

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION  
OFFICIAL MINUTES  
MARCH 7, 2014**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 8:30 A.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

**PRESENT: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Connor**

**ABSENT: Salas, Shafer, Feldman**

- Chairman’s Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- |                       |                       |
|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2014-067  | 700 Culberson         |
| 2. Case No. 2014-069  | 2415 Evans            |
| 3. Case No. 2014-070  | 236 E. Rosewood       |
| 4. Case No. 2014-076  | 426 E. Courtland Pl.  |
| 5. Case No. 2014-078  | 1125 N. Olive         |
| 6. Case No. 2014-073  | 229 Vance             |
| 7. Case No. 2014-075  | 2822 N. Flores        |
| 8. Case No. 2014-074  | 1915 Broadway         |
| 9. Case No. 2014-084  | 1700 to 2200 Huisache |
| 10. Case No. 2013-345 | 726 E. Woodlawn       |
| 11. Case No. 2013-388 | 323 W. Hollywood      |
| 12. Case No. 2014-072 | 706 E. Guenther       |
| 13. Case No. 2013-340 | 925 S. St. Mary’s     |
| 14. Case No. 2013-393 | 2110 W. Summit        |
| 15. Case No. 2014-083 | 517 E. Locust         |
| 16. Case No. 2013-142 | 355 E. Kings Hwy      |

Items 13, and 16 were pulled from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

**AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**13. HDRC NO. 2013-340**

Applicant: Montgomery Howard

Address: 925 S. St. Mary’s

The applicant is requesting final approval to:

1. Construct a new 30,000 square foot building on the southern portion of the Bonham Academy campus. The proposed structure will be two stories and will include five classrooms, a faculty work center, two science classrooms, music, art, a black box theatre, and a computer lab. The existing portables on this area of the campus will be removed. The proposed structure will use buff and red colored masonry and brick to match existing school buildings and incorporate colored panels to relate to the surrounding neighborhood. The south and north walls of the structure are proposed to either be flat seam metal panels (Option 1) or brick veneer (Option 2). The main mass of the proposed new building will be set back from S. St. Mary's Street while the black box theatre will project toward the street at the northeast corner of the building;

2. As Alternate #1, replace existing windows on both the original building and the 1996 addition with matching wood windows and wood trim;

3. As Alternate #2, replace existing windows on both the original building and the 1996 addition with aluminum windows aluminum trim;

4. As Alternate #3, install new perimeter fencing. Proposed fencing is 5-foot wrought iron;

5. As Alternate #8, replace existing windows on the original building and the 1996 addition with aluminum-clad wood windows with wood trim;

6. Remove an existing significant pecan tree located on the western portion of the property behind the house at 114 Cedar. Proposed playground equipment will be addressed in the future in a separate application.

#### **FINDINGS:**

a. A design for the new 30,000sf building was given conceptual by the HDRC on October 16, 2013, with the following stipulations:

1. The fenestration pattern and articulation on the S. St. Mary's Street façade continue to be studied based on findings k and l.
2. Further development of the space between the proposed building and S. St. Mary's Street in terms of landscaping or street furniture be completed prior to returning for final approval based on findings e and l.

b. The plans submitted for this request for a Certificate of Appropriateness address both stipulations. A more regular fenestration pattern appears on the S. St. Mary's façade and landscape plans indicate that the yard between the building and street will be developed with appropriate landscaping and furnishings.

c. The main building on the Bonham Academy campus first appears on the 1896 Sanborn map, listed as a public school with windows on all sides. Since that time, this original structure has remained largely unchanged. According to the 1912-1951 Sanborn map, additions were constructed on the campus in 1914 and 1930. A 1996 gymnasium was also constructed to the south of the original building. The proposed new classroom building will be to the south of the existing 1996 structure.

d. The proposed structure addresses neighborhood concerns about the proximity of the structure to adjacent residential properties to the west of the campus.

e. The use of color on this structure relates to existing precedents in the neighborhood.

f. The proposed structure is consistent in terms of building height with the other campus buildings, in keeping with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Section 2.A.i.

g. The proposed orientation and setback of the new structure are consistent with the other buildings on the campus, in keeping with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Section 1.A.

h. The proposed structure relates to the existing campus building in terms of the horizontal datum lines incorporated into the configuration of the façade, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Sections 2.A.iii and 2.C.ii.

- i. The applicant has submitted two options for either metal panels or brick veneer on the north and south facades of the new construction. Staff finds that the brick option is more compatible with existing structures in the area and more consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction 3.A.i.
- j. The existing wood windows of the original school building were installed in 1997. An in-kind replacement with matching wood windows would be consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.iv. Replacement with aluminum-clad wood windows may be appropriate on the 1996 addition.
- k. Replacement of existing wood windows in the original school building and 1996 addition with aluminum windows and trim would constitute a change in materials and appearance. This would not be consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations 6.B.iv.
- l. An existing, 4-foot metal fence is located along the S. St. Mary's property line. As an alternate, the applicant may ultimately install new perimeter fencing. Staff finds the requested 5-foot wrought iron fence to be appropriate for the rear of the property. However, a 4-foot fence along the S. St. Mary's side of the property would be more appropriate and consistent with the existing precedent.
- m. Several significant trees will be removed as a result of the new construction. A previous request for removal of a significant pecan for the temporary placement of a portable classroom building (item 5) was not approved. The applicant has not been able to provide substantial evidence as to why the tree must be removed, but has stated that there are general concerns with available space on the property.

**RECOMMENDATION:**

- 1. Staff recommends approval of the new construction with the brick option based on findings a through i.
- 2. Staff recommends approval of wood replacement windows (Alternate 1) based on finding j.
- 3. Staff does not recommend approval of aluminum replacement windows (Alternate 2) based on finding k.
- 4. Staff recommends approval new perimeter fencing (Alternate 3) with the stipulation that a 4-foot height is maintained along S. St. Mary's Street based on finding l.
- 5. Staff does not recommend approval of aluminum-clad wood windows (Alternate 8) as submitted. Staff recommends that this type of replacement be limited to the 1996 addition and not the original school building based on finding j.
- 6. Staff does not recommend approval of the selected tree removal based on finding m.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve with the stipulation that the brick option be included.

**AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**16. HDRC NO. 2013-142**

Applicant: Samuel Avestas

Address: 355 E. Kings Hwy.

Reset to March 19, 2014.

**17. HDRC NO. 2014-040**

Applicant: Michael P. Stein

Address: 518 E. Park

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Replace the existing ribbon driveway with a solid, 10 foot wide concrete driveway to match the dimension of the existing approach. The existing concrete ribbons, which are cracked and uneven, are narrower than the approach. There is a concrete curb on the west side of the ribbon driveway which is proposed to be replaced in kind.

**FINDINGS:**

- a. The home at 518 E. Park first appears on the 1912-1951 Sanborn map.
- b. On the 500 block of E. Park, there is only one other example of a ribbon driveway, which has concrete ribbons with a gravel material between them. The remaining homes either have solid concrete driveways or no driveway.
- c. Ribbon driveways are character-defining features of historic homes and, based on the Historic Design Guidelines for Site Elements, Section 5.B.i, should be retained and repaired in place.
- d. If the current driveway needs to be replaced, staff finds that the new driveway should maintain a ribbon configuration. Installing pavers or decomposed granite or similarly pervious materials between and to the east side of the ribbons to achieve the functionality of a 10 foot wide driveway may be an appropriate solution in this case

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on findings c and d. Staff recommends that the ribbon driveway be replaced in kind. If a solid driveway is approved, staff recommends that the articulation of the ribbons be maintained and the infill materials be differentiated from the ribbons.

Michael Stein, owner, presented his case. Mr. Stein indicated most driveways in the area have solid concrete drives.

Ricki Kushner, Tobin Hill Hist. Assoc., stated that Tobin Hill's committee was not unanimous on this case and did agree that if a plain unadorned slab driveway was installed, it would be unfortunate. The intent of the guidelines is to make neighborhoods look and feel like it did when it was first developed.

Commissioner Guarino stated he would prefer a solid concrete driveway.

Commissioner Connor stated that he believes the existing driveway is original and is a character defining feature of the historic property.

Commissioner Guarino indicated that the infill could be decomposed granite, brick, pavers or concrete pavers.

**COMMISSION ACTION:**

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to grant denial based on findings c and d.

**AYES: Cone, Judson, Laffoon, Guarino, Zuniga, Valenzuela, Connor**

**NAYS: None**

**THE MOTION CARRIED.**

**18. HDRC NO. 2014-027**

Applicant: Annette Galloway

Address: 339 Mary Louise

Reset to March 19, 2014 per the applicant.

March 7, 2014

5

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:15 A.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone  
Chair