

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
MARCH 9, 2012**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 8:00 a.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

ABSENT: Carpenter, Guarino

- Chairman’s Statement
- Announcements
- **Reset** – Committee Appointments
- Citizens to be heard

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|-------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2012-018 | 103 W. 9 th Street |
| 2. Case No. 2012-053 | 110 Tuleta |
| 3. Case No. 2012-068 | 112 King William |
| 4. Case No. 2012-054 | 117 W. Gramercy |
| 5. Case No. 2012-055 | 118 E. Mulberry |
| 6. Case No. 2012-056 | 133 E. Rosewood |
| 7. Case No. 2012-057 | 204 Augusta |
| 8. Case No. 2012-058 | 315 E. Commerce |
| 9. Case No. 2012-059 | 510 Mary Louise |
| 10. Case No. 2012-060 | 518 E. Houston |
| 11. Case No. 2012-042 | 604 Avenue A |
| 12. Case No. 2012-061 | 634 Cedar |
| 13. Case No. 2012-062 | 823 E. Magnolia |
| 14. Case No. 2012-063 | 965 E. Mistletoe |
| 15. Case No. 2012-065 | 2300 Avenue B |
| 16. Case No. 2012-064 | 3200 McCullough |

Commissioner Connor pulled items 1 and 16 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Item 2, 2012-053 reset to March 21, 2012.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2012-018

Applicant: Timothy K. Sanford

Address: 103 W. 9th Street

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to install landscape for a new hotel located adjacent to the river.

Bianca Maldonado stated she has concern with the caliber of the trees proposed. She further expressed concern with the proposed acorn producing tree near the ADA ramp. She suggested an alternative tree would be in the best interest of the public.

Lisa Moore, applicant, presented. Ms. Moore stated the caliber of the trees have been increased to 6 inches and would agree to change the proposed acorn producing tree to a Cedar Elm tree.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve with staff recommendations and with the revision of the tree selection to cedar elm and increase tree caliber to 6".

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC NO. 2012-064

Applicant: Michael McChesney

Address: 3200 McCullough

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

Construct a new recreational facility for fencing and basketball. The new building will be constructed one level above the existing parking lot. The exterior of the proposed building is based upon the architectural characteristics of the existing high school façade, which is comprised of segmented brick arches and cast stone elements. The proposed windows will be single hung aluminum within cast stone framed openings. In lieu of slate, the proposed roof will be metal with a slope to match the existing building.

Michael Machesney, applicant, presented.

Paul Kinnison, Monte Vista Historical Assoc., stated MVHA has not had the opportunity to review the project. MVHA has concerns with the master plan as being presented and would request that the applicant meet with MVHA prior to final approval.

Commissioner Rodriguez stated that expansive roof and wall plain along the side elevation does seem exorbitant and ask that the applicant consider breaking it up.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to grant conceptual approval with staff's stipulation and that the applicant meet with Monte Vista Historical Association.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC NO. 2012-065

Applicant: John Greene

Address: 115 Oakmont Court

Reset to March 21, 2012.

18. HDRC NO. 2012-011

Applicant: John Greene

Address: 119 Oakmont Court

Reset to March 21, 2012.

19. HDRC NO. 2012-066

Applicant: John Greene

Address: 146 Oakmont Court

Reset to March 21, 2012.

20. HDRC NO. 2012-067

Applicant: Mary Bartlett

Address: 110 Auditorium

The applicant is seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval of the following:

1. Removal of parking (p. 3; Loading docks have already been removed as part of the building package)
2. Installation of signage: One main entrance sign, "Tobin Center for the Performing Arts", per Design Review Committee recommendations on 12/8/11 (p. 8); two "Studio Theater" signs (p. 9, actual name to be determined).
3. Installation of a decorative guardrail to west and east arcades (pp. 10, 11).
4. Addition of a limestone veneer along the west elevation (pp. 10, 11).
5. Decreasing the proposed length of the loading-dock veil, per Design Review Committee recommendations on 12/8/11 (p. 15).
6. Installation of lighting for hardscape and landscaping, per Design Review Committee recommendations on 12/8/11 (pp. 13-17).
7. Landscaping and hardscape throughout the entire site (pp. 18, 19 (pL405))
8. Removal of a section of the retaining wall along RiverWalk (pp. 3, 20)
9. Installation of a portal from the RiverWalk to Veterans Memorial Plaza with monuments to honor Medal of Honor recipients from San Antonio (pp. 21-24).
10. Addition of a barge landing to the river (p. 25).

Mary Bartlett, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Cone presented committee report.

