxes, air conditioners, rooftop mechanical equipment, skylights, satellite dishes, cable lines, and other roof appurtenances on primary facades, front-facing roof slopes, in front yards, or in other locations that are clearly visible from the public right-of-way.

ii. *Service Areas*—Locate service areas towards the rear of the site to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Where service areas cannot be located at the rear of the property, compatible screens or buffers will be required.

B. SCREENING

i. *Building-mounted equipment*—Paint devices mounted on secondary facades and other exposed hardware, frames, and piping to match the color scheme of the primary structure or screen them with landscaping.

ii. *Freestanding equipment*—Screen service areas, air conditioning units, and other mechanical equipment from public view using a fence, hedge, or other enclosure.

iii. *Roof-mounted equipment*—Screen and set back devices mounted on the roof to avoid view from public right-of-way.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

1. Topography

A. TOPOGRAPHIC FEATURES

i. *Historic topography*—Avoid significantly altering the topography of a property (i.e., extensive grading). Do not alter character-defining features such as berms or sloped front lawns that help define the character of the public right-of-way. Maintain the established lawn to help prevent erosion. If turf is replaced over time, new plant materials in these areas should be low-growing and suitable for the prevention of erosion.

ii. *New construction*—Match the historic topography of adjacent lots prevalent along the block face for new construction. Do not excavate raised lots to accommodate additional building height or an additional story for new construction.

iii. *New elements*—Minimize changes in topography resulting from new elements, like driveways and walkways, through appropriate siting and design. New site elements should work with, rather than change, character-defining topography when possible.

2. Fences and Walls

A. HISTORIC FENCES AND WALLS

i. *Preserve*—Retain historic fences and walls.

ii. *Repair and replacement*—Replace only deteriorated sections that are beyond repair. Match replacement materials (including mortar) to the color, texture, size, profile, and finish of the original.

iii. *Application of paint and cementitious coatings*—Do not paint historic masonry walls or cover them with stone facing or stucco or other cementitious coatings.

B. NEW FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Design*—New fences and walls should appear similar to those used historically within the district in terms of their scale, transparency, and character. Design of fence should respond to the design and materials of the house or main structure.
- ii. *Location*—Avoid installing a fence or wall in a location where one did not historically exist, particularly within the front yard. The appropriateness of a front yard fence or wall is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences or wall should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them.
- iii. *Height*—Limit the height of new fences and walls within the front yard to a maximum of four feet. The appropriateness of a front yard fence is dependent on conditions within a specific historic district. New front yard fences should not be introduced within historic districts that have not historically had them. If a taller fence or wall existed historically, additional height may be considered. The height of a new retaining wall should not exceed the height of the slope it retains.
- iv. *Prohibited materials*—Do not use exposed concrete masonry units (CMU), Keystone or similar interlocking retaining wall systems, concrete block, vinyl fencing, or chain link fencing.
- v. *Appropriate materials*—Construct new fences or walls of materials similar to fence materials historically used in the district. Select materials that are similar in scale, texture, color, and form as those historically used in the district, and that are compatible with the main structure. Screening incompatible uses—Review alternative fence heights and materials for appropriateness where residential properties are adjacent to commercial or other potentially incompatible uses.

C. PRIVACY FENCES AND WALLS

- i. *Relationship to front facade*—Set privacy fences back from the front façade of the building, rather than aligning them with the front façade of the structure to reduce their visual prominence.
- ii. *Location* – Do not use privacy fences in front yards.

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

- i. *Historic Gardens*— Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.
- ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.
- iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.
- iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.
- v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

- i. *Impervious surfaces* —Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.
- ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.
- iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

C. MULCH

Organic mulch – Organic mulch should not be used as a wholesale replacement for plant material. Organic mulch with appropriate plantings should be incorporated in areas where appropriate such as beneath a tree canopy.

i. *Inorganic mulch* – Inorganic mulch should not be used in highly-visible areas and should never be used as a wholesale replacement for plant material. Inorganic mulch with appropriate plantings should be incorporated in areas where appropriate such as along a foundation wall where moisture retention is discouraged.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

iii. *Maintenance* – Proper pruning encourages healthy growth and can extend the lifespan of trees. Avoid unnecessary or harmful pruning. A certified, licensed arborist is recommended for the pruning of mature trees and heritage trees.

4. Residential Streetscapes

A. PLANTING STRIPS

i. *Street trees*—Protect and encourage healthy street trees in planting strips. Replace damaged or dead trees with trees of a similar species, size, and growth habit as recommended by the City Arborist.

ii. *Lawns*—Maintain the use of traditional lawn in planting strips or low plantings where a consistent pattern has been retained along the block frontage. If mulch or gravel beds are used, low-growing plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Alternative materials*—Do not introduce impervious hardscape, raised planting beds, or other materials into planting strips where they were not historically found.

B. PARKWAYS AND PLANTED MEDIANS

i. *Historic plantings*—Maintain the park-like character of historic parkways and planted medians by preserving mature vegetation and retaining historic design elements. Replace damaged or dead plant materials with species of a like size, growth habit, and ornamental characteristics.

ii. *Hardscape*—Do not introduce new pavers, concrete, or other hardscape materials into parkways and planted medians where they were not historically found.

C. STREET ELEMENTS

i. *Site elements*—Preserve historic street lights, street markers, roundabouts, and other unique site elements found within the public right-of-way as street improvements and other public works projects are completed over time.

ii. *Historic paving materials*—Retain historic paving materials, such as brick pavers or colored paving, within the public right-of-way and repair in place with like materials.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*—Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site.

Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

C. CURBING

i. *Historic curbing*—Retain historic curbing wherever possible. Historic curbing in San Antonio is typically constructed of concrete with a curved or angular profile.

ii. *Replacement curbing*—Replace curbing in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. Where in-kind replacement is not be feasible, use a comparable substitute that duplicates the color, texture, durability, and profile of the original. Retaining walls and curbing should not be added to the sidewalk design unless absolutely necessary.

7. Off-Street Parking

A. LOCATION

i. *Preferred location*—Place parking areas for non-residential and mixed-use structures at the rear of the site, behind primary structures to hide them from the public right-of-way. On corner lots, place parking areas behind the primary structure and set them back as far as possible from the side streets. Parking areas to the side of the primary structure are acceptable when location behind the structure is not feasible. See UDC Section 35-310 for district-specific standards.

ii. *Front*—Do not add off-street parking areas within the front yard setback as to not disrupt the continuity of the streetscape.

iii. *Access*—Design off-street parking areas to be accessed from alleys or secondary streets rather than from principal streets whenever possible.

B. DESIGN

i. *Screening*—Screen off-street parking areas with a landscape buffer, wall, or ornamental fence two to four feet high—or a combination of these methods. Landscape buffers are preferred due to their ability to absorb carbon dioxide. See UDC Section 35-510 for buffer requirements.

ii. *Materials*—Use permeable parking surfaces when possible to reduce run-off and flooding. See UDC Section 35-526(j) for specific standards.

iii. *Parking structures*—Design new parking structures to be similar in scale, materials, and rhythm of the surrounding historic district when new parking structures are necessary.

OHP Window Policy Document

Recommended stipulations for replacement: Individual sashes should be replaced where possible. Should a full window unit require replacement, inserts should

- Match the original materials;
- Maintain the original dimension and profile;
- Feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements;
- Maintain the original appearance of window trim or sill detail.

Windows used in new construction should:

- Maintain traditional dimensions and profiles;
- Be recessed within the window frame. Windows with a nailing strip are not recommended;
- Feature traditional materials or appearance. Wood windows are most appropriate. Double-hung, block frame windows that feature alternative materials may be considered on a case-by-case basis;
- Feature traditional trim and sill details. Paired windows should be separated by a wood mullion. The use of low-e glass is appropriate in new construction provided that hue and reflectivity are not drastically different from regular glass.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff does not recommend approval of the replacement of the casement windows based on finding d.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the installation of the new windows on the primary structure based on finding e with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant proposes windows that meet the following stipulations: meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

Item 3, Staff does not recommend the installation of rounded skylights on the primary structure based on finding f.

Item 4, Staff recommends approval of the rear addition based on findings with the following stipulations:

- ii. That the applicant proposes vertical windows on the addition in lieu of the proposed horizontal windows as noted in finding l. The applicant is required to submit updated elevation drawings and specifications to staff for review and approval prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness. The windows should comply with the following specifications: meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25” and stiles no wider than 2.25”. White manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff. There should be a minimum of two inches in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness. Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate sill detail. Window track components must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.

- iii. That the board and batten siding features boards that are twelve (12) inches wide with battens that are 1 – ½” wide.

Item 5, Staff recommends approval of the hardscaping and landscaping modifications based on findings r through t.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Tony Garcia.

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to approve items 1 and 2 as proposed. Deny item 3 so applicant can work with staff to determine height, approve item 4 with stipulation 3, and approve item 5. Commissioner Velasquez seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

• **Item #B-12. HDRC NO. 2019-484**
APPLICANT: 2054 W MULBERRY AVE
ADDRESS: Office of Historic Preservation

REQUEST:

The Office of Historic Preservation is requesting a recommendation to the Building Standards Board (BSB) for the demolition of the rear accessory structure at 2054 W Mulberry.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

UDC Section 35-614 Demolition.

Demolition of a historic landmark constitutes an irreplaceable loss to the quality and character of the City of San Antonio. Accordingly, these procedures provide criteria to prevent unnecessary damage to the quality and character of the city's historic districts and character while, at the same time, balancing these interests against

the property rights of landowners.

a. Applicability. The provisions of this section apply to any application for demolition of a historic landmark (including those previously designated as historic exceptional or historic significant) or a historic district.

