

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
JUNE 16, 2010**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 p.m., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Gonzalez, Chairperson, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

ABSENT: Brown, Beyer, Salas

- Chairman’s Statement.
- Citizens to be Heard:
- Announcements:

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 1. Case No. 2010-185 | 600 N. Presa St. (400 E. Houston) |
| 2. Case No. 2010-171 | Bike Share Program – Various locations through out PULLED
Downtown |
| 3. Case No. 2010-180 | 115 W. Magnolia |
| 4. Case No. 2010-179 | 3805 Broadway |
| 5. Case No. 2010-178 | West & East Houston St. (N. Alamo St. to N. Santa Rosa) |
| 6. Case No. 2010-177 | Alamo Plaza |
| 7. Case No. 2010-174 | Hays St. Bridge (between Austin & Cherry - Signage) PULLED |
| 8. Case No. 2010-175 | Hays St. Bridge (between Austin & Cherry – Public Art) PULLED |
| 9. Case No. 2010-172 | 6518 W. Hausman Rd. |
| 10. Case No. 2010-182 | 101 E. Craig Place |
| 11. Case No. 2010-186 | 312 Pearl Parkway |
| 12. Case No. 2010-181 | 3105 Shane |

Commissioner Cabel made a request to pull Case No. 2010-171 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

Commissioner Maldonado made a request to pull Case No. 2010-174 & 2010-175 from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

The motion was made by Commissioner Cone and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve the remaining items on the Consent Agenda with staff stipulations.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

2. HDRC NO. 2010-171

Applicant: Julia Diana c/o COSA Office of environmental Policy

Address: Various Locations through out downtown – Bike Share Program

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to:

1) Install 14 bike sharing rental stations located through-out the downtown area. The following locations are proposed:

Station 1: San Antonio Museum of Art

Station 2: Southwest School of Arts & Crafts

- Baptist Medical Center

- San Antonio Central Library

Station 3: Travis Park

- Texas Rangers Museum

Station 4: Vistana

- Market Square

- Milam Square

Station 5: University of Texas - San Antonio

Station 6: Main Plaza

- City Hall

- San Fernando Cathedral

Station 7: La Villita

- West Entrance

Station 8: The Alamo

- Rivercenter Mall placement

- Menger Hotel

Station 9: Henry Gonzales Convention Center

- Grand Hyatt Complex

- Marriott

Station 10: Federal Offices

- HemisFair Park

Station 11: Villa Finale Visitors Center

- Texas Highway Patrol Museum

Station 12: Blue Star Arts Complex

- Guenther House

Station 13: Sunset Station

Station 14: Alamodome

Laurence Doxsey, Office of Environmental Policy, presented the case.

Roberto Hinkson, San Antonio Conservation Society, read into the record a letter from Rollette Schreckenghost, President. The San Antonio Conservation Society is concerned that there is no information about the specific locations to be proposed. Too many of the proposed site locations are located in historic areas, the very area the HDRC is charged with protecting against visual clutter and

commercial exploitation. Areas outside of or immediately adjacent to historic places, historic district and historic landmarks would be possibly acceptable. No location should be considered without detailed information about the height, length and width of the structure proposes, including its dimension filled with bicycles. Also, proposed signage should be part of the visual consideration in renderings of the facilities.

Julia Diana, Office of Environmental Policy, gave a detailed presentation on the bicycle rental stations.

Commissioner Cabel stated he shares the concerns of San Antonio Conservation Society on the site locations.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she has concerns giving conceptual approval to a case with limited amount of information. It's a great idea but more detail is needed.

Commissioner Shafer stated he is concerned in particular to the stations located in Main Plaza. Main Plaza is congested with the kiosks and would consider an alternate location. All locations should be looked at critically.

Commissioner Cone stated the locations are in sensitive area and should be looked at closely. Commissioner Cone suggested the bike stations be brought forward in small pieces.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Cabel and seconded by Commissioner Maldonado to grant conceptual approval of bicycle rental stations with the stipulation that the applicant return with each bike station location, design, signage and that the applicant meet with the Design Review Committee prior to final approval.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. HDRC NO. 2010-174

Applicant: Anibal Gutierrez c/o City of San Antonio

Address: Hays St. Bridge (between Austin & Cherry)

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1) Placement of interpretive signage at either bridge approach. Signage will discuss the bridge's construction and history. Interpretive sign face area will be 24 1/2" x 18 1/2", and will be mounted on poles that extend 30 1/4" above grade.

2) Placement of identification signage at either bridge approach. The monument style signs simply state "Hays Street Bridge" and are 46" x 69" and will be mounted on 3" steel pipe that extends to a height of 13'-6".

Anibal Gutierrez, CIMS, presented plan.

Commissioner Maldonado had questioned if the font has been finalized.

Anibal Gutierrez stated they have not received the proofs however the intent is to match the font on the interpretive panels.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Shafer to approve with the stipulation on item 2 that the applicant submit final font and imagery to staff.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

8. HDRC NO. 2010-175

Applicant: James LeFluer c/o City of San Antonio

Address: Hays St. Bridge (between Austin & Cherry)

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to install public art enhancements along the approach railings to the Hays Street Bridge. Public Art consists of decorative metal railing with train images.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve as submitted.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

13. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-165

Applicant: David Cantu

Address: 3900 Broadway

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Install an awning 16' long by 4'-10" high, with white 22" high lettering.
- 2) Reface a 4' by 8' pole sign.

Applicant was not present.

Commissioner Carpenter gave the committee report. He stated the applicant was agreeable to a reduced sign with only 2 feet in depth as well as reducing letter size to 20 inches.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with the stipulation that the "cleaner" sign be reduced to 2'x4', the sign on top of the existing pole sign be removed and that the canopy sign lettering be reduced to 20".

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-150

Applicant: RVK Architects

Address: 323 Stadium Drive

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

- 1) Construct a new pavilion/play shelter on the existing soccer field.
- 2) Expand the existing bleacher seating on the north side of the field.

Kenneth Zuschlag, applicant, gave the presentation.

Commissioner Cone expressed concern with the ownership transparency.

John Green, Trinity University, clarified that the property in question is not a Monte Vista park. The property is a Trinity University recreation field, owned & maintained by Trinity. Trinity has graciously agreed to allow the public the use of the jogging trail. There is no agreement between Trinity University and Monte Vista; however there is an agreement of deed restriction in place with the City of San Antonio and Trinity University.

Commissioner Cone questioned if the wall to the south could possibly be lowered.

Commissioner Maldonado expressed concern of the view coming off 281 west bound on E. Mulberry.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with the stipulation that the applicant to submit a landscaping plan to staff addressing the street edge landscaping.

AYES: Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: Cone

RECUSED: Gonzalez

THE MOTION CARRIED.

15. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-173

Applicant: City of San Antonio, Office of Historic Preservation

Address: Knob Hill Historic District
1100-1200 Iowa St.
1100-1200 Virginia Blvd.
200 Blk. of Nelson Ave.
1003 S. New Braunfels

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to form the Knob Hill Historic District. The request for district formation includes 86 lots, 1 of which is already an individually designated landmark.

Elizabeth Porterfield, Office of Historic Preservation, presented the history for the case in question.

Evelin Baker, asked for clarification.

Roberto Hinkson, San Antonio Conservation Society, read into the record a letter of support from Rollette Schreckenghost, President. The SACS is strongly in favor of the designation of the Knob Hill Historic District. The residential area prospered in the early twentieth century as witnessed by its fine examples of Classical Revival and Craftsman Style houses. The near east side of San Antonio has recently been the focus of long overdue attention. We see the creation of the Knob Hill Historic District as a step in the cognition of the East Side's historic role in the community and its potential for revitalization.

William Johnson Sr., 1132 Virginia, stated he is not convinced the area should be designated and opposes the proposed designation. He stated he is concerned with rising tax costs.

Natalie Harmon, owner, stated she is strongly in favor of designation. Designation will help protect the integrity of the neighborhood. Knob Hill is prime area and needs to be protected and will increase revitalization.

Joe Arriola, owner, stated he is in support of the designation.

Vincent & Lydia Acosta, owner, stated he owns three homes on Iowa and fears the maintenance costs would affect some the homeowners.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Shafer and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to grant approval of historic district designation for Knob Hill.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cone, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC CASE NO. 2010-188

Applicant: Mike Ferrell

Address: 151 Oakmont Court

Withdrawn by the applicant.

17. HDRC CASE NO. 2009-329

Applicant: Kimberly Gilbert

Address: 2109 W. Mistletoe

The applicant is requesting approval to:

1. Alter existing column spacing on front elevation
2. Add 2nd floor covered porch on front elevation
3. Add covered porches on either side of existing structure
4. Add additional living space behind the existing structure.
5. Add new standing seam metal roof
6. Add 3 new dormers to the front elevation
7. Replace an existing window with a door on the front façade
8. Add an attached garage to the rear
9. Add porte cochere

Kim Gilbert, applicant, addressed the outstanding items of concern: windows, garage, and trees being affected.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Maldonado and seconded by Commissioner Cabel to approve with the stipulation that the applicant provide a shed roof on the western side of the garage, the garage doors incorporate some articulation and return to staff for administrative approval, and that the windows be proportional to the original windows on the property.

Commissioner Cone stated because of the significant changes to the front of the house he will oppose. The changes go against the Secretary of Interiors Standards for historic properties of this importance are handled.

Commissioner Connor stated the HDRC explained the protection of designation in the previous case for Knob Hill and the case in question is going completely against that. The home is significant and is being butchered.

Commissioner Gonzalez stated the home is literally taken from the brink to make this something the neighborhood could be proud of now and for the future.

Commissioner Maldonado stated she would like to see a landscaping plan return.

AYES: Gonzalez, Cabel, Maldonado, Shafer, Carpenter

NAYS: Cone, Connor

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Assignments to Design Review Committee (DCR) and Designation & Demolition Committee
- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

APPROVED


Xavier Gonzalez
Chairperson