Bianca Maldonado stated there has been no application to remove the lettering off the front of the building but the removal has been completed. Ms. Maldonado asked if the lettering could be retained and preserved as part of the historic fabric of the building.

Mary Bartlett stated the lettering was removed as part of the building package and stored.

Commissioner Cone stated that the signage is part of the historic building and needs to be retained and protected. Should the lettering not be part of the building it should be given to the City for preservation.

Commissioner Rodriguez questioned if the ornamental iron work will be reused in the proposed railing or stored. The lettering is equally important and should be preserved.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Tak

THE MOTION CARRIED.

21. HDRC NO. 2012-051

Applicant: Justin Carpenter

Address: 210 Thorain

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Construct a porch on the front of the house.
2. Fill in the garage door opening with stone to match the existing, and install a window in its place (garage area has been converted into living space).

Justin Carpenter, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Connor stated it is inappropriate for a masonry column/pier to be sitting on a wood porch.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Connor to deny the applicants request and request that the applicant returns with a more appropriate design.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

22. HDRC NO. 2011-261

Applicant: Randy Bartholomew

Address: 233 Leigh

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to construct a new one and a half story residence.

Natasha Kay stated she has concern with the mass and scaling. The footprint is 2100 square feet, too large for the street scape.

Natalie Bushman stated the massing, scale and architecture is in appropriate for the neighborhood.

Jody Newman suggested that the owner/developers work closely with the neighbors. The proposed structure is not appropriate.

Paul McKutchin, owner, presented. Mr. McKutchin indicated they have met three times with the surrounding neighbors.

Commissioner Rodriguez suggested a shade and shadow study. This could possibly ease the concerns of being in the shadow of the structure. The footprint is large and could possibly be reduced and set back from the neighbor.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to refer to the DRC.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

23. HDRC NO. 2012-061

Applicant: Davis Sprinkle, Sprinkle and Co. Architects

Address: 312 Pearl Parkway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to:

Install a shade canopy between the newly-constructed CIA Garage building and the historic Boiler House. The proposed canopy will be suspended between both buildings in order to provide shade for an outdoor dining area. The canopy will be supported by eyehooks attached to the CIA Garage, and by galvanized steel stub columns with eyehooks projecting from the roof of the Boiler House. Ten main cables will be suspended between the garage structure and Boiler House to support the weight of the canopy. The proposed canopy would extend above the wall of the historic building and ties into the new roof of the boiler house structure. Cables will attach to the historic building in five places to deal with wind uplift on the canopy. The cables tie into the internal steel structure that was added recently to deal with structural issues. The tubes connected to the cables will penetrate the masonry wall in those five places, displacing one or two bricks at each location, according to the applicant. The canopy itself will be made of semi-transparent green and beige fabric.

Davis Sprinkle, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve with staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

24. HDRC NO. 2012-062

Applicant: Robert Watson

Address: 325 W. Lynnwood

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for final approval to:

Construct retaining walls of ledge stone boulders along the slope facing West Lynnwood Ave and install new landscaping. The proposed retaining walls be three tiers tall (27"-36") on either side of the driveway and no more than two tiers tall (18"-24") in the other locations facing Lynnwood Ave.

Robert Watson, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Cone stated sloping lawns are a character defining feature of Monte Vista. Hill country rough stone is not introduced in the neighborhood. The new wall is not respectful of the house or the existing wall.

Commissioner Connor stated the esthetic of the stone is inappropriate.

Bianca Maldonado stated the work that has been completed is not appropriate. Since the wall has been erected, it has been tagged multiple times.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to refer to the DRC.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

25. HDRC NO. 2012-063

Applicant: Jim Sublousky

Address: 450 Mary Louise

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace 5 windows (4 on west side, and 1 on south side) with wood "Renewal" windows by Anderson in the existing frames and existing pockets.

Jim Sublousky, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Rodriguez and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to refer to the DRC.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

26. HDRC NO. 2006-322

Applicant: SA Partnership – Francisco Valadez

Address: 849 E. Commerce

Frank Valadez, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to grant conceptual approval with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

27. HDRC NO. 2012-066

Applicant: Ben Lopez, M & M Contracting

Address: 2350 Gillingham

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to demolish structure.

Greg Hammer, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to refer to an on site Designation/Demolition Committee meeting.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

28. HDRC NO. 2012-067

Applicant: Ben Lopez, M & M Contracting

Address: 2486 Gillingham

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to demolish structure.

Greg Hammer, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to refer to an on site Designation/Demolition Committee meeting.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- January 6, 2012 meeting minutes:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve January 6, 2012 minutes.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Tak, Valenzuela, Salas, Shafer, Rodriguez, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 10:20 A.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone

Chair