(3) Property Located in Historic District and Contributing to District Although Not Designated a Landmark. No certificate shall be issued for property located in a historic district and contributing to the district although not designated a landmark unless the applicant demonstrates clear and convincing evidence supporting an unreasonable economic hardship on the applicant if the application for a certificate is disapproved. When an applicant fails to prove unreasonable economic hardship in such cases, the applicant may provide additional information regarding loss of significance as provided in subsection (c)(3) in order to receive a certificate for demolition of the property.

Sec. 35-615. - Prevention of Demolition by Neglect.

(a) Applicability. In keeping with the city's minimum housing standards, the owner, or other person having legal custody and control of a designated historic landmark or structure in a local historic district shall preserve the historic landmark or structure against decay and deterioration and shall keep it free from any of the following defects:

- (1) Parts which are improperly or inadequately attached so that they may fall and injure persons or property;
- (2) Deteriorated or inadequate foundation;
- (3) Defective or deteriorated floor supports or floor supports that are insufficient to carry the loads imposed safely;
- (4) Walls, partitions, or other vertical supports that split, lean, list, or buckle due to defect or deterioration or are insufficient to carry the loads imposed safely;
- (5) Ceilings, roofs, ceiling or roof supports, or other horizontal members which sag, split, or buckle due to defect or deterioration or are insufficient to support the loads imposed safely;
- (6) Fireplaces and chimneys which list, bulge, or settle due to defect or deterioration or are of insufficient size or strength to carry the loads imposed safely;
- (7) Deteriorated, crumbling, or loose exterior stucco or mortar, rock, brick, or siding;
- (8) Broken, missing, or rotted roofing materials or roof components, window glass, sashes, or frames, or exterior doors or door frames; or
- (9) Any fault, defect, or condition in the structure which renders it Structurally unsafe or not properly watertight.

(b) Compliance. The owner or other person having legal custody and control of a designated historic landmark or structure in a local historic district shall, in keeping with the city's minimum housing standards, repair the landmark or structure if it is found to have any of the defects listed in subsection (a) of this section. In addition, the owner or other person having legal custody and control of a historic landmark or a building, object, site, or structure located in a historic district shall keep all property, including vacant property, clear of all weeds, fallen trees or limbs, debris, abandoned vehicles, and all other refuse as specified under the city's minimum housing codes and ordinances.

(c) Enforcement.

(1) The historic preservation officer and the historic and design review commission are authorized to work with a property owner to encourage maintenance and stabilization of the structure and identify resources available before taking enforcement action under this section.

(2) The historic and design review commission, on its own initiative, or the historic preservation officer may file a petition with code compliance requesting that the city proceed under the public safety and housing ordinance to require correction of defects or repairs to any structure covered by subsection (a) above so that such structure shall be preserved and protected in accordance with the purposes of this article and the public safety and housing ordinance.

(3) Penalties.

(i) A person may not violate a requirement of this article. Pursuant to Section 214.0015 (Additional Authority Regarding Substandard Buildings) of the Texas Local Government Code, a person who violates a requirement of this article commits a civil offense, and is civilly liable to the City of San Antonio in an amount not to exceed one thousand dollars (\$1,000.00) per day for each violation or an amount not to exceed ten dollars (\$10.00) per day

for each violation if the property is the owner's lawful homestead. The City of San Antonio may by order assess and recover any such civil penalties against a property owner at the time of an administrative hearing regarding the violations provided the property owner was notified of the requirements of the ordinance and the owner's need to comply with the requirements and, after notification, the property owner committed an act in violation of the ordinance or failed to take an action necessary for compliance with the ordinance. The city clerk shall file with the district clerk of Bexar County a certified copy of any order issued under this subsection stating the amount and duration of the penalty. Any monies collected shall be deposited into an account as directed by the historic preservation officer for the benefit, rehabilitation or acquisition of local historic resources.

(ii) A person who violates this article commits an offense. An offense under this article is a class C misdemeanor punishable as provided in the municipal ordinances of San Antonio.

(iii) An action to enforce the requirements of this article may include injunctive relief and may be joined with enforcement of all applicable city codes.

(iv) If any building, object, site or structure covered by this subdivision shall have to be demolished as a public safety hazard and the owner thereof shall have received two (2) or more notices from the director of code compliance of building neglect in violation of this and other city ordinances, no application for a permit for a project on the property may be considered for a period of five (5) years from the date of demolition of the structure. Additionally, no permit for a curb cut needed for the operation of surface parking lot shall be granted by a city office during this period, nor shall a parking lot for vehicles be operated whether for remuneration or not on the site for a period of five (5) years from and after the date of such demolition.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends in-kind repair of the structure based on findings a, c and d. If this is not economically or structurally feasible, staff finds that the property owner should demonstrate a loss of significance or an economic hardship, per the UDC Section 35-614.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE.

Motion: Commissioner Fish moved to approve with staff's recommendation. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nays: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, AND 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

• **Item #B-14. HDRC NO. 2019-490**

ADDRESS: 127 E MISTLETOE

APPLICANT: E.C. Parker

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct an addition on the front (south) elevation of an existing rear accessory structure.
2. Enclose two windows on the rear accessory structure.
3. Widen the existing asphalt driveway. The existing curb cut will not be modified.
4. Widen the rear portion of the asphalt driveway beyond the front plane of the primary structure by approximately 6 feet.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Doors*—Replace doors, hardware, fanlight, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures in-kind when possible and when deteriorated beyond repair. When in-kind replacement is not feasible, ensure features match the size, material, and profile of the historic element.
- ii. *New entrances*—Ensure that new entrances, when necessary to comply with other regulations, are compatible in size, scale, shape, proportion, material, and massing with historic entrances.
- iii. *Glazed area*—Avoid installing interior floors or suspended ceilings that block the glazed area of historic windows.
- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

9. Outbuildings, Including Garages

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Existing outbuildings*—Preserve existing historic outbuildings where they remain.
- ii. *Materials*—Repair outbuildings and their distinctive features in-kind. When new materials are needed, they should match existing materials in color, durability, and texture. Refer to maintenance and alteration of applicable materials above, for additional guidelines.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- i. *Garage doors*—Ensure that replacement garage doors are compatible with those found on historic garages in the district (e.g., wood paneled) as well as with the principal structure. When not visible from the public right-of-way, modern paneled garage doors may be acceptable.
- ii. *Replacement*—Replace historic outbuildings only if they are beyond repair. In-kind replacement is preferred; however, when it is not possible, ensure that they are reconstructed in the same location using similar scale, proportion, color, and materials as the original historic structure.
- iii. *Reconstruction*—Reconstruct outbuildings based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. If no such evidence exists, the design should be based on the architectural style of the primary building and historic

patterns in the district. Add permanent foundations to existing outbuildings where foundations did not historically exist only as a last resort.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 3, Guidelines for Additions

1. Massing and Form of Residential Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Minimize visual impact*—Site residential additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize views of the addition from the public right-of-way. An addition to the front of a building would be inappropriate.
- ii. *Historic context*—Design new residential additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, a large, two-story addition on a block comprised of single-story homes would not be appropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, overhang, and orientation as the historic structure for additions.
- iv. *Transitions between old and new*—Utilize a setback or recessed area and a small change in detailing at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design residential additions, including porches and balconies, to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- ii. *Rooftop additions*—Limit rooftop additions to rear facades to preserve the historic scale and form of the building from the street level and minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. Full-floor second story additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.
- iii. *Dormers*—Ensure dormers are compatible in size, scale, proportion, placement, and detail with the style of the house. Locate dormers only on non-primary facades (those not facing the public right-of-way) if not historically found within the district.
- iv. *Footprint*—The building footprint should respond to the size of the lot. An appropriate yard to building ratio should be maintained for consistency within historic districts. Residential additions should not be so large as to double the existing building footprint, regardless of lot size.
- v. *Height*—Generally, the height of new additions should be consistent with the height of the existing structure. The maximum height of new additions should be determined by examining the line-of-sight or visibility from the street. Addition height should never be so contrasting as to overwhelm or distract from the existing structure.

2. Massing and Form of Non-Residential and Mixed-Use Additions

A. GENERAL

- i. *Historic context*—Design new additions to be in keeping with the existing, historic context of the block. For example, additions should not fundamentally alter the scale and character of the block when viewed from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Preferred location*—Place additions at the side or rear of the building whenever possible to minimize the visual impact on the original structure from the public right of way. An addition to the front of a building is inappropriate.
- iii. *Similar roof form*—Utilize a similar roof pitch, form, and orientation as the principal structure for additions, particularly for those that are visible from the public right-of-way.
- iv. *Subordinate to principal facade*—Design additions to historic buildings to be subordinate to the principal façade of the original structure in terms of their scale and mass.
- v. *Transitions between old and new*—Distinguish additions as new without distracting from the original structure. For example, rooftop additions should be appropriately set back to minimize visibility from the public right-of-way. For side or rear additions utilize setbacks, a small change in detailing, or a recessed area at the seam of the historic structure and new addition to provide a clear visual distinction between old and new building forms.

B. SCALE, MASSING, AND FORM

- i. *Height*—Limit the height of side or rear additions to the height of the original structure. Limit the height of rooftop additions to no more than 40 percent of the height of original structure.

ii. *Total addition footprint*—New additions should never result in the doubling of the historic building footprint. Full-floor rooftop additions that obscure the form of the original structure are not appropriate.

3. Materials and Textures

A. COMPLEMENTARY MATERIALS

i. *Complementary materials*—Use materials that match in type, color, and texture and include an offset or reveal to distinguish the addition from the historic structure whenever possible. Any new materials introduced to the site as a result of an addition must be compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

ii. *Metal roofs*—Construct new metal roofs in a similar fashion as historic metal roofs. Refer to the Guidelines for Alternations and Maintenance section for additional specifications regarding metal roofs.

iii. *Other roofing materials*—Match original roofs in terms of form and materials. For example, when adding on to a building with a clay tile roof, the addition should have a roof that is clay tile, synthetic clay tile, or a material that appears similar in color and dimension to the existing clay tile.

B. INAPPROPRIATE MATERIALS

i. *Imitation or synthetic materials*—Do not use imitation or synthetic materials, such as vinyl siding, brick or simulated stone veneer, plastic, or other materials not compatible with the architectural style and materials of the original structure.

C. REUSE OF HISTORIC MATERIALS

i. *Salvage*—Salvage and reuse historic materials, where possible, that will be covered or removed as a result of an addition.

4. Architectural Details

A. GENERAL

i. *Historic context*—Design additions to reflect their time while respecting the historic context. Consider character defining features and details of the original structure in the design of additions. These architectural details include roof form, porches, porticos, cornices, lintels, arches, quoins, chimneys, projecting bays, and the shapes of window and door openings.

ii. *Architectural details*—Incorporate architectural details that are in keeping with the architectural style of the original structure. Details should be simple in design and compliment the character of the original structure. Architectural details that are more ornate or elaborate than those found on the original structure should not be used to avoid drawing undue attention to the addition.

iii. *Contemporary interpretations*—Consider integrating contemporary interpretations of traditional designs and details for additions. Use of contemporary window moldings and door surroundings, for example, can provide visual interest while helping to convey the fact that the addition is new.

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

4. Residential Streetscapes

A. PLANTING STRIPS

i. *Street trees*—Protect and encourage healthy street trees in planting strips. Replace damaged or dead trees with trees of a similar species, size, and growth habit as recommended by the City Arborist.

ii. *Lawns*—Maintain the use of traditional lawn in planting strips or low plantings where a consistent pattern has been retained along the block frontage. If mulch or gravel beds are used, low-growing plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Alternative materials*—Do not introduce impervious hardscape, raised planting beds, or other materials into planting strips where they were not historically found.

B. PARKWAYS AND PLANTED MEDIANS

i. *Historic plantings*—Maintain the park-like character of historic parkways and planted medians by preserving mature vegetation and retaining historic design elements. Replace damaged or dead plant materials with species of a like size, growth habit, and ornamental characteristics.

ii. *Hardscape*—Do not introduce new pavers, concrete, or other hardscape materials into parkways and planted medians where they were not historically found.

C. STREET ELEMENTS

i. *Site elements*—Preserve historic street lights, street markers, roundabouts, and other unique site elements found within the public right-of-way as street improvements and other public works projects are completed over time.

ii. *Historic paving materials*—Retain historic paving materials, such as brick pavers or colored paving, within the public right-of-way and repair in place with like materials.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*— Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

C. CURBING

i. *Historic curbing*—Retain historic curbing wherever possible. Historic curbing in San Antonio is typically constructed of concrete with a curved or angular profile.

ii. *Replacement curbing*—Replace curbing in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. Where in-kind replacement is not be feasible, use a comparable substitute that duplicates the color, texture, durability, and profile of the original. Retaining walls and curbing should not be added to the sidewalk design unless absolutely necessary.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Item 1, Staff recommends approval of the rear accessory structure addition based on finding b with the following stipulations:

- i. That the applicant installs two single bay garage doors with carriage style detailing in lieu of the proposed double bay garage door. The applicant is required to submit updated elevation and plan drawings that reflect this change prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.
- ii. That the applicant salvages the existing front-facing wood windows and stores them on site for future renovations or construction.

Item 2, Staff recommends approval of the proposed window enclosures based on finding c.

Item 3, Staff does not recommend approval of the widening of the driveway near the public right-of-way based on finding d.

Item 4, Staff recommends approval of the driveway widening towards the rear of the lot based on finding e with the following stipulation:

- i. That the applicant installs a landscape buffer on the southern edges of the widened portions of the driveway as noted in finding e. The applicant is required to submit a landscaping plan to staff prior to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: NONE

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to approve item 1 with stipulation 1 that garage have windows and applied trim to appear as other garage doors in neighborhood and stipulation 2 that

the applicant salvage the front facing windows and restore them on-site; approve item 2 with staff recommendations; approval of item 4 as submitted; Deny item 3.
Commissioner Fish seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

Action: MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT

• **Item #B-15. HDRC NO. 2019-507**

ADDRESS: 311 PEREIDA ST

APPLICANT: Amy Perez/KAI HOMES LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to amend and clarify the window specifications in the second-floor façade to allow vinyl-clad wood windows (ANDERSON 400) as originally proposed instead of exposed wood; both options would be trimmed and painted appropriately.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

2. *Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations*

6. Architectural Features: Doors, Windows, and Screens

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

- i. *Openings*—Preserve existing window and door openings. Avoid enlarging or diminishing to fit stock sizes or air conditioning units. Avoid filling in historic door or window openings. Avoid creating new primary entrances or window openings on the primary façade or where visible from the public right-of-way.
- ii. *Doors*—Preserve historic doors including hardware, fanlights, sidelights, pilasters, and entablatures.
- iii. *Windows*—Preserve historic windows. When glass is broken, the color and clarity of replacement glass should match the original historic glass.
- iv. *Screens and shutters*—Preserve historic window screens and shutters.
- v. *Storm windows*—Install full-view storm windows on the interior of windows for improved energy efficiency. Storm window may be installed on the exterior so long as the visual impact is minimal and original architectural details are not obscured.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

- iv. *Window design*—Install new windows to match the historic or existing windows in terms of size, type, configuration, material, form, appearance, and detail when original windows are deteriorated beyond repair.
- v. *Muntins*—Use the exterior muntin pattern, profile, and size appropriate for the historic building when replacement windows are necessary. Do not use internal muntins sandwiched between layers of glass.
- vi. *Replacement glass*—Use clear glass when replacement glass is necessary. Do not use tinted glass, reflective glass, opaque glass, and other non-traditional glass types unless it was used historically. When established by the architectural style of the building, patterned, leaded, or colored glass can be used.
- vii. *Non-historic windows*—Replace non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are typical of the architectural style of the building.
- viii. *Security bars*—Install security bars only on the interior of windows and doors.
- ix. *Screens*—Utilize wood screen window frames matching in profile, size, and design of those historically found when the existing screens are deteriorated beyond repair. Ensure that the tint of replacement screens closely matches the original screens or those used historically.
- x. *Shutters*—Incorporate shutters only where they existed historically and where appropriate to the architectural style of the house. Shutters should match the height and width of the opening and be mounted to be operational or appear to be operational. Do not mount shutters directly onto any historic wall material.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval of amending the window specifications to specifically allow for a vinyl-clad wood product based on finding b and c. If they commission denies the amendment request, the applicant must submit window specifications that feature a one-over-one fully wood sash window that excludes cladding of any material within 90 days unless otherwise stipulated.

The standard specifications for window replacement apply unless otherwise stipulated by the commission:

- O MATERIAL – That the windows and all interior, exterior, and trim components be fully wood, excluding hardware.
- O SASH: Meeting rails must be no taller than 1.25”. Stiles must be no wider than 2.25”. *
- O DEPTH: There should be a minimum of 2” in depth between the front face of the window trim and the front face of the top window sash. This must be accomplished by recessing the window sufficiently within the opening or with the installation of additional window trim to add thickness.
- O TRIM: Window trim must feature traditional dimensions and architecturally appropriate casing and sloped sill detail. Window track components such as jamb liners must be painted to match the window trim or concealed by a wood window screen set within the opening.
- O GLAZING: Windows should feature clear glass. Low-e or reflective coatings are not recommended for replacements. The glazing should not feature faux divided lights with an interior grille. If approved to match a historic window configuration, the window should feature real exterior muntins.
- O COLOR: Wood windows should feature a painted finished If a clad product is approved, white or metallic manufacturer’s color is not allowed, and color selection must be presented to staff.
- O INSTALLATION: Wood windows should be supplied in a block frame and exclude nailing fins. Window opening sizes should not be altered to accommodate stock sizes prior to approval.
- O FINAL APPROVAL: If the proposed window does not meet the aforementioned stipulations, then the applicant must submit updated window specifications to staff for review, prior to purchase and installation. For more assistance, the applicant may request the window supplier to coordinate with staff directly for verification.

CASE COMMENT:

COMPLIANCE – A number of renovation items were approved for the property at 311 Pereida including wholesale fenestration restoration to the second floor front facade. On a site visit conducted on August 2, 2019, staff found that the windows that were installed were vinyl-clad wood windows instead of wood windows as approved with stipulations at the March 20, 2019 HDRC hearing. At this time, only a commission action letter has been submitted as staff is awaiting for the stipulated materials to be submitted prior to issuing a Certificate of Appropriateness. When staff confronted the applicant about the discrepancy, the applicant explained that they installed vinyl-clad wood windows in good faith, not knowing that they are distinct from exposed wood windows. The applicant has submitted a request on August 23, 2019 to be heard at the next available HDRC hearing to amend and clarify the window specifications.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: Virginia VanCleave

Motion: Commissioner Fish made a motion to deny application.
Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: Velasquez.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman .

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 6 AYES, and 1 NAYS. 4 ABSEN**

• **Item #B-16. HDRC NO. 2019-493**

ADDRESS: 619 BARBE ST

APPLICANT: Henry Rodriguez/Queta Construction Group, LLC

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a ridge cap on the newly-installed standing seam metal roof on the primary structure at 619 Barbe St. The crimped ridge seam was installed incorrectly and the requested ridge cap is proposed in an effort to aesthetically mitigate the seam.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 2, Exterior Maintenance and Alterations

3. Materials: Roofs

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Regular maintenance and cleaning*—Avoid the build-up of accumulated dirt and retained moisture. This can lead to the growth of moss and other vegetation, which can lead to roof damage. Check roof surface for breaks or holes and flashing for open seams and repair as needed.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Roof replacement*—Consider roof replacement when more than 25-30 percent of the roof area is damaged or 25-30 percent of the roof tiles (slate, clay tile, or cement) or shingles are missing or damaged.

ii. *Roof form*—Preserve the original shape, line, pitch, and overhang of historic roofs when replacement is necessary.

iii. *Roof features*—Preserve and repair distinctive roof features such as cornices, parapets, dormers, open eaves with exposed rafters and decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, and brackets with shaped ends.

iv. *Materials: sloped roofs*—Replace roofing materials in-kind whenever possible when the roof must be replaced. Retain and re-use historic materials when large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required (e.g., slate or clay tiles). Salvaged materials should be re-used on roof forms that are most visible from the public right-of-way. Match new roofing materials to the original materials in terms of their scale, color, texture, profile, and style, or select materials consistent with the building style, when in-kind replacement is not possible.

v. *Materials: flat roofs*—Allow use of contemporary roofing materials on flat or gently sloping roofs not visible from the public right-of-way.

vi. *Materials: metal roofs*—Use metal roofs on structures that historically had a metal roof or where a metal roof is appropriate for the style or construction period. Refer to Checklist for Metal Roofs on page 10 for desired metal roof specifications when considering a new metal roof. New metal roofs that adhere to these guidelines can be approved administratively as long as documentation can be provided that shows that the home has historically had a metal roof.

vii. *Roof vents*—Maintain existing historic roof vents. When deteriorated beyond repair, replace roof vents in-kind or with one similar in design and material to those historically used when in-kind replacement is not possible.

4. Materials: Metal

A. MAINTENANCE (PRESERVATION)

i. *Cleaning*—Use the gentlest means possible when cleaning metal features to avoid damaging the historic finish. Prepare a test panel to determine appropriate cleaning methods before proceeding. Use a wire brush to remove corrosion or paint build up on hard metals like wrought iron, steel, and cast iron.

ii. *Repair*—Repair metal features using methods appropriate to the specific type of metal.

iii. *Paint*—Avoid painting metals that were historically exposed such as copper and bronze.

B. ALTERATIONS (REHABILITATION, RESTORATION, AND RECONSTRUCTION)

i. *Replacement*—Replace missing or significantly damaged metal features in-kind or with a substitute compatible in size, form, material, and general appearance to the historical feature when in-kind replacement is not possible.

- ii. *Rust*—Select replacement anchors of stainless steel to limit rust and associated expansion that can cause cracking of the surrounding material such as wood or masonry. Insert anchors into the mortar joints of masonry buildings.
- iii. *New metal features*—Add metal features based on accurate evidence of the original, such as photographs. Base the design on the architectural style of the building and historic patterns if no such evidence exists.

OHP Standing Seam Metal Roofing Policy Stipulations

Standing metal roofs should feature panels that are 18 to 21 inches wide, seams that are 1 to 2 inches tall, a crimped ridge seam and a standard galvalume finish. Ridges are to feature a double-munch or crimped ridge configuration; no vented ridge caps or end caps are allowed. An on-site inspection must be scheduled with OHP staff prior to the start of work to verify that the roofing material matches the approved specifications. All chimney, flue, and related existing roof details must be preserved.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff does not recommend approval based on findings a and b. Staff finds that the applicant should correct the ill-installed crimped ridge seam in lieu of proposing a non-functional ridge cap to cover the seam.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Carpenter made a motion to deny application.
Commissioner Grube seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

• **Item #B-18. HDRC NO. 2019-483**

ADDRESS: 123 CROFTON

APPLICANT: John Chester

REQUEST:

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to

1. Replace the existing, front yard walkway with a brick walkway, and install additional sidewalk paving.
2. Install a brick driveway in the location of the existing gravel driveway.
3. Perform front yard landscaping modifications including the installation of various plantings.

APPLICABLE CITATIONS:

Historic Design Guidelines, Chapter 5, Guidelines for Site Elements

3. Landscape Design

A. PLANTINGS

- i. *Historic Gardens*—Maintain front yard gardens when appropriate within a specific historic district.
- ii. *Historic Lawns*—Do not fully remove and replace traditional lawn areas with impervious hardscape. Limit the removal of lawn areas to mulched planting beds or pervious hardscapes in locations where they would historically be found, such as along fences, walkways, or drives. Low-growing plantings should be used in historic lawn areas; invasive or large-scale species should be avoided. Historic lawn areas should never be reduced by more than 50%.
- iii. *Native xeric plant materials*—Select native and/or xeric plants that thrive in local conditions and reduce watering usage. See UDC Appendix E: San Antonio Recommended Plant List—All Suited to Xeriscape Planting

Methods, for a list of appropriate materials and planting methods. Select plant materials with a similar character, growth habit, and light requirements as those being replaced.

iv. *Plant palettes*—If a varied plant palette is used, incorporate species of taller heights, such informal elements should be restrained to small areas of the front yard or to the rear or side yard so as not to obstruct views of or otherwise distract from the historic structure.

v. *Maintenance*—Maintain existing landscape features. Do not introduce landscape elements that will obscure the historic structure or are located as to retain moisture on walls or foundations (e.g., dense foundation plantings or vines) or as to cause damage.

B. ROCKS OR HARDSCAPE

i. *Impervious surfaces* —Do not introduce large pavers, asphalt, or other impervious surfaces where they were not historically located.

ii. *Pervious and semi-pervious surfaces*—New pervious hardscapes should be limited to areas that are not highly visible, and should not be used as wholesale replacement for plantings. If used, small plantings should be incorporated into the design.

iii. *Rock mulch and gravel* - Do not use rock mulch or gravel as a wholesale replacement for lawn area. If used, plantings should be incorporated into the design.

C. MULCH

i. *Organic mulch* – Organic mulch should not be used as a wholesale replacement for plant material. Organic mulch with appropriate plantings should be incorporated in areas where appropriate such as beneath a tree canopy.

ii. *Inorganic mulch* – Inorganic mulch should not be used in highly-visible areas and should never be used as a wholesale replacement for plant material. Inorganic mulch with appropriate plantings should be incorporated in areas where appropriate such as along a foundation wall where moisture retention is discouraged.

D. TREES

i. *Preservation*—Preserve and protect from damage existing mature trees and heritage trees. See UDC Section 35-523 (Tree Preservation) for specific requirements.

ii. *New Trees* – Select new trees based on site conditions. Avoid planting new trees in locations that could potentially cause damage to a historic structure or other historic elements. Species selection and planting procedure should be done in accordance with guidance from the City Arborist.

iii. *Maintenance* – Proper pruning encourages healthy growth and can extend the lifespan of trees. Avoid unnecessary or harmful pruning. A certified, licensed arborist is recommended for the pruning of mature trees and heritage trees.

5. Sidewalks, Walkways, Driveways, and Curbing

A. SIDEWALKS AND WALKWAYS

i. *Maintenance*—Repair minor cracking, settling, or jamming along sidewalks to prevent uneven surfaces. Retain and repair historic sidewalk and walkway paving materials—often brick or concrete—in place.

ii. *Replacement materials*—Replace those portions of sidewalks or walkways that are deteriorated beyond repair. Every effort should be made to match existing sidewalk color and material.

iii. *Width and alignment*— Follow the historic alignment, configuration, and width of sidewalks and walkways. Alter the historic width or alignment only where absolutely necessary to accommodate the preservation of a significant tree.

iv. *Stamped concrete*—Preserve stamped street names, business insignias, or other historic elements of sidewalks and walkways when replacement is necessary.

v. *ADA compliance*—Limit removal of historic sidewalk materials to the immediate intersection when ramps are added to address ADA requirements.

B. DRIVEWAYS

i. *Driveway configuration*—Retain and repair in place historic driveway configurations, such as ribbon drives. Incorporate a similar driveway configuration—materials, width, and design—to that historically found on the site. Historic driveways are typically no wider than 10 feet. Pervious paving surfaces may be considered where replacement is necessary to increase stormwater infiltration.

ii. *Curb cuts and ramps*—Maintain the width and configuration of original curb cuts when replacing historic driveways. Avoid introducing new curb cuts where not historically found.

C. CURBING

i. *Historic curbing*—Retain historic curbing wherever possible. Historic curbing in San Antonio is typically constructed of concrete with a curved or angular profile.

ii. *Replacement curbing*—Replace curbing in-kind when deteriorated beyond repair. Where in-kind replacement is not be feasible, use a comparable substitute that duplicates the color, texture, durability, and profile of the original. Retaining walls and curbing should not be added to the sidewalk design unless absolutely necessary

RECOMMENDATIONS:

Staff recommends approval of items #1 through #3 with the following stipulations:

- i. That the front yard walkway be repaired, or replaced in-kind with matching materials and a matching profile as noted in finding b.
- ii. That the proposed driveway not exceed ten (10) feet in width as noted in finding c.
- iii. That no gravel or similar materials be installed in the front yard as a wholesale groundcover as noted in finding d.
- iv. That an additional landscaping plan be submitted to OHP staff review of the final ground cover at the end of construction on site.

CITIZENS TO BE HEARD: None.

Motion: Commissioner Grube motion to approve of items 1,2. And 3 with stipulations 2,3, and 4. Additional stipulation- Footprint of the sidewalk be maintained.. Commissioner Carpenter seconded the motion.

Vote: Ayes: Fish, Velasquez, Martinez-Flores, Carpenter, Grube, Fetzer, and Laffoon.
Nay: None.
Absent: Fernandez, Harris, Connor, and Bowman.

Action: **MOTION PASSED with 7 AYES, and 0 NAYS. 4 ABSENT**

EXECUTIVE SESSION.

Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.

ADJOURNMENT.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:06 PM.

APPROVED



Jeffrey Fetzer
Chair