

**SAN ANTONIO HISTORIC AND DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
OFFICIAL MINUTES
JUNE 19, 2013**

- The Historic and Design Review Commission of the City of San Antonio met in session at 3:00 P.M., in the Board Room, Development and Business Services Center, 1901 S. Alamo
- The meeting was called to order by Commissioner Cone, Chair, and the roll was called by the Secretary.

PRESENT: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor
ABSENT: Zuniga, Shafer

- Chairman’s Statement
- Citizens to be heard
- Announcements

The Commission then considered the Consent Agenda which consisted of:

- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 1. Case No. 2013-177 | 200 E. Main Plaza |
| 2. Case No. 2013-171 | 1800 Broadway |
| 3. Case No. 2013-173 | 103 E. Jones |
| 4. Case No. 2013-179 | 511 Columbus |
| 5. Case No. 2013-184 | 117 E. French Place |
| 6. Case No. 2013-138 | VIA Westside Multimodal Transit Center, Phase II |
| 7. Case No. 2013-142 | 355 E. Kings Hwy. |
| 8. Case No. 2013-165 | 219 W. Elsmere Pl. |
| 9. Case No. 2013-166 | 234 Carolina |
| 10. Case No. 2013-167 | 1007 Avenue B |
| 11. Case No. 2013-170 | 516 E. Guenther |
| 12. Case No. 2013-132 | 305 E. Houston |
| 13. Case No. 2013-140 | 210 W. Market |
| 14. Case No. 2013-181 | 709 S. Alamo |
| 15. Case No. 2013-180 | 908-910 W. Houston |
| 16. Case No. 2013-183 | 3903 N. St. Mary’s |
| 17. Case No. 2013-169 | 329 E. Myrtle |

Items 15 and 16 were pulled from the Consent Agenda to be heard under Individual Consideration.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Feldman to approve the remaining cases on the Consent Agenda based staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor
NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

5. HDRC NO. 2013-184

Applicant: Craig McMahon Architects
Address: 117 E. French Place

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Replace the existing grass on the front playing field at San Antonio Academy with artificial grass called Matrix Turf. With the previously approved modifications to the campus master plan, the existing front playing field will now be the school's only playing field year-round which will necessitate a durable playing surface.

FINDINGS:

a. On December 5, 2012, the applicant received final approval from the HDRC to implement Phase 1 of the San Antonio Academy master plan. On June 5, 2013, the applicant received final HDRC approval to revise one element of the proposed master plan to replace the existing practice field on the northeast corner of the campus with a new parking area. As a result of this modification, the school's front playing field will be the only athletic field on campus and will be used more often.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to approve as submitted based on findings b through f.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

6. HDRC NO. 2013-138

Applicant: Christina Vina, VIA Metropolitan Transit

Address: VIA Westside Multimodal Transit Center, Phase II

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval for the proposed development of the VIA Westside Multimodal Transit Center Phase II which will cover the entire city block bounded by W. Travis St., N. Medina St., W. Houston St., and N. Frio St. This proposed plaza is being developed in conjunction with VIA's rehabilitation and reuse of the International & Great Northern (I&GN) transportation terminal at 123 N. Medina St. The applicant also proposes to rehabilitate the historic structure at 230 N. Medina, known as the Viera Historical Building and the Washington Hotel Building. The plaza is intended to function as a major hub/transfer site for bus users of multiple service routes as well as the Bus Rapid Transit service and eventually the downtown streetcar service. The proposed plaza will include:

1. New construction of a large circular shade structure with an arbor of trees within it over the entire block. The proposed canopy will slope down toward the center of the circle. Beneath the large shade structure, there may be enclosed spaces for a waiting area or a café. Solar panels are proposed to be installed on the southern portion of the shade structure and a vertical illuminated tower is proposed to be constructed at the northeastern corner of the site. The proposed light tower will function as a wayfinding element and a means of identifying the plaza. The proposed tower is still being developed, but is proposed to be approximately 70 feet in height (lower than the total height of the I&GN building's dome). Signage is proposed to be installed above the southeastern portion of the large canopy structure as freestanding letters.
2. New construction of a small circular canopy over N. Medina St. just north of W. Houston St. This canopy is intended to be a shaded waiting area for customers using VIA's Primo service. The proposed Primo canopy will be illuminated by upward facing light fixtures attached to the supporting posts located beneath the innermost circle of the canopy.
3. New construction of two buildings to the south and the east of the existing historic building at 230 N. Medina. One building will face N. Medina St. to the south of the Viera/Washington Hotel Building and is proposed to contain retail space and a rooftop observation deck. The building to the east and behind the existing historic structure will contain restrooms, an information booth, office space, storage and mechanical. The façade of the proposed building to the south of the existing structure is set back to respect the historic building and its upper floor steps back further for the same reason. The plaza shade structure wraps around the new building to help address the pedestrian scale along N. Medina St. in the vicinity of the Viera/Washington Hotel Building.

FINDINGS:

- a. This application was reviewed by the Design Review Committee on January 8, 2013. At that time, the committee found that more information was required to understand how the proposed new construction would relate to the historic building at 230 N. Medina St. The committee also noted that the proposed plaza structure is a grand and monumental gesture, but some of that is lost at the northwest corner at the historic Viera/Washington Hotel Building where VIA is attempting to bring new and historic structures together. The committee urged the applicant to consider the human scale in the design of the proposed new buildings that will be adjacent to the historic structure. The committee also requested more structural details to understand what the proposed columns of the shade structure will look like and how they will connect to the canopy.
- b. This application was reviewed a second time by the Design Review Committee on June 11, 2013. At that meeting, the committee found that the proposed transit plaza will create a great public space. The committee recommended that ground level uplighting or tree-mounted downlights be used in the plaza rather than installing pole lights. The committee requested additional information about exactly what the proposed new buildings adjacent to the Viera Building at 230 N. Medina will look like upon returning for final approval. The committee noted that since their last meeting, steps have been taken to push the new construction back with respect to the Viera Building. The committee also noted that the northeast corner of the plaza is treated very differently from the southeast corner, discussing how that relates to the broader connectivity of the site and noting that the proposed light tower at the northeast corner should be tall enough to be seen from a distance. The committee suggested that the structure and details of the proposed canopies should be celebrated and made unique. The committee also noted that the applicant should be mindful of additional elements such as signage and timetables that will have to be installed in the plaza and how those will relate to the structure.
- c. The Alazan Acequia historically ran through the proposed plaza site in the north-south direction toward the western edge of the site. Staff finds the applicant's proposal to reference the acequia through the use of a lateral strip of porous paving through the site to be appropriate.
- d. The applicant has indicated that further exploration will be performed prior to beginning construction in an effort to determine the exact location of the historic acequia.
- e. Staff finds that retaining and restoring the existing Viera/Washington Hotel Building at 230 N. Medina is appropriate.
- f. The applicant has requested approval to demolish existing structures on five of the parcels on this block. All of the structures in question have been determined by the Office of Historic Preservation to be non-contributing to the Cattlemans Square Historic District.
- g. The proposed new large canopy structure and arbor have been laid out and oriented in such a way as to preserve view corridors to the historic International & Great Northern building at 123 N. Medina, in keeping with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation number 10.
- h. Since the plaza is entirely surrounded by city streets, there is no rear portion of the structure. However, the orientation of the roof, which slopes down toward the center will allow the proposed solar installation on the southern portion of the shade structure to be largely hidden from view from public right of way, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Section 7.C.i.
- i. The proposed light tower will be at the intersection of N. Frio St. and W. Travis St. The other corners of this intersection contain parking areas for nearby businesses and one apartment complex. Staff finds that placing a light tower at this location will have minimal impact on neighboring properties, provided the light is directed and shielded, consistent with the UDC Section 35-392, referenced above.
- j. The proposed Primo canopy that will be constructed over N. Medina St. is pulled back from the historic I&GN Station so as to preserve views of that structure's iconic dome and parapet walls, consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation numbers 9 and 10.
- k. Staff finds that more detailed information about the design of the proposed new buildings on the northwest corner of the plaza will be required prior to returning for final approval. At this point, staff finds that the conceptual models presented of these structures indicate appropriate scale and massing, consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for New Construction, Sections 2.A.i and ii.

1. Staff recommends conceptual approval based on findings c through i with the following stipulations:
 - a. Some indication of additional signage and timetable elements that will be installed beneath the shade structure be provided for final approval based on finding b.
 - b. More detailed information about the proposed light tower and its potential impact on neighboring properties be provided for final approval based on finding i.
 - c. A copy of any archaeological report produced with reference to the historic acequia that ran through this site be provided to OHP based on findings c and d.
2. Staff recommends conceptual approval as submitted based on findings g and j.
3. Staff recommends conceptual approval based on finding k with the stipulation that more detailed information about the design of these buildings be provided by the applicant prior to returning to the HDRC for final approval.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Valenzuela to grant Conceptual approval based on findings c through i with staff recommendations.

Item 1:

- a. Some indication of additional signage and timetable elements that will be installed beneath the shade structure be provided for final approval based on finding b.
- b. More detailed information about the proposed light tower and its potential impact on neighboring properties be provided for final approval based on finding i.
- c. A copy of any archaeological report produced with reference to the historic acequia that ran through this site be provided to OHP based on findings c and d.

Item 3:

Applicant must provide more detailed information about the design of the buildings prior to returning to HDRC for final approval.

AYES: Cone, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Carpenter, Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

7. HDRC NO. 2013-142

Applicant: Samuel Avestas

Address: 355 E. Kings Hwy

The applicant is requesting conceptual approval to construct a new single-family residence on the vacant lot at 355 E Kings Hwy. The proposed residence is a two-story, Prairie Revival Style house with stone veneer, stucco and lap siding. An attached two-car garage is proposed with a driveway, set at an angle from the street. The driveway will consist of either gravel, crushed granite or permeable pavers. A terrace with wood trellis is proposed over the garage.

FINDINGS:

- a. This request was reviewed by the Design Review Commission on May 28, 2013. That that time, the applicant presented a preliminary design for a two-story residence with large fixed windows, a single-sloped roof and stucco siding. There was some concern over the placement of an attached two story garage facing the street and the impact of a new driveway at the street. The applicant was encouraged to reference the surround context of the site.

b. This block of East Kings Hwy features homes in a variety of styles. A multi-family development is located immediately to the west of the property. The Saint Anthony's campus is located to the south across East Kings Hwy.

c. Staff finds that the proposed new construction references design elements of the Prairie style which is found within the Monte Vista Historic District. Staff finds that the proposed design is a contemporary interpretation of this style and is appropriate within the district.

d. The proposed new construction is consistent with the Guidelines for New Construction in terms of building and entrance orientation, mass, scale, roof forms, fenestration patterns, materials and textures, and architectural details.

e. Staff finds that the proposed two-car garage is set back from the primary façade of the house, but that an additional reveal from the front façade would improve the overall composition. Setting the garage at an angle from the street further reduces its dominance on the front façade. Staff also finds that dividing the two-car garage into two distinct bays will break up the scale of the garage and would be more appropriate.

f. As submitted, the proposed driveway consists of permeable or semi-permeable materials and is 13'-1" wide. The proposed parking area will be screened by plantings which is appropriate for this property. Generally, driveways in historic districts are no wider than 10 feet. A 10-foot driveway would be more appropriate.

g. The applicant has submitted an elevation of the south (front) façade as well as a concept sketch. Staff has not received proposed elevations drawings for the other three facades. Staff finds conceptual approval of the submitted schematic design would be appropriate provided that the remaining elevation incorporate a similar materials palette as the proposed south façade.

Staff recommends conceptual approval with the following stipulations:

1. That the driveway be no wider than 10 feet with a 12-foot apron at the street.
2. That the garage be divided into two distinct bays.
3. That every effort be made to further set back the garage from the front property line, or that an additional reveal be included on the southeast corner adjacent to the garage.
4. That the remaining elevation are developed using a similar materials palette as the south façade.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Connor to grant conceptual approval based on findings a through g with staff recommendations.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

14. HDRC NO. 2013-181

Applicant: Rene Fernandez

Address: 709 S. Alamo

The applicant is request a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

1. Install a new wall sign at 709 S Alamo using 20" letters attached to the brick façade and smaller letters on the existing painted panel. The sign will feature halo-lit, aluminum reverse channel letters;
2. Install a new 6-foot wrought iron fence and entry gate along S Alamo with access to an interior courtyard; and
3. Develop an interior courtyard in the existing space to include brick pavers and a 6-foot cedar privacy fence.

FINDINGS:

a. The proposed fencing and gate is replacing an existing chain link fence that is over 6 feet in height. A wrought iron fence would be a considerable improvement over the existing conditions and is consistent with the Guidelines for Site Elements 2.B.

b. The proposed brick pavers will be installed over a sand base, and constitute the removal of the existing asphalt paving. The new pavers will reintroduce historically-appropriate materials to the property and aid in the reduction of storm water runoff.

c. The materials and lighting method of the proposed signage is appropriate for this location. Staff finds that smaller letters would be more in scale with the proposed wall space, consistent with the Guidelines for Signage.

Staff recommends approval with the stipulations that the proposed aluminum letters be no taller than 14" and that the sign is installed in a manner that does not result in additional damage to the existing masonry.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve with staff recommendations that the proposed aluminum letters be no taller than 14" and that the sign is installed in a manner that does not result in additional damage to the existing masonry.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Guarino

THE MOTION CARRIED.

15. HDRC NO. 2013-180

Applicant: Avance, Inc.

Address: 908 – 910 W. Houston

The applicants is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish the historic landmark at 908/910 W Houston.

FINDINGS:

a. A site visit to this property was conducted by the Designation and Demolition Committee on May 22, 2013. At that meeting, it was observed that the building at 908/910 W Houston was in extremely poor condition and was not salvageable. Interest was expressed in reusing some of the remaining materials, specifically the existing brick found in the remaining walls of the structure. The applicant was encouraged by the Committee to present a site plan for the future uses of the property.

b. The building at 908 W Houston was constructed circa , and is only remaining residential structure located within the Cattleman Square Historic District. It was converted for commercial use at some point, and a commercial storefront was added to the front of the structure along Houston. That addition has since been removed. The building has no remaining windows, and an entire wall on the southern façade has collapsed. The gabled roof has recently fallen to the south of the building in a single piece.

c. The applicant has submitted an initial cost estimate for the rehabilitation and reuse of the building. Staff finds the submitted estimate of approximately \$491,000 for the re rehabilitation of small building to be an unreasonable economic hardship.

d. The applicant has submitted replacement plans for the parcel, which will be used for parking and a small sitting area. Reclaimed brick from the demolished building is proposed to serve as paving materials in the sitting area and screening for the proposed parking. The applicant has submitted three options for replacement plans.

e. Any tree removal is to be done in coordination with the City Arborist.

Staff recommends approval to demolish the building at 908 W Houston with the stipulation that the applicant coordinate with staff regarding the final replacement plans for the site.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve demolition at 908 W. Houston with stipulation that the applicant coordinate with staff regarding the final replacement plans for the site.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

16. HDRC NO. 2013-183

Applicant: San Antonio Zoo

Address: 3903 N. St. Mary's St.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to:

Expand the White Rhino yard at the San Antonio Zoo. The existing rhino enclosure houses two species of rhino. The San Antonio Zoo is moving toward housing only one species—the White Rhino—which is larger than the other species. The applicant proposes to remove a 91 foot section of an existing wall that divides the two current rhino exhibits, leaving in place an 8 to 10 foot long remnant of the wall. The applicant also proposes to demolish a small barn attached to this wall and raise the height of the other existing barn in this area from approximately 6 feet to 9 or 10 feet. The existing barn has a concrete roof that slopes down from front to back. The applicant proposes to maintain the slope of the roof, but to install a metal roof in place of concrete.

FINDINGS:

- a. The existing rhino enclosure is of historic age and consistent with other original animal enclosures at the San Antonio Zoo.
- b. Staff finds that any modifications to the existing rhino enclosure should maintain the architectural character of the historic San Antonio Zoo through the use of compatible or salvaged materials to help mitigate the change to the distinctive materials, features, spaces and spatial relationships of this site, consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation numbers 1 and 2.
- c. The applicant has indicated plans to salvage as much material from the demolished barn as possible to reuse in the remaining barn. This is consistent with the Historic Design Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, Section 3.C.i.
- d. Staff finds that based on the information provided by the applicant, the existing rhino enclosure no longer meets the needs of the zoo or the animals to be kept within the space, constituting a loss of significance.
- e. The proposal to raise the height of the remaining rhino barn will make the space more suited to this species of rhino and will not significantly impact the appearance of the existing barn.
- f. The applicant's proposal to replace the roof of the remaining barn with metal rather than concrete, while a change of material from the original, is consistent with other buildings at the San Antonio Zoo.
- g. Staff finds that the new roof should maintain an overhang of a similar dimension to that of the existing concrete roof. Staff recommends approval with the stipulations that as much material as possible be salvaged and reused in the proposed modifications to the remaining barn and that the new roof of the remaining barn maintain an overhang similar to that of the existing roof based on findings b through g.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Connor and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve based on findings b through g with staff recommendations that as much material as possible be salvaged and reused in the proposed modifications to the remaining barn and that the new roof of the remaining barn maintain an overhang similar to that of the existing roof.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Connor

NAYS: None

RECUSED: Feldman

THE MOTION CARRIED.

19. HDRC NO. 2013-174

Applicant: Robert Frank Jr.

Address: 238 W. Wildwood Dr.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace existing composite shingle roof with a galvalume standing seam metal roof.

FINDINGS:

- a. Olmos Park Terrace was originally platted in 1931 by the Northside Improvement Company, with developer H.C. Thorman as president. Houses developed by H.C. Thorman were constructed of stone veneer over reinforced concrete with attached garages. According to the 1938 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, the house at 134 Thorain was built in 1938 as part of the Olmos Park Terrace development in an English stone cottage style.
- b. Consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, a standing seam metal roof is a compatible roofing material to a stone cottage style house.
- c. According to the 1911-1951 Sanborn Maps the house originally had a composition roof. English stone cottages throughout the Olmos Park Terrace Historic District historically had shingle roofs. A standing seam metal roof is not a typical roofing material found on stone houses within the district.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. Staff recommends an in kind replacement. If a standing seam metal roof is approved, staff recommends that the new roof not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double much seam instead, that ridges are less than 2" high and panels are 18-21" wide.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Carpenter and seconded by Commissioner Guarino to approve a standing seam metal roof with staff recommendations that the new roof not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double much seam instead, that ridges are less than 2" high and panels are 18-21" wide.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

20. HDRC NO. 2013-163

Applicant: Irma Sanchez

Address: 134 Thorain

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for approval to replace the existing composite shingle roof with a standing seam metal roof.

FINDINGS:

- a. Olmos Park Terrace was originally platted in 1931 by the Northside Improvement Company, with developer H.C. Thorman as president. Houses developed by H.C. Thorman were constructed of stone veneer over reinforced concrete with attached garages. According to the 1938 Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps, the house at 134 Thorain was built in 1938 as part of the Olmos Park Terrace development in an English stone cottage style.
- b. Consistent with the Guidelines for Exterior Maintenance and Alterations, a standing seam metal roof is a compatible roofing material to a stone cottage style house.
- c. According to the 1911-1951 Sanborn Maps the house originally had a composition roof. English stone cottages throughout the Olmos Park Terrace Historic District historically had shingle roofs. A standing seam metal roof is not a typical roofing material found on stone houses within the district.

Staff does not recommend approval as submitted based on the findings above. Staff recommends an in kind replacement. If a standing seam metal roof is approved, staff recommends that the new roof not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double much seam instead, that ridges are less than 2" high and panels are 18-21" wide.

COMMISSION ACTION:

The motion was made by Commissioner Guarino and seconded by Commissioner Carpenter to approve a standing seam metal roof with staff recommendations that the new roof not incorporate a ridge cap vent and use a double much seam instead, that ridges are less than 2" high and panels are 18-21" wide.

AYES: Cone, Carpenter, Laffoon, Guarino, Valenzuela, Salas, Feldman, Connor

NAYS: None

THE MOTION CARRIED.

- Executive Session: Consultation on attorney – client matters (real estate, litigation, contracts, personnel, and security matters) as well as the above mentioned agenda items may be discussed under Chapter 551 of the Texas Government Code.
- Adjournment.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:45 P.M.

APPROVED



Tim Cone
Chair