

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
MARCH 16, 2011**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

ABSENT: Beyer, Salas

- Chairman's Statement
- Announcements
- Citizens to be heard

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|------------------------------------|
| 1. Case No. 2011-048 | 3503 Martin Luther King Dr. |
| 2. Case No. 2010-160 | Various – Beacon Hill Linear Park |
| 3. Case No. 2011-053 | 5707 Sthly 151 |
| 4. Case No. 2011-055 | 2315 Avenue B |
| 5. Case No. 2011-056 | 518 E. Houston St. |
| 6. Case No. 2011-052 | 217 Daniel |
| 7. Case No. 2011-057 | 1721 E. Houston St. |
| 8. Case No. 2011-058 | 818 Lamar St. |
| 9. Case No. 2011-001 | 108 W. French Pl. |
| 10. Case No. 2011-041 | 315 Leigh |
| 11. Case No. 2011-054 | 600 HemisFair Plaza Way, Bldg. 203 |

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve the cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Guarino, Maldonado, Beyer, Salas, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Barrera

THE MOTION CARRIED.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to move up item 14 – 1015 Nolan on the agenda.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC NO. 2011-059

Applicant: Jenny Hernandez

Address: 1015 Nolan

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to:

- 1) Replace three windows on rear addition with double-hung, one over one Jeld-Wen wood windows. Remove smaller side window.
- 2) Enclose door to the right of the main entrance. Door was added when the home was converted to multi-family use. Replace trim surrounding main entry door and porch area window.
- 3) Replace wrought iron porch supports with square wood posts. Details of posts to match nearby historic homes.
- 4) Install gravel driveway at existing curb cut.
- 5) Replace rear screen porch addition with wood deck.

Jenny Hernandez, owner, stated she would agree to staff's recommendations.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

**HDRC recessed into Executive Session at 3:22 P.M.
HDRC reconvened at 4:00 P.M.**

Commissioner Guarino recused himself from HDRC Case No.2010-267

12. HDRC NO. 2010-267

Applicant: LMN Architects

Address: 100 Auditorium Circle

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Partially demolish and rehabilitate Municipal Auditorium as a performance art center.
- 2) Construct an addition to the historic structure to house a 1,750 seat Performance Hall with box tier and full stage house that will meet the highest standards for symphonic, operatic, theatrical and amplified presentations. Addition to also include a 230 seat flat floor Studio Theatre that allows for various theatrical configurations, music rehearsal and community events. A complete array of back of house technical and performance support spaces will be provided for both performance venues.

To accommodate the new program spaces and achieve the high standards for acoustical quality, technical excellence and patron experience, a portion of the existing building is proposed to be demolished. The scope of demolition work includes the existing auditorium and surrounding support spaces. The existing Spanish Colonial Revival style front and side facades will remain and new construction includes the renovation of the existing historic front facade and side arcades composed of Indiana limestone field stone detailing and single pane, true divided light steel windows. The building will be provided with completely new systems including structural, mechanical, electrical, lighting, fire protection, theatrical lighting and equipment, performance sound, telecommunications and security.

Bruce Bugg, Chairman & President of the Bexar County Performing Arts Foundation, made opening remarks.

Phil Hardberger stated this is a very significant project. The fifteen million dollars given by the Tobin Endowment, is the second largest gift given to the City of San Antonio. This building, once it opens, will have the best acoustics in the State of Texas. The Municipal Auditorium is greatly underused.

Nelson Wolf, stated will be a wonderful project. The County has put in 9.9 million and the private sector has put in 1.9 million, almost 12 million has been expended towards this wonderful facility.

Mark Reddington, presented the design in detail.

Commissioner Carpenter presented committee report.

Margaret Camargo stated she believes the elegance and grand interior will be destroyed.

Rollette Schreckenghost, San Antonio Conservation Society, stated the SACS has been very concerned with the renovation plans for the City's beloved Municipal Auditorium. The concern was based largely on the veil that will reconfigure this iconic downtown landmark. The remaining concern is to not remove the "Municipal Auditorium" letters over the front entrance since the auditorium was built in 1929 as a memorial to World War I veterans. The letters MUNICIPAL AUDITORIUM should remain where they are on the front of the building as a historical statement, and a small remnant of the WWI memorial to those that gave so much.

Commissioner Cone requested a clarification from City Attorney on HDRC's purview on the signage.

Wayne Chote, attorney, clarified the issue of naming rights.

Commissioner Connor stated the applicant has responded wonderfully to modifying the windows in an appropriate way. Commissioner Connor stated he is impressed with the addition of the lower veil.

Commissioner Shafer stated the applicant has done a wonderful job in working with the Design Review Committee with such a challenging project.

Commissioner Carpenter stated the resulting piece of architecture is beautiful. The design works on a civic scale but also there has been careful work and refinement to the design. Commissioner Carpenter further stated he would like to see a metallic finish.

Commissioner Cabel stated there are a few issues that still need resolution but are not too significant enough to hold up progress.

Commissioner Barrera stated he commends the applicant for taking the task in designing a significant piece as delicately as possible.

Commissioner Rodriguez asked the applicant to further explain the features that will be retained on the front façade.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she is concerned with birds perching on the veil. She further expressed concern with the veil encroaching on the historic building and the protection of the statue. Commissioner Maldonado suggested an inventory be done of all the plaques and statues on the property and how they will be preserved and not removed.

Commissioner Cone stated the building design has evolved and appreciate the applicant's response. Commissioner Cone stated he shares the concern of the perching birds issue and the height of the veil.

Commissioner Shafer stated that what ever is taken down is documented and appropriately archived.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to:

Item 1:

Final approval of Item 1, the partial demolition and rehabilitation of the historic landmark and veteran's memorial Municipal Auditorium with the following stipulations:

- 1) Though the doors may be reconstructions, they are part of the original design intent for the building and should remain in the building.
- 2) The lettering above the main entrance identifying the historic name of the building, Municipal Auditorium, will remain and signage will be sent to committee for additional review.
- 3) A photographic inventory of all plaques, historic markers and statues on the property must be submitted to staff prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness being issued.

Item 2:

All information and comments will reference the new drawings submitted 3/9/2011 and no drawings prior to that date.

- 1) Every effort should be made to minimize the visibility from street level of the rooftop braces supporting the veil structure. The braces shown on sheets A303-307 may be visible to pedestrians. The applicant has agreed to this stipulation.
- 2) A preservation plan is issued to staff prior to receiving a Certificate of Appropriateness on all trees that will remain prior to construction.
- 3) Every effort is made to minimize the bird perching issue.
- 4) Final approval of lighting design.
- 5) Elevator, by the river connection area, is made of a translucent material.
- 6) Remove the veil extended from the building located by the loading dock or the option to return with a smaller/ lower in scale to allow a pedestrian friendly feel.
- 7) Every effort is made to minimize the overall height of the veil at the fly space.
- 8) Signage will be sent to committee for additional review and no existing signage may be removed.

DISCUSSION:

Audrey Zamora-Johnson, City Attorney's Office, stated that the applicant is asking for final approval and has not amended their request for conceptual approval on any item. Based on the UDC what should be voted on is what the applicant has submitted in their application, in this case, it would be for final approval.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Maldonado, Cabel, Rodriguez

NAYS: Barrera, Shafer, Connor

RECUSED: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

HDRC recessed for 10 minutes: 5:55 – 6:05 P.M.

13. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-051

Applicant: Westside Historic Preservation Group

Address: 1312 Guadalupe

The applicant is requesting a Finding of Historic Significance based on the following criteria for evaluation listed in Sec. 35-607 of the Unified Development Code:

- Sec. 35-607 (b)1 Its value as a visible reminder of the cultural heritage of the community;
- Sec. 35-607 (b)2 Its location as a site of a significant local event;
- Sec. 35-607 (b)3 Its identification with a person or persons who significantly contributed to the development of the community;
- Sec. 35-607 (b)7 Its unique location or singular physical characteristics that make it an established or familiar visual feature;
- Sec. 35-607 (b)8 Its historical and cultural integrity of location, design, and materials;
- Sec. 35-607 (b)11 It is distinctive in character, interest and value and strongly exemplifies the cultural, economic, social, ethnic and historical heritage of San Antonio
- Sec. 35-607 (b)12 It is an important example of a particular architectural type; and
- Sec. 35-607 (b)13 It bears an important and significant relationship to other distinctive structures by contributing to the overall character of the area based on architectural, historic or cultural motif.

Graciela Sanchez, Westside Historic Preservation Group, presented.

Oscar Ramirez, Avenida Guadalupe Association, owner, presented.

Rollette Schreckenghost, San Antonio Conservation Society, stated the “Pink Building” is an important architectural and cultural asset to the City’s Westside and is deserving of a Finding of Historic Significance. SACS has urged Avenida Guadalupe Association Board of Directors to consider options other than demolition to allow for an adequate period of time to raise funds and make the necessary repairs to 1312 Guadalupe Street and urge HDRC to find in favor of Historic Significance.

Rita Vidal stated she is in favor of designating the structure.

Marisa Gonzalez stated she is in favor of designating the building at 1312 Guadalupe.

Araceli Herrera stated she is in favor of saving the building at 1312 Guadalupe.

Laura Codena stated she is in favor of saving the structure at 1312 Guadalupe. It is vital to save the neighborhood history.

Amy Castalee stated she is in favor of designating the structure significant.

Abigail Atuna stated she believes the structure should be demolished in order to move forward with progress. The community will benefit from the “La Promesa” project.

Mary Agnes Rodriguez stated every building and every house has a story to tell to help build the history of San Antonio.

Thomas Frausta stated place truly matters and the “Pink House” is a part of San Antonio history. Casa Maldonado serves as a reminder of a working class human resilience and creativity.

Efrien Fernandez stated the neighborhood has progressed and by demolishing the structure Avenida can further move the community towards the future.

Carmela Plat stated she is in favor of designating 1312 Guadalupe.

Theresa Hernandez stated 1312 Guadalupe is the only building Avenida owns and the completion of the entire “Promesa Project” will help Avenida become self sufficient.

Daniel Gonzalez stated he is in favor of designation.

Gabriel Velasquez stated the group present at HDRC is one group but with different perspectives. Avenida Guadalupe was created to make a difference in the Westside.

Rodolfo Rosales stated he is in favor of designation.

Armando Valdez stated Avenida is a great resource in the community and serve a definite need.

Susana Segura stated she is in favor of preserving and designating 1312 Guadalupe. This could possibly be a great opportunity for Avenida Guadalupe to incorporate into “La Promesa” project.

Isabel Sanchez stated she is in favor of designating 1312 Guadalupe.

Molly Watt stated she is in favor of designating 1312 Guadalupe.

Rachel Jennings stated she is in favor of designating 1312 Guadalupe. Casa Maldonado has a rich complex significant history.

Patti Radle stated she is in favor of designating 1312 Guadalupe.

Guadalupe Espinoza stated many of the individuals in favor of 1312 Guadalupe do not live in the neighborhood. La Promesa project must move forward.

Commissioner Cabel asked the applicant if there is a plan in place if the structure is designated.

Commissioner Connor stated he understands the views on both sides. Architecturally it is not significant.

Commissioner Carpenter stated he appeals to Avenida Guadalupe to really consider integrating the structure into the project and if there is no possible way to do so, then there should be a component of the project that focuses on community memory.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the building has touched people in many different ways and really shows the passion the people have for their community.

Commissioner Shafer left the meeting.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Barrera to grant denial for a finding of historic significance.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Cabel

NAYS: Carpenter, Guarino, Maldonado, Connor, Rodriguez

THE MOTION FAILED.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Rodriguez to approve a Finding of Historic Significance based on staff recommendations and UDC Sec. 35-607(b)1, 35-607(b)11 and 35-607(b)13.

AYES: Carpenter, Guarino, Maldonado, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: Cone, Barrera, Cabel

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Meeting minutes for 12/1 and 12/15, 2010

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve December 1 and December 15, 2010 minutes.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Cabel, Connor, Rodriguez

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 9:30 p.m.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair