

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
JANUARY 20, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Gonzalez, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.
- Chairman's Statement.
- **PRESENT: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**
- **ABSENT: None**
- Citizens to be Heard
Barbara Witte-Howell – Awards Presentation 2010
- Announcements
- Committee Appointment:

Design Review:

Xavier Gonzalez
Bianca Maldonado
Michael Connor
Scott Carpenter

Designation/Demolition:

Tim Cone
Harry Shafer
Ed Cabel
Maureen Brown

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Cone to accept the designated committee members for the Design Review and the Designation/Demolition Committees.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

• Election of Officers

Shanon Peterson Wasielewski, Historic Preservation Officer, opened up the nominations for HDRC Chair.

Commissioner Cabel nominated Commissioner Xavier Gonzalez for Chairperson.

No other nominations for HDRC Chair. Nominations closed.

The vote was unanimous for Xavier Gonzalez as Chairperson for HDRC.

Shanon Peterson Wasielewski, Historic Preservation Officer, opened up the nominations for HDRC Vice-Chair.

Commissioner Gonzalez nominated Commissioner Tim Cone for Vice-Chair.

No other nominations for HDRC Vice-Chair. Nominations closed.

The vote was unanimous for Tim Cone as Vice-Chair for HDRC.

• The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- 1. Case No. 2009-319 2307 Vance Jackson Rd.
- 2. Case No. 2010-019 318 E. Houston **PULLED**
- 3. Case No. 2010-017 3015 Broadway **PULLED**
- 4. Case No. 2010-018 401 S. Presa
- 5. Case No. 2010-021 120 W. Elsmere Pl. **PULLED**

Commissioner Cabel made a request to pull Case No. 2010-019 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Maldonado made a request to pull Case No. 2010-017 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Cabel made a request to pull Case No. 2010-021 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve the remaining items on the Consent Agenda with staff's stipulations.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

2. HDRC NO. 2010-019

Applicant: Alamo Architects

Address: 318 E. Houston

Commissioner Cabel two years ago there was a request for additional signage and at that time it was decided there should be no more signage.

Mike McGlone, applicant stated the current owners want to get the signage into conformance. He further stated he would like to get the entrance renovated prior to spring break then return in February with a comprehensive signage plan.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve as submitted.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

3. HDRC NO. 2010-017

Applicant: Ashley & Rad Weaver

Address: 3015 Broadway

Commissioner Maldonado gave the committee report. Concerned with the entrance stone being very similar to the stone in Brackenridge Park. There was discussion on differentiating Brackenridge Park to the privately owned Kiddie Park.

Ashley Weaver, owner stated she would like to request the stone at the entrance but would keep it separate from the Brackenridge Park stone.

Commissioner Cabel stated he was at the committee meeting and has no concern over the stone.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Beyer approve as submitted.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

5. HDRC NO. 2010-021

Applicant: Teal Hanzel

Address: 120 W. Elsmere Pl.

Commissioner Cone requested clarification on the address.

Don McDonald, applicant stated the property is subdivided and the address is 110 W. Elsmere.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant conceptual approval with the stipulation that the applicant meet with the Monte Vista Historic District.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

6. HDRC CASE NO. 2009-309

Applicant: W. Bebb Francis

Address: 110 Barrera St. (108 Barrera rear house)

Bebb Francis, applicant presented case for demolition.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the structure sits in a historic district and should follow the same guidelines.

Commissioner Cone indicated he would not support the demolition request. He further stated they were able to view the attic with the structural engineer but what he saw was a very sound structure. The wall framing was in good shape, base to the walls was in very good shape. The structure has one pier that is at a different elevation than the other piers. The pier is causing distortion, but walls, roof, base everything in the structure is in good shape and doesn't seem to be a compelling reason for demolition. When the property was purchased it was clear both structures were landmarked and made very clear to the owner. He feels if the owner has no use for the structure the owner should then take measures in securing the structure.

Commissioner Carpenter gave a report of the site visit. He believes the structure would not be a good candidate for relocation and feels the structure could possibly be restored in place.

Commissioner Shafer stated the address issue clouds the case terribly. He further indicated that if the applicant can't show the structure was built there, then there is a question of its relevance. He feels there is a bigger concern with historic integrity of the building.

Bebb Francis, applicant stated that the owner, Mr. Selig, has presented future plans. The owner has put significant dollars into 108 Barrera. There has been a plan and a commitment. He further indicated that if demolition was granted the owner will return with a landscaping plan.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to grant denial of demolition.

AYES: Cone, Brown, Maldonado, Carpenter

NAYS: Gonzalez, Cabel, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Connor

THE MOTION FAILED.

Commissioner Cone suggests for consideration of approval of demolition pending submittal of landscape plan.

Bebb Francis, applicant would accept demolition with stipulation for owner to return with a landscape plan.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Beyer to approve with the stipulation that the owner return to HDRC with a landscape plan prior to pulling the demolition permit.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: Cone, Brown, Maldonado

THE MOTION CARRIED.

8. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-016

Applicant: Edith Stockhardt

Address: 403 St. Anthony Ave.

Edith Stockhardt, owner presented case.

Lisa Davis, San Antonio Conservation Society, read into the record a letter of support from Rollette Schreckenghost, San Antonio Conservation Society President.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve a Finding of Historic Significance of the Gaenslen House at 403 St. Anthony Avenue.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

9. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-020

Applicant: Andres Andujar

Address: 700 N. St. Mary's

Andres Andujar, applicant presented the case for new construction at 700 N. St. Mary's. He stated he would agree to conduct an archaeological investigation of the property and accept the stipulation for landscape buffer from the river.

Commissioner Beyer encouraged the applicant to introduce landscaping where ever possible.

Commissioner Shafer stated he would add a stipulation that the applicant do archaeological work and engage a professional team. He further indicated the applicant would have to apply for an antiquities permit and until THC approves, no work should proceed.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve staff recommendations with the stipulations that the applicant perform an archaeological survey prior to construction and design of the parking structure include buffering from the river.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Commissioner Beyer left at 5:00 p.m.

10. HDRC CASE NO. 2009-369

Applicant: Alvin Groves

Address: 210 W. Market St.

Alvin Groves, applicant presented the case.

Commissioner Gonzales asked who would be responsible for maintenance.

Alvin Groves, applicant stated that the responsibility for maintenance is still in discussion. The fountain belongs to the City but would be an element of the museum.

Commissioner Maldonado gave the committee report. The main focus is the ADA issue.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated that from a conceptual stand point the design should be simpler and feels there is too much going on in that particular area.

Commissioner Cone asked if the fountain was designed by an artist.

Alvin Groves, applicant stated that the landscape architect and he are designing the fountain.

Commissioner Carpenter stated he is glad the steers have been eliminated and should find other public art.

Alvin Groves, applicant stated the steers were introduced because the area is the original cattle crossing.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with staff stipulations and with the added stipulation that the landscaping plan be compatible with the existing vegetation along the RiverWalk. The applicant should meet with the Design Review Committee prior to final approval.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

11. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-023

Applicant: City of San Antonio

Address: 517 E. Dewey

Owner was not present.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Cone to refer 517 E. Dewey to the DSDB for consideration to issue DSDB orders for the repairs.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. **HDRC CASE NO. 2009-389**

Applicant: Quynh and Gnocbich Nguyen

Address: 235 W. Mistletoe

Owner out of town.

Commissioner Cone gave the on site committee report. Neither parking in the front yard nor changing the front walkway into a driveway is not appropriate.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to grant denial.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Commissioner Gonzalez asked OHP staff to look into the possible demolition of the O'Krent Building and also the proposed flag pole on the Tower Life Building.
- Future Training Needs Assessment
- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 6:00 p.m.

APPROVED



Xavier Gonzalez
Chairperson