

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
FEBRUARY 17, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Gonzalez, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.
- Chairman's Statement.
- **PRESENT: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor**
- **ABSENT: Cone, Beyer**
- Citizens to be Heard
- Announcements
March 3rd HDRC meeting rescheduled to March 5, 2010
- Briefing on Public Art San Antonio
Jimmy LeFlore presented
- The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

1. Case No. 2010-055	San Antonio RiverWalk – Alamo Plaza
2. Case No. 2010-021	120 W. Elsmere Place
3. Case No. 2010-046	127 Devine Street
4. Case No. 2010-050	218 Washington Street
5. Case No. 2010-045	305 E. Euclid Avenue
6. Case No. 2010-043	330 Grayson Street
7. Case No. 2010-048	430 N. Cherry Street
8. Case No. 2010-049	526 Mission Street
9. Case No. 2010-022	2120 San Pedro
10. Case No. 2010-039	2833 E. Houston Street
11. Case No. 2010-019	318 E. Houston Street
12. Case No. 2010-047	211 W. French Place
13. Case No. 2010-038	231 Losoya Avenue
14. Case No. 2010-041	1606 N. Alamo
15. Case No. 2010-053	126 E. Lullwood Avenue
16. Case No. 2010-037	335 King William

Commissioner Cabel made a request to pull Case No. 2010-055 and 2010-041 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve the remaining items on the Consent Agenda with staff's stipulations.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2010-055

Applicant: Ford, Powell & Carson Architects

Address: RiverWalk – Alamo Plaza

John Mise, applicant, presented the signage proposal.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to grant conceptual approval as submitted.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC NO. 2010-041

Applicant: James Duwayne Greene

Address: 1606 N. Alamo

Duwayne Greene, owner, made a brief presentation.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve with stipulations to use a lower profile snap seam and narrower seam on the ridges and valleys, 24 gauge with Kynar finish and panel width of 16-18 inches to be used. Applicant to work with the Office of Historic Preservation on the specific details.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

17. HDRC NO. 2009-253

Applicant: River Bank Ltd.

Address: 123 Losoya

Commissioner Maldonado gave the committee report.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the updated drawings presented at the 2/17/10 HDRC meeting.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

18. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-030

Applicant: Ward Richter

Address: 124 E. Elsmere Place

Commissioner Maldonado gave the committee report.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to grant conceptual approval.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

19. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-042

Applicant: Operative Holdings, LLC

Address: 115 Devine Street

Commissioner Maldonado gave committee report.

Hilary Scruggs, owner, presented project.

Commissioner Carpenter suggested pulling the parking to the east and possibly adding landscaping to help shade the west side.

Commissioner Maldonado stated as the project moves on she would like to see the overhang issue resolved and work on the water deflection system.

Commissioner Gonzalez encouraged that the applicant continue the finish just above the ground as opposed to stopping where the slab is.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to grant conceptual approval of the drawings submitted February 19, 2010 with the stipulations that the applicant continue looking at the adjoining wall, evaluate the guide wire, address the parking issue, overhang issue and the water deflection system.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

20. HDRC CASE NO. 2009-380

Applicant: Davis Sprinkle

Address: 1111 S. Alamo

Commissioner Gonzalez gave the committee report.

Davis Sprinkle, applicant stated he has met with San Antonio Conservation Society and King William Association.

Commissioner Shafer read into the record a letter from King William Association.

Davis Sprinkle, applicant stated the railing will continue all the way around the roof.

Commissioner Shafer asked the applicant if he would be willing to lighten the exterior color.

Davis Sprinkle, applicant stated that the owner feels darkening the color would be more in keeping with the historic district.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to grant conceptual approval of the amendment with the stipulation that the railing extend to encompass the entire roof area.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

The second motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to grant final approval of the colors, guardrail and exterior firescape stairs as submitted with the stipulation that the applicant remove the signage currently on the building and the reconstruction of the fencing.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

21. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-054

Applicant: City of San Antonio Office of Historic Preservation

Address: 1902 -2055 W Gramercy Pl, 1901-2055 W Kings Hwy, 1902-2055 W Summit,
1902-2055 W Mulberry, 1900-2055 W Huisache, 1902-2055 W Magnolia,
1901-2055 W Mistletoe, 1901-2065 W Woodlawn (north side of street only)

Rollette Schreckenghost, San Antonio Conservation Society, supports the proposed Phase 5 Expansion of the Monticello Historic District. The area considered for the expansion is a continuation of the recognition of the historic significance of the Woodlawn Terrace development platted in 1923. The additional area is consistent in style, materials and association with the previously designated areas.

Roberto Hinkson, President Monticello Park HD, requested the support of the HDRC.

Richard Tankersley – Vice President Monticello Park HD, requested the approval of the HDRC.

Alicia Daneils, 2024 W. Kings Highway, stated her particular block opposes. The block has no cohesive pattern and has houses from 1921-1960's.

Juan Sandoval, 1903 W. Woodlawn, stated he has reservations about joining the historic district.

Marie Cooper, 1940 W. Summit, stated she is in full support of the designation.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she has seen a great evolution. Many people are very passionate about preservation.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve a finding of historic significance for the Monticello Park Phase 5 Historic District.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

22. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-052

Applicant: Scott Hays

Address: 351 E. Huisache Avenue

Scott Hays, owner, presented. He indicated that he completely relied on his contractor to pull the appropriate permits.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the ribbon driveway is a defining feature and have asked other residents to replace their ribbon driveways. She further indicated that she could support concrete up to the approach and across the sidewalk but would much rather see a ribbon driveway.

Commissioner Gonzalez asked about control joints. He further suggested scoring to tell a story of a ribbon drive, the scores could recall what was there.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she is not comfortable and feels this is a great opportunity to place two ribbons.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated he would like to see the concrete die into the stone.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve staff recommendation for a concrete ribbon driveway and salvage stone for retaining wall. Concrete to terminate into the stone along the retaining wall.

AMENDMENT

Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Salas to include pavers between the two ribbons upon approval of the Design Review Committee and will return with the material of the pavers.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: Maldonado

THE MOTION CARRIED.

AMENDMENT

Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Salas to allow staff to administratively approve the appropriate infill.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

23. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-040

Applicant: Abraham Alecozay

Address: 403 W. Elsmere Place

Abraham Alecozay, owner, presented his case.

Rollette Schreckenghost, San Antonio Conservation Society, stated the clay tile roof was a crowning feature of the building, also distinguished by its exuberant cut stone exterior. The replacement roof is a poor substitute for the original. Strongly recommend replacement in kind.

Commissioner Carpenter stated the tile could have been stocked piled, repair the structural issues and replaced the few broken tiles.

Commissioner Maldonado in this particular issue, clay tile is the only option. The clay tile is a very defining element.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve staff's recommendation of clay tiles to be replaced with in-kind material.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Brown, Maldonado, Salas, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Presentation and public comment regarding proposed historic district and historic landmark designation in River North area.

Shanon Wasielewski, Historic Preservation Officer, briefed the HDRC on the River North area.

Anna Glover, Office of Historic Preservation, briefed the HDRC on the process.

Elizabeth Porterfield, Office of Historic Preservation, briefed the HDRC on the designation criteria.

Citizens to be Heard:

Art Martinez, Ft Sam Houston VFW, stated they are already designated, however, request that the carriage house be undesignated.

William Malcomson, Pastor of Redemption Ministries, stated just because something is old, it does not mean it is historic.

Barbara Witte-Howell, San Antonio Conservation Society, stated SACS is in full support of historic designation and historic designation of individual landmarks in the River North Area. It is important to recognize the area's historic and architectural legacy through the City's historic designation process.

William Burkeholder, 901 N. Alamo, stated the area is in dire need of development and by designating it a historic district rather than historic properties; this could slow down the development.

Stella Elizondo, 515 & 514 Erie and 702 Quincy, stated she does not support the designation and requests that her properties be excluded.

David Addleman, asked would one criteria to be considered be the use in terms of functional challenges.

Patrick Lopez, KLRN, concerned with the ability to function as a t.v. station.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

APPROVED



Xavier Gonzalez
Chairperson