

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
JUNE 15, 2011**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel

ABSENT: Beyer, Salas, Connor, Rodriguez

- Chairman’s Statement
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 1. Case No. 2010-236 | 600 E. Theo Ave. PULLED |
| 2. Case No. 2011-077 | Haven for Hope - Multiple locations downtown PULLED |
| 3. Case No. 2011-103 | 107 Mary Louise PULLED |
| 4. Case No. 2011-104 | 3903 North St. Mary’s Street |
| 5. Case No. 2011-107 | 5626 San Fernando Street |
| 6. Case No. 2011-118 | 514 W. Commerce PULLED |
| 7. Case No. 2011-112 | La Villita - Signage PULLED |
| 8. Case No. 2011-119 | La Villita – Signage Design Guidelines PULLED |
| 9. Case No. 2011-116 | 314 Sherman |
| 10. Case No. 2011-115 | 126 Camargo |
| 11. Case No. 2011-102 | 132 Camargo |
| 12. Case No. 2011-101 | 719 S. Palmetto |
| 13. Case No. 2003-185 | 1131 SE Military Drive PULLED |
| 14. Case No. 2010-431 | 511 Dallas PULLED |
| 15. Case No. 2011-109 | 201 N. St. Mary’s #102 |
| 16. Case No. 2011-105 | 245 E. Commerce PULLED |
| 17. Case No. 2011-100 | 237 Donaldson Ave. |
| 18. Case No. 2011-099 | 102 Crofton PULLED |
| 19. Case No. 2010-420 | 120 Produce Row PULLED |
| 20. Case No. 2011-113 | 414 Navarro |

Commissioner Cabel pulled items 1, 2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 13, 14, 16 and 18 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Maldonado pulled item 19 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

1. HDRC NO. 2010-236

Applicant: James Gray

Address: 600 E. Theo Avenue

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct new entry portal and related park improvements from the San Antonio River Mission Reach to Mission Concepcion.

The Mission Concepcion Portal is part of a series of Mission Reach river enhancement projects designed to improve the environmental and visual quality of the southern portion of the San Antonio River. The portal site lies along the San Antonio River just north of Theo Avenue Bridge. The architecture of the portal will be guided by the Mission Concepcion, reinforcing its massive and dignified qualities. The portal's other spaces and features will become a canvas for crafts and artwork inspired by the history of the five missions.

Brian Mask, applicant for 600 E. Theo Ave.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

2. HDRC NO. 2011-077

Applicant: Haven for Hope

Address: Multiple locations downtown

Paula Stallcup, Downtown Operations Department, presented.

Commissioner Barrera stated he is not taking any exception to the proposed donation station meters but questions if it is fair to other organizations not to have a permanent location for receiving contributions.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

ABSTAIN: Barrera

THE MOTION CARRIED.

6. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-118

Applicant: Paul Stallcup, Downtown Operations

Address: 514 W. Commerce

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to move the Works Progress Administration plaque and Municipal Truck Market plaque located on the east side of the El Mercado building near the service alley where they are not visible to the public. Request is to move them to a more highly visible location.

Colleen Swain, Downtown Operations, presented.

Commissioner Barrera stated once the signs are moved to the proposed location there should be some sort of sign identifying where the signs originally placed.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve with a stipulation that once the plaques are moved to the new location there should be an indication on the new site where the plaques originally came from.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

3. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-103

Applicant: VIA Metropolitan Transit

Address: 107 Mary Louise

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a new transit stop and associated infrastructure within the public right of way and proposed easement at 107 Mary Louise and Fredericksburg Rd.

The shelter will be one of eight similarly designed station stops for the new Fredericksburg Rd. Rapid Bus Line. Service proposed to begin in late 2012.

Christine Vina, VIA, presented.

Ferne Burney, Monticello Park Neigh. Assoc., President, stated that VIA's transit stop requires much more design attention before receiving Monticello Park Neigh. Assoc. support. Monticello Park has been a supporter of the Bus Rapid Transit line being installed along Fredericksburg Road. The current design, however, does not embrace the historic nature of its surroundings as had been previously promised.

Robert Sipes, stated he fully supports the project in general, however not what is being currently proposed. There must be more interaction with the neighborhood and VIA.

Commissioner Maldonado stated there are significant concerns with scale and massing and how it relates to the existing building.

Audrey Zamora Johnson, City Attorney's Office clarified for the record that if HDRC is requesting dialogue with a homeowner association or neighborhood association it is appropriate, however it should not be a misperception that in no way that HDRC is delegating approval or authority as a part of the dialogue taking place.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant conceptual approval with stipulations:

- 1) Return to the Design Review Committee prior to final approval
- 2) Consider an alternate location of the fence and the material of the fence
- 3) Material of the station should be compatible to the pedestrian features currently in the Deco District
- 4) Overall scale and massing should be respectful of the building currently on the property
- 5) Trees that will be removed should be replaced and a landscaping component accompany the design of the station
- 6) The relationship of the stop should interact with the neighborhood
- 7) Public right-of-way sidewalk should be scored to match the 45 degree angle scoring that is present in the Deco District
- 8) Include City of San Antonio public right-of-way
- 9) Continue working with the neighborhood association – notify of Design Review Committee meeting

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-112

Applicant: Beth Wells, Bender Wells Clark Design

Address: La Villita – Signage

A series of identification and directional signs have been developed to guide visitors into and through the site. The panels of the signs will be constructed of aluminum and painted with new updated colors. All posts will be painted steel. The proposed colors will coordinate with the new River Walk signage but be distinct enough to create a separate identity for La Villita.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Re-face the large quatrefoil identification signs on Alamo and Villita Street and those located along the River Walk.
- 2) Posts of the existing kiosks will be re-painted and a new cap, map panel, and directory will be installed. The map panels in the directories will be oriented to the way the person is facing to make way finding easier.
- 3) Smaller post mounted map panels with directories will be installed in selected areas to facilitate way finding.
- 4) Install new building number signs will be to coordinate with the directory identification and for public safety reasons.
- 5) Replace existing Plaza identification signs with quatrefoil shaped signs to match the La Villita identification signs.
- 6) Install new directional signage at key decision points. Existing movable and fixed directional signs will be removed.
- 7) Install Flag mounted removable restroom signs displaying the international symbols at all restroom locations.

Beth Wells, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with staff stipulations and additional stipulation that the applicant obtain staff approval prior to implementing item 4.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.**8. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-119**

Applicant: Beth Wells, Bender Wells Clark Design

Address: La Villita – Signage Design Guidelines

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to establish Signage Design Guidelines for La Villita tenants.

Beth Wells, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC CASE NO. 2003-185

Applicant: Ed Hernandez

Address: 1131 SE Military Drive

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

Revise original final approval for Mission Plaza shopping center to include a new service entry to be accessible only from Mission Road

Project was previously approved with stipulation for buffer and no entry along Mission Road.

Ed Hernandez, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant conceptual approval with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-431

Applicant: Sue Ann Pemberton, Mainstreet Architects

Address: 511 Dallas

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Rehabilitate and adapt a currently vacant historic residence for use as a medical eye care center.

- 1) Remove existing rear addition.
- 2) Construct a new 1-story addition to the rear and side of building. Roof pitch, windows, siding and details to match historic structure.
- 3) Restore historic structure including windows, porch, dormers and siding.
- 4) Historic Tax Certification.

Sue Ann Pemberton, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Carpenter presented the committee report.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to approve with staff stipulations excluding solar panels.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-105

Applicant: Frank G. Obregon

Address: 245 E. Commerce

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install signage on existing sign post on RiverWalk (Previously Panini's location).
2. Install dual head light fixtures in planter (to be installed by Downtown Operations)

Frank Obregon, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve as submitted.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

18. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-099

Applicant: Guadalupe & Angie Garza

Address: 102 Crofton

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct an approximately 12' x 43' second-story addition to existing home. Install aluminum windows with wood screens and Hardie plank siding to match the previous addition. Roofing material and paint color to match existing home.

Guadalupe Garza, owner, introduced himself for the record.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with staff stipulations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

19. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-420

Applicant: Sprinkle & Co. Architects

Address: 120 Produce Row

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to replace existing plastic weather protection shrouds and table umbrellas with lightweight protective fabric awning over outdoor dining area to complement existing awnings on the El Mercado Building across Produce Row. Awning color will be beige. Awnings will be supported by steel posts. Existing wrought iron railings to be modified to fit within proposed column spacing. Existing trees to remain in place and penetrate through proposed canopy when necessary. The existing light poles will remain in place.

Meredith Siegel, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she is concerned with size, scale and massing. There is a missed opportunity in utilizing the balcony and the shade that currently exists. She further stated that she is concerned that not every option has been evaluated for a free standing canopy. The ultimate goal is to preserve the integrity of the balcony.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant conceptual approval of the revised drawings submitted June 8, 2011 with stipulations that the frieze band be protected in the installation of the canopy in such a way that it is reversible and remove all the speakers and conduit wire.

AYES: Cone, Barrera, Guarino, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: Carpenter, Maldonado

THE MOTION CARRIED.**21. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-045**

Applicant: Chad Stranahan

Address: 600 Soledad St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to revitalize an existing outdoor site at the Main Library to attain greater use and function for the public. Project to add flexible use/rentable areas, flexible use hardscape/media areas, outdoor education areas and passive reading spaces.

- 1) Replace original stained concrete walkways with cut limestone walkways.
- 2) Install perimeter green screen fencing. Fencing to be 5'6" in height. Fencing to include 5'w x 6'h x 10"d Cantera stone clad walls, 5 along Augusta Street and 8 along the pathway adjacent to the parking garage.
- 3) Install green screen pedestrian gates and fencing in existing openings of delta wall. Gates and fencing to be 5'6" in height.
- 4) Install green screen rolling vehicular gate along Augusta Street. Gate will be 5'6" in height. Limestone clad gate columns will be 6ft. in height.
- 5) Construct circular outdoor stage area with trellis and perimeter seating. Backstage wall will be 8ft in height. Trellis columns to be 8ft in height. Walls, columns and stage steps to be constructed of limestone. Overhead trellis to be steel. Trellis height will be 10ft. Perimeter to include a section of 1'9" stone seating wall flanked by boulder seating at least 24" in height. Additional boulder seating to be installed between trellis and stage. Stage area to be defined by 2ft flagstone banding. Interior of circle to be sod.
- 6) Construct five additional circular gathering spaces. Spaces to be defined by 2ft flagstone banding and include stone wall seating and boulder seating. Interior of circular spaces to be paved with flagstone or a combination of flagstone and sod.
- 7) Install curvilinear flagstone pathway, with seating and planting areas in area between Main Library and Parking Garage. Place benches in seating areas.
- 8) Install plant material per planting plan. Install irrigation system.
- 9) Install site lighting.

Chad Stranahan, applicant, presented.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve with staff stipulations striking stipulations 1, 5 and 6.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.**22. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-098**

Applicant: Humberto & Victoria Rodriguez

Address: 936 Dawson

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to construct a new 1-story home on a vacant lot in the Dignowity Hill Historic District. Home to be square in plan and cover approximately 1100 sq. ft. including the front porch and rear screen porch. Exterior siding will be wood clapboard siding. Side gable roof with asphalt shingles. Windows will be 1/1 double-paned, all wood frame, low E2 (3050 windows. All operable windows will be covered with wood frames screens. Exterior window trim will be 1" x 6". Exterior doors will be metal. A simple carport with gable roof will be constructed behind the home.

Luis Garcia, owner's representative, stated he is familiar with staff stipulations and willing to abide by them.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to approve with staff stipulations and the additional stipulation that hand rail in front should be integrated with the porch hand rail in a residential manner.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.**23. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-106**

Applicant: Rene LaFuente

Address: 2301 W. Kings Highway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1) Replace existing chain link fence with 4' wrought iron fence with 14" stucco columns

2) Demolish existing accessory dwelling at rear of property

Rene LaFuente, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the property is in a unique site in the historic district. The request for stucco columns on the wrought iron fence is inappropriate.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve item 2 and denial of item 1.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

24. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-114

Applicant: Robert N. Cruz

Address: 401 Kendall

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Replace four existing 1/1 wood windows with aluminum windows.
- 2) Replace second-story 1/1 wood window with a steel 9-light door.

Windows and door were installed without prior approval or City permits in December 2010.

Robert Cruz, owner, presented.

Commissioner Maldonado stated the windows installed are not appropriate for the historic district.

Commissioner Cabel motioned that the case be referred for an on site visit. Motion failed due to lack of a second.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to deny items 1 and 2.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Maldonado, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: Barrera, Guarino, Cabel

THE MOTION CARRIED.

25. HDRC CASE NO. 2011-089

Applicant: William McDonald

Address: 631 E. Guenther House

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

- 1) Demolish existing 18' x 28' wood frame shed at rear of property.
- 2) Construct a 1,200 sq. ft. 2-car garage and storage building. Garage height will be 14' 4" at ridgeline. Exterior to be clad with board and batten and shingle style Hardie siding. Roof to be standing seam metal and feature two dormer vents. Double hung windows to match historic home. Install two 12' double flat panel overhead garage door. Facade facing the home features two half-light panel doors and a covered porch. An arbor will extend from the porch. Install concrete apron along length of building facing alley.
- 3) Replace existing perimeter fence with new 6ft. cedar fencing along rear and side (South only) property lines. Construct new fence with gate between new structure and South perimeter fence.

William McDonald, applicant, presented.

Commissioner Maldonado presented the committee report.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to grant conceptual approval of new drawings submitted May 26, 2011 and additional stipulations that 2 windows, similar to existing windows, be added on the Constance Street elevation and the applicant should return to staff with lighting.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Cabel, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

Recess 5:15 – 5:20 PM

• Citizens to be heard

Commissioner Maldonado stated the letters from Municipal Auditorium have been removed. She expressed concern with the actions that were being taken at the location in reference to compliance with the Certificate of Appropriateness. Commissioner Maldonado requested that Office of Historic Preservation and Development Services Department monitor the demolition as there have been things occurring outside the scope of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Commissioner Cabel left at 5:25 PM

26. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-237

Applicant: Alamo Architects

Address: 112 Lindell

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Demolish existing structure to make way for new construction.

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

Construct 6-unit apartment building, two-car garage, and a covered parking area along the alley. Plans will require demolition of the existing structure. Two of the units are one bedroom flats. One of the units is a two bedroom flat. Three of the units are two bedroom townhouses. A courtyard will be the central amenity for the residents and opens on the west to the street.

Ken Brown, representative for applicant and owner, presented unreasonable economic hardship for 112 Lindell.

Irby Hightower, Alamo Architects, presented the loss of significance for 112 Lindell.

Bebb Francis, representative for River Road Historic District, spoke against demolition. There are 161 properties in the River Road Historic District and 93% of residents are against demolition. River Road Historic District is a unique district. Every opportunity was given to the applicant to provide proof to reach the threshold of preponderance evidence to make a determination of unreasonable economic hardship.

Bob Buchanan spoke against the demolition. Mr. Buchanan gave a history of the neighborhood.

Barbara Witte Howell spoke against the demolition. Ms. Howell gave a history of 112 Lindell.

Larry De Martino spoke against the demolition.

Donna Martin spoke against the demolition.

John Larqued spoke against the demolition. Mr. Larqued stated that Asher Reilly and his wife attended the neighborhood meeting and indicated that they purchased 112 Lindell and will live in the home. River Road Historic District was surprised when the Reilly's proposed an apartment complex. The home at 112 Lindell is not in bad condition.

Recess 6:55 – 7:00 PM

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado that the economic hardship determination has not been met.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: Barrera

THE MOTION CARRIED.

The motion was made by Commissioner Barrera and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to reconsider the economic hardship determination case.

AYES: Barrera, Maldonado

NAYS: Cone, Carpenter, Guarino, Shafer, Connor

THE MOTION FAILED.

Commissioner Connor stated he is not convinced that the structure ever had much architectural significance. The neighborhood was designated as a whole and made a historic district without any contributing buildings. Commissioner Connor believes that makes the neighborhood, in its totality, a historic district of consequence and significance.

Commissioner Shafer stated there are some serious problems to the structure. The upper labour runs very near 112 Lindell.

Commissioner Barrera stated there have been numerous modifications to the structure.

Commissioner Carpenter feels that if the building were taken down, there would be a loss to the totality of the neighborhood. The basis for the historic district is a contiguous, geographically defined area of houses.

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to refer to an on site visit for a determination as to whether the property has had a loss of significance and return to HDRC. Also to consider the archaeological issues.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- March 16, April 6, and April 20, 2011 meeting minutes.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Connor to approve April 6 and April 20, 2011 minutes as submitted.

March 16, 2011 minutes with the correction to Page 5, Commission Action Item 2, stipulation #8 – Signage will be sent to committee for additional review and no existing signage may be removed.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Barrera, Guarino, Maldonado, Shafer, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:45 p.m.